

When one phenotype is not enough: divergent evolutionary trajectories govern venom variation in a widespread rattlesnake species

Zancolli, Giulia; Calvete, Juan J.; Cardwell, Michael D.; Greene, Harry W.; Hayes, William K.; Hegarty, Matthew J.; Herrmann, Hans-Werner; Holycross, Andrew T.; Lannutti, Dominic I.; Mulley, John F.; Sanz, Libia; Travis, Zachary D.; Whorley, Joshua R.; Wuster, Catharine E.; Wuster, Wolfgang

Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences

DOI:
[10.1098/rspb.2018.2735](https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2018.2735)

Published: 13/03/2019

Peer reviewed version

[Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication](#)

Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA):

Zancolli, G., Calvete, J. J., Cardwell, M. D., Greene, H. W., Hayes, W. K., Hegarty, M. J., Herrmann, H.-W., Holycross, A. T., Lannutti, D. I., Mulley, J. F., Sanz, L., Travis, Z. D., Whorley, J. R., Wuster, C. E., & Wuster, W. (2019). When one phenotype is not enough: divergent evolutionary trajectories govern venom variation in a widespread rattlesnake species. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 286(1898), 20182735. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2018.2735>

Hawliau Cyffredinol / General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

1 **When one phenotype is not enough – divergent evolutionary trajectories govern venom**
2 **variation in a widespread rattlesnake species**

3 Giulia Zancolli^{1*}, Juan J. Calvete², Michael D. Cardwell³, Harry W. Greene⁴, William K. Hayes⁵,
4 Matthew J. Hegarty⁶, Hans-Werner Herrmann⁷, Andrew T. Holycross⁸, Dominic I. Lannutti⁹, John
5 F. Mulley¹, Libia Sanz², Zachary D. Travis⁵, Joshua R. Whorley¹⁰, Catharine E. Wüster¹,
6 Wolfgang Wüster¹

7
8 ¹Molecular Ecology and Fisheries Genetics Laboratory, School of Natural Sciences, Bangor
9 University, Bangor LL57 2UW, UK.

10 ²Evolutionary and Translational Venomics Laboratory, CSIC, Jaume Roig 11, Valencia 46010,
11 Spain.

12 ³Department of Biology, San Diego State University, San Diego 92182, California, USA.

13 ⁴Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, Corson Hall, Cornell University, Ithaca 14853,
14 New York, USA.

15 ⁵Department of Earth and Biological Sciences, School of Medicine, Loma Linda University, Loma
16 Linda 92350, California, USA.

17 ⁶Institute of Biological, Environmental and Rural Sciences, Aberystwyth University, Aberystwyth
18 SY23 3EE, UK.

19 ⁷Wildlife Conservation and Management, School of Natural Resources and the Environment,
20 University of Arizona, 1064 East Lowell Street (ENR2), Tucson 85721, Arizona, USA.

21 ⁸Natural History Collections, Arizona State University, 734 W. Alameda Drive, Tempe 85282,
22 Arizona, USA.

23 ⁹Department of Biological Sciences, University of Texas at El Paso, 500 W. University, El Paso
24 79968, Texas, USA.

25 ¹⁰Seattle Central College, Science, Technology, Engineering & Mathematics Division, 1701
26 Broadway Ave. E., Seattle 98122, Washington, USA.

27 * Current address: SIB - Swiss Institute of Bioinformatics, Rue du Bugnon 25A, 1011 Lausanne,
28 Switzerland. Tel: +41 21 545 44 03; Email: giulia.zancolli@gmail.com.

29

30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72

Abstract

Understanding the origin and maintenance of phenotypic variation, particularly across a continuous spatial distribution, represents a key challenge in evolutionary biology. For this, animal venoms represent ideal study systems: they are complex, variable, yet easily quantifiable molecular phenotypes with a clear function. Rattlesnakes display tremendous variation in their venom composition, mostly through strongly dichotomous venom strategies, which may even coexist within single species. Here, through dense, widespread population-level sampling of the Mojave rattlesnake, *Crotalus scutulatus*, we show that genomic structural variation at multiple loci underlies extreme geographic variation in venom composition, which is maintained despite extensive gene flow. Unexpectedly, neither diet composition nor neutral population structure explain venom variation. Instead, venom divergence is strongly correlated with environmental conditions. Individual toxin genes correlate with distinct environmental factors, suggesting that different selective pressures can act on individual loci independently of their co-expression patterns or genomic proximity. Our results challenge common assumptions about diet composition as the key selective driver of snake venom evolution and emphasise how the interplay between genomic architecture and local-scale spatial heterogeneity in selective pressures may facilitate the retention of adaptive functional polymorphisms across a continuous space.

Introduction

The origin and genetic basis of phenotypic variation, and its retention in a population in the face of both random and deterministic forces, are pivotal questions for our understanding of evolutionary adaptations. Functional polymorphisms typically segregate in spatially isolated populations [1,2] and/or discrete ecological conditions [3-5]. In contrast, it is much more challenging to dissect the evolutionary processes involved in adaptive geographic variation across a continuous spatial distribution [6]. As a result, relatively few studies have comprehensively examined the relationship between genomic architecture, the resulting phenotypic variation and the ecological pressures maintaining that variation in continuously distributed organisms [2].

Animal venoms represent exemplar models for investigating the genetic basis of phenotypic variation [7]. Genes encoding venom toxins are uniquely expressed in distinct, specialized glands, and their final product can be easily detected and quantified. This sidesteps the problem of pleiotropy in the genes involved in adaptive polygenic traits, which often obscures the phenotypic effects of individual genetic variants [8,9].

Rattlesnakes (*Crotalus*) produce highly complex and diverse venoms, with tens to hundreds of individual components. These venoms display a puzzling phenotypic dichotomy, with two largely mutually exclusive strategies: type A venoms are highly lethal and characterized by heterodimeric, presynaptic β -neurotoxic phospholipases A₂ (PLA₂), whereas type B venoms are less toxic and rich in snake venom metalloproteinases (SVMPs) with haemorrhagic and proteolytic activity [10]. The distribution of these phenotypes across the phylogeny of rattlesnakes is highly irregular: both types occur within most major clades, and even within some individual species (Figure S1) [10].

