

Successional convergence in experimentally disturbed intertidal communities

Martins, Gustavo M.; Arenas, Francisco; Tuya, Fernando; Ramirez, Ruben; Neto, Ana Isabel; Jenkins, Stuart

Oecologia

DOI: 10.1007/s00442-017-4022-1

Published: 01/02/2018

Peer reviewed version

Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication

Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA): Martins, G. M., Arenas, F., Tuya, F., Ramirez, R., Neto, A. I., & Jenkins, S. (2018). Successional convergence in experimentally disturbed intertidal communities. *Oecologia*, *186*(2), 507-516. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00442-017-4022-1

Hawliau Cyffredinol / General rights Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

· Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.

- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
 You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

	Successional convergence in experimentally disturbed intertidal communities					
2						
	Gustavo M. Martins ^{1,2*} , Francisco Arenas ³ , Fernando Tuya ⁴ , Rubén Ramírez ⁴ , Ana I.					
4	Neto ^{1,2} , Stuart R. Jenkins ⁵					
ć						
6	1 Faculdade de Ciências e Tecnologia, Departamento de Biologia, Universidade dos					
	Açores, 9501–801 Ponta Delgada, Açores, Portugal.					
8	2 cE3c – Centre for Ecology, Evolution and Environmental Changes/Azorean					
	Biodiversity Group, 9501-801 Ponta Delgada, Açores, Portugal.					
10	3 Interdisciplinary Centre of Marine and Environmental Research (CIIMAR) University					
	of Porto, Terminal de Cruzeiros do Porto de Leixões					
12	Av. General Norton de Matos s/n 4450-208 Matosinhos, Portugal.					
	4 Grupo en Biodiversidad y Conservación, IU-ECOAQUA, Universidad de Las Palmas de					
14	Gran Canaria, Las Palmas, 35017, Canary Islands, Spain.					
	5 School of Ocean Sciences, Bangor University, Menai Bridge, Anglesey, UK.					
16						
	* Corresponding author:					
18	Email: gustavo.om.martins@uac.pt					
	Tel: +351 296 650 101					
20	Fax: +351 296 650 100					
22	Author contributions:					
	GMM, FA and SRJ conceived and designed the experiment. GMM, FA, FT, RR and AIN					

24 performed the experiment. GMM analysed the data and wrote the manuscript with contribution from FA, FT, RR, AIN and SRJ.

26 **ABSTRACT.**

Determining the causes of variation in community assembly is a central question in

- 28 ecology. Analysis of β-diversity can provide insight by relating the extent of regional to local variation in diversity, allowing inference of the relative importance of
- 30 deterministic *versus* stochastic processes. We investigated the effects of disturbance timing on community assembly at three distinct regions with varying environmental
- 32 conditions: Northern Portugal, Azores and Canaries. On the lower rocky intertidal, quadrats were experimentally cleared of biota at three distinct times of the year and
- 34 community assembly followed for one year. Similar levels of α and γ -diversity were found in all regions, which remained constant throughout succession. When Jaccard
- 36 (incidence-based) and Bray-Curtis (abundance-based) metrics were used, β-diversity
 (the mean dissimilarity among plots cleared at the different times) was larger during
- early stages of community assembly, but decreased over time. The adaptation of theRaup Crick's metric, which accounts for changes in species richness, showed that the
- 40 structure of assemblages disturbed at different times of the year was similar to the null model of random community assembly during early stages of succession, but became
- 42 more similar than expected by chance. This pattern was observed in all regions despite differences in the regional species pool, suggesting that priority effects are likely weak
- 44 and deterministic processes determine community structure despite stochasticity during early stages of community assembly.

46

Keywords: Diversity; β-diversity; Deterministic; Stochastic; Community assembly; 48

50

INTRODUCTION

- 52 The extent to which the structure of natural communities is determined by stochastic or deterministic processes is a central question in ecology. There has been strong debate
- 54 regarding the relative importance of niche-based, deterministic, processes and neutral stochastic processes for community assembly (Hubbell 2001; Wooton 2005; Alonso et
- al. 2006; Dornela et al. 2006). Attempts to reconcile niche and neutral perspectivesargue that they act as two ends of a continuum between competitive exclusion and
- 58 stochastic immigration (Gravel et al. 2006), where both niche and neutral processes simultaneously influence the dynamics of competing species (Adler et al. 2007). It has
- 60 also been shown that the relative importance of niche *versus* neutral processes can be scale-dependent, with the former becoming relatively more important at increasing
- 62 spatial scales (Garzon-Lopez et al. 2014; Chase 2014), as well as changing with the level of resources (e.g. productivity) (Chase 2010).
- 64

Processes operating at different spatial scales interact to produce patterns of species

- distribution (e.g. Navarrete et al. 2005). In this context, measures of β -diversity, i.e. the variation in identities of species among sites or times (Anderson et al. 2011), provide a
- link between scales, by relating the extent of regional and local variation in diversity(Whittaker 1960, 1972). β-diversity can be a useful metric to understand patterns of
- 70 species diversity across space and time, which can be driven by environmental conditions (e.g. Ellingsen and Gray 2002; Anderson et al. 2013), biological interactions
- (e.g. Chase et al. 2009; Smith et al. 2009) and disturbance regimes (e.g. Chase 2007).
 Even though the study of β-diversity *per se* cannot be used to infer the mechanisms
- 74 determining community structure, it can be used to infer the importance of stochastic

(see Chase and Myers 2011 and references therein) and/or neutral (Tucker et al. 2016)

