

Local human impacts decouple natural biophysical relationships on Pacific coral reefs

Williams, G.J.; Gove, J.M.; Eynaud, Y.; Zgliczynski, B.J.; Sandin, S.A.

Ecography

DOI: 10.1111/ecog.01353

Published: 28/02/2015

Peer reviewed version

Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication

Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA): Williams, G. J., Gove, J. M., Eynaud, Y., Zgliczynski, B. J., & Sandin, S. A. (2015). Local human impacts decouple natural biophysical relationships on Pacific coral reefs. *Ecography*, *38*(8), 751-761. https://doi.org/10.1111/ecog.01353

Hawliau Cyffredinol / General rights Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

· Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.

- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
 You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Local human impacts decouple natural biophysical relationships on Pacific coral reefs

2

Gareth J. Williams^{1*}, Jamison M. Gove², Yoan Eynaud¹, Brian J. Zgliczynski¹, Stuart A. Sandin¹

¹Center for Marine Biodiversity and Conservation, Scripps Institution of Oceanography, La Jolla,
CA 92083, USA.

⁷ ²NOAA Fisheries, Pacific Islands Fisheries & Inouye Regional Center, Honolulu, HI, USA

8 *corresponding author, EMAIL: gareth@ucsd.edu, TEL: 858-534-8783, FAX: 858-822-1267

9

10 Abstract: Human impacts can homogenize and simplify ecosystems, favoring communities that 11 are no longer naturally coupled with (or reflective of) the background environmental regimes in 12 which they are found. Such a process of biophysical decoupling has been explored little in the marine environment due to a lack of replication across the intact-to-degraded ecosystem 13 14 spectrum. Coral reefs lacking local human impacts provide critical baseline scenarios in which to explore natural biophysical relationships, and provide a template against which to test for their 15 human-induced decoupling. Using 39 Pacific islands, 24 unpopulated (relatively free from local 16 17 human impacts) and 15 populated (with local human impacts present), spanning 45° of latitude and 65° of longitude, we ask, what are "natural" biophysical relationships on coral reefs and do 18 we see evidence for their human-induced decoupling? Estimates of the percent cover of benthic 19 groups were related to multiple physical environmental drivers (sea surface temperature, 20 21 irradiance, chlorophyll-a, and wave energy) using mixed-effects models and island mean

22 condition as the unit of replication. Models across unpopulated islands had high explanatory power, identifying key physical environmental drivers of variations in benthic cover in the 23 absence of local human impacts. These same models performed poorly and lost explanatory 24 power when fitted anew to populated (human impacted) islands; biophysical decoupling was 25 clearly evident. Furthermore, key biophysical relationships at populated islands (i.e. those 26 27 relationships driving benthic variation across space in conjunction with chronic human impact) bore little resemblance to the baseline scenarios identified from unpopulated islands. Our results 28 highlight the ability of local human impacts to decouple biophysical relationships in the marine 29 30 environment and fundamentally restructure the natural rules of nature.

31

32 Key words: biophysical decoupling; coral reef benthic regimes; crustose coralline algae; hard
33 coral; human impacts; human-environment interactions; macroalgae; mixed-effects models;
34 natural variation; physical drivers

35

36 Introduction

Long-term environmental regimes, interspersed with anomalous disturbance events, play a crucial role in determining both the rate and path of ecological succession (Odum 1969, Connell and Slatyer 1977, Sousa 1984). When disturbances are rare, competitive exclusion results in mature climax communities and the system can approach relative stability (Pianka 1970, Margalef 1975, Stearns 1977, Hughes and Connell 1999). In contrast, when disturbance events are frequent or the system experiences continually harsh environmental conditions, the abundance of stress-tolerant species with weedy life history strategies can increase, leading to seemingly stochastic fluctuations of community structure (Stearns 1977, Sousa 1984, Hughes
and Connell 1999, Reznick et al. 2002). Across gradients in environmental regimes, therefore,
biological communities often change in discernable (and predictable) ways; adult survivorship
and community composition are often strongly coupled with and reflective of their surrounding
physical environment (Margalef 1975, Stearns 1977, Sousa 1984).