Multiple studies have explored the drivers of intraspecific variation in venom composition and found evidence for the effect of natural selection for the optimisation of venom to diet [7,11-13]. Even subtle differences, involving only a few low-expression toxins, appear to have selectively significant consequences [14]. This suggests that the much starker intraspecific variation in species

73 with both venom A and B populations would likely have very powerful selective consequences,
74 and thus predicts a strong effect of diet-related factors as drivers of this variation [15-17].

75 Whilst identifying selective drivers has been a significant research focus, the role of neutral factors,
76 such as past population fragmentation [18] or current gene flow, has received less attention.
77 Evolutionary theory traditionally emphasizes the role of gene flow in either facilitating the transfer
78 of selectively favourable alleles or reducing the potential for local adaptation through genotypic
79 homogenization [19]; nonetheless, the relative importance of gene flow and selection on venom
80 have rarely been compared directly. Although recent studies [20, 21] have identified selection and
81 inter-population genetic distances as better predictors of venom composition, those involved
82 subtler differentiation than the A/B dichotomy.

83 The Mojave rattlesnake (*Crotalus scutulatus*) represents an ideal system to study the causes and
84 mechanisms underlying variation in this remarkable molecular phenotype. Four highly distinct
85 phylogeographic lineages have been identified across its wide range in southwestern USA and
86 Mexico [17, 22]. Here, we focus on the Mojave-Sonoran clade, ranging from California to south-
87 western New Mexico, which in itself represents a microcosm of the phenomenon of extreme
88 intraspecific venom variation within a single population [22]: most individuals secrete type A
89 venoms characterised by the neurotoxic Mojave toxin (MTX), whereas snakes from central
90 Arizona secrete type B venoms. Intermediate A+B venoms containing both SVMPs and MTX are
91 found at the contact zones between the two venom types [23,24]. Additional toxins belonging to
92 different gene families, such as other, myotoxin (MYO) and C-type lectins (CTL), also show
93 geographic variation in their expression [16,24]. We therefore used the Mojave-Sonoran clade of
94 *C. scutulatus* to investigate the causes and mechanisms generating and maintaining
95 polymorphisms across a widespread and continuously distributed species. We performed densely
96 sampled population-level analysis of the genomic basis of venom variation, investigated
97 population structure and diet, and then used in-depth environmental association analysis (EEA)
98 and climate reconstruction to disentangle the dynamics between genotype, phenotype and
99 environment.

101 **Material and Methods**

102 **Approach.** Initially, we used in-depth proteomic analysis, genome sequencing and venom gland
103 transcriptomics of two field-caught adults of *C. scutulatus* from venom type A and B areas (Figure
104 1) to identify major toxins, and to design primers to test for the presence of specific toxin genes in
105 additional specimens. We then mapped phenotype onto genotype by comparing proteomic and
106 genomic presence/absence of toxins across a larger sample, and, after establishing a strict linkage,
107 extended this to additional specimens at genomic level only. We then correlated the venom profiles
108 with new, densely sampled population genetic data, geographic variation in diet, and physical,
109 climatic and vegetational parameters to understand the drivers of venom variation.

110 **Draft whole-genome sequencing.** For each representative individual we sequenced two genomic
111 libraries on an Illumina HiSeq2500. High-quality reads were assembled *de novo* using the CLC
112 Genomics Workbench platform v6.5, and contigs combined into scaffolds using SSPACE
113 Standard 3.0 [25]. Scaffolds containing putative toxin genes were identified by mapping all toxin
114 transcripts to genome assemblies using the GMAP software [26].

115 **Venom-gland transcriptomics.** Venom gland cDNA libraries of the two representatives were
116 sequenced on an Illumina HiSeq2500 and high-quality reads assembled *de novo* using Trinity 2.0.4
117 [27]. We identified all possible toxin transcripts with blastx searches against the NCBI
118 nonredundant (nr) protein sequences [28], UniProtKB [29] and a custom database containing only
119 toxin protein sequences. Homologous toxin transcripts were identified by reciprocal blast analysis
120 and considered homologous if the coding sequences were 99% identical, with minimum 70%
121 sequence coverage. Absence of toxins due to failure of Trinity to recover venom transcripts was
122 verified by reciprocal mapping of reads against either transcriptomes and investigation of the
123 proteome (see below).

124 **Venom proteomics.** To link venom proteins to their corresponding transcripts we analysed the
125 venoms of the two representative snakes by RP-HPLC and obtained molecular masses and peptide
126 sequences [30]. All sequences were blasted against the NCBI non-redundant database and the
127 venom-gland transcriptome assemblies using tblastn adjusted for short sequences. RP-HPLC
128 venom profiles of 50 additional specimens from different geographic areas were then examined to
129 identify the most highly expressed and variable toxins, and to test whether variation in venom
130 composition is caused by genome-level differences (see below).

131 **Toxin genotyping.** We selected toxins that were unambiguously scorable as either absent or highly
132 expressed in the proteome, and designed gene-specific primer pairs based on our genomic
133 scaffolds using the Primer-BLAST tool [31]. Amplification specificity was checked against our
134 two transcriptomes and the NCBI nucleotide database. Twelve toxin genes belonging to five
135 families were selected for further investigation (see electronic supplementary material, Table S3),
136 in addition to the acidic (MTXa) and basic (MTXb) subunit genes of Mojave toxin [32]. Up to 163
137 individuals were screened for toxin gene presence, PCR products were checked on 1.5% agarose
138 gel, and a subset were sequenced to verify consistency of primer specificity. Sequences were
139 blasted against the NCBI nucleotide (nt) and whole-genome shotgun contigs (wgs) databases.
140 Pairwise Pearson correlation coefficients were calculated to test for linkage between toxin genes.

141 Given the absolute link between presence/absence of toxins in the proteome and the corresponding
142 coding genes (see below), we expanded our sampling by genotyping additional individuals without
143 proteomic information (e.g., road killed specimens) to assess toxin gene distributions.