- 76 processes, relative to niche-based processes for community assembly.
- 78 Marine ecosystems are generally regarded as open, since most animals and plants have complex life-cycles, including an initial planktonic dispersing stage. The arrival of new
- 80 individuals to adult habitats varies greatly both in space and time and is often independent of local adult abundances (Jenkins et al. 2009). In rocky intertidal
- 82 ecosystems, early colonists of disturbed substrata tend to be opportunistic and fastgrowing species that are available for colonisation throughout the year and generally
- 84 include biofilms, foliose and filamentous algae belonging to genera such as *Ulva*,
 Polysiphonia, Ceramium, Ectocarpus (Jenkins and Martins 2010). *Ulva* spp. release
- 86 spores all year around and have high dispersal abilities (Norton 1992), so that when space is freed, they are generally able to colonise. In contrast, late colonists tend to be
- 88 more competitive perennial algae with more complex morphologies, as well as common invertebrates, such as barnacles and mussels. Many of these taxa have distinct
- 90 reproductive periods, with propagules or larvae available in the water column only for short periods of time (Jenkins and Martins 2010). As a consequence, the timing of
- 92 disturbance has a large impact on patterns of species recruitment, because of seasonality in organisms' reproductive patterns (Dayton et al. 1984; Breitburg 1985;

94 Sousa 1985; Benedetti-Cecchi and Cinelli 1993; Jenkins et al. 2005; Underwood and Chapman 2006; Martins et al. 2010). This, in turn, may have long-lasting effects if the

- 96 distribution and composition of communities is strongly dependent on events occurring early in succession (Berlow 1997; Petraitis and Latham 1999). For instance, Benedetti-
- 98 Cecchi (2000) showed that littoral rockpools could be dominated by either canopy- or turf-forming algae depending on the timing of disturbance. Canopy algae were the

- 100 dominant species in rockpools when the timing of disturbance matched their peak of recruitment, thus highlighting the importance of priority effects. In other cases,
- 102 however, post-settlement processes can completely erase the signal of dispersal or settlement and the structure of different adult assemblages, which vary in initial

104 composition, converges (Caro et al. 2010).

- Here, we investigated, through analysis of the successional patterns followingdisturbance at different times of the year, the relative strength of stochasticity for the
- 108 assemblage of rocky shore assemblages at three distinct regions of the Atlantic. By stochastic processes we refer to the probability of propagule arrival at a given location
- 110 or time, temporal variation in growth rates, etc. Note that although the underlying mechanisms determining the numbers of propagules available in the water column, at a
- 112 given time and space, can be deterministic (e.g. seasonality in species reproduction), patterns of recruitment and mortality of post-settlement stages of marine organisms
- 114 are often stochastic (e.g. Vadas et al. 1992, Underwood and Chapman 2006). They reflect the interaction between multiple factors (e.g. variability in density of
- 116 reproductive adults, variable patterns of currents, spatial variability in predators, smallscale variability in environmental conditions), making predictions about patterns of
- 118 colonisation complex and virtually impossible (see Vellend et al. 2014, for further discussion of the point). In contrast, deterministic processes refer to those processes
- that reduce variability by exploiting and maximising niche differences among species(e.g. environmental filters, biotic interactions). Our prediction is that stochastic
- 122 processes will be more important during early successional stages, reflecting variation in the match between the time resources (e.g. space) were made available (via
- 124 experimental disturbances done at different times of the year) and variability in

demographics of early colonisers. This will be depicted by significant variation in β-

- 126 diversity (temporal dissimilarity) among assemblages disturbed at different times of the year. It should also be depicted by a similar pattern between the structure of these
- 128 assemblages and those created by a null model of random community assembly. As succession proceeds, however, we hypothesise that niche-based processes (e.g.
- 130 competition, environmental filtering) favouring the establishment of certain species will tend to lead to a deterministic signal, with the outcome of succession being invariant
- 132 regardless of variability (or stochasticity) in early stages of community assembly. This will be detected by a reduction in β -diversity (temporal dissimilarity) with time among
- 134 assemblages disturbed at different times of the year and divergence from the null model of random community assembly.

136

If niche-based processes prevail at later stages of community assembly, we can also

- 138 investigate the role of historical contingency (priority effects) in determining community structure. Priority effects (or divergent selection) can be assessed by
- 140 showing whether the variability generated during early successional stages of community assembly disturbed at different times of the year can lead to
- 142 later-successional assemblages that are clearly distinct (preserving the stochasticsignal) and are more diverse than expected by chance. In contrast, if priority effects are
- not important, biological interactions and environmental filtering will lead to a convergent selection resulting in assemblages that are less diverse than expected by
 chance.

148 MATERIAL AND METHODS

Study sites

- 150 The study was done on the lower shore, algal-dominated, rocky intertidal at three locations in each of three regions: Northern Portugal, the Azores and the Canary Islands.
- 152 These three regions are all part of the Lusitanian province, but differ in latitude by 14 degrees. Northern Portugal is a cold-temperate zone at the transition between the
- 154 Atlantic and Mediterranean biogeographical regions (Lima et al. 2007; Tuya et al. 2012) and supports a highly diverse biota where many cold- and warm-water species have
- their latitudinal limits of distribution (Araújo et al. 2009 and references therein). TheAzores are located at the transition between the temperate and subtropical regions,
- 158 whereas the Canary Islands are located well within the subtropical region. The Northern Portugal and the Canary Islands are influenced by the Canary Upwelling
- System (Iberian system), one of the major upwelling regions in the world (see Santos et al. 2011 and references therein). The Canary Islands and the Azores are oceanic
- 162 archipelagos belonging to the Macaronesia region. The two archipelagos differ in that the Canary Islands are considered a hotspot for biodiversity, whereas the Azores
- 164 support a comparatively less diverse biota due to the high degree of isolation and recent geological age (Hawkins et al. 2000; Tuya and Haroun 2009). Unlike the adjacent
- 166 continental mass, oligotrophic oceanic waters (Martins et al. 2007) generally surround the Canary Islands and the Azores, although productivity can be occasionally high due
- to island effects (see Hernández-Léon 1988), especially in the Canary Islands (see Table1 in Martins et al. 2014 for environmental differences among these regions).