Superimposed over these naturally coupled biophysical relationships are the effects of 49 human activities. Humans can act to homogenize and simplify ecosystems (Odum 1969, Western 50 2001, Riegl et al. 2012), artificially favoring stress-tolerant species (Darling et al. 2013) and 51 forcing the system into an earlier successional state (Schulte et al. 2007, Sandin and Sala 2012). 52 53 Under chronic anthropogenic stress, the community becomes a product of human-induced change (Graham et al. 1963, Odum 1969, Möllmann et al. 2009) and is no longer naturally 54 coupled with (or reflective of) the background environmental regime in which it is found (Curran 55 56 et al. 2004, Folke et al. 2011); we term this process *biophysical decoupling*. For example, in the Borneo rainforest, human activities have shifted climax forest communities to expanses of early 57 successional plant communities fragmented by low diversity monoculture (Curran et al. 2004). 58 Under such human-induced change, wildfires associated with El Niño events, instead of being a 59 key natural driver of regenerative processes and ecological succession in the forests, are actually 60 61 detrimental to ecological succession. The natural biophysical relationships that once existed have 62 become decoupled and novel feedbacks have established (Curran et al. 2004, Folke et al. 2011). Separating the independent and interacting relationships between naturally coupled biophysical 63 64 relationships versus those established or modified by local human impacts, however, remains hard to test in many ecological systems. Human-induced change is so ubiquitous that unaltered 65 communities, ones that provide replication at the intact end of an intact-to-degraded spectrum, 66

often do not exist (Steffen et al. 2011). Testing for evidence of biophysical decoupling in
ecological systems, therefore, poses some practical challenges.

Coral reefs provide an interesting case study in which to examine the effects of human-69 induced change to biophysical relationships in ecological communities as they provide example 70 71 of some of the most human-degraded (Pandolfi et al. 2003, Mora 2008, Hughes et al. 2010) but 72 also the most pristine (Sandin et al. 2008, Vroom et al. 2010, Williams et al. 2013) ecosystems on our planet. In particular, remote islands harboring coral reefs relatively free from local human 73 impacts provide replication at the intact end of the spectrum, enabling biophysical relationships, 74 and their potential for human-induced decoupling, to be investigated. The foundational benthic 75 76 organisms that contribute to coral reef development and persistence are those that deposit calcium carbonate, particularly hard (scleractinian) corals and crustose coralline algae (CCA). 77 The latter are critical for reef growth, acting to consolidate reef substrate (Littler and Littler 78 79 1984) and facilitate coral recruitment (Price 2010). When conditions are such to allow community succession, CCA provide a mechanism for ecological resilience following 80 disturbance (Nyström et al. 2008), and the system may transition to a state where hard corals 81 82 hold competitive superiority against algal turfs and larger macroalgae (Grigg 1983, Littler and Littler 1985, Barott et al. 2012). Macroalgae represent another community attractor on coral reefs 83 that directly compete with corals and CCA for space. Both calcifying and fleshy forms exist, 84 85 with the former more typical of functionally intact systems (Vroom and Braun 2010, Williams et al. 2013) and the latter characteristic of more degraded, human-impacted coral reef environments 86 87 (Littler and Littler 1985, Hughes et al. 2010).

Here we use 39 Pacific coral reef islands and atolls (hereafter referred to as islands) in a
macroecological setting to test the hypothesis that local human impacts are capable of

90 decoupling natural biophysical relationships in the marine environment. These islands span 45° of latitude and 65° of longitude, crossing multiple gradients in physical environmental drivers 91 (Gove et al. 2013) and human population density (Williams et al. 2011). We quantify changes in 92 93 the percent cover of three major benthic groups (hard coral, crustose coralline algae, and macroalgae) to ask two questions: 1) Given the absence of local human populations (and thus 94 direct local human impacts), under which set of physical environmental drivers do individual 95 benthic groups predominate (i.e. what are "natural" biophysical relationships on coral reefs?), 96 and 2) Do we see evidence for human-induced decoupling of these natural relationships? 97

98 Methods

99 Study regions

Benthic surveys were conducted as part of the Coral Reef Ecosystem Division (CRED) of 100 101 the NOAA Pacific Island Fisheries Science Center's (PIFSC) Pacific Reef Assessment and Monitoring Program (RAMP). The 39 islands are located within four major geopolitical regions: 102 103 the Hawaiian Archipelago, the Mariana Archipelago, the Pacific Remote Island Areas (PRIAs), 104 and the islands of American Samoa (Fig. 1). With the exception of the unpopulated PRIAs, some islands within each region harbor dense human populations and are directly impacted by human 105 106 activities (e.g. fishing and coastal development), such as Oahu in the Hawaiian Islands, Guam in the Mariana Archipelago, and Tutuila in American Samoa. Conversely, islands that are 107 unpopulated and far from human population centers are relatively free of local human impacts 108 109 (Williams et al. 2011). In this study, we describe islands as either 'unpopulated' (relatively free of local human impacts) or 'populated' (local human impacts are present). In this manner, 24 110 islands were classified as unpopulated and 15 as populated. 111