144 **Venom fingerprinting.** Proteomic techniques allow detailed characterisation of individual venom
145 components, but do not allow for large-scale, standardised comparisons of overall variation and
146 diversity [30]. To increase our sampling and standardise our phenotype comparisons, we analysed
147 the same 50 venoms (see above) and 48 additional samples by on-chip electrophoresis [30]. All
148 samples were from adult snakes. The binary matrix of protein peak presence/absence was used to
149 calculate Shannon diversity index and pairwise Bray-Curtis dissimilarity matrices for subsequent
150 analyses.

151 **Population genetic analysis.** After preliminary analyses, we genotyped 290 specimens at 13
152 microsatellite loci (Table S5) (see electronic supplementary materials for details). Population
153 structure was determined using the spatial Bayesian clustering algorithm in TESS 2.3.1 [33].
154 Partitioning of genetic variation within and across subpopulations as inferred by TESS was
155 examined using analysis of molecular genetic variance (AMOVA) in GenAlex [34]. To test
156 whether spatial genetic patterns and population structure are the results of recent genetic
157 bottlenecks, heterozygosity excess and deficit were tested using the software BOTTLENECK
158 v1.2.02 [35] and Genepop [36].

159 Isolation by distance (IBD) was tested between pairs of individuals in GenAlex. A pairwise genetic
160 distance matrix was then estimated based on the proportion of shared alleles (*Dps*) [37] between
161 localities and used in a Mantel test against Euclidean geographic distances.

162 **Inference of past distributions.** To test whether current variation in venom composition could be
163 the result of past range fragmentation due to climatic changes, we performed niche modelling
164 using the program M_AXEnt [38]. Georeferenced occurrence localities of the Mojave-Sonoran
165 clade of *C. scutulatus* were gathered from the VertNet (<http://vertnet.org>) and Global Biodiversity
166 Information Facility (www.gbif.org) databases. Current climatic data were obtained from the
167 WorldClim 1.4 database (<http://www.worldclim.org>) at 30 sec resolution [39]. To avoid
168 collinearity, highly correlated variables (Pearson's coefficient $|r| \geq 0.8$) were pruned based on a
169 pairwise correlation matrix, leaving a total of 13 climatic variables (Table S10 and S11). Past
170 climatic data for the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) were obtained from simulations with Global
171 Climate Models (GCMs) estimated by the Community Climate System Models (CCSM), and data
172 from the Last Interglacial (LIG) were obtained from [40]. All models were run with default
173 regularization and 10 replicates subsampled, using 20% of the points for test and 80% for training
174 each replicate. We generated ecological niche models for the species as well as for each individual
175 toxin gene, and used present-day climate envelopes for inference of past distributions.

176 **Statistical analysis workflow.** All statistical analyses were performed in R version 3.4.2 [41]
177 using two approaches. First, we grouped individuals into discrete localities delineated by sampling
178 gaps and valley/mountain ridge systems. Individuals falling between localities were excluded.
179 Although this approach has the drawback of removing samples collected between localities, it can
180 exploit population-based association approaches, such as testing for relationships between venom
181 phenotype and diet composition. We ran Mantel and partial Mantel tests (controlling for
182 geographic distance) in the *vegan* 2.4-4 package [42] using the following response distance
183 matrices: i) venom phenotype: mean pairwise Bray-Curtis dissimilarities between localities
184 calculated from on-chip fingerprinting binary matrix; ii) venom genotype: pairwise Bray-Curtis
185 dissimilarity matrices based on toxin gene frequencies (one per gene).

186 Second, we used an individual-based approach, including all samples, to allow better detection of
187 association along gradients. For the venom phenotype, we analysed patterns of variation using
188 non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS) based on a pairwise Bray-Curtis distance matrix
189 and used the individual scores on the first two axes as response variables in regression models. For
190 the venom genotype, presence or absence of each toxin gene were used as response variables in
191 logistic regression models using the *glm* (generalized linear model) function with binomial
192 (`link="logit"`) error distribution.

193 False discovery rates for all p-values of multiple comparison analyses were corrected using the
194 method of Benjamini & Hochberg [43]. One locality ("Gila"), where we were unable to collect
195 venoms, was only included in the genotype analysis.

196 **Venom variation and current gene flow.** Multiple approaches were used to test whether variation
197 in venom composition reflects current patterns of gene flow and neutral genetic structure. First,
198 we used AMOVA in GenAlex to estimate numbers of migrants and compare molecular variance
199 between (i) the three major venom types (i.e. A, B, A+B), and (ii) sampling localities. Secondly,
200 we ran partial Mantel tests between venom and genetic (*Dps*) distance matrices based on localities.
201 Finally, we tested for correlations between individual-level venom variation and neutral genetic
202 structure using the admixture proportions estimated by TESS as the explanatory variables.

203 **Venom variation and diet.** To test whether geographic variation in venom phenotype and
204 distribution of toxin genes is associated with differences in diet composition, we recorded stomach
205 and gut contents from 463 preserved, geo-referenced specimens from museum collections. All
206 prey items were either mammals or reptiles, except for three amphibians, two arthropods and one
207 bird, which were excluded from further analyses. Altogether, 445 items were identified to class
208 level, 327 to family, 249 to genus, and 192 to species level.

209 For each taxonomic level we calculated the “frequency occurrence”, defined as the number of
210 samples in which a food item occurs expressed as a frequency of the total number of samples with
211 identifiable prey [44], the most commonly used method for diet analysis [45]. For each locality,
212 we used the frequency occurrence to calculate two measures of diet composition: i) diet niche
213 overlap, ranging from 0 (no overlap) to 1 (complete overlap), describes diet composition similarity
214 between localities and corresponds to the pairwise Bray-Curtis dissimilarity index; ii) niche width
215 (Shannon diversity index) describes the diet diversity within a locality, with values near 0
216 indicating a narrow niche and values near 1 a broad niche. Both metrics were calculated with prey
217 identified to class, family, genus and species level. Pairwise distance matrices based on these
218 metrics were used for Mantel tests. Additionally, we tested for correlation between venom
219 diversity and niche width, and between frequencies of individual prey species and toxin genes in
220 order to identify potential key species involved in predator-prey arm races.

221 **Environmental association analysis (EAA).** To test whether the observed variation in venom
222 phenotype and toxin gene distributions were associated with spatial heterogeneity, and to identify
223 environmental factors potentially contributing to local adaptation and genetic variation, we
224 performed EAA.

