

Temporal scale of field experiments in benthic ecology

Jenkins, Stuart; Yrayzoz, Marc Uya

Marine Ecology: progress series

DOI: 10.3354/meps11659

Published: 01/04/2016

Peer reviewed version

Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication

Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA): Jenkins, S., & Yrayzoz, M. U. (2016). Temporal scale of field experiments in benthic ecology. *Marine Ecology: progress series*, *547*, 273-286. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps11659

Hawliau Cyffredinol / General rights Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

· Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.

- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
 You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

1	Temporal scale of field experiments in benthic ecology
2	Stuart R Jenkins and Marc Uyà
3	School of Ocean Sciences, Bangor University, Menai Bridge, Anglesey, UK LL59 5AB
4	
5	
6	Running head: Duration of experiments in benthic ecology
7	
8	Email: s.jenkins@bangor.ac.uk
9	

10 Abstract

The issue of scale in ecology is all-pervasive, with recognition that most ecological questions 11 are scale dependent. Scaling up has become part of the lexicon of experimental ecology, and 12 in marine benthic systems has resulted in numerous advances. While it is clear that 13 manipulative experiments in benthic systems have been conducted over increasing spatial 14 scales, it is less clear whether the notion of scaling up has been applied to temporal scale. 15 Here, we examine the temporal scale at which experiments have been undertaken before 16 reviewing longer term studies to examine the insights gained from extending the duration of 17 observation following perturbation. Field experiments which examined 18 population/community responses to perturbations, and studies which monitored the 19 consequences of natural disturbances, were identified over the period 1980-2013. The median 20 length of study was 10 months and only 12% of studies were carried out over more than 3 21 years. Neither the median study length, nor the proportion of studies longer than 2 or 3 years, 22 23 showed a trend over the 33 years. Review of experiments with a duration of 3 years or more revealed numerous benefits of a long-term approach. Some of these were unexpected, but 24 25 others were predictable based on life history traits of dominant organisms, slow successional patterns, or response variables related to longer term community level responses, such as 26 stability. The review suggests modest investment in resources to extend the duration of 27 experiments can bring substantial benefits and hence consideration of experimental duration 28 should be one of the primary decisions in planning field experiments. 29 30 Keywords: field experiments; long term; perturbation; scaling up; temporal scale 31

- 32
- 33
- 34
- 35
- 36

37 Introduction

Our understanding of ecological processes in the marine benthic environment has been built 38 on a foundation of manipulative experiments over the past half century or so, in a range of 39 intertidal and shallow sub-tidal systems. Both soft and hard substrata habitats have been 40 utilised by experimental ecologists, intent on understanding the processes structuring marine 41 42 assemblages, and hence explaining patterns in abundance, distribution and diversity of species (see Raffaelli & Hawkins 1996 for review). Marine ecological experiments have also 43 contributed to important advances in ecological theory (e.g. Connell 1961, Paine 1966, 44 Dayton 1975, Menge & Sutherland 1976, Bertness & Callaway 1994). The intertidal zone is 45 favoured by experimental ecologists owing to the logistical ease of working on marine 46 communities when the tide is out, combined with a sharp marine/terrestrial environmental 47 gradient which is conducive to investigations of the interaction of physical and biological 48 processes. Additionally, the intertidal is inhabited by organisms which are generally small 49 and sessile/slow moving and hence amenable to experimental manipulation (Connell 1972, 50 Paine 1977, Underwood 2000) and in the case of hard substrate, the environment is two-51 52 dimensional in nature. Sub-tidal work is more challenging, but there is still a vast body of experimental research undertaken in this environment, either through the use of SCUBA or 53 suspending experiments from floating or fixed structures. Focal habitats for experimental 54 research in the coastal zone include coral reefs, seagrass beds, subtidal rocky reefs, intertidal 55 rocky shores, mud-flats and beaches and sub-tidal soft sediment systems. 56

The development of experimental ecology in marine systems and the advances made over the 57 58 past 50 years or so are well documented (see Paine 1994, Underwood 2000, Castilla 2000 for reviews). One area which has received increasing attention, in marine as well as terrestrial 59 and freshwater habitats, is the issue of scale (Wiens 1989, Levin 1992, Schneider 2001, Ellis 60 61 & Schneider 2008). Schneider (2001) neatly summarised three components to the problem of scale: problems in ecology often exist at decadal time scales over large ecosystems; most 62 variables can only be measured in small areas over short time scales; patterns and processes 63 observed at small scales do not necessarily hold at large scales. It is increasingly recognised 64 that environmental drivers and ecological processes operate over a range of different spatial 65 and temporal scales and over the past two decades, scale, in a quantitative sense, has been 66 increasingly incorporated into experimental work (Ellis & Schneider 2008). 67

Ecologists in coastal marine systems have been key in developing a framework in which 68 69 understanding from manipulative experiments may be scaled up through the comparative experimental approach (Menge et al. 2002). Identical replicated experiments are conducted at 70 71 multiple sites often over some environmental gradient (e.g. Menge et al. 1997, Jenkins et al. 2001, Coleman et al. 2006), thus allowing determination of the extent to which large scale 72 physical conditions, which are not amenable to manipulation, can modify ecological 73 processes. This 'scaling up' approach has led to a number of important developments in 74 understanding of coastal systems, particularly in recognising the importance of latitudinal 75 76 variation in temperature (e.g. Leonard 1999, Sanford 1999, Jenkins et al. 2001), regional 77 variation in productivity (Menge et al. 1997, Broitman et al. 2001) and large scale variation in 78 recruitment regime (Connolly & Roughgarden 1998). Studies of systems in contrasting oceanographic regimes have made progress in integrating small, medium and large scale 79 80 processes and in particular have shown that benthic assemblages in shallow water or intertidal 81 areas do not operate in isolation from the planktonic, pelagic realm (Menge et al. 2003).

In considering scale, attention has not solely focused on variation in space, with increasingly 82 83 sophisticated ecological experiments examining processes at a range of different temporal scales. For example the importance of seasonality in determining the magnitude and direction 84 of ecological processes is now recognised in experiments through manipulations being 85 performed at different times of the year, and it is not uncommon for multiple starting dates to 86 be nested within season in order to provide unconfounded tests of seasonal effects (e.g. 87 88 Jenkins et al. 2005). Another aspect of temporal scale is the variability of events through time. Benedetti-Cecchi (2003) highlighted that temporal variability in the occurrence of 89 perturbations is generally expressed in terms of the frequency of events, but argues that a 90 more appropriate approach which avoids confounding the variance with the mean effect size 91 (i.e. a more frequent disturbance is also more intense) is to design experiments in which levels 92 of intensity, and those of variability, are chosen independently. His work has led to 93 94 numerous studies explicitly assessing the importance of temporal variance in perturbations (e.g. Incera et al. 2010, Maggi et al. 2012, Oliveira et al. 2014). 95

96 Consideration of temporal scale also clearly needs to take account of the duration of any
97 particular manipulative experiment. Underwood (2000), based on the assertion of Connell &
98 Sousa (1983) that studies should encompass a period as long as the turnover of individuals in
99 resident species, suggests that on Australian rocky shores a period of between 5 and 7 years
100 might be appropriate, but also considers studies may need to be much longer to allow analyses

of equilibria. Yodzis (1988) considered that for the impact of a press perturbation to be 101 known, a long term approach is required. He recommended adopting a rule of thumb such 102 that the time scale of observation should approximate to two times the sum of the generation 103 times of a pressed species (i.e. one whose density has been modified) and the potentially 104 impacted species of interest. It is debateable whether all experiments require such duration, 105 and clearly there are specific questions which can be addressed by much shorter studies. For 106 example Menge (1997) tested the assertion that indirect effects may take longer to become 107 apparent, following a manipulation, than direct effects, by determining the relationship 108 109 between duration of experiment and the importance of indirect effects using 23 rocky 110 intertidal interaction webs. He concluded that in the case studies examined, which ranged in length from 0.5 to 156 months, *'interpretations of community dynamics are not likely to be* 111 distorted because experiments were too brief' (p.812). Thus, based on addressing a very 112 113 specific goal, that of quantifying indirect effects in community dynamics, Menge (1997) considered the experiments he reviewed as being sufficiently long. 114