112 Benthic community surveys

113 Inter-island variation in the percent cover of benthic groups was quantified using a towed-diver survey method, a spatially expansive method that is effective at characterizing 114 benthic communities at a coarse taxonomic resolution (hard coral, crustose coralline algae, and 115 macroalgae) (Kenyon et al. 2006). Although the towed divers also recorded percent cover of 116 sand, rubble, and 'other', these categories were not investigated in detail here (raw data 117 presented in Supplementary material Appendix 1, Fig. A1). For each island, all tows over the 118 forereef habitat (depth range of 8 - 20 m) crossing consolidated hard (habitable) substrate were 119 averaged to give an island mean percent cover of each benthic group. We used surveys carried 120 121 out during the shortest interval of consecutive years that had the largest number of islands surveyed (2008 and 2009) to maximize sample size while minimizing temporal variation (sensu 122 Mora 2008). A more detailed description of the towed-diver survey technique is given in 123 124 Supplementary material Appendix 2 and details pertaining to the location, timing, and relative effort of surveys are given in Supplementary material Appendix 3, Table A1. 125

126 Predictor variables

We quantified four major physical environmental drivers known to structure coral reef benthic communities: sea surface temperature (SST), irradiance, wave energy, and chlorophyll-*a* (as a proxy for phytoplankton biomass) (Odum and Odum 1955, Glynn 1976, Done 1983, Brown 1997, Hoegh-Guldberg 1999). SST data were generated using Pathfinder v5.0, irradiance and chlorophyll-*a* using the Moderate Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer (MODIS) and wave energy using the global, full spectral Wave Watch III wave model (see Appendix 2 for full details on how these data were generated). Each of the satellite-derived (SST, irradiance,

134 chlorophyll-a) and modeled (wave energy) time series data sets were quality controlled and proportionally scaled to the size of each island in order to control for variable island sizes across 135 our data set (sensu Gove et al. 2013). The following metrics were derived from the above time 136 series data sets: long-term climatological mean and standard deviation and positive anomalous 137 events, represented as both the frequency of positive anomalies (the annual average percentage 138 139 of time above the maximum climatological value) and the magnitude of positive anomalies (the annual average magnitude of events above the maximum climatological value) (Gove et al. 140 2013). Only information up to the survey date for each individual island was included. Human 141 142 population density estimates were obtained from Williams et al. (2011). A summary of these data, with their units and range across our study region, are provided in Supplementary material 143 144 Appendix 3, Table A2.

145 *Statistical modeling*

We constructed a series of models to test our questions: 1) a best-fit model across 146 147 unpopulated islands - to quantify "natural" biophysical relationships in the absence of local human impacts, 2) the unpopulated island best-fit model structure fitted anew to populated 148 islands – to test whether biophysical relationships remained unaltered in the presence of local 149 human impacts, 3) the unpopulated island best-fit model structure fitted anew to populated 150 151 islands with variations in human population density forcibly included as a predictor - to assess for improved model performance, 4) a best-fit model across populated islands - to test whether 152 novel biophysical relationships can emerge on coral reefs under the influence of local human 153 impact, and 5) a best-fit model across all 39 islands – to quantify biophysical relationships when 154 155 no *a priori* groups across the islands were defined.