225 In addition to the WorldClim data (see above), we used the high resolution digital elevation model
226 (DEM) raster (<http://asterweb.jpl.nasa.gov>) to produce additional topographic variables including
227 slope, solar radiation, aspect and topographic position index (TPI) using the Spatial Analyst
228 toolbox in ArcMap 10.3 (ESRI®). Land cover data describing North American ecological areas
229 (level III “ecoregions”) were obtained from the US EPA ([https://www.epa.gov/eco-](https://www.epa.gov/eco-research/ecoregions-north-america)
230 [research/ecoregions-north-america](https://www.epa.gov/eco-research/ecoregions-north-america)), and vegetation data from the Gap Analysis Project
231 (<https://gapanalysis.usgs.gov/gaplandcover/data/download/>).

232 Patterns of environmental heterogeneity across the study areas were examined using Principal
233 Component Analysis (PCA), and the significance of differences between localities were tested
234 with pairwise t-tests.

235 For climatic and topographic variables, Euclidean distance matrices were calculated based on the
236 average values within each locality, whereas for categorical variables (ecoregion and vegetation)
237 distance matrices were generated based on the proportion of each factor level within localities.
238 Prior to Mantel test analysis the BIOENV procedure [46] in the *vegan* package was used to reduce
239 the climatic variables contributing to the final distance matrix. This function calculates Euclidean
240 distances for all possible subsets of scaled climatic variables and finds the maximum Spearman
241 (rank) correlation with the response distance matrix.

242 In the individual-level analysis, univariate regression models were generated for all variables in
243 order to identify the strength, direction and nature of the relationships between each environmental
244 factor and venom variation/toxin gene presence. We also generated climatic niche models for the
245 individual genes using the WorldClim data, and used MaxEnt to generate predicted distribution
246 maps for each.

247 **Gradient analysis.** To investigate local environmental patterns at the interface between the two
248 main venom types, we performed a gradient analysis to test associations between phenotypic or
249 genetic variation and environmental factors along a continuous cline. We identified two suitable
250 venom B – venom A transects, one running west (“Maricopa”) and the other south (“Sasabe”) from
251 the core of the venom B area (Figure 3b). We intensively sampled these two transects and tested
252 for presence of MTX and SVMP genes. Trends along the transects were analysed for each climatic
253 variable.

254 255 **Results and Discussion**

256 **Venom variation is due to structural genomic variation.** High-throughput genome sequencing
257 of *C. scutulatus* generated 652865 contigs for the venom type A representative individual and
258 597176 for the type B, with sequencing coverage of approximately 8x (Table S1). RNA-Seq of
259 the venom glands generated 37162 contigs for the venom A and 56627 for the type B (Table S2).
260 We identified a total of 96 unique toxin transcripts in the venom A transcriptome and 115 in the
261 venom B. Both venom gland transcriptomes and proteomes showed marked differences, with
262 several toxins highly expressed in either one or the other venom (Figure S2 and S3), including
263 SVMPs, PLA₂s, serine proteases (SVSPs), C-type lectins (CTLs) and myotoxin (MYO).

264 Comparison of the proteomic profiles and genotypes of 50 specimens confirmed that the presence
265 or absence of 14 differentially expressed toxins in the proteome was invariably associated with the
266 presence or absence of the corresponding coding genes (Figure S4). This was previously
267 documented for MTX, other PLA₂s and SVMPs [16,32], and is here confirmed for CTLs and
268 MYO. Based on this strict phenotype-genotype link, we analysed the spatial distribution of toxin
269 genes in a larger sample to identify gene complexes and linkage patterns (Figure 2a, Table S4). In
270 both main venom types, some genes appeared tightly linked, whereas others varied independently.
271 In the core venom B area there were two main genotypes, both characterized by the presence of
272 SVMPs, PLA₂s (gA1, gB1 and gK) and CTL-B7, but differing in the presence of myotoxin
273 (MyoB). Much greater diversity was observed across the venom A genotypes: all were
274 characterized by the tightly linked neurotoxic MTXa and MTXb, the absence of SVMPs, PLA₂gK
275 and gB1, but varied in the occurrence of PLA₂gA1, MyoB and CTL-B7, each with unique spatial
276 distribution patterns. While MTXa and MTXb, as well as PLA₂gK and gB1, remained linked in
277 all specimens, other linkages between gene complexes were disrupted across the contact zone
278 between venom types, where mixed (A+B) genotypes and multiple different gene combinations
279 occur. Interestingly, the intergrade zones also produced three individuals lacking both neurotoxic
280 MTX and SVMP genes (type O), suggesting that mating between mixed genotypes can not only
281 disrupt adaptive genomic linkages, but even lead to the complete loss of multiple key components.
282 This raises the question how these different genomic variants persist in the species, and what
283 determines the distribution of venom phenotypes.

284 **Venom variation is not associated with population genetic structure.** Our climatic niche
285 modelling suggests a past range fragmentation into western, Sonoran (AZW), and eastern,
286 Madrean (AZE), refuges (Figure 2b). Both TESS and sPCA detected a genetic discontinuity with
287 extensive admixture corresponding to the boundaries between the Sonoran and Madrean
288 ecoregions (Figure 2b), reflecting predicted Pleistocene vicariance and consistent with postglacial
289 range expansion. No evidence of recent bottlenecks (Table S6) or further subpopulation structuring
290 (Figure S6 and S7) was detected. Our results contrast with previous inferences of panmixia within

291 the Mojave-Sonoran clade of *C. scutulatus*, based on analyses of mtDNA, or RADseq data from
292 much smaller samples [22,47].