In most fields of marine benthic ecology there has been a lack of explicit consideration of 115 116 experimental duration. A field of burgeoning research that has recently recognised the serious implications of a short term approach is in Biodiversity and Ecosystem Functioning (BEF) 117 work (Hooper et al. 2005, O'Connor & Crowe 2005, Raffaelli 2006, Crowe et al. 2012, Duffy 118 119 et al. 2012). Crowe et al. (2012) used existing meta-analyses (Cardinale et al. 2007, Stachowicz et al. 2007) to review the temporal scale of biodiversity-ecosystem functioning 120 121 (BEF) studies conducted in both laboratory and field settings (in marine, terrestrial and freshwater environments). The authors argue that limiting the temporal extent of experiments 122 has a marked effect on the conclusions regarding the importance of biodiversity in ecosystems 123 and the mechanism by which biodiversity may exert an effect; short term experiments will 124 over-emphasise the importance of dominant species (a species identity effect) relative to 125 complementarity among species. Stachowicz et al. (2008a) examined the effect of seaweed 126 127 diversity on cover over a period of three years. They showed that seaweed cover in diverse treatments only exceeded that in the best performing monoculture after a period of 18 months, 128 129 a period much longer than many biodiversity studies (Crowe et al. 2012). These observations might reasonably be seen as strong arguments for lengthening the duration of BEF 130 experiments (although doing so in any multi-trophic manner incorporating large, mobile long 131 lived consumers will be enormously challenging (Raffaelli 2006)). 132

Although many aspects of temporal scale have been addressed through ecological 134 experiments in recent decades, it is debateable whether the scaling up approach, so prevalent 135 in considerations of spatial scale, has been applied to temporal scale. Thus it is unclear 136 whether the overall length of experimental study (i.e. scaling up in time) has increased, 137 despite numerous publications tentatively expressing concern at the paucity of longer term 138 experimentation (e.g. Connell & Sousa 1983, Underwood 2000, Raffaelli 2006). Such calls 139 have no doubt been influenced by the perceived benefits of long term experimentation 140 (Underwood 2000; Crowe et al 2012). Here, we examine the temporal scale at which 141 142 ecological experiments (which apply some form of perturbation) are undertaken in intertidal 143 and shallow sub-littoral environments before reviewing the literature to highlight the range of 144 insights gained from long term experiments. We finish by considering the challenges associated with increasing the temporal extent of marine benthic experiments and the way in 145 146 which these may be addressed.

147 Review of experimental duration

As outlined above there have been a number of calls for longer term experimentation, but a 148 149 factor which may act counter to such a move is the increasing pressure on scientists to publish their work. While publication of research in a vibrant international literature is the life-blood 150 151 of science, the pressure to publish could be argued to lead to a short term approach, with researchers rushing to publish each new piece of research. It is very easy to see how this 152 153 short term approach can influence our approach to experimental ecology. Why spend 5 years undertaking an experiment when a paper can be published on the basis of results collected 154 155 over a period of 18 months? By reviewing the literature (including both marine focused and general ecological journals) we hope to determine what range of temporal scales experimental 156 157 marine ecologists are working at and whether the approach to experimental duration has 158 changed over a 33 year period. This review is limited to assessment of the effects of perturbation on marine systems; thus long term monitoring per se is not considered although 159 it is acknowledged that this approach may often address similar questions. 160

161 <u>Methods</u>

162 We examined literature published over a 33 year period in two of the leading marine

ecological journals, Marine Ecology Progress Series (MEPS) and Journal of Experimental

164 Marine Biology and Ecology (JEMBE), and three general ecological journals, Ecology, Oikos

and Oecologia in order to examine the temporal scale and sampling frequency of field

perturbation experiments in shallow sub-tidal and intertidal benthic environments. In 166 167 selecting publications, all types of pulse and press perturbations were included, from manipulations which simulate some form of natural or anthropogenic disturbance event, to 168 those in which the density or presence of one or more particular species is altered. In addition 169 to manipulation of biota we included perturbations to the physical environment, for example 170 modification of the nutrient or light regime. One very common type of study was one in 171 which new substrata (often simple PVC panels) were introduced into the environment. Such 172 perturbations may be considered analogous to clearance of biota in natural communities, since 173 174 both provide bare space, free from competitors.

In considering which studies to include, the main criterion beyond inclusion of an appropriate 175 176 perturbation was the response variable measured. In general, studies were included which measured the community or population response of macro-organisms to a perturbation (i.e. 177 meiofauna and microbial communities were rejected). Studies where the research aim was 178 solely to examine some process rate, such as growth or mortality, or the effect of disturbance 179 on an organisms' body condition, were excluded. In addition, studies which examined only a 180 181 behavioural response were not included. One difficult judgement to be made was in studies designed to examine spatial or temporal patterns in the arrival of animals or algae i.e. 182 settlement/recruitment. Where the aims of such work were only short term in nature, i.e. 183 examination of settlement, such studies were not included since settlement can be clearly 184 defined as a short term process (Jenkins et al. 2009). However, use of the term recruitment is 185 186 more problematic. Because of its variable use in benthic ecology with no defined time period over which it applies (Keough & Downes 1982, Jenkins et al. 2009) studies examining 187 recruitment were included unless the aim of the study was clearly related to understanding 188 processes determining the arrival of propagules and subsequent settlement (e.g. Reinhardt et 189 al. 2013) rather than the development of a benthic population or community. 190

In addition to manipulative experiments implemented by the experimenter, numerous studies examine the consequences of events or implementation of management structures not under the control of the experimenter. These include investigations of natural disturbances such as extreme weather events (e.g. Tegner et al. 1997) or human-induced perturbations such as pollution (e.g. Jacobs 1980), the exclusion of humans from Marine Protected Areas (Castilla & Bustamante 1989) and managed realignment of coastal limits through intentional flooding (Hughes et al. 2009). These `natural experiments` were included in our review of literature whenever data were available prior to the perturbation taking place, such that a true temporalcontrol existed.

Using the criteria outlined above, all publications in MEPS, JEMBE, Ecology, Oikos and 200 Oecologia at four yearly intervals from 1981 to 2013 were initially reviewed by examination 201 202 of the title and abstract. Following identification of potential papers the full text was read and 203 then either rejected or the appropriate information extracted. This approach was taken rather than performing a search based on keywords because of the difficulty in creating suitable 204 search terms which would highlight appropriate papers without bias. Our search through 205 12,557 titles (6940 in general ecological journals; 5617 in marine ecological journals) 206 identified a total of 263 publications containing 322 independent experiments over the nine 207 208 publication years. These represented an average of 3.5% and 1.3% of the studies published in marine and general ecological journals respectively (or 15.9% of the marine related papers 209 published in general journals). Although there was no obvious directional change over the 33 210 years of review in the proportion of appropriate studies selected in each year in either journal 211 type, there was a general increase in the number of studies from which data were extracted 212 213 owing to the huge increase in number of publications in all journals over time (from 299/564 in 1981 to 823/831 in 2013 for marine/general ecological journals respectively). In order to 214 allow good representation of experimental work in earlier years, additional publications were 215 sought for the earliest five dates by examining studies published up to two years before (and 216 217 in the case of 1981, two years after). This approach was taken in the same way as described 218 above, until a minimum of 10 independent experiments in both marine ecological and general ecological journals were identified for each of the four-yearly periods. This resulted in 293 219 publications containing 352 studies being reviewed. 220

221 The temporal scale of experiments in all 352 studies was determined as the length of time 222 from initial sampling, immediately prior to the perturbation, to the final sampling event. Where multiple experiments within a single publication were conducted with the aim to 223 224 examine a single goal or hypothesis, the maximum length of experimentation was documented. In determining the sampling interval (i.e. length of time between each sampling 225 226 event) an average value over the period of the study was calculated. For example, in a ten month study examining the influence of bivalve shell material introduced to a mudflat on 227 228 colonisation by burrowing thalassinidean shrimp, Feldman et al. (1997) made observations 1 month after the perturbation and after ten months. Here, the average sampling interval was 229 recorded as 5 months. The habitats in which experiments were undertaken were classified as 230

inter-tidal or sub-tidal. In micro-tidal regimes such as the Mediterranean (e.g. Maggi et al. 231 2009) and Baltic (e.g. Lindegarth et al. 2001) studies undertaken in areas frequently exposed 232 to air through variations in pressure and wind were classified as intertidal. The Caribbean 233 234 fringing reef studied by Kilar & MacLachlan (1989) is exposed to air only during particular conditions, at certain times of the year, and was therefore considered sub-tidal. The 235 classification of habitat type (rock, soft sediment, sea-grass, coral, mangrove, salt-marsh, 236 artificial substrate) was generally clear cut. Cobble and boulder habitat were considered 237 238 simply as rock rather than creating a novel category.