156 To build each of the models we used generalized additive mixed-effects models (GAMM) (Wood 2012). We incorporated a random factor (island groups) to account for possible 157 spatial autocorrelation between islands. Groupings were identified using hierarchical clustering 158 based on pairwise Euclidean distances between each of our 39 islands and an inflection point in 159 the intra-island group variance identified (n = 12 groups total, see Supplementary material 160 161 Appendix 2 for more details on these methods). GAMMs were fitted using the gamm4 and lme4 packages for R. Predictor variables were investigated for co-linearity (with a threshold 162 correlation for inclusion set at 0.75) and normalized to account for the large variation in their 163 164 numerical values (see Appendix 3, Supplementary Tables A2 and A3 for the list of final predictor variables included, their ranges, and their co-lineation values). Non-linear smoothness 165 was determined using penalized cubic regression splines, with the number of knots spread evenly 166 167 throughout each covariate value and limited to four to reduce overfitting. We coded a convenience wrapper R function (all.subsets.gamm) to fit each GAMM to all possible 168 169 combinations of the predictors to avoid stepwise selection procedures (see Appendix 4 for the all.subsets.gamm R code). Candidate models were subsequently ranked based on AICc relative-170 importance weights (w_i) , with the most plausible model having the highest weight 171 172 (Wagenmakers and Farrell 2004). We report all models with >15 % of the model-based support from the w_i results (MacNeil et al. 2009), or the top three where this resulted in a single model to 173 highlight the rapid drop in w_i . To assess the stability of the best-fit models, we sequentially 174 175 deleted single data points from the original response variable data set (delete-one jackknife) and re-calculated the GAMM. We then calculated the percentage of times this resulted in the same 176 177 model structure. Finally, we calculated a measure of predictor variable relative importance 178 within each candidate model by calculating the sum of AICc model weights for each predictor

(i.e. the sum of model weights across all models containing each predictor). A more detailedoutline of our statistical modeling methods is given in Supplementary material Appendix 2.

181 **Results**

182 Spatial variation in benthic cover

Across our study system, mean percent cover of hard coral equaled 18.8 % (upper CI 183 =15.7, lower CI = 22.1), crustose coralline algae 12.5 % (9.6, 15.8), and macroalgae 15.0 % 184 (12.1, 18.1), but there was considerable variation across a variety of hierarchical scales (Fig. 2). 185 186 In summary, hard coral cover was higher at unpopulated islands (22.5 %) than at populated ones 187 (12.9%) (see Fig. 2 for associated CIs). Across regions, hard coral cover was highest in the Pacific Remote Island Areas (PRIAs) (30.7 %) and lowest in the Hawaiian Archipelago (13.4 188 %). Within any single region harboring both unpopulated and populated islands, only within the 189 190 Mariana Archipelago was hard coral cover higher at unpopulated islands (20.1 %) than at populated ones (10.6 %) (Fig. 2). 191

The overall mean percent cover of crustose coralline algae (CCA) did not differ with 192 193 island status (unpopulated versus populated islands) (Fig. 2). Across regions, CCA cover was 194 highest in American Samoa (31.2%) and the PRIAs (16.2%) and lowest in the Hawaiian (9.5 %) and Mariana Archipelago (6.5 %) (see Fig. 2 for associated CIs). Within any single region 195 harboring both unpopulated and populated islands, CCA cover did not differ with island status. 196 197 Similarly, the overall mean percent cover of macroalgae did not differ with island status or 198 across regions (Fig. 2); however, macroalgae cover was higher at unpopulated (23.4 %) than 199 populated (10.8 %) islands within the Hawaiian Archipelago and higher at populated (25.5 %) than unpopulated (8.6 %) islands within the Mariana Archipelago. In summary, the complex 200

variation in benthic cover across regions and island status (unpopulated *versus* populated islands)
provided motivation for an island-level model-fitting approach.

203 Biophysical relationships across Pacific coral reefs

Hard coral: Across unpopulated islands, mean sea surface temperature (SST), the 204 magnitude of wave anomalies, and mean chlorophyll-*a* formed the best-fit model, explaining 205 72.3 % of the variation in hard coral cover (Table 1). Hard coral cover was higher at unpopulated 206 islands experiencing a higher mean SST (> 28° C), wave anomaly events of a lower magnitude (< 207 30 kW m⁻¹ above the maximum climatological value), and higher levels of mean chlorophyll-a (> 208 0.15 mg m⁻³) (Fig. 3a). Within our confidence set of models, hard coral cover was also higher at 209 unpopulated islands where mean wave energy was lower ($< 25 \text{ kW m}^{-1}$) and where wave 210 211 anomalies were rare (< 2 % of the time); however, these predictors had low relative importance scores (Table 1, Supplementary material Appendix 1, Fig. A2). 212

The unpopulated island best-fit model structure performed poorly when fitted anew to 213 populated islands, explaining only 14.7 % of the variation in hard coral cover (Table 1); p > 0.05214 215 for all the smooth terms (Fig. 3b). The addition of human population density as a predictor across populated islands did not improve model performance (Table 1) and no significant relationship 216 217 was seen with hard coral cover (Fig. 3c). The populated islands best-fit model identified mean irradiance as the strongest predictor, explaining 25.7 % of the variation in hard coral cover 218 (Table 1). Hard coral cover was generally higher at populated islands experiencing a lower mean 219 irradiance ($< 42 \text{ Em}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$); above this value the relationship appeared to level off but was 220 associated with increased error (Fig. 3d). This single model had strong relative plausibility, as 221 shown by the high Akaike weight (Table 1). The best-fit model for hard coral cover across all 39 222

of our study islands, with no *a priori* grouping of the data, performed more poorly than each of
the unpopulated island and populated island models (Supplementary material Appendix 3, Table
A4).