293 Since the two genetic clusters did not predict the distribution of venom types (Figure 2a, Table
294 S8), we further assessed the relationship between venom composition and genetic structure by
295 grouping the samples geographically into localities (Figure 1b) and calculating venom distance
296 matrices and toxin gene frequencies. Overall genetic differentiation was weak, including between
297 venom A and B localities ($F_{st} = 0.003-0.05$), with high levels of gene flow ($N_m = 8-75$). Analysis
298 of genetic variation showed evidence of deviation from Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (HWE) and
299 heterozygosity deficit in the venom B and adjoining localities, suggesting strong selective regimes
300 (Table S7). AMOVA analysis grouping either by venom types or localities confirmed an absence
301 of finer substructure, with most of the variance arising from within individuals (Table S8). Partial
302 Mantel tests showed no significant association between venom phenotype variation and neutral
303 genetic distance; similarly, individual toxin gene frequencies were not correlated with gene flow
304 (Table 1). While a significant pattern of isolation by distance (IBD) (Mantel $r^2=0.70$, $p=0.006$),
305 weak genetic structure ($F_{st}=0.02$) and heterozygosity deficit ($p=0.001$) are consistent with
306 population expansion following LGM, the complete absence of association between phenotype
307 and neutral genetic differentiation suggests that strong selective forces are driving the distribution
308 of venom types, rather than differentiation in allopatry followed by range expansion.

309 **Venom composition is not associated with diet spectrum.** Because adaptation to diet is generally
310 invoked as the foremost driver of venom evolution [11,14,16,17,47,48], we tested whether the
311 divergent phenotypes are associated with differences in local diet. Our diet data show that *C.*
312 *scutulatus* feeds primarily on small mammals, with the rodent families Heteromyidae and
313 Cricetidae alone constituting 78.8% of prey items (Figure 1b and S8b). Partial Mantel tests found
314 no significant association between overall venom composition and diet spectrum measured as
315 niche overlap or niche width, irrespective of whether the spectrum was resolved to class, family,
316 genus or species level (Table 1).

317 Similarly, we found no significant pairwise relationships between individual toxin gene
318 frequencies and individual prey species; in particular, neither MTX nor SVMPs, the two main
319 players in the venom dichotomy, were linked to any specific prey. We also tested the hypothesis
320 that more complex venoms would allow predation upon a more diverse array of prey [49].
321 Interestingly, we found the opposite trend: localities with less diverse venoms had broader prey
322 spectra, although this was only weakly significant (Figure S8a). None of the frequencies of the
323 individual toxin genes were significantly correlated with either diet composition or niche width,
324 except PLA_2gA1 , an inhibitor of ADP-induced platelet aggregation [50], which showed a strong
325 association with climate and ecoregion, and a weaker, but significant, correlation with diet
326 composition at the family level (Table 1). The functional significance of this is unclear, as this
327 gene is widespread in the genomes of both type A and type B rattlesnakes in general [16]. Whether
328 this association is due to direct selection for diet or a partial correlation between diet and climate
329 or ecoregion is also unclear.

330 Because the primary function of venom in snakes is prey acquisition [7], adaptation to specific diet
331 as the key selective driver of venom evolution has become the dominant paradigm in the study of
332 snake venom evolution. Since even subtle variation in venom composition can reflect selection for
333 local prey [12,14], we had hypothesized that the stark contrast in toxicity and mode of action
334 (neurotoxic vs. haemorrhagic) between A and B venoms in *C. scutulatus* would have a significant
335 impact on the snakes' foraging biology. Our results thus challenge the widespread assumption of

336 diet composition as the main determinant of the venom dichotomy in this or other rattlesnake
337 species [16,17] and its universality as a selective driver of snake venom evolution in general [7].

338 **Spatial environmental heterogeneity predicts venom variation.** Spatial heterogeneity in
339 environmental variables is a key driver of genotypic and phenotypic polymorphism [51]. In the
340 absence of a strong venom-diet association, we performed EAA to understand whether differences
341 in other biotic and/or abiotic factors contribute to geographic variation of venom composition
342 [47,52,53]. Overall venom variation was strongly associated with temperature (Table 1), and the
343 longitudinal climatic gradient characterizing the Sonoran desert (Figure S9 and S10) was reflected
344 in the differentiation across venom A profiles along the first NMDS axis (Figure 3a). In contrast,
345 the second NMDS axis, which broadly separates A and B venoms, showed weaker correlations
346 (TableS12). However, across a large, continuous distribution without discrete physical barriers,
347 large-scale analyses may fail to detect the effect of local ecotones and short environmental clines
348 of potential selective importance. We thus analysed local scale climatic trends along two A-B
349 transects and discovered sharp clines for several variables (Figure 3b-g). In agreement with this
350 and previous findings [47,53], logistic regression models revealed significant associations of MTX
351 and SVMPs with climatic variables, with venom B areas characterized by larger diurnal thermal
352 fluctuations, milder winters and less seasonal variation in precipitation (Table S12).

353 The other toxin genes, even though highly co-expressed in some phenotypes, showed different
354 correlation patterns, suggesting that different selective forces orchestrate individual loci to create
355 complex, dynamic phenotypes (Table S12). Strikingly, genes located few kb apart, such as some
356 PLA₂s [15], also displayed independent associations, demonstrating that divergent selective
357 pressures can differentially affect parts of the same genomic region. Climatic niche modelling of
358 the distribution of individual toxin genes yielded different predictions even for neighbouring
359 genes, and the models proved to be accurate predictors of gene distribution (Figure S5),
360 emphasising the environment-genotype link. This interesting phenomenon deserves further
361 investigation, since genes coding for the same adaptive phenotype are generally brought closer
362 together by means of chromosomal rearrangements such as inversions or supergenes [54].

363 **Genome, environment and the maintenance of geographic variation.** The emerging picture of
364 the mechanisms and drivers governing venom variation in *C. scutulatus* is thus one of adaptive
365 polymorphism with gene flow, with the distribution of toxin genes shaped by directional natural
366 selection for local environmental factors other than diet spectrum or neutral gene flow. Margres et
367 al. [20] recently suggested that gene flow may be more likely to drive venom composition in
368 dietary generalists than in specialists; the lack of association between gene flow and venom
369 composition in the specialist mammal-feeder *C. scutulatus* is consistent with this, but the lack of
370 association between diet spectrum and venom suggests that other determinants are involved.