Classification of experiments as pulse or press was clear-cut in most cases. Pulse experiments 239 were defined as those receiving a one-off, perturbation which was generally short in temporal 240 extent compared to the temporal scale of the study. The introduction of artificial substrata 241 such as PVC panels (e.g. Valdivia et al. 2005) or newly quarried boulders (e.g. Chapman 242 2013) was considered a pulse disturbance, analogous in many ways to the creation of bare 243 space by a single disturbance event. In cases where both pulse and press perturbations were 244 implemented, the experiments were invariably classified as press. For example in numerous 245 246 studies, novel substrata were introduced in order to examine the consequences of a particular press manipulation, such as light and sediment (Connell 2005) or herbivores (Kaehler & 247 Williams 1997). Other studies (e.g. Russell & Connell 2005) combined pulse manipulations 248 249 such as the one-off removal of a particular species with continued press perturbations such as addition of nutrients Rather than class these as a combination of both pulse and press, they 250 251 were classed as press. In some studies, multiple perturbations were applied through time (Jewett et al. 2005, Incera et al. 2009, Minchinton & Fels 2013) and again here it was 252 253 considered that the principle of an ongoing perturbation (although not continuous) justified categorisation as press. 254

255 <u>Results and Discussion</u>

256 64 % of the 352 studies over the 33 years were from marine journals (MEPS and JEMBE)

whereas 36 % were published in general ecological journals (OIKOS, Ecology, Oecologia).

258 The studies were split almost exactly equally between the intertidal (49.7%) and the sub-tidal

259 (50.3%) zones. Of the eleven different habitats identified the most common was inter-tidal

rocky shore (31% of studies) followed by sub-tidal rocky reef (14%) and then sub-tidal

artificial substrate and sub-tidal coral reef (9% each). 62 % of the studies were categorised as

press (217 studies) whilst the rest were considered as pulse (135).

Examination of the frequency distribution of study length across 33 years showed a clear 263 skew to a shorter time frame (Figure 1). The highest proportion (24% and 33% for marine and 264 general ecological journals respectively) were very short (between 0 and 3 months), with 265 266 obvious peaks at 9-12 and 21-24 months for marine journals (presumably due to the logical attraction of terminating experiments at one and two years respectively) (Figure 1). Most 267 studies (85% for marine and 82% for general ecological journals) lasted two years or less and 268 only 39 of the 352 studies were conducted over a period of 3 years or more. Of these, 17 269 studies were of a period of 5 years or more. The median length of study over the period 270 271 reviewed was 11 months in marine journals, 9 months in general ecological journals and 10 months overall (Figure 2). Although the median study length varied among years for marine 272 273 journals (Kruskal Wallis test, Chi-Square = 19.427; df =8; P=0.013) there was no apparent 274 trend in study length with time.

275 Study length showed differences between habitat (intertidal versus subtidal) and between perturbation type (pulse versus press) (Figure 3). The median length of inter-tidal studies (12 276 months) was significantly longer than sub-tidal studies (8 months) (Mann Whitney U test: 277 278 Z=-2.407; p=0.016 (Figure 3A). In the intertidal zone, 30% of studies were conducted over 2 years or more, approximately double that in the sub-tidal. The median study duration of pulse 279 experiments (14 months) was significantly longer than press experiments (6 months) (Mann 280 Whitney U test: Z=-4.762; p<0.001) (Figure 3A) and a far greater proportion lasted two years 281 or longer (35% of pulse compared to only 16% for press). 282

- There was a significant positive relationship between experimental duration and sampling interval (F $_{1,347} = 108.5$; P <0.001). Thus, as experiments got longer the time between sampling events increased. However, the relationship was weak ($r^2 = 0.236$), driven partially by the fact that a sampling interval (the dependent variable) cannot be greater than the experimental duration (the predictor variable) and indeed many studies well beyond the median duration had short sampling intervals of between 0.5 and 3 months.
- In discussing the need for a longer term approach Underwood (2000, p.68) states that *the*
- 290 majority of ecological studies are quite short, usually three to five years'. In fact, our
- analysis of 352 studies over 33 years shows that for experiments (i.e. where some form of
- 292 manipulation or perturbation has taken place, as opposed to purely observational work) the
- median length of study was only 10 months and only 12% of published work was over a
- 294 period greater than 3 years. Patterns were similar irrespective of the type of journal (marine

specific versus general ecological) in which papers were published. These results were quite clear in indicating that calls for an increase in the temporal scale of studies have not led to any general increase in experimental duration over the past 3 decades. This is true whether considering the median duration of studies or the proportion which are longer than 24 or 36 months.

300 Different approaches can be taken to make an argument for the benefits of longer term experimental duration. One is in demonstrating that longer term experiments reveal, for 301 example, differences in effect sizes compared to short term experiments. Such an approach is 302 fraught with problems in designing a non-biased analysis, since often the benefits of long 303 term experimentation are revealed not in a single bigger outcome but in multi-faceted results 304 305 which provide greater insight into ecological complexities. Below we address such complexity by reviewing a range of longer term studies (generally greater than three years) 306 307 which have revealed greater insight than could be achieved by equivalent short term work.

308 Insights from long term experiments

309 <u>Controlled manipulations</u>

There are a diversity of reasons for conducting long term experiments including: study of long 310 lived species (e.g. Clarke & Allaway 1993; Jenkins et al. 2004) and slow successional change 311 (Yakovis et al 2005); work in polar regions where development rates are much slower (Konar 312 2007, Beuchel & Gulliksen 2008); the search for long lived ecological phenomena such as 313 314 alternate stable states (Petraitis & Dudgeon 2005); determination of the nature and extent of temporal community fluctuations in disturbed systems (Dye 1998). Defining how long to run 315 field experiments is a difficult task but the number of studies in marine coastal systems which 316 317 show differences between control and treatment plots more than 5 years (Clarke & Allaway 1993, Cervin et al. 2005, Viejo 2009, Schiel & Lilley 2011) and in some cases more than 10 318 319 years (Dye 1998, Jenkins et al. 2004, Beuchel & Gulliksen 2008) after a perturbation suggest that to address many community level questions experiments should run for years rather than 320 321 months. Differences among treatments are not simply limited to community structure but also 322 to overall community productivity (Tait & Schiel 2011) and to community stability (Dye 323 1998). For example, Tait & Schiel (2011) showed that 90 months after removal of the fucoid canopy alga *Hormosira banksii*, community primary productivity was only between 40% to 324 325 60% that of control areas. The reasons for slow recovery may be because successional development is inhibited (sensu Connell & Slatyer 1977) by early colonisers (e.g. Sutherland 326

& Karlson 1977), communities are dominated by slow growing species (e.g. Jenkins et al.
2004) or the environment is conducive to slow development, for example in polar regions
(e.g. Beuchel & Gulliksen 2008).

330 In polar regions disturbance can have a profound effect on community structure owing to very slow, and in many cases, an almost complete lack of recovery (Dayton & Oliver 1977, Barnes 331 332 1996, Konar 2007). For example, Konar (2007) found that 4 years after clearance of sub-tidal boulders on the Alaskan north coast, cover of biota had only reached 2%, despite the fact that 333 bare surface in the community in general was scarce (< 10%). A similar lack of colonisation 334 (a total of 2 serpulid polychaetes present after 3 years, and reports of bare surfaces after 5 335 years) on a settlement panel array was observed in McMurdo Sound, Antarctica (Dayton 336 1989). This was followed at some point by bryozoan, hydroid, soft coral, and sponge 337 colonisation leading to 'heavily covered' surfaces (Dayton 1989, p.1486). Low recruitment 338 and slow growth may characterise polar regions, with physically driven episodic events 339 340 driving a punctuated succession (Dayton 1989). Such an environment clearly requires long 341 term experimental work.