170

Study communities

- 172 In Northern Portugal, the lower shore was a patchy mosaic of algae dominated by coarsely branched algae (e.g. *Osmundea* spp., *Dictyota* spp.) or the leathery alga
- 174 Bifurcaria bifurcata. The Azores and Canaries were dominated by articulated corallines

(e.g. Ellisolandia elongata, Jania rubens) and algal turfs consisting of coarsely branched

- 176 and filamentous (e.g. *Palisada perforata, Chaetomorpha* spp.) algae. At this shore level, animals present included *Mytilus* sp. and *Sabellaria alveolata* (only in Northern
- Portugal), chthamalid barnacles, gastropod molluscs (patellid limpets, trochid snails and muricid whelks) and sea urchins (*Paracentrotus lividus*). Animals were, however,
 generally rare in our study sites at the chosen shore level.

182 Sampling design

At each location, a total of thirty 15 × 15 cm plots were haphazardly established on the

- lower algal-dominated shore in areas of gentle sloping, well-drained, bedrock. Plotswere marked with stainless steel screws and plastic tags. Plots were then randomly
- assigned to two treatments: disturbed (15 plots) and control (15 plots). Disturbed plotswere cleared of biota by chiselling and scrubbing off all visible biota and blow-torched
- 188 afterwards. The size of disturbed plots (225 cm²) is within the range of sizes of naturally disturbed patches observed in the rocky intertidal both in the Azores (Martins
- et al. 2013) and elsewhere (Airoldi 2003). Control plots were left un-manipulated and are used as a surrogate for mature communities. To test the influence of disturbance
- 192 timing, clearance of biota was carried out at three distinct times of the year (April, July and October of 2011). Five plots (of the 15 assigned to the disturbance treatment) were
- randomly assigned to each time. Disturbed plots were then visually inspected at one,three, six, nine and twelve months after disturbances. A different set of unmanipulated
- 196 control plots (n = 5), out of those initially marked (n = 15), was also sampled when each set of disturbed plots reached 12 months (April, July and October of 2012).
- Algae and sessile animals were quantified using the method described by Dethier et al.(1993), where a score of 0-4 (0 being absence, 4 being full cover) was given to each

- 200 taxon in each of the 25 subdivisions making up the sampling quadrat (15 × 15 cm). Rare species were marked as present and ascribed an arbitrary cover of 1%. Mobile animals
- 202 (e.g. limpets) were counted as density of individuals. However, these were rare in our dataset and were not further considered in the analyses. All species were identified *in*
- *situ* to the lowest taxonomic resolution possible. Where in doubt, sample specimens were collected nearby and brought to the laboratory for latter identification.

206

Data analysis

- 208 We examined the effect of timing of disturbance on the structure of assemblages through succession (i.e. 1 month, 3 months, etc., following disturbance) among regions
- using a four-way PERMANOVA (Anderson 2001) with the factors: Region (random, 3 levels), Timing of Clearance (random, 3 levels), Location (random and nested within
- 212 region, 3 levels) and Successional Month (fixed, 6 levels). The analysis was run usingBray-Curtis dissimilarities on the fourth-root transformed data. Canonical Analysis of
- 214 Principal Coordinates (CAP) was used to ordinate samples in a bidimensional space, but constrained by the interaction between time of clearance and successional month. For
- clarity, the data plotted are the centroids for each location. All analyses were done usingPRIMER v6 + PERMANOVA add-on, Anderson 2001, Clarke and Gorley 2006).

218

For each location, α-diversity of macrobiota was calculated as the average number of
 species pooled across the three disturbance timings (n = 15 per location) and γ diversity as the total number of species.

222

To place these results in a global perspective, we investigated whether regionalenrichment of local diversity varied with succession. This was addressed by using the

log-response ratio effect size of regional-to-local diversity $[ln(\gamma - diversity)/ln(\alpha - diversity)]$

- 226 diversity)]. The use of the ratio enabled us to measure the extent of regional pool influence on local diversity without any unknown bias stemming from inaccurately
- estimating regional species pool among regions and at different successional stages.Spatial and temporal variation in the response ratio was investigated using a 2-way
- permutational ANOVA with the factors: Region (random) and Successional Month (fixed). The analysis was run using Euclidean dissimilarities on PRIMER v6 +
- 232 PERMANOVA add-on. When based on Euclidean distance, PERMANOVA is analogous to traditional ANOVA, while maintaining the flexibility and lack of assumptions of other
- non-parametric methods (Anderson 2001). in parametric assumptions. Prior to
 analysis, PERMIDSP was used to test for heterogeneity of variances and transformations
 were applied if necessary.
- 238 We then estimated β -diversity as the mean dissimilarity in the structure of assemblages disturbed at different times of the year using three metrics. Hence, in our study, β -
- 240 diversity is a measure of temporal dissimilarity. We used the Jaccard's incidence-baseddissimilarity metric to estimate temporal β-diversity (among disturbance timings) and
- the Bray-Curtis dissimilarity index to include an abundance-based metric. However,because most similarity (or dissimilarity) metrics are confounded by variation in local
- 244 species richness, we further used the approach described by Chase et al. (2011), which is an adaptation of the Raup and Crick's metric. This estimates the probability of the
- 246 number of co-occurring species with species occurrences probabilities proportional to species frequencies (Raup and Crick 1979). It estimates the probability that, in our case,
- 248 time-to-time dissimilarity (β -diversity) is due to chance (Chase et al. 2011). This metric is then used to determine the relative strength of stochastic *versus* deterministic