371 The precise nature and mechanism of selection, and especially the association of venom with
372 environmental parameters, remain unclear. It seems to us unlikely that climate by itself exerts
373 strong selection on venom composition. In fact, the generally positive association between type B
374 venoms and higher winter temperatures runs contrary to the hypothesis that SVMPs are needed to
375 assist digestion at lower temperatures [10, 55]. However, climatic stability and seasonality may
376 affect other factors, for instance prey community composition and dynamics [52]. These, in turn,
377 could influence snake foraging strategies, and potentially also the exposure of snakes to predation,
378 an understudied source of selection on venom [56]. In widely distributed species occupying diverse
379 environmental conditions, spatial heterogeneity could thus select for local fitness optima, resulting
380 in the maintenance of disparate, locally adaptive gene complexes.

381 While venom composition does not correlate with diet spectrum, the possibility of more subtle
382 diet-related selection deserves further study: predator-prey arms races, pitting resistance to venom
383 in prey against the snakes' venom, appear to be important drivers of venom evolution in at least
384 some cases [12]. While many desert rodents display resistance to type B venoms [57], there are
385 virtually no corresponding data for type A venoms. Geographic variation in the prevalence of prey
386 resistance to different venom types, perhaps correlated with other environmental variables, could
387 conceivably act as a driver of venom composition in *C. scutulatus*. This could constitute a fruitful
388 focus for future research. Potential prey-specific toxicity in PLA₂gA1, the only diet-associated
389 toxin, may also repay further investigation.

390 As in previous studies [47,53], we hypothesise that disruptive selection against intermediate A+B
391 phenotypes may ensure spatial segregation, thereby favouring persistence of gene complexes and
392 divergent phenotypes. The role of relatively subtle environmental changes in driving the dramatic
393 differences in venom composition in this species, coupled with selection against intermediate
394 phenotypes, suggests the existence of steep clines in the adaptive fitness landscape, where one
395 phenotype gains a selective advantage over the other across short geographic distances. However,
396 the proximate factors mediating the geographic variation in selection pressures remain to be fully
397 understood.

398 **Conclusions.** The unique genomic architecture of rattlesnake venom provides an important
399 addition to the catalogue of mechanisms underlying adaptive phenotypic variation, and establishes
400 a promising system for investigating the ecological and evolutionary implications of genomic
401 structural variation in non-model organisms. Together, our results emphasise the importance of
402 combining large-scale genotype, phenotype and ecological data in natural populations to uncover
403 the wide variety of mechanisms and drivers underlying phenotypic variation, and emphasise the
404 need to consider a multitude of factors as potential selective drivers of phenotypic variation.

405 **Data accessibility.** Raw Illumina sequences have been deposited in the European Nucleotide
406 Archive (ENA) under project accession PRJEB29193. RNA-seq accession numbers: venom type
407 A: ERS2793705 (right venom gland); ERS2793704 (left venom gland); type B: ERS2793703
408 (right venom gland). Whole genome sequencing accession numbers: type A: ERS2793891 (300bp
409 insert) and ERS2793890 (600bp insert); type B: ERS2793893 (300bp insert) and ERS2793892
410 (600bp insert). Toxin gene sequences are deposited in GenBank with accession numbers:
411 MG948948-MG949116. Sample localities, microsatellite and diet data are found at
412 doi:10.5061/dryad.d21k432.

413 **Authors' contributions.** Conceptualization: WW, GZ; Formal analysis: GZ; Methodology: GZ,
414 JJC, MH; Investigation: all authors; Writing – original draft: GZ; review & editing: all authors.

415 **Competing interests.** The authors declare no competing interests.

416 **Funding:** Leverhulme Trust Grant RPG 2013-315 to WW, Santander Early Career Research
417 Scholarship to GZ, Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad Grant BFU2013-42833-P to JJC.

418 **Acknowledgments.** We are grateful to the numerous friends and colleagues who helped with
419 fieldwork and sample collection. G. Whiteley, R.A. Harrison and R. Morgan performed venom-
420 gland dissection. A. Foote provided insightful comments. Fieldwork carried out under Arizona
421 Game and Fish Department permits SP684786, SP724028 and SP760658 and New Mexico
422 Department of Game and Fish Authorization 3542.

423 **References**

- 424 1. Mayr E, 1947 Ecological factors in speciation. *Evolution* **1**, 263–288.
- 425 2. Bosse M *et al.* 2017 Recent natural selection causes adaptive evolution of an avian polygenic
426 trait. *Science* **358**, 365–368.
- 427 3. Levene H, 1953 Genetic equilibrium when more than one ecological niche is available. *Am. Nat.*
428 **87**, 331–333.
- 429 4. Hedrick PW, 2006 Genetic polymorphism in heterogeneous environments: the age of genomics.
430 *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol.* **37**, 67–93.
- 431 5. Chakraborty M, Fry JD, 2016 Evidence that environmental heterogeneity maintains a detoxifying
432 enzyme polymorphism in *Drosophila melanogaster*. *Curr. Biol.* **26**, 219–223.
- 433 6. Foote AD, 2018 Sympatric speciation in the genomic era. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **33**, 85–95.
- 434 7. Casewell NR, Wüster W, Vonk FJ, Harrison RA, Fry BG, 2013 Complex cocktails: the
435 evolutionary novelty of venoms. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **28**, 219–229.
- 436 8. Stern DL, Orgogozo V, 2008 The loci of evolution: how predictable is genetic evolution?
437 *Evolution* **62**, 2155–2177.
- 438 9. Seehausen O *et al.* 2014 Genomics and the origin of species. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* **15**, 176–192.
- 439 10. Mackessy SP, 2008 Venom composition in rattlesnakes: trends and biological significance. In
440 *Biology of the Rattlesnakes* (eds WK Hayes KR Beaman MD Cardwell, SP Bush) , pp. 495–510.
441 Loma Linda, CA: Loma Linda University Press)
- 442 11. Daltry JC, Wüster W, Thorpe RS, 1996 Diet and snake venom evolution. *Nature* **379**, 537–540.
- 443 12. Holding ML, Biardi JE, Gibbs HL, 2016 Coevolution of venom function and venom resistance
444 in a rattlesnake predator and its squirrel prey. *Proc. R. Soc. London Ser B*, **283**, 20152841.
- 445 13. Smiley-Walters SA, Farrell TM, Gibbs HL, 2017 Evaluating local adaptation of a complex
446 phenotype: reciprocal tests of pigmy rattlesnake venoms on treefrog prey. *Oecologia* **184**: 739-
447 748.
- 448 14. Margres MJ, Wray KP, Hassinger ATB, Ward MJ, McGivern JJ, Lemmon EM, Lemmon AR,
449 Rokyta DR, 2017 Quantity, not quality: rapid adaptation in a polygenic trait proceeded
450 exclusively through expression differentiation. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **34**, 3099–3110.
- 451 15. Dowell NL, Giorgianni MW, Kassner VA, Selegue JE, Sánchez EE, Carroll SB, 2016 The deep
452 origin and recent loss of venom toxin genes in rattlesnakes. *Curr. Biol.* **26**, 2434–2445.
- 453 16. Dowell NL, Giorgianni MW, Griffin S, Kassner VA, Selegue JE, Sánchez EE, Carroll SB, 2018
454 Extremely divergent haplotypes in two toxin gene complexes encode alternative venom types
455 within rattlesnake species. *Curr. Biol.* **28**, 1016–1026.
- 456 17. Strickland JL, Mason AJ, Rokyta DR, Parkinson CL, 2018 Phenotypic variation in Mojave
457 rattlesnake (*Crotalus scutulatus*) venom is driven by four toxin families. *Toxins* **10**, 135.
- 458 18. Hewitt G, 2000 The genetic legacy of the Quaternary ice ages. *Nature* **405**, 907–913.
- 459 19. Räsäner K & Hendry AP, 2008 Disentangling interactions between adaptive divergence and
460 gene flow when ecology drives diversification. *Ecol. Lett.* **11**, 624–636.