342 One argument for conducting long term experiments is that they can reveal quite unexpected results. Jenkins et al. (1999a,b, 2004) report the results of factorial manipulations of the long 343 344 lived canopy species Ascophyllum nodosum and the keystone grazer Patella vulgata on sheltered canopy dominated shores of the Isle of Man. Short term results over a period of one 345 346 to two years included the die back of understorey turfing algae, opening up of bare space and replacement of the Ascophyllum canopy with alternative more opportunistic shorter lived 347 348 fucoid species, Fucus vesiculosus and F.serratus. However it was the longer term observations over 6 years (Jenkins et al. 1999a) and then twelve years (Jenkins et al. 2004) 349 350 which revealed the importance of Ascophyllum in limiting patellid limpet populations; loss of 351 the facilitatory function of the canopy on understorey turfing algae, and hence the opening up of bare space, resulted in enhancement of limpet recruitment, leading to populations up to six 352 times greater in abundance over a decade after canopy loss. Here, experimental work 353 demonstrated the stabilising function of turfing algae in the undisturbed community. Other 354 work has recognised how the dense low lying nature of turfing algae, combined with sediment 355 trapping ability (Connell et al. 2014) contributes to stability or slow succession (e.g. Cervin et 356 357 al. 2005, Schiel & Lilley 2011).

It is frequently stated that coastal marine systems are ideal environments in which to conduct 358 359 manipulative experiments because dominant organisms have relatively short generation times and hence experiments may be conducted over short time scales. However it is debatable 360 361 whether generation times in primary producers, key consumers and dominant space occupiers (which are often a number of years) are short enough to justify this view (Beuchel & 362 Gulliksen 2008). Species life history traits are important determinants for the recovery of 363 communities following disturbance in a range of different ecosystems including saltmarshes 364 (e.g. Bertness 1991), mangroves (e.g. Clarke & Allaway 1993) and rocky shores (e.g. 365 366 Methratta & Petraitis 2008), and species longevity, as well as mode and rate of colonisation, have clear implications for experimental duration. Methratta & Petraitis (2008) examined 367 368 recovery from disturbance on rocky shores focusing on species with contrasting longevities, barnacles and fucoid algae. They showed that differences in life history traits of dominant 369 370 species modified successional trajectories at different spatial scales over a 5 year period. Understanding of the population dynamics and community structuring role of long lived 371 372 species will invariably require longer term studies than investigation into species with short generation times, clearly demonstrated by the nine year study on mangrove regeneration of 373 374 Clarke & Allaway (1993) and the three year study of Bertness (1991) on Spartina competitive 375 interactions. On rocky shores Ascophyllum nodosum, a dioecious, long-lived species (Aberg1992), with low rates of recruitment rate and slow growth rate (Aberg & Pavia 1997, 376 Cervin et al. 2005) has been the focus of a number of long term studies in the NE and NW 377 Atlantic (e.g. Jenkins et al. 1999a,b, 2004, Cervin et al. 2005, Ingolffson & Hawkins 2008, 378 Araújo et al. 2012). Araújo et al. (2012) showed that the impacts of human trampling can 379 have long term (5 years) effects on understorey community structure in stands of Ascophyllum 380 *nodosum.* Even small scale $(25 \times 25 \text{ cm})$ disturbance events can have long lasting effects on 381 Ascophyllum understorey communities (Cervin et al. 2005); small scale loss of Ascophylum 382 canopy led to a change in community structure still apparent after 7 years. Such effects can 383 occur despite recovery of the long lived biomass dominants. Schiel & Lilley (2011) showed 384 385 differences between disturbed and control understory communities 8 years after removal of the *Hormosira* canopy even though this dominant fucoid returned to a nearly closed canopy. 386

Communities composed of long lived individuals are often described as stable, but in reality
may only be stable as a consequence of the long lived nature of their components (Connell &
Sousa 1983). Long term observations following perturbations, especially where dominant
biota are long lived, are essential to judge the stability of communities and consequent

properties of ecosystems (Farrell 1988, Hooper et al. 2005). Hooper et al. (2005) points out 391 that theoretical work on stability has outpaced the ability of empirical work to test predictions, 392 essentially because of the time and resource requirements of long term experimental work 393 394 required to determine the fate of all adults over at least one complete turnover (Connell & Sousa 1983). The problem of time scale is one which has dogged the sometimes vigorous 395 debate surrounding the existence, or otherwise, of alternate stable states (see Petraitis & 396 Dudgeon 2004 for review). The question of whether systems can occupy more than one 397 equilibrium point and hence support different stable communities in the same habitat 398 399 (Lewontin 1969, Connell & Sousa 1983, Peterson 1984, Petraitis & Latham 1999, Petraitis et al. 2009) has been addressed in a number of different marine coastal assemblages including 400 401 coral reefs (Scheffer et al. 2001), rocky shores (Paine et al. 1985, Petraitis & Latham 1999), sub-tidal rocky reefs (Simenstad et al. 1978) and soft sediments (van de Koppel et al. 2001). 402 403 Part of the problem in answering what at first sight seems a relatively simple question is that spatial and temporal scale are an intractable part of defining stability. Connell & Sousa 404 405 (1983) argued that experimental tests of stability require long term experiments where 'the fate of all adults of the population or community must either be followed for a minimal period 406 407 of at least one complete turnover, or their replacement probabilities estimated' (p.808). Others disagree (Peterson 1984, Sutherland 1990) and over the last decade or so Petraitis and 408 co-workers (e.g. Petraitis & Latham 1999, Petraitis & Dudgeon 2005, Petraitis et al. 2009) 409 have implemented manipulations which although long term by the standards of this review do 410 not reach the temporal standards defined by Connell & Sousa (1983). The possibility that 411 412 mussel beds and stands of Ascophyllum nodosum represent alternative states in sheltered bays of the Gulf of Maine was tested through initiating pulse disturbances (clearance of the 413 414 Ascophyllum canopy) of different sizes and monitoring successional pathways over a nine year period (Petraitis et al. 2009). The shift from Ascophyllum assemblage to mussel bed in 415 37% of large clearances, nine years after disturbance, is argued by Petraitis et al. (2009) to 416 show that these communities represent multiple stable states on the intertidal shore of the Gulf 417 418 of Maine. They go on to present a conceptual framework which combines this view with the prevailing paradigm of environmentally driven consumer control (Lubchenco & Menge 1978, 419 420 Bertness et al. 2002). Irrespective of tests of ecological theory, investigation of how the scale of disturbance affects successional trajectory clearly requires a long term approach in this 421 environment at least, as evidenced by the diversity of successional responses among clearing 422 sizes and sites over a six year period (Petraitis & Dudgeon 2005). 423

424

425 <u>Natural perturbations and Marine Protected Areas</u>

426 The majority of ecological experimentation involves small scale, controlled manipulation, which, if of sufficient duration, may give insight into the time scale of recovery of marine 427 428 communities following perturbation. However, Schiel and Lilley (2011) point out the 429 limitation of such approaches in understanding recovery at coast-wide scales, where propagule supply may be limiting. Underwood (1998, p.292) makes a cogent argument to 430 'grab opportunities afforded by dramatic events, such as unusually severe weather and large-431 scale changes brought about by natural agents' to enable a longer term and larger scale 432 approach to ecology. Observations, over temporal and spatial scales well beyond standard 433 controlled experiments following mass die-offs (Levitan 1988, Linares et al. 2005), large 434 disturbance events such as ice scour (McCook & Chapman 1997), storms (Hughes 1989, 435 Underwood 1998), earthquakes (Castilla 1988), human management intervention (Hughes et 436 al. 2009) and pollution (Southward & Southward 1978) have created insight into ecological 437 processes. McCook and Chapman (1997) assessed the impacts of large scale ice scouring on 438 439 exposed rocky shores in Nova Scotia over a 5 year period, and showed that many experimental effects noted over shorter time scales (McCook & Chapman 1991,1992) were 440 441 not apparent after longer periods, suggesting that much of the variation within the exposed shore habitat is temporary. They also argue that the temporal dominance of *Fucus* observed 442 443 over mussels over a 5 year period, and no evidence of competitive superiority by mussels, 444 should lead to caution in assuming any general applicability of previously stated general 445 models of community structure based on the work of Menge and Sutherland (1976, 1987). Such conclusions, based on long term observations following large scale perturbations, 446 447 present a cautionary note to basing environmental management advice on a theoretical 448 framework based predominantly on the short term and small scale. Underwood (1998) makes the point that observations following disturbance can give rise to hypotheses regarding 449 450 mechanisms which can then be tested through small scale, shorter term experiments. He observed variable rates of recovery in the canopy alga Hormosira banksii over a seven year 451 period following an extremely large storm and then used short term experimental 452 453 manipulations to test two alternative models: 1) that the rate of recovery was a function of the severity of disturbance; 2) recovery was determined by the activities of grazers. A similar 454 combined approach was taken by Carroll and Highsmith (1996). A severe freeze in Alaska 455 coincided with a spring low tide series leading to high levels of mussel mortality, but little 456

- 457 effect on the mussels' principal predator *Nucella lima* which winters in the sub-tidal. A
- 458 combination of observations over 3 years and experimental manipulations demonstrated that
- 459 the extreme event *set the framework for a shift in balance of the interaction* between
- 460 predator and prey (Carroll & Highsmith 1996, p.130). In the presence of high numbers of *N*.
- 461 *lima*, mussels were unable to recover over a 3 year period despite annual recruitment events.