Crustose coralline algae (CCA): Across unpopulated islands, the frequency and 226 227 magnitude of chlorophyll-a anomalies formed the best-fit model, explaining 80.2 % of the 228 variation in CCA cover (Table 1). CCA cover was higher at unpopulated islands with frequent chlorophyll-*a* anomalies (> 10 % of the time) of a high magnitude (> 0.02 mg m⁻³ above the 229 maximum climatological value) (Fig. 4a). Within our confidence set of models, CCA cover was 230 also higher at unpopulated islands experiencing higher mean wave energy (> 40 kW m⁻¹), but 231 where wave anomaly events were of a low magnitude (< 20 kW m⁻¹ above the maximum 232 233 climatological value); however, these predictors had low overall relative importance scores (Supplementary material Appendix 1, Fig. A3). 234

The unpopulated island best-fit model structure performed poorly when fitted anew to 235 236 populated islands, explaining only 11.7 % of the variation in CCA cover (Table 1). The relationships with the frequency and magnitude of chlorophyll-a anomalies decoupled (p > 0.05237 238 for the smooth term) and reversed in direction, respectively (Fig. 4b). CCA cover was lower at populated islands experiencing chlorophyll-a anomalies of a high magnitude (> 0.015 mg m⁻³) 239 240 above the maximum climatological value); however, this relationship was associated with increased error in the smooth term at very high magnitudes (Fig. 4b). The addition of human 241 population density as a predictor improved model performance across populated islands and 242 suggested an increase in CCA cover at lower population densities; however, the relationship was 243 244 weak (Fig. 4c) and increased the overall variation explained by only 6.9 % (Table 1). The populated islands best-fit model identified the magnitude of irradiance anomalies as the strongest 245

predictor, explaining 87.0 % of the variation in CCA cover (Table 1). CCA cover was higher at populated islands where irradiance anomalies were of a high magnitude (> $3.4 \text{ Em}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$ above the maximum climatological value) (Fig. 4d), and this single model heavily dominated in terms of relative plausibility as shown by the high Akaike weight (Table 1). The best-fit model for CCA cover across all 39 of our study islands, with no *a priori* grouping of the data, performed more poorly than each of the unpopulated island and populated island models (Supplementary material Appendix 3, Table A4).

Macroalgae: Across unpopulated islands, the frequency of chlorophyll-a anomalies 253 formed the best-fit model, explaining 61.2 % of the variation in macroalgae cover (Table 1). 254 255 Macroalgae cover was higher at unpopulated islands experiencing lower frequencies of 256 chlorophyll-a anomalies (< 1 % of the time) (Fig. 5a). Within our confidence set of models, relationships with mean SST and the frequency of wave anomalies also featured (Table 1), with 257 258 macroalgae cover higher at unpopulated islands experiencing a lower mean SST (< 23.5 °C) and lower frequencies of wave anomalies (< 1 % of the time) (Supplementary material Appendix 1, 259 Fig. A4). 260

261 The unpopulated island best-fit model structure performed poorly when fitted anew to populated islands, explaining only 18.1 % of the variation in macroalgae cover (Table 1). The 262 263 overall negative effect of increasing chlorophyll-a anomaly frequencies on macroalgae cover still held at populated islands, but was associated with increased error in the relationship (Fig. 5b). 264 Variations in human population density across populated islands had no significant effect on 265 model performance (Table 1) and showed no significant relationship with macroalgae cover (Fig. 266 267 5c). The populated islands best-fit model for macroalgae identified mean wave energy as the strongest predictor, explaining 87.7 % of the variation in macroalgae cover (Table 1). 268

Macroalgae cover was lower at populated islands experiencing a higher mean wave energy (> 20 kW m⁻¹) (Fig. 5d), and this single model dominated in terms of relative plausibility as shown by the high Akaike weight (Table 1). The best-fit model for macroalgae cover across all 39 of our study islands, with no *a priori* grouping of the data, performed more poorly than each of the unpopulated island and populated island models (Supplementary material Appendix 3, Table A4).