- processes for community assembly (Chase 2010; Chase and Myers 2011; Chase et al.
 2011; Stegen et al. 2012). The metric is standardised between -1 and 1, where -1
- 252 indicates that communities are more similar than expected by chance, 1 indicates communities are more dissimilar than expected by chance, and 0 indicates communities
- 254 that do not differ from random expectation. The Jaccard and Bray-Curtis dissimilarities were calculated using PRIMER v6. For the Raup-Crick, we used the code provided in
- 256 Chase et al. (2011) to perform all the analyses. For each of the above three metrics, β diversity was calculated as the mean dissimilarity between disturbance timings by
- 258 averaging all the possible combinations among quadrats disturbed at different times of the year, separately for each location and successional stage (n = 75). For controls, we
- 260 similarly calculated the mean dissimilarity between different sampling times by averaging all the possible combinations among undisturbed quadrats sampled at
- 262 different times of the year. This yielded a total of three values per region and successional stage, which were used to test variation in the effect of disturbance timing
- at different successional stages and among regions using a 2-way permutational ANOVA(as described above). In our study, β-diversity is thus a measure of temporal
- 266 dissimilarity among quadrats disturbed (or sampled in the case of controls) at different times of year, calculated separately for each location and plot age. Note also that, as for
- 268 the estimates of α and γ -diversity, β -diversity metrics were calculated separately for each successional stage; the rationale being that only a subset species of the regional
- 270 species pool can *de facto* colonise disturbed patches at any given time (early vs. late successional species).

272

We have then used the approach of Hillebrand et al. (in press) to investigate the relative importance of changes in species composition (SER_r) and abundances (SER_a) for assemblage turnover through succession. SER_r and SER_a were calculated for each

quadrat at successive sampling times. Spatial and temporal variation in SER_r and SER_a
 was then analysed separately using a 4-way permutational ANOVA as described above.

278

RESULTS

- For the overall study, we found a total of 115 species; 58 in Northern Portugal, 52 in theCanary Islands and 48 in the Azores. Of these, 36 species were exclusive to Northern
- 282 Portugal, 26 to the Canary Islands and 20 to the Azores; 33 species were present in at least two regions, whilst only 10 species were shared among all regions. Assemblage
- 284 structure varied significantly with Time of Clearance (TC) and Successional Month (SM) at both regional spatial scales (P = 0.001 for Region x TC x SM interaction) and local
- spatial scales (P = 0.001 for Location nested in Region x TC x SM interaction, see OnlineResource 1). Inspection of pair-wise comparisons (see also Online Resource 1) showed
- 288 that Time of Clearance had a significant (P < 0.05) effect on the structure of assemblages, especially during early stages of community succession. The duration of
- 290 these effects (how long into the successional stage they were apparent) appears to have decreased with latitude, lasting longer in Northern Portugal (effects of timing of
- clearance were detected up to 9 months after clearance) and less in the Canary Islands(effects of timing of clearance could not be detected 3 months after clearance) (Fig. 1).
- Although the Time of Clearance had a significant effect on early assemblage structure, such effects were entirely absent (P > 0.05 in all cases) for all regions 12 months after
- 296 disturbance (Fig. 1, see Online Resource 1). The largest source of variability was associated with the factor Regions (39%, see coefficients of variation in Online Resource
- 298 1), highlighting the substantial variation in assemblage structure among these.

- 300 The log-response ratio effect size of regional-to-local diversity did not differ significantly among regions or throughout succession (Fig. 2; see Online Resource 2 for
- 302 ANOVA table), indicating that the rate of species additions or losses at regional and local scales was similar among regions and succession and was not a confounding factor in
- 304 betadiversity analyses below. It also suggests that changes in species richness (gains and losses) at smaller and larger spatial scales through succession are not dissociated.

306

When using the Jaccard's metric (which does not account for variation in α), variation in

- β-diversity among disturbance timings (mean dissimilarity among quadrats disturbed at different times of the year) differed significantly among successional stages (time
- 310 after clearance) and consistently among regions (no interaction) (Table 1). Overall, variation in β -diversity among disturbance timings tended to decrease with succession,
- i.e. assemblages disturbed at different times of the year became increasing similar with time (Fig. 3). When using the Bray-Curtis' metric (which does not account for variation
- in α, but includes abundance data), there was a significant interaction between Regionand Successional Month (Table 1). Inspection of pair-wise comparisons (not shown)
- and Figure 3 showed that the response of β -diversity (dissimilarity among disturbance timings) to succession was variable and specific for each region, when accounting for
- 318 species relative abundances. In other words, timing of disturbance not only influenced
 the identities of species, but also their abundances during community recovery, but the
 320 response was highly variable among regions.
- 322 When using the modified Raup-Crick metric (which accounts for variation in α), variation in β -diversity among disturbance timings was significant among successional
- 324 stages, but this pattern was consistent from region to region, despite significant

variation among regions (Table 1). More importantly, inspection of Figure 3 shows that

- 326 the metric was similar to zero (-0.07 \pm 0.07, mean \pm SE, pooling among the three regions) during the early stages of succession, but that it gradually deviated from zero
- 328 as succession proceeded. It averaged -0.40 ± 0.07 twelve months post disturbance, a value that was similar to that of controls with -0.53 ± 0.06 . This indicates that disturbed

330 communities assembling at different times of the year were initially very variable, but progressively became more similar than expected by chance (compared to the null

332 model), as succession proceeded.