462 One type of 'experiment' in coastal marine environments which by its nature tends to be long term is the implementation of Marine Protected Areas (MPA's). By totally or partially 463 excluding the extractive activities of humans (Sciberras et al. 2015) MPA's establish a 464 (usually) large scale experiment (Castilla 1999, Diaz et al. 2003) which can be used for 465 understanding long-term dynamics (Castilla 2000) and has led to enormous ecological insight 466 467 in coastal marine systems, particularly into the prevalence, time scale and magnitude of trophic cascades (reviewed by Castilla 1999). For example in Chile, Duran and Castilla 468 (1989) report the results of a five year study of the consequences of exclusion of human food 469 gatherers from the rocky intertidal and shallow sub-tidal at Las Cruces in central Chile. The 470 cessation of human exploitation of the carnivorous muricid gastropod Concholepas 471 472 concholepas or 'loco' led to significant enhancement of its density and consequent strong predatory control of previously dominating mussels. These cascading effects resulted in an 473 elevation of intertidal diversity and subsequent domination by barnacles. 474

The majority of marine reserves or protected areas are established to protect fisheries-targeted 475 476 species, including benthic organisms such as lobsters, scallops, abalone and the Chilean 'loco'. Such organisms are generally long lived relative to the majority of benthic organisms 477 478 studied in perturbation experiments. Because the focus of MPA studies has often been to 479 establish effects on these relatively long lived target species (e.g. Duran & Castilla 1989, 480 Hoskin et al. 2011), and because the temporal scale of the press manipulation (reduction or 481 elimination of human disturbance) is not limited by the normal drivers of ecological experimentation (e.g. researchers funds), it is not surprising that published studies of MPAs 482 are often long term. Harvested species may show a significant lag in response (e.g. Beukers-483 484 Stewart et al. 2005), but benthic prey may also show many years to respond to enhanced predation. For example sea urchins can take many years to respond to changes in predator 485 numbers, (e.g. 13 years in New Zealand, 7 years, in Tasmania, 15 years in Kenya; see 486 487 Babcock et al. 2010 and references therein). Thus indirect effects on organisms that occur through cascading trophic interactions can take substantially longer to develop than direct 488 effects (Babcock et al. 2010). This observation may explain why species assemblages in 489

older reserves often differ from recently created reserves (Micheli et al. 2004) and could lead
to failure to identify trophic cascades owing to a lack of sufficient temporal scale (Shears &
Babcock 2003).

493 The large scale, uncontrolled nature of MPA experiments can lead to considerable insight into 494 the nature of the relationship between environmental and biotic drivers of community state 495 when observations are conducted over sufficient time scale (Babcock et al. 2010, Fraschetti et al. 2013). Fraschetti et al. (2013, p.11) consider a long term approach is essential because 496 *'ecological components may respond differently and over varying temporal scales'*. They 497 used a nine year series of observations inside and outside an MPA in SE Italy to examine the 498 role of protection in determining temporal and spatial variability. They showed that protected 499 500 assemblages, with relatively long lived invertebrates and macroalgae, displayed spatial and temporal homogeneity in marked contrast to a mosaic of changing disturbed patches outside 501 502 the MPA. Thus, at a local scale, protection enhanced community stability. However, there were also a number of idiosyncratic results, where the effects of protection did not match 503 expectations. Here, it is likely that multiple processes, some derived from variation in 504 505 environmental context, were acting simultaneously. Similarly Shears and Babcock (2003) demonstrated long term effects (25 years) of protection in a trophic cascade in the Leigh 506 marine reserve in New Zealand mediated through the decline of urchins. However, urchin 507 508 decline was also observed over the short term (possibly as a consequence of disease) at some 509 unprotected sites.

Studies of the effect of protection from human disturbance are often made at a single point in 510 511 time through comparison of protected and unprotected sites, often many years after 512 establishment of the protection regime. Although suffering from difficulties in firmly 513 ascribing observed spatial differences to protection effects (Underwood 1991), these studies 514 are logistically relatively easy to implement and can (limitations accepted) give important long term insight. For example Mumby et al. (2006) sampled fish and benthic assemblages of 515 Caribbean reef systems 18 years after implementation of a fishing ban. A net doubling of 516 grazing pressure from parrot fishes in protected areas led to a four-fold reduction in 517 macroalgal cover (Mumby et al. 2006) and consequently a two fold increase in coral 518 519 recruitment (Mumby et al. 2007). Clearly such observations tell us nothing of the rate of 520 change in fish or benthic assemblages, nor the temporal dynamic between interacting species, but does demonstrate the strong top down control exerted by key fish consumers in supporting 521 the health of Caribbean coral reefs. As a note of caution to accepting conclusions based on 522

such an approach, a review of six time series studies showed that increases in target species
following protection were not always as high as expected on the basis of studies with no
temporal replication (Babcock et al. 2010). Thus, understanding how communities change
through time following protection is likely to lead to a far greater mechanistic understanding
of protection effects.

528

529 **Conclusions**

It is clear from our review of experimental duration over 33 years, that the majority of 530 531 manipulative experiments in benthic systems, examining community or population responses of macro-organisms, are reasonably short (two years or less). It is also clear, from reviewing 532 533 a range of experiments operating over a longer time scale, that a long term approach can yield considerable insight, and in many cases alter conclusions based on the same experiments 534 535 conducted over shorter time scales. Thus we argue that although many short studies will be perfectly valid, in general, increasing the period over which observations are made following 536 experimental manipulations will yield important benefits. 537

Limitations on the temporal extent of marine benthic experiments are numerous, and range 538 from the logistical to considerations of motive and reward. Raffaelli and Moller (2000) 539 showed through interviews of experimentalists that decisions regarding duration of field 540 experiments were predominantly pragmatic. Temporal scale was often based on the time 541 available in a studentship, or grant, or the difficulties of maintaining the experiment in a 542 hostile environment. However, there are a number of simple, practical approaches that can be 543 implemented to lengthen experimental duration. First and foremost when planning 544 545 manipulative field experiments Diaz et al. (2003) stress the need for foresight and the acquisition of long-term funding where possible. However, extending sampling regimes may 546 547 not necessarily be costly. A common approach where the temporal scale has been extended is to sample at regular intervals over the first year or so of an experiment and then sample at 548 549 much lower frequencies over a number of years (e.g. Jenkins et al. 2004, Viejo 2009). 550 Extending an experiment over multiple years generally requires some foresight in 551 experimental establishment (e.g. use of secure, non corrosive, preferably stainless steel, markers and a mapping system of spatial replicates which can be utilised by persons other 552 553 than the original experimenter), plus the motivation to revisit experimental sites over multiple

years. This can be achieved long after the original experimenter (e.g. student, post-doctoralscientist) has moved on to new pastures.