- 461 20. Margres MJ, Patton A, Wray KP, Hassinger ATB, Ward MJ, Lemmon EM, Lemmon AR,
462 Rokyta DR, 2018 Tipping the scales: the migration-selection balance leans towards selection in
463 snake venoms. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* in press. (doi:10.1093/molbev/mst012)
- 464 21. Holding ML, Margres MJ, Rokyta DR, Gibbs HL, 2018 Local prey community composition and
465 genetic distance predict venom divergence among populations of the northern Pacific rattlesnake
466 (*Crotalus oreganus*). *J. Evol. Biol.* doi: 10.1111/jeb.13347
- 467 22. Schield DR *et al.* 2018 Cryptic genetic diversity, population structure, and gene flow in the
468 Mojave rattlesnake (*Crotalus scutulatus*), *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* **127**, 669–681.
- 469 23. Glenn JL, Straight RC, Wolfe MC, Hardy DL, 1983 Geographical variation in *Crotalus*
470 *scutulatus scutulatus* (Mojave rattlesnake) venom properties. *Toxicon* **21**, 119–130.
- 471 24. Massey DJ, Calvete JJ, Sánchez EE, Sanz L, Richards K, Curtis R, Boesen K, 2012 Venom
472 variability and envenoming severity outcomes of the *Crotalus scutulatus scutulatus* (Mojave
473 rattlesnake) from Southern Arizona. *J. Proteomics* **75**, 2576–2587.
- 474 25. Boetzer M, Henkel CV, Jansen HJ, Butler D, Pirovano W, 2011 Scaffolding pre- assembled
475 contigs using SSPACE. *Bioinformatics* **27**, 578–579.
- 476 26. Wu TD, Watanabe CK, 2005 GMAP: a genomic mapping and alignment program for mRNA
477 and EST sequences. *Bioinformatics* **21**, 1859–1875.
- 478 27. Grabherr MG *et al.* 2011 Full-length transcriptome assembly from RNA-Seq data without a
479 reference genome. *Nat. Biotechnol.* **29**, 644–652.
- 480 28. NCBI Resource Coordinators, 2013 Database resources of the National Center for
481 Biotechnology Information. *Nucleic Acids Res.* **41**, D8–D20.
- 482 29. The UniProt Consortium, 2014 UniProt: a hub for protein information. *Nucleic Acids Res.* **43**,
483 D204–D212.
- 484 30. Zancolli G, Sanz J, Calvete JJ, Wüster W, 2017 Venom on-a-chip: a fast and efficient method
485 for comparative venomics. *Toxins* **9**, 179.
- 486 31. Ye J, Coulouris G, Zaretskaya I, Cutcutache I, Rozen S and TL Madsen, 2012 Primer-BLAST: a
487 tool to design target-specific primers for polymerase chain reaction. *BMC Bioinformatics* **13**,
488 134.
- 489 32. Zancolli G *et al.* 2016 Is hybridization a source of adaptive venom variation in rattlesnakes? A
490 test, using a *Crotalus scutulatus* x *viridis* hybrid zone in Southwestern New Mexico. *Toxins* **8**,
491 188.
- 492 33. Chen C, Durand E, Forbes F, François O, 2007 Bayesian clustering algorithms ascertaining
493 spatial population structure: a new computer program and a comparison study. *Mol. Ecol. Notes*
494 **7**, 747–756.
- 495 34. Peakall R, Smouse PE, 2006 Genalex 6: genetic analysis in Excel. Population genetic software
496 for teaching and research. *Mol. Ecol. Notes* **6**, 288–295.
- 497 35. Piry S, Luikart G, Cornuet J-M, 1999 BOTTLENECK: a computer program for detecting recent
498 reductions in the effective population size using allele frequency data. *J. Hered.* **90**, 502–503.
- 499 36. Raymond M, Rousset F, 1995. GENEPOP (Version 1. 2): population genetics software for exact
500 tests and ecumenicism. *J. Hered.* **86**, 248–249.