- Partitioning species turnover into its compositional (SER_r) and abundance (SER_a)
 components showed that the process of community assembly through succession was
- 336 mostly the result of species replacements (mean SER_r = 0.64, mean SER_a = 0.14)(Fig. 4). For nine and twelve month old assemblages, however, species turnover was not only
- 338 the result of species replacements (mean SER_r = 0.60), but there were also substantial changes in species abundances (mean SER_a = 0.37) (Fig. 4). SER_r and SER_a varied
- 340 significantly with timing of disturbance clearance and successional stage at the scale of locations, but not at regional scales (see Online Resource 3 for PERMANOVA)

342

DISCUSSION

- 344 Community succession has received considerable attention from ecologists in general, and marine ecologists in particular (see Jenkins and Martins 2010 for review). In fact,
- 346 the study of natural succession in marine intertidal ecosystems has contributed substantially to the development of ecological theory, such as the seminal paper of
- 348 Connell and Slayter (1977), where three alternative models of community succession (facilitation, tolerance and inhibition), and their relative roles for community structure

and stability, were defined. Despite decades of research, there is still considerablecontroversy about whether ecological communities generally converge towards a

- 352 common structure or not (Fukami et al. 2005). In fact, even though assembly history can influence both the structure of communities and the functional properties of
- ecosystems, and thus is of both theoretical and applied interest, the factors determiningthe circumstances under which historical contingency can occur have received

considerably less attention than other areas of community ecology (Fukami 2015).

- 358 Our study showed that, as predicted, there was considerable variability in the structure of assemblages disturbed at different times of the year during early stages of
- 360 community assembly. This finding concurs with the wider body of literature of intertidal communities stressing that during early stages of community assembly,
- 362 timing of disturbance can have an enormous impact on assemblage structure, because of seasonality in organisms' reproductive patterns, or due to seasonality in species'
- 364 growth rates in relation to temporal variation in environmental conditions (Benedetti-Cecchi and Cinelli 1993; Underwood and Chapman 2006; Jenkins and Martins 2010.
- 366 Furthermore, during these early stages of community assembly, patterns of assemblage structure did not differ from that created by random community assembly suggesting
- 368 the stochastic nature of the initial stages of community assembly. This variability in the initial stages of community assembly reflected not only changes in community
- 370 composition (as suggested by the Jaccard dissimilarity), probably arising as aconsequence of temporal differences in the composition of species available for
- 372 colonisation at the time when resources were freed, but also changes in speciesabundances (as suggested by the Bray-Curtis dissimilarity), potentially arising as a

374 consequence of temporal variability in environmental conditions modifying species growth rates.

376

378

 β -diversity, that is the variability in the structure of assemblages disturbed at different times of the year, tended to reduce as time since disturbance elapsed. This was evident

both when considering variation in assemblage composition (Jaccard) but also species

- 380 abundances (Bray-Curtis). Moreover, the signal clearly deviated from that of random community assembly as succession proceeded (Raup-Crick). Our study thus suggests
- that stochastic processes likely prevailed during early stages of community assembly,but tended to become progressively less important as succession proceeded.

384

In the rocky intertidal, two situations have been shown to occur: one in which despite

- 386 significant variability in recruitment regimes there is high ecological convergence in late successional communities (e.g. Caro et al. 2010), and one where priority effects lead to
- the development of structurally and functionally different communities (e.g. Benedetti-Cecchi 2000). A fundamental question is thus to understand under what circumstances
- 390 can priority effects determine the outcome of community assembly after a givendisturbance. Fukami (2015) discussed a number of factors thought to determine the
- 392 relative importance of priority effects for community assembly. These included a group of factors that influence the rate of local population dynamics (e.g. small habitat patch
- 394 size, high productivity, low environmental variability and low predation pressure)relative to species immigration. The rationale here is that priority effects can only occur
- 396 when local population dynamics are fast, relative to species immigrations, so that early colonisers grow rapidly in biomass or population size to pre-empt or modify niches
- before the arrival of later-colonisers (Fukami 2015). In addition the properties of

regional species pools (e.g. species richness, species traits) and the extent to which the

- species pool is decoupled from local population dynamics are proposed to be important.Fukami (2015) argues that priority effects should generally be stronger, the greater the
- 402 diversity and stability of the regional species pool (see Fukami 2015 for detailed discussion of these factors).

```
404
```

Our study was replicated in three distinct regions differing not only in regional species 406 pool but also in productivity. Moreover, the size of our experimentally disturbed patches was judged to be large enough to prevent the rapid monopolisation of space

- 408 from the adjacent community (e.g. via lateral vegetative growth) yet small enough to ensure that it could be easily monopolised by the species first arriving to the patch
- 410 (Martins et al. 2010). Regardless, we found no evidence of strong priority effects in any of the three regions. The impact of priority effects would have been clearly identified if
- 412 assemblages disturbed at different times of the year (which promoted the stochastic early stages of community assembly) had become more diverse (less similar) than
- 414 expected by random community assembly. However, the reverse was true with assemblages becoming progressively more similar than expected by chance with
- 416 succession. This result thus refutes the idea that priority effects had an important role in determining community structure in our study systems. Limited seasonal variation in
- 418 propagule/larvae availability could have hindered the possibility of priority effects.However, 1-month old disturbed patches, taken as a reasonable proxy for species
- 420 settlement and recruitment, and hence to the availability of propagules or larvae, showed significant variation in assemblage structure in terms of abundance and
- 422 composition disturbed at different times of the year. Our results indicate that despite early variation in community composition, there was a remarkable determinism in

424 community succession across all regions. Why is it then that priority effects had little influence in our study systems?