556

In promoting a longer term approach to experimentation it is reasonable to consider the role 557 558 of reviewers and editors. Working over an appropriate temporal scale to address the question 559 posed is an integral part of experimental design and hence should be considered as an issue ranking in importance alongside appropriate replication and independence of sampling units. 560 Whether it currently is, or not, is debatable. That may be because the question is much less 561 tangible. It is always likely that extending an experiment will give additional insight but the 562 cost-benefit relationship of extended monitoring for potentially marginal gains is probably 563 complex and difficult to pin down. However, it is clear from the review of long term studies 564 above, that an increased mechanistic understanding of marine ecological processes can be 565 gained from a longer term approach and understanding the longer-term consequences of 566 impacts on benthic systems is a crucial part of determining management options in the face of 567 global change. 568

569

570 Acknowledgements

- 571 This work was supported by a Brazilian FAPESP Visiting Researcher grant to the first author.
- 572 Facilities were kindly supplied by the Departamento de Ciências do Mar, Universidade
- 573 Federal de São Paulo Campus Baixada Santista, Brazil. The manuscript was much
- improved by the comments of five anonymous reviewers.
- 575
- 576

577 **References**

- Aberg P (1992) Size based demography of the seaweed *Ascophyllum nodosum* in stochastic
 environments. Ecology 73:1488-1501
- Aberg P, Pavia H (1997) Temporal and multiple scale variation in juvenile and adult
 abundance of the brown alga *Ascophyllum nodosum*. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 158:111-119
- Araújo RM, Sousa-Pinto I, Serrão EA, Åberg P (2012) Recovery after trampling disturbance
 in a canopy-forming seaweed population. Mar Biol 159:697–707

Babcock RC, Shears NT, Alcala AC, Barrett NS, Edgar GJ, Lafferty KD, McClanahan TR, 584 Russ GR (2010) Decadal trends in marine reserves reveal differential rates of change 585 in direct and indirect effects. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 107:18256-18261 586 Barnes DKA (1996) Low levels of colonisation in Antarctica: the role of bryozoans in early 587 community development. In: Gordon D, Smith A, Grant-Mackie A (eds) Bryozoans in 588 space and time. National Institute of Water & Atmospheric Research Ltd. Wellington, 589 p 19–28 590 591 Benedetti-Cecchi L (2003) The importance of the variance around the mean effect size of ecological processes. Ecology 84:2335-2346 592 Bertness MD, Callaway R (1994) Positive interactions in communities. Trends Ecol Evol 593 9:191-193 594 Bertness MD, Trussell GC, Ewanchuk PJ, Silliman BR (2002) Do alternate stable community 595 states exist in the Gulf of Maine rocky intertidal zone? Ecology 83:3434-3448 596 Beuchel F, Gulliksen B (2008) Temporal patterns of benthic community development in an 597 Arctic fjord (Kongsfjorden, Svalbard): results of a 24-year manipulation study. Polar 598 Biology 31:913-924 599 Beukers-Stewart BD, Vause BJ, Mosley MWJ, Rossetti HL, Brand AR (2005) Benefits of 600 closed area protection for a population of scallops. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 298:189–204, 601 Broitman BR, Navarrete SA, Smith F, Gaines SD (2001) Geographic variation of 602 southeastern Pacific intertidal communities. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 224:21-34 603 Carroll ML, Highsmith RC (1996) Role of catastrophic disturbance in mediating Nucella-604 Mytilus interactions in the Alaskan rocky intertidal. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 138:125-133 605 606 Castilla JC (1988) Earthquake-caused coastal uplift and its effects on rocky intertidal kelp communities. Science 242:440-443 607 608 Castilla JC (1999) Coastal marine communities: trends and perspectives from humanexclusion experiments. Trends Ecol Evol 14:280-283 609 Castilla JC (2000) Roles of experimental marine ecology in coastal management and 610 611 conservation. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 250:3-21 Castilla JC, Bustamante R (1989) Human exclusion from rocky intertidal of Las-Cruces, 612 central Chile - effects on Durvillaea-antarctica (Phaeophyta, durvilleales). Mar Ecol 613 Prog Ser 50:203-214 614 Cervin G, Aberg P, Jenkins SR (2005) Small-scale disturbance in a stable canopy dominated 615 community: implications for macroalgal recruitment and growth. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 616 305:31-40 617 618 Chapman MG (2013) Constructing replacement habitat for specialist and generalist molluscsthe effect of patch size. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 473:201-214 619 Coleman RA, Underwood AJ, Benedetti-Cecchi L, Aberg P, Arenas F, Arrontes J, Castro J, 620 Hartnoll RG, Jenkins SR, Paula J, Della Santina P, Hawkins SJ (2006) A continental 621 scale evaluation of the role of limpet grazing on rocky shores. Oecologia 147:556-564 622 623 Connell JH (1961) The influence of interspecific competition and other factors on the distribution of the barnacle Chthamalus stellatus. Ecology 42:710-723 624 Connell JH (1972). Community interactions on marine rocky intertidal shores. Annu Rev Ecol 625 Syst 3: 169-192 626 Connell JH, Slayter RO (1977) Mechanisms of succession in natural communities and their 627 628 role in community stability and organization. Am Nat 111:1119-1144

Connell JH, Sousa WP (1983) On the evidence needed to judge ecological stability or 629 persistence Am Nat 121:789-824 630 Connell SD (2005) Assembly and maintenance of subtidal habitat heterogeneity: synergistic 631 effects of light penetration and sedimentation. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 289:53-61 632 Connell SD, Foster MS, Airoldi L (2014) What are algal turfs? Toward a better 633 understanding of turfs. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 495:299-307 634 Connolly SR, Roughgarden J (1998) A latitudinal gradient in northeast Pacific intertidal 635 community structure: Evidence for an oceanographically based synthesis of marine 636 community theory. Am Nat 151:311-326 637 Crowe TP, Bracken MES, O'Connor NE (2012) Reality check: issues of scale and abstraction 638 in biodiversity research and potential solutions. In: Solan M, Aspden R, Paterson D 639 (eds) Marine biodiversity and ecosystem functioning: frameworks, methodologies and 640 integration. Oxford University Press Oxford 641 Davis AR, Ward DW (2009) Establishment and persistence of species-rich patches in a 642 species-poor landscape: role of a structure-forming sub-tidal barnacle. Mar Ecol Prog 643 Ser 380:187-198 644 Dayton PK (1975) Experimental evaluation of ecological dominance in a rocky intertidal 645 algal community. Ecol Monogr 45:137-159 646 Dayton PK (1989) Inter-decadal variation in an Antarctic sponge and its predators from 647 oceanographic climate shifts. Science 245:1484–1486 648 Dayton PK, Oliver JS (1977) Antarctic soft-bottom benthos in oligotrophic and eutrophic 649 environments. Science 197:55-58 650 Diaz S, Symstad AJ, Chapin FS, Wardle DA, Huenneke LF (2003) Functional diversity 651 revealed by removal experiments. Trends Ecol Evol 18:140-146 652 Duffy JE, Stachowicz JJ, Bruno JF (2012) Multi-trophic biodiversity and the responses of 653 marine ecosystems to global change In: Solan M, Aspden R, Paterson D (eds) Marine 654 biodiversity and ecosystem functioning: frameworks, methodologies and integration. 655 Oxford University Press, Oxford 656 Duran LR, Castilla JC (1989) Variation and persistence of the middle rocky intertidal 657 community of central Chile, with and without human harvesting. Mar Biol 103:555-658 562 659 Dye AH (1998) Community-level analyses of long-term changes in rocky littoral fauna from 660 South Africa. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 164:47-57 661 Ellis J, Schneider DC (2008) Spatial and temporal scaling in benthic ecology. J Exp Mar Biol 662 Ecol 366:92-98 663 Farrell TM (1988) Community stability: effects of limpet removal and reintroduction in a 664 rocky intertidal community. Oecologia 75:190-197 665 Feldman KL, Armstrong DA, Eggleston DB, Dumbauld BR (1997) Effects of substrate 666 selection and post-settlement survival on recruitment success of the thalassinidean 667 668 shrimp Neotrypaea californiensis to inter-tidal shell and mud habitats. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 150:121-136 669 Fraschetti S, Guarnieri G, Bevilacqua S, Terlizzi A, Boero F (2013) Protection enhances 670 671 community and habitat stability: evidence from a Mediterranean marine protected area. Plos ONE 8(12): e81838. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0081838 672 Goodsell PJ, Connell SD (2005) Historical configuration of habitat influences the effects of 673 674 disturbance on mobile invertebrates. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 299:79-87