275 **Discussion**

Using 39 coral reef islands across the Pacific, we show that local human impacts 276 fundamentally alter natural biophysical relationships in the marine environment. Relationships 277 278 across unpopulated islands (i.e. natural biophysical relationships in the absence of local human 279 impacts) were easily discernable and had high explanatory power. Here variations in physical drivers were linked in a predictable manner to variations in the percent cover of each of the three 280 281 benthic groups (hard coral, crustose coralline algae, and macroalgae). In contrast, these same 282 model structures performed poorly when fitted anew to populated (human impacted) islands, with many of the biophysical relationships predominating at unpopulated islands becoming 283 decoupled or altering in the direction of their relationship; we term this process *biophysical* 284 decoupling (Fig. 6). To our knowledge, our study is among the first to take a macroecological 285 approach to demonstrate a clear human-induced decoupling of natural biophysical relationships 286 in the marine environment. 287

In the absence of local human impacts, the principal physical drivers of variations in benthic groups were largely consistent with natural history gleaned from decades of coral reef science. For example, hard coral cover was higher at unpopulated islands experiencing a higher

291 mean sea surface temperature; where mean temperatures were lower, corals decreased in cover and competitive macroalgae increased in cover. Such latitudinal limits to coral reef development 292 have been previously noted (Johannes et al. 1983, Lough and Barnes 2000) and are thought to 293 reflect variations in energy influx into the system dictating community diversity and succession 294 (Fraser and Currie 1996). Hard coral cover also declined under conditions of high wave energy, 295 296 particularly anomalous, high-magnitude events. This is a common biophysical relationship on Pacific coral reefs (Dollar 1982, Grigg 1983, Page-Albins et al. 2012, Williams et al. 2013, Gove 297 et al. In Press) and often results from colony dislodgement and abrasive damage (Madin and 298 299 Connolly 2006) and the inability of coral larvae to settle under high hydrodynamic disturbance (Abelson and Denny 1997). In contrast, crustose coralline algae (CCA) increased in cover at 300 unpopulated islands experiencing higher mean wave energy (i.e. higher levels of disturbance) as 301 predicted by the relative dominance model proposed by Littler and Littler (1985). Similarly to 302 hard corals, however, CCA cover was lower at unpopulated islands experiencing a higher 303 frequency of large-magnitude wave anomalies. Although physically adapted to high wave energy 304 environments (Sheppard 1980), CCA are still vulnerable to abrasion at very high levels of wave 305 energy and can give way to earlier successional states, such as algal turfs (Williams et al. 2013, 306 307 Gove et al. In Press). As well as increasing in cover in warmer waters, hard coral cover also increased under conditions of higher mean chlorophyll-a (indicative of more nutrient-rich 308 waters). Under oligotrophic conditions, increased nutrient supply to corals may act to promote 309 310 persistence and resilience following disturbance (Grottoli et al. 2006, Connolly et al. 2012). CCA also positively responded to increased chlorophyll-a, increasing in cover particularly where there 311 312 were frequent anomalies of a large-magnitude. These paralleled relationships between hard coral 313 and CCA with increases in chlorophyll-a likely reflect the positive effects CCA can have on hard

coral cover (Price 2010) and the negative effects CCA can have on competitive macroalgae
(Vermeij et al. 2011). In the absence of local human impacts, it would appear background
increases in chlorophyll-*a* drive macroalgae cover down, likely reflecting a loss of competitive
dominance with hard corals and CCA for space.