426

We found that the ratio of γ -to- α diversity remained equivalent over succession and that

- 428 this was true at three distinct regions under contrasting environmental variability. That is, effects of succession were scale-invariant; reductions or increases in species
- 430 occurred to the same extent throughout succession at smaller and larger spatial scales. In other words, species pools were not decoupled from local dynamics. This suggests
- 432 that the subset of species of the regional species pool available for colonisation at any given time was not stable and that there was potentially a limited supply of immigrants
- that could colonise patches at any given step during community assembly, in turnlimiting the probability for the development of divergent assemblages (Fukami 2015).
- 436 Moreover, strong priority effects require that species are competitively similar. This similarity ensures (or makes possible) that the outcome of competitive interactions is
- 438 sensitive to the arrival of species. However, under strong competitive hierarchy, species arrival order should have little influence since the most competitive species eventually
- 440 dominate regardless of patch history (Fukami 2015). As suggested by the partition of species turnover into its compositional and abundance components, variation in
- 442 diversity along succession was mostly associated with species replacements. In other words, new species kept replacing previously 'established' species as time since
- 444 disturbance increased. This and the fact that species tended to converge into a similar assemblage structure with succession lends support to the idea that competitive
- 446 hierarchy was present in our study systems and hence supports the competitioncolonisation model of succession, which predicts that late successional species
- 448 outcompete early successional species (Pacala and Rees 1998). Although we cannot

infer mechanisms from our observational approach, we suspect that differences in

- 450 biological traits among species (e.g. reproductive output, seasonality in reproduction, growth rate) correlate with competitive ability and determine the colonisation-
- 452 competition trade-off through succession (Jenkins and Martins 2010). This is supported by the work of Viejo et al. (2008) in the NE Atlantic, who showed that different
- 454 mechanisms (both inhibitory and facilitative) operate throughout succession and that competition among species with different traits is important. For instance, even though
- 456 during early stages of colonisation early-successional species (ephemeral green algae) were able to delay the colonisation of late-successional species (canopy algae), the latter
- eventually dominated at the end of the experiment. This, in turn, inhibited the
 establishment of some species, whilst facilitating the establishment of others (Viejo et
 al. 2008).
- 462 It is possible that our experimental design may have hampered our ability to detect priority effects. Disturbance scale may have an important influence on the
- 464 establishment of divergent assemblages. Disturbance of larger areas could be morelikely to remove those species involved in positive feedbacks, which maintain
- 466 community state. Loss of such species may allow the arrival and establishment of species of potentially alternative assemblages (e.g. Petraitis and Latham 1999).
- 468 Specifically, Petraitis et al. (1999) showed that in the Gulf of Maine, divergence in the structure of intertidal assemblages was unlikely in disturbed patches smaller than 2 m².
- 470 In one of our study systems (Azores), Martins et al. (2010) found little effect on the outcome of succession among disturbed patches of differing size, the largest of which
- 472 was at least 3 times larger than the ones used here. It is possible that even these were still not large enough. However, in ecosystems with narrow tidal ranges (our insular

- 474 systems), a disturbance larger than 3 m² would effectively include the removal of all species from the lowest intertidal level up to the littorinid zone, high up on the shore.
- 476 Such a disturbed area would encompass a range of environmental conditions (as a function of shore height) and blur the interpretation of any outcome compared to that
- 478 of smaller patches. Moreover, this would confound the comparison between the continental (macrotidal) and insular (microtidal) ecosystems. The fact that structure of
- 480 early successional assemblages assembling at distinct times of the year was very variable suggests that, at least, our plot size did not limit the colonisation of species that
- 482 might lead to alternative assemblages.
- 484 Chase and Myers (2011) also highlighted that changes in the size of the regional species pool (γ -diversity) can lead to changes in β -diversity, as long as α -diversity does not
- 486 change at the same rate as γ -diversity. In our approach, we estimated β -diversity separately for each location and successional age. This could, in theory, impair the
- 488 comparisons among regions and even among successional stages. However, the fact that changes in γ- and α-diversity remained unchanged through succession and were similar
 490 among regions (see Fig. 2), suggests this was not a confounding factor in our estimates of β-diversity.
- 492

494

In summary, we found evidence that, in diverse rocky shore ecosystems and over large spatial scales, differences in the identities and abundances of species that are available

to colonise disturbed patches at any given time, although relatively important during

- 496 early stages of community assembly, had little to no effect on the longer-term structure of intertidal assemblages. Furthermore, we found little support for strong priority
- 498 effects despite changes in species pools, productivity and environmental conditions

among the three regions. Instead, there was strong determinism in the process of

500 community assembly suggesting that environmental filtering or strong interactions among a subset of species can shape assemblages into a relatively convergent structure.

502

Acknowledgments

- 504 Funding was provided from National Funds through FCT Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia, under the project UID/BIA/00329/2013. GMM was supported by post-
- doctoral grants awarded also by FCT (SFRH/BDP/63040/2009 andSFRH/BDP/108114/2015). Sampling at the Canary Islands was funded by the Spanish
- 508 MINECO 'Plan Nacional' (ANTROTIDAL, CGL 2011-23833).

510 **REFERENCES**

Adler PB, HilleRisLambers J, Levine JM (2007) A niche for neutrality. Ecol Lett 10:95-

512 104.

Airoldi L (2003) Effects of patch shape in intertidal algal mosaics: roles of area,

514 perimeter and distance from edge. Mar Biol 143:639-650.

Alonso D, Etienne RS, McKane AJ (2006) The merits of neutral theory. Trends Ecol Evol

516 21:451-457.

Anderson MJ (2001) A new method for non-parametric multivariate analysis of

518 variance. Aust Ecol 26:32-46.

Anderson MJ, Crist TO, Chase JM, Vellend M, Inouye BD, Freestone AL, Sanders NJ,

520 Cornell HV, Comita LS, Davies KF, Harrison SP, Kraft NJB, Stegen JC, Swenson NG (2011) Navigating the multiple meanings of β-diversity: a roadmap for the

522 practicing ecologist. Ecol Lett 14:19-28.

Anderson MJ, Tolimieri N, Millar RB (2013) Beta diversity of demersal fish assemblages

- in the North-Eastern Pacific: Interactions of latitude and depth. PLoS ONE8(3):e57918.
- 526 Araújo R, Bárbara I, Tibaldo M, Bereciber E, Tapia PD, Pereira R, Santos R, Pinto IS
 (2009) Checklist of benthic marine algae and cyanobacteria of northern Portugal.
 528 Bot Mar 52:24-46.