- 501 37. Bowcock AM, Ruiz-Linares A, Tomfohrde J, Minch E, Kidd JR, Cavalli-Sforza LL, 1994 High
502 resolution of human evolutionary trees with polymorphic microsatellites. *Nature* **368**, 455–457.
- 503 38. Phillips SJ, Anderson RP, Schapire RE, 2006 Maximum entropy modeling of species
504 geographic distributions. *Ecol. Model.* **190**, 231–259.
- 505 39. Hijmans RJ, Cameron SE, Parra JL, Jones PG, Jarvis A, 2005 Very high resolution interpolated
506 climate surfaces for global land areas. *Int J Climatolog* **25**, 1965–1978.
- 507 40. Otto-Bliesner BL *et al.* 2006 Simulating arctic climate warmth and icefield retreat in the last
508 Interglaciation. *Science* **311**, 1751–1753.
- 509 41. R Development Core Team, 2017 R: a language and environment for statistical computing (R
510 Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna), <https://www.R-project.org/>.
- 511 42. Oksanen J *et al.* 2017 Vegan: Community Ecology Package. R package version 2. 4-4.
512 <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=vegan>
- 513 43. Benjamini Y, Hochberg Y, 1995 Controlling the false discovery rate: a practical and powerful
514 approach to multiple testing. *J. R. Stat. Soc. B* **57**, 289–300.
- 515 44. Amundsen PA, Gabler HM, Staldvik FJ, 1996 A new approach to graphical analysis of feeding
516 strategy from stomach contents data—modification of the Costello (1990) method. *J Fish Biol*,
517 **48**, 607–614.
- 518 45. Davis NE *et al.*, 2015 Interspecific and geographic variation in the diets of sympatric
519 carnivores: dingoes/wild dogs and red foxes in south-eastern Australia. *PLOS ONE* **10**,
520 e0120975.
- 521 46. Clarke KR, Ainsworth M, 1993 A method of linking multivariate community structure to
522 environmental variables. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* **92**, 205–219.
- 523 47. Strickland JC *et al.*, 2018 Evidence for divergent patterns of local selection driving venom
524 variation in Mojave rattlesnakes (*Crotalus scutulatus*). *Scientific Reports* **8**, 17622.
- 525 48. Barlow A, Pook CE, Harrison RA, Wüster W, 2009 Co-evolution of diet and prey-specific
526 venom activity supports the role of selection in snake venom evolution. *Proc. R. Soc. London Ser*
527 *B* **276**, 2443–2449.
- 528 49. Phuong MA, Mahardika GN, Alfaro ME, 2016 Dietary breadth is positively correlated with
529 venom complexity in cone snails. *BMC Genomics* **17**, 401.
- 530 50. Tsai IH, Wang YM, Chen YH, Tu AT, 2003 Geographic variations, cloning, and functional
531 analyses of the venom acidic phospholipases A2 of *Crotalus viridis viridis*. *Arch. Biochem.*
532 *Biophys.* **411**, 289–296.
- 533 51. Wang IJ, Bradburd GS, 2014 Isolation by environment. *Mol. Ecol.* **23**, 5649–5662.
- 534 52. Gren ECK *et al.*, 2017 Geographic variation of venom composition and neurotoxicity in the
535 rattlesnakes *Crotalus oreganus* and *C. helleri*: assessing the potential roles of selection and
536 neutral evolutionary processes in shaping venom variation. In *Biology of the Rattlesnakes II* (eds
537 MJ Dreslik, WK Hayes, SJ Beaupre, SP Mackessy), pp. 228–252. Rodeo, NM: Eco
538 Herpetological Publishing and Distribution,

- 539 53. Zancolli G et al., 2018 When one phenotype is not enough – divergent evolutionary trajectories
540 govern venom variation in a widespread rattlesnake species. *BioRxiv* preprint,
541 <https://doi.org/10.1101/413831>
- 542 54. Thompson MJ, Jiggins CD, 2014 Supergenes and their role in evolution. *Heredity* **113**, 1–8.
- 543 55. Thomas RG, Pough FH, 1979 The effect of rattlesnake venom on digestion of prey. *Toxicon* **17**,
544 221–228.
- 545 56. Gangur AN, Seymour JE, Liddell MJ, Wilson D, Smout MJ, Northfield TD, 2017 When is
546 overkill optimal? Tritrophic interactions reveal new insights into venom evolution. *Theor. Ecol.*
547 **11**, 141–149.
- 548 57. Perez JC, Haws WC, Garcia VE, Jennings BM, 1978 Resistance of warm-blooded animals to
549 snake venoms. *Toxicon* **16**, 375–383.

550

551 **Legends:**

552 **Figure 1. Geographic variation in venom and diet of adult *C. scutulatus*.** (a) Distribution of
553 samples for which the major venom types were identified based on toxin genotypes; stars represent
554 the sampling locations of the two representative individuals used for the genome-transcriptome-
555 proteome analyses. (b) Two-ring pie-charts showing the proportion of mammals and reptiles from
556 stomach contents (inner charts) and venom types (outer ring) for each locality.

557 **Figure 2. Toxin genotype and niche modelling.** (a) Presence-absence matrix of toxin genes and
558 admixture plot (TESS) with $K=2$. (b) Niche models and sample distribution of the Mojave-Sonoran
559 clade of *Crotalus scutulatus* with individuals represented by proportion of genetic clusters. Grey
560 lines delineate ecoregion boundaries.

561 **Figure 3. Association between venom phenotypic variation, neutral genetic differentiation
562 and environment.** (a) Non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS) analysis of venom profiles
563 shows great overall variation. Variation along NMDS1 is strongly correlated with the marked east-
564 west environmental cline across Arizona (Table S12, Figure S9 and S10), whereas environmental
565 associations along NMDS2, broadly separating the A-B transition, are weaker because global-
566 scale variation hinders the detection of local-scale patterns. (b to g) Local-scale analysis along two
567 transects (b) reveals sharp clines in various temperature (c-e) and precipitation (f, g) variables (see
568 Table S11 for bioclimatic variable description) across the venom A-B transition zone.

569 **Table 1.** Environmental association analysis between localities. Correlation matrix of partial
570 Mantel tests (Spearman R partial correlation coefficients multiplied by 100) between overall
571 venom phenotype or individual toxin gene frequencies against environmental variables, with
572 geographic Euclidean distance matrix as covariate. Isolation by distance (IBD) is the null model.
573 Proportion of shared alleles (Dps) was used as index for neutral genetic differentiation. Variables
574 selected with the BIOENV procedure to generate climatic and topography distance matrix are
575 reported: BIO1-BIO9 correspond to measures related to temperature and BIO12-BIO19 to
576 precipitation. Values with $p < 0.05$ are in bold.