Across populated islands, all the natural biophysical relationships identified from 318 unpopulated islands decoupled, lost explanatory power, or became fundamentally altered in the 319 direction of their relationship (Fig. 6). Hard coral cover no longer showed a significant 320 321 relationship with either mean temperature or mean chlorophyll-a and the relationship between CCA cover and the frequency and magnitude of chlorophyll-a anomalies decoupled and 322 323 reversed, respectively. On occasion, novel biophysical relationships even appeared to develop. 324 For example, hard coral cover across populated islands decreased as mean irradiance increased, perhaps reflecting a stress-reinforcing factor reducing the persistence of corals in an already 325 326 chronically stressed system (Lesser and Farrell 2004). In contrast, CCA cover increased as the frequency of irradiance anomalies increased, particularly anomalies of a large magnitude. CCA 327 possess a tremendous ability to photoacclimate (Bulleri 2006) and thus often thrive under well-lit 328 329 conditions (Sheppard 1980, Williams et al. 2013). Incoming irradiance may therefore be a key physical driver allowing CCA to persist in more chronically stressed reef systems. Finally, across 330 populated islands, the relationship between macroalgae cover and mean chlorophyll-a 331 substantially weakened; macroalgae cover was instead primarily related to wave energy, with 332 cover higher at populated islands experiencing a lower mean wave energy. Macroalgae, like 333 334 corals, are vulnerable to dislodgement (Dethier et al. 1991, Engelen et al. 2005) and it therefore follows that increased wave energy can reduce their overall cover on coral reefs (Gove et al. In 335 *Press*). Also, it is interesting to note that our findings do not follow a common expectation that 336

337 the cover of macroalgae should be positively related to factors associated with human presence on coral reefs (Littler and Littler 1985, Hughes 1994, Mora 2008). Only within the Mariana 338 Archipelago did this expectation hold true and the opposite trend was actually observed within 339 340 the Hawaiian Archipelago. Across the Hawaiian Archipelago, macroalgae cover was 2.5 times higher across the unpopulated and highly protected Northwestern Hawaiian Islands than in the 341 342 populated Main Hawaiian Islands. Such disparities have been previously noted within the Hawaiian Archipelago (Vermeij et al. 2010, Vroom and Braun 2010, Jouffray et al. In Press) and 343 likely reflect the broad functional roles different types of macroalgae have on coral reefs (Vroom 344 345 2011, Williams et al. 2013).

346 Future work to further our understanding of biophysical decoupling

347 We hypothesize that the decoupling of natural biophysical relationships across populated (human impacted) islands reflects, in part, human-induced ecological homogenization (Riegl et 348 349 al. 2012). In other words, while human impacts may not always result in wholesale changes to 350 benthic cover (as was largely the case in our study), the dominant species within each group may shift as a result of human-induced selective pressure. For example, the relative dominance of 351 fleshy versus calcified macroalgae often differs across gradients of human impact (Vroom et al. 352 353 2006, Vroom 2011) and coral communities are flexible and can reorganize in response to 354 selective pressure, each species differing in their degree of stress-tolerance (Darling et al. 2013). Local human impacts may be artificially selecting for more stress-tolerant, weedy species within 355 356 each benthic group whose abundances are dictated more by stochastic recruitment processes and less by adult survivorship across gradients in natural physical drivers (Margalef 1969, Pianka 357 358 1970, Reznick et al. 2002, Darling et al. 2013). The result is an overall decoupling of natural 359 biophysical relationships within the system. To test this working hypothesis would require data

360 across similar spatial scales but at a finer taxonomic resolution and likely reveal more intricate ways in which human impacts disrupt and decouple natural biophysical relationships on coral 361 reefs. Furthermore, we require information pertaining to the types of human impacts occurring 362 across our large spatial gradient. Our binary split of 'unpopulated' and 'populated' islands as a 363 proxy for local human impacts, while necessary for the current analysis, is likely reducing model 364 365 performance. For example, in a meta-analysis by Cinner et al. (2013), distance of the island to local markets was a better predictor of total reef fish biomass than variations in local human 366 population density. Quantifying the types of human impacts and their severity across our 367 368 gradient would likely improve future interpretation of the spatial patterns in benthic cover we observed. Also, our analysis did not examine for the effects of intra-island spatial gradients in 369 physical drivers on biophysical relationships. Wave energy, for example, often varies around an 370 island, leading to complex intra-island patterns of benthic cover (Williams et al. 2013, Gove et 371 al. In Press). Human impacts to biophysical relationships may not, therefore, be uniform around 372 entire islands and future work should focus on determining the range of spatial scales at which 373 human-induced biophysical decoupling is evident. Finally, changes in reef fish biomass are often 374 more sensitive to local human impacts than changes in benthic cover on coral reefs (McClanahan 375 376 et al. 2011). Future work should therefore focus on whether a similar phenomenon of biophysical decoupling occurs within the reef fish community across similar spatial scales on coral reefs. 377

378 Conclusion

Using 39 Pacific coral reef islands, we show that considerable spatial variation exists in the cover of three benthic groups (hard coral, crustose coralline algae, and macroalgae), even in the absence of local human impacts, as a result of broad spatial