Benedetti-Cecchi L (2000) Priority effects, taxonomic resolution, and the prediction of

- 530 variable patterns of colonisation of algae in littoral rock pools. Oecologia123:265-274.
- 532 Benedetti-Cecchi L, Cinelli F (1993) Early patterns of algal succession in a mid-littoral community of the Mediterranean Sea: a multifactorial experiment. J Exp Mar Biol

534 Ecol 169:15-31.

Berlow EL (1997) From canalization to contingency: historical effects in a successional
rocky intertidal community. Ecol Monogr 67: 435-460.

Breitburg DL (1985) Development of a subtidal epibenthic community – factors

- affecting species composition and the mechanisms of succession. Oecologia65:173-184.
- 540 Caro AU, Navarrete SA, Castilla JC (2010) Ecological convergence in a rocky intertidal shore despite high spatial variability in recruitment regimes. Proc Natl Acad Sci
 542 USA 107:18528–18532.

Chase JM (2007) Drought mediates the importance of stochastic community assembly.

544 Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 104:17430-17434.

Chase JM (2010) Stochastic community assembly causes higher biodiversity in more
productive environments. Science 328:1388-1391.

Chase JM (2014) Spatial scale resolves the niche versus neutral theory debate. J Veg Sci

548 25:319-322.

Chase JM, Myers JA (2011) Disentangling the importance of ecological niches from

- stochastic processes across scales. Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci 366:2351-2363.
- 552 Chase JM, Biro EG, Ryberg WA, Smith KG (2009) Predators temper the relative
 importance of stochastic processes in the assembly of prey communities. Ecol
 554 Lett 12:1210-1218.

Chase JM, Kraft JB, Smith KG, Vellend M, Inouye BD (2011) Using null models to

- disentangle variation in community dissimilarity from variation in α-diversity.Ecosphere 2:1-11.
- 558 Clarke, KR, Gorley RN (2006) PRIMER v6: User Manual/Tutorial. PRIMER-E, Plymouth, 192pp.
- 560 Connell JH, Slayter RO (1977) Mechanisms of succession on natural communities and their role in community stability and organization. Am Nat 111:1119-1144.
- 562 Dayton PK, Currie V, Gerrodette T, Keller BD, Rosenthal R, Ven Tresca D (1984)
 Dynamics and stability of some California kelp communities. Ecol Monogr
 564 54:254-289.

Dethier MN, Graham ES, Cohen S, Tear LM (1993) Visual versus random-point percent

- 566 cover estimations: 'objec- tive' is not always better. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 96:93-100.Dornelas M, Connolly SR, Hughes TP (2006) Coral reef diversity refutes the neutral
- 568 theory of biodiversity. Nature 440:80-82.Ellingsen KE, Gray JS (2002) Spatial patterns of benthic diversity: is there a latitudinal

570 gradient along the Norwegian continental shelf? J Anim Ecol 71:373-389.

Fukami T (2015) Historical contingency in community assembly: Integrating niches,

572 species pools, and priority effects. Annu Rev Ecol Evol S 46:1-23.

Fukami T, Bezemer TM, Mortimer SR, van der Putten WH (2005) Species divergence

- and trait convergence in experimental plant community assembly. Ecol Lett8:1283-1290.
- 576 Garzon-Lopez CX, Jansen PA, Bohlman SA, Ordonez A, Olff H (2014) Effects of sampling scale on patterns of habitat association in tropical trees. J Veg Sci 25:349-362.
- 578 Gravel D, Canham CD, Beaudet M, Messier C. 2006. Reconciling niche and neutrality: the continuum hypothesis. Ecol Lett 9:399-409.
- Hawkins SJ, Corte-Real HBSM, Pannacciulli FG, Weber LC (2000) Thoughts on the ecology and evolution of the intertidal biota of the Azores and other Atlantic
 islands. Hydrobiologia 440:3-17.

Hernández-Léon S (1988) Gradients of mesozooplankton biomass and ETS activity in

- the wind-shear area as evidence of an island mass effect in the Canary Island waters. J Plankton Res 10:1141-1154.
- Hillebrand H, Blasius B, Borer ET, Chase JM, Downing JA, Eriksson BK, Filstrup CT,
 Harpole WS, Hodapp D, Larsen S, Lewandowska AM, Seabloom EW, Van de Waal
- 588DB, Ryabov AB (in press) Biodiversity change is uncoupled from species richnesstrends: consequences for conservation and monitoring. J Appl Ecol.
- Hubbell SP (2001) The unified neutral theory of biodiversity and biogeography.Princeton Univ Press, New Jersey.
- Jenkins SR, Coleman RA, Della Santina P, Hawkins SJ, Burrows MT, Hartnoll RG (2005)
 Regional scale differences in the determinism of grazing effects in the rocky
 intertidal. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 287:77-86.

Jenkins SR, Marshall D, Fraschetti S (2009) Settlement and recruitment. In: Wahl M (ed)

- 596 Marine hard bottom communities: Patterns, dynamics, diversity and change.Springer, Berlin, pp 177-190.
- 598 Jenkins SR, Martins GM (2010) Succession on hard substrata. In: Dürr S, Thomason JC (eds) Biofouling. Wiley-Blackwell, Oxford, pp 60-72.
- Lima F, Ribeiro PA, Queiroz N, Hawkins SJ, Santos A (2007) Do distributional shifts of
 northern and southern species of algae match the warming pattern? Glob Change
 Biol 13:2592-2604

Martins AM, Amorim ASB, Figueiredo MP, Sousa RJ, Mendonça AP, Bashmachnikov IL,

- 604 Carvalho DS (2007) Sea surface temperature (AVHRR, MODIS) and ocean colour (MODIS) seasonal and interannual variability in the Macaronesian islands of
 606 Azores, Madeira, and Canaries. Proc SPIE 6743: 67430A-1.
 - Martins GM, Jenkins SR, Ramírez R, Tuya F, Neto AI, Arenas F (2014) Early patterns of
- 608 recovery from disturbance in intertidal algal assemblages: consistency across regions within a marine province. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 517:131-142.
- 610 Martins GM, Thompson RC, Neto AI, Hawkins SJ, Jenkins SR (2010) Exploitation of intertidal grazers as a driver of community divergence. J Appl Ecol 47:1282-
- 612 1289.