675 676	Grant DL, Clarke PJ, Allaway WG (1993) The response of grey mangrove (<i>Avicennia marina</i> (Forsk.) Vierh.) seedlings to spills of crude oil. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 171: 273-295.
677 678	Green DS, Crowe TP (2013) Physical and biological effects of introduced oysters on biodiversity in an intertidal boulder field. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 482:119-132
679 680	Holmes NJ, Harriott VJ, Banks SA (1997) Latitudinal variation in patterns of colonisation of cryptic calcareous marine organisms. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 155:103-113
681	 Hooper DU, Chapin FS, Ewel JJ, Hector A, Inchausti P, Lavorel S, Lawton JH, Lodge DM,
682	Loreau M, Naeem S, Schmid B, Setala H, Symstad AJ, Vandermeer J, Wardle DA
683	(2005) Effects of biodiversity on ecosystem functioning: A consensus of current
684	knowledge. Ecol Monogr 75:3-35
685	Hoskin MG, Coleman RA, von Carlshausen E, Davis CM (2011) Variable population
686	responses by large decapod crustaceans to the establishment of a temperate marine no-
687	take zone. Can J Fish Aquat Sci 68:185-200
688 689	Hughes TP Community structure and diversity of coral reefs: the role of history. Ecology 70: 275-279
690	Hughes RG, Fletcher PW, Hardy MJ (2009) Successional development of saltmarsh in two
691	managed realignment areas in SE England, and prospects for saltmarsh restoration.
692	Mar Ecol Prog Ser 384:13-22
693 694 695	Incera M, Bertocci I, Benedetti-Cecchi L (2010) Effects of mean intensity and temporal variability of disturbance on the invasion of <i>Caulerpa racemosa</i> var. cylindracea (Caulerpales) in rock pools. Biol Inv 12:501-514
696 697	Incera M, Olabarria C, Troncoso JS, Lopez J (2009) Response of the invader <i>Sargassum muticum</i> to variability in nutrient supply. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 377:91-101
698	Ingolfsson A, Hawkins SJ (2008) Slow recovery from disturbance: a 20 year study of
699	<i>Ascophyllum</i> canopy clearances. J Mar Biol Assoc UK 88:689-691
700 701	Jacobs R (1980) Effects of the Amoco-Cadiz oil-spill on the seagrass community at Roscoff with special reference to the benthic infauna. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 2:207-212
702	Jenkins SR (2009) Settlement and recruitment In: M W (ed) Marine Hard Bottom
703	Communities: Patterns, Dynamics, Diversity and Change. Springer, Verlag
704	Jenkins SR, Arenas F, Arrontes J, Bussell J, Castro J, Coleman RA, Hawkins SJ, Kay S,
705	Martinez B, Oliveros J, Roberts MF, Sousa S, Thompson RC, Hartnoll RG (2001)
706	European-scale analysis of seasonal variability in limpet grazing activity and
707	microalgal abundance. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 211:193-203
708	Jenkins SR, Coleman RA, Della Santina P, Hawkins SJ, Burrows MT, Hartnoll RG (2005)
709	Regional scale differences in the determinism of grazing effects in the rocky intertidal.
710	Mar Ecol Prog Ser 287:77-86
711	Jenkins SR, Hawkins SJ, Norton TA (1999a) Direct and indirect effects of a macroalgal
712	canopy and limpet grazing in structuring a sheltered inter-tidal community. Mar Ecol
713	Prog Ser 188:81-92
714	Jenkins SR, Norton TA, Hawkins SJ (1999b) Interactions between canopy forming algae in
715	the eulittoral zone of sheltered rocky shores on the Isle of Man. J Mar Biol Assoc UK
716	79:341-349
717 718	Jenkins SR, Norton TA, Hawkins SJ (2004) Long term effects of <i>Ascophyllum nodosum</i> canopy removal on mid shore community structure. J Mar Biol Assoc UK 84:327-329
719 720	Jewett EB, Hines AH, Ruiz GM (2005) Epifaunal disturbance by periodic low levels of dissolved oxygen: native vs. invasive species response. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 304:31-44

- Kaehler S, Williams GA (1997) Do factors influencing recruitment ultimately determine the
 distribution and abundance of encrusting algae on seasonal tropical shores? Mar Ecol
 Prog Ser 156:87-96
- Keough MJ, Downes BJ (1982) Recruitment of marine-invertebrates the role of active larval
 choices and early mortality. Oecologia 54:348-352
- Kilar JA, McLachlan J (1989) Effects of wave exposure on the community structure of a
 plant-dominated, fringing-reef platform intermediate disturbance and disturbance mediated competition. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 54:265-276
- Konar B (2007) Recolonization of a high latitude hard-bottom nearshore community. Polar
 Biology 30:663–667
- Leonard GH (1999) Positive and negative effects of intertidal algal canopies on recruitment
 and survival of barnacles. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 178:241-249
- Levin S (1992) The problem of pattern and scale in ecology. Ecology 72:1943-1967
- Levitan DR (1988) Algal-urchin biomass responses following mass mortality of *Diadema antillarum* Philippi at Saint John, U.S. Virgin Islands. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol
 119:167-178
- Lewontin RC (1969) The meaning of stability. In: Woodwell G, Smith H (eds) Diversity and
 stability in ecological systems. Brookhaven National Laboratory, Upton, NY., p 12-24
- Linares C, Coma R, Diaz D, Zabala M, Hereu B, Dantart L (2005) Immediate and delayed
 effects of a mass mortality event on gorgonian population dynamics and benthic
 community structure in the NW Mediterranean Sea. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 305:127-137
- Lindegarth M, Aberg P, Cervin G, Nilsson PG (2001) Effects of grazing on the structure of
 mid-shore, inter-tidal assemblages on moderately exposed rocky shores of the
 Swedish west coast. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 212:29-38
- Lubchenco J, Menge BA (1978) Community development and persistence in a low rocky
 intertidal zone. Ecol Monogr 48:67-94
- Maggi E, Bertocci I, Vaselli S, Benedetti-Cecchi L (2009) Effects of changes in number,
 identity and abundance of habitat-forming species on assemblages of rocky seashores.
 Mar Ecol Prog Ser 381:39-49
- Maggi E, Bulleri F, Bertocci I, Benedetti-Cecchi L (2012) Competitive ability of macroalgal
 canopies overwhelms the effects of variable regimes of disturbance. Mar Ecol Prog
 Ser 465:99-109
- McCook, LJ Chapman ARO (1991) Community succession following massive ice scour on
 an exposed rocky shore : effects of *Fucus* canopy algae and of mussels during late
 succession. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 154:137-169
- McCook LJ, Chapman ARO (1992) Vegetative regeneration of *Fucus* rockweed canopy as a
 mechanism of secondary succession on an exposed rocky shore. Bot Mar 35:35-
- McCook LJ, Chapman ARO (1997) Patterns and variations in natural succession following
 massive ice-scour of a rocky intertidal seashore. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 214:121-147
- Menge BA (1997) Detection of direct versus indirect effects: Were experiments long enough?
 Am Nat 149:801-823
- Menge BA, Daley BA, Wheeler PA, Dahlhoff E, Sanford E, Strub PT (1997) Benthic-pelagic
 links and rocky intertidal communities: Bottom-up effects on top-down control? Proc
 Natl Acad Sci USA 94:14530-14535
- Menge BA, Lubchenco J, Bracken MES, Chan F, Foley MM, Freidenburg TL, Gaines SD,
 Hudson G, Krenz C, Leslie H, Menge DNL, Russell R, Webster MS (2003) Coastal

767 768	oceanography sets the pace of rocky intertidal community dynamics. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 100:12229-12234
769	Menge BA, Sanford E, Daley BA, Freidenburg TL, Hudson G, Lubchenco J (2002) Inter-
770	hemispheric comparison of bottom-up effects on community structure: Insights
771	revealed using the comparative-experimental approach. Ecol Res 17:1-16
772 773	Menge BA, Sutherland JP (1976) Species diversity gradients: synthesis of the roles of predation, competition and temporal heterogeneity. Am Nat 110:351-369
774	Menge BA, Sutherland JP (1987) Community regulation: Variation in disturbance,
775	competition and predation in relation to environmental stress and recruitment. Am Nat
776	130:730-757
777 778	Methratta ET, Petraitis PS (2008) Propagation of scale-dependent effects from recruits to adults in barnacles and seaweeds. Ecology 89:3128-3137
779 780	Micheli F, Halpern BS, Botsford LW, Warner RR (2004) Trajectories and correlates of community change in no-take marine reserves. Ecol Appl 14:1709–1723
781	Miller MW, Valdivia A, Kramer KL, Mason B, Williams DE, Johnston L (2009) Alternate
782	benthic assemblages on reef restoration structures and cascading effects on coral
783	settlement. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 387:147-156
784	Minchinton TE, Fels KJ (2013) Sediment disturbance associated with trampling by humans
785	alters species assemblages on a rocky intertidal seashore. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 472:129-
786	140
787	Mumby PJ, Dahlgren CP, Harborne AR, Kappel CV, Micheli F, Brumbaugh DR, Holmes KE,
788	Mendes JM, Broad K, Sanchirico JN, Buch K, Box S, Stoffle RW, Gill AB (2006)
789	Fishing, trophic cascades, and the process of grazing on coral reefs. Science 311:98-
790	101
791	Mumby PJ, Harborne AR, Williams J, Kappel CV, Brumbaugh DR, Micheli F, Holmes KE,
792	Dahlgren CP, Paris CB, Blackwell PG (2007) Trophic cascade facilitates coral
793	recruitment in a marine reserve. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 104:8362-8367
794 795	Naeem S (2008) Advancing realism in biodiversity research. Trends in Ecology and Evolution 23:414-416
796 797	Nelson WG (1981) Experimental studies of decapod and fish predation on seagrass macrobenthos. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 5:141-149
798 799	O'Connor NE, Crowe TP (2005) Biodiversity loss and ecosystem functioning: Distinguishing between number and identity of species. Ecology 86:1783-1796
800	Oliveira JP, Sousa-Pinto I, Weber GM, Bertocci I (2014) Interplay of experimental harvesting
801	and climate-related disturbance on benthic assemblages of rocky seashores. Mar Ecol
802	Prog Ser 495:131-142
803	Paine RT (1966) Food web complexity and species diversity. Am Nat 100:65-75
804	Paine, R. (1977). Controlled manipulations in the marine intertidal zone and their
805	contributions to ecological theory. In: Goulden CE (ed) Changing scenes in natural
806	sciences 1776-1976. Academy of Natural Sciences, Philadelphia, PA, 245-270.
807 808 809	Paine RT (1994) Marine rocky shores and community ecology: an experimentalist's perspective. In: Kinne O. (ed.) Excellence in Ecology 4. Ecology Institute, D-21385 Oldendorf/Luhe, Germany
810	Paine RT, Castillo JC, Cancino J (1985) Perturbation and recovery patterns of starfish-
811	dominated intertidal assemblages in Chile, New Zealand, and Washington State. Am
812	Nat 125:679-691

Peterson CH (1984) Does a rigorous criterion for environmental identity preclude the 813 existence of multiple stable points? Am Nat 124:127-133 814 Petraitis PS, Dudgeon SR (2004) Detection of alternative stable states in marine communities. 815 J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 300:343-371 816 Petraitis PS, Dudgeon SR (2005) Divergent succession and implications for alternative states 817 on rocky intertidal shores. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 326:14 – 26 818 819 Petraitis PS, Latham RE (1999) The importance of scale in testing the origins of alternative community states. Ecology 80: 429 - 442 820 Petraitis PS, Methratta ET, Rhile EC, Vidargas NA, Dudgeon SR (2009) Experimental 821 confirmation of multiple community states in a marine ecosystem. Oecologia 161:139-822 148 823 Raffaelli DG (2006) Biodiversity and ecosystem functioning: issues of scale and trophic 824 complexity. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 311:285-294 825 Raffaelli DG, Hawkins SJ (1996) Intertidal ecology. Chapman and Hall, London 826 Raffaelli DG, Moller H (2000) Manipulative experiments in animal ecology-Do they promise 827 more than they can deliver? Adv Ecol Res 30:299-330 828 Reinhardt JF, Whitlatch RB, Osman RW (2013) Effects of temperature on the recruitment 829 phenology and niche overlap of shallow epifaunal assemblages in southern New 830 England. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 489:61-74 831 Ruiz JM, Romero J (2001) Effects of in situ experimental shading on the Mediterranean 832 seagrass Posidonia oceanica. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 215:107-120 833 834 Russell BD, Connell SD (2005) A novel interaction between nutrients and grazers alters relative dominance of marine habitats. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 289:5-11 835 Sanford E (1999) Regulation of keystone predation by small changes in ocean temperature. 836 Science 283:2095-2097 837 Scheffer M, Carpenter S, Foley JA, Folke C, Walker B (2001) Catastrophic shifts in 838 ecosystems. Nature 413:591 - 596 839 Schiel DR, Lilley SA (2011) Impacts and negative feedbacks in community recovery over 840 eight years following removal of habitat-forming macroalgae. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 841 842 407:108-115 Schneider DC (2001) The rise of the concept of scale in ecology. Bioscience 51:545-553 843 Sciberras M, Jenkins SR, Kaiser MJ, Hawkins SJ, Pullin AS (2015) Evaluating the relative 844 conservation value of partially and fully protected marine reserves. Fish and Fisheries 845 16: 58–77 846 847 Shears NT, Babcock RC (2003) Continuing trophic cascade effects after 25 years of no take marine reserve protection. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 246:1-16 848 Simenstad CA, Estes JA, Kenyon KW (1978) Aleuts, sea otters, and alternate stable state 849 communities. Science 200:403-411 850 851 Southward AJ, Southward EC (1978) Recolonization of rocky shores in Cornwall after use of toxic dispersants to clean up the Torrey Canyon spill. J Fish Res Board Can 35:682-852 706 853 Spivak AC, Canuel EA, Duffy JE, Douglass JG, Richardson JP (2009) Epifaunal community 854 composition and nutrient addition alter sediment organic matter composition in a 855 natural eelgrass Zostera marina bed: a field experiment. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 376:55-67 856

857 858 859	Stachowicz JJ, Bracken MES, Graham M (2008b) Complementarity in marine biodiversity manipulations: reconciling divergent evidence from field and mesocosm experiments. Proc Natl Acad Sci 105:18842-18847
860 861 862	Stachowicz JJ, Graham M, Bracken MES, Szoboszlai AI (2008a) Diversity enhances cover and stability of seaweed assemblages: the role of heterogeneity and time. Ecology 89:3008–3019
863 864	Sutherland JP (1990) Perturbations, resistance and alternative views of the existence of multiple stable points in nature. Am Nat 136:270-275
865 866	Sutherland JP, Karlson RH (1977) Development and stability of fouling community at Beaufort, North-Carolina. Ecol Monogr 47:425-446
867 868	Tait LW, Schiel DR (2011) Legacy effects of canopy disturbance on ecosystem functioning in macroalgal assemblages. PloS ONE DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0026986
869 870 871	Tegner MJ, Dayton PK, Edwards PB, Riser KL (1997) Large-scale, low-frequency oceanographic effects on kelp forest succession: A tale of two cohorts. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 146:117-134
872 873 874	Underwood AJ (1991) Beyond BACI: Experimental designs for detecting human environmental impacts on temporal variations in natural populations. Aust J Mar Freshwat Res 42:569-587
875 876 877	Underwood AJ (1998) Grazing and disturbance: an experimental analysis of patchiness in recovery from a severe storm by the intertidal alga <i>Hormosira banksii</i> on rocky shores in New South Wales. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 231:291-306
878 879	Underwood AJ (2000) Experimental ecology of rocky intertidal habitats: what are we learning? J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 250:51-76
880 881 882	Valdivia N, Heidemann A, Thiel M, Molis M, Wahl M (2005) Effects of disturbance on the diversity of hard-bottom macrobenthic communities on the coast of Chile. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 299:45-54
883 884	Van De Koppel J, Herman PMJ, Thoolen P, Heip CHR (2001) Do alternate stable states occur in natural ecosystems? Evidence from a tidal flat. Ecology 82:3449 - 3461
885 886	Viejo RM (2009) Resilience in intertidal rocky shore assemblages across the stress gradient created by emersion times. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 390:55-65
887	Wiens JA (1989) Spatial scaling in ecology Func Ecol 3:385-397
888	Yodzis P (1988) The indeterminacy of ecological interactions as perceived through
889 890	perturbation experiments Ecology 09.508-515
891	
892	
893	



899 Figure 1 Frequency histogram indicating the distribution of experimental study duration in





Figure 2 Box plot showing the duration of manipulative experiments over the nine periods
examined and for all periods combined in (A) marine journals and (B) ecological journals.
Boxes indicate the median (horizontal line) and the 25th and 75th percentiles; whiskers indicate
the 10th and 90th percentile and black dots the outliers. Number of independent experiments
included in the analysis indicated in brackets beneath each year.





916 Figure 3 Box plots showing median study duration (and 10th, 25th, 75th and 90th percentiles)

917 for comparisons among A) press (n=219) and pulse (n=133) studies and B) intertidal (n= 175)

918 and sub-tidal (n=177) studies