Martins GM, Prestes ACL, Neto AI (2013) Effects of density versus size on grazing by a

614 key exploited herbivore. Vie et Milieu 64:35-40.

Navarrete SA, Wieters E, Broitman B, Castilla JC (2005) Scales of benthic-pelagic

- 616 coupling and the intensity of species interactions: from recruitment limitation to top down control. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 102:18046-18051.
- 618 Norton TA (1992) Dispersal by macroalgae. British Phycol J 27:293-301.

620 explaining successional diversity. Am Nat 152:729-737.
Petraitis PS, Latham RE (1999) The importance of scale in testing the origins of
622 alternative community states. Ecology 80:429-442.
Petraitis PS, Methratta ET, Rhile EC, Vidargas NA, Dudgeon SR (1999) Experimental
624 confirmation of multiple community states in a marine ecosystem. Oecologia
161:139-148.
626 Raup D, Crick RE (1979) Measurement of faunal similarity in paleontology. J Paleontol
53:1213-1227.

Pacala SW, Rees M (1998) Models suggesting field experiments to test two hypothesis

Santos F, Gómez-Gesteira M, deCastro M, Álvarez I (2011) Upwelling along the western coast of the Iberian Peninsula: dependence of trends on fitting strategy. Clim Res 48:213-218.

Smith KG, Lips KR, Chase JM (2009) Selecting for extinction: nonrandom disease-

632 associated extinction homogenizes amphibian biotas. Ecol Lett 12:1069-1078. Sousa WP (1985) Disturbance and patch dynamics on rocky intertidal shores. In: Pickett

- 634 STA, White PS (eds) The ecology of natural disturbance and patch dynamics.Academic Press, Orlando, pp, 101-124.
- 636 Stegen JC, Freestone AL, Crist TO, Anderson MJ, Chase JM, et al. (2012) Stochastic and deterministic drivers of spatial and temporal turnover in breeding bird

638 communities. Global Ecol Biogeogr 22:202-212.

Tucker CM, Shoemaker LG, Davies KF, Nemergut DR, Melbourne BA (2016)

Differentiating between niche and neutral assembly in metacommunities using null models of β-diversity. Oikos 125:778-789.

Tuya F, Cacabelos E, Duarte P, Jacinto D and others (2012) Patterns of landscape and
 assemblage structure along a latitudinal gradient in ocean climate. Mar Ecol Prog
 Ser 466:9-19.

Tuya F, Haroun RJ (2009) Phytogeography of Lusitanian Macaronesia: biogeographic646affinities in species richness and assemblage composition. Eur J Phycol 44:405-

- 413.
- 648 Underwood AJ, Chapman MG (2006) Early development of subtidal macrofaunal assemblages: relationships to period and timing of colonization. J Exp Mar Ecol
 650 Biol 330:221-233.

Vadas RL, Johnson S, Norton TA (1992) Recruitment and mortality of early post-

652 settlement stages of benthic algae. Br Phycol J 27:331-351.

Vellend M, Srivastava DS, Anderson KM, Brown CD, Jankowski JE, Kleynhans EJ, Kraft

NJB, Letaw AD, Macdonald AAM, Maclean JE, Myers-Smith IH, Norris AR, Xue X
(2014) Assessing the relative importance of neutral stochasticity in ecological
communities. Oikos 123:1420-1430.

Viejo R, Arenas F, Fernández C, Gómez M (2008) Mechanisms of succession along the

658 emersion gradient in intertidal rocky shore assemblages. Oikos 117:376-389. Whittaker R (1960) Vegetation of the Siskiyou mountains, Oregon and California. Ecol

660 Monogr 30:279-338.

Whittaker R (1972) Evolution and measurement of species diversity. Taxon 21:213-

662 251.

Wootton JT (2005) Field parameterization and experimental test of the neutral theoryof biodiversity. Nature 433:309-312.

Table 1. Two-way permutational ANOVA testing the effects of disturbance timing on community dissimilarities among three regions (Northern Portugal, Azores and Canaries) throughout succession (time after clearance). * P < 0.05, ** P < 0.01, *** P < 0.001

		Jaccard		Bray-Curtis		Raup-Crick	
Source	df	MS	F	MS	F	MS	F
Region = R	2	928.07	28.59***	2380.40	15.08***	0.253	7.03**
Suc. Month = SM	5	179.41	4.91*	106.71	0.28	0.250	6.15**
R × SM	10	36.54	1.13	380.42	2.41*	0.041	1.13
Residual	36	32.46		157.82		0.036	

Figure captions

Fig 1. CAP ordination of samples based on the 4th-root transformed Bray-Curtis dissimilarity. Different symbols stand for the different times of clearance, whilst the colour gradient (shades of grey) stands for successional month, from 1 month (black) through controls (white). For clarity, data are the centroids for each location

Fig. 2. Mean (\pm SE) γ -to- α diversity ratio through succession at each region (black: Northern Portugal, grey: Azores, white: Canary Islands)

Fig. 3. Mean (± SE) dissimilarities among intertidal communities experimentally disturbed at different times of the year. Comparisons at different stages of succession at each of three regions (black: Northern Portugal, grey: Azores, white: Canary Islands)

Fig. 4. Bivariate plots between richness-based and abundance-based species exchange ratio (SER_r and SER_a) for each quadrat at successive successional stages. Different shades of grey represent different successional stages



Figure 1



Figure 2



Figure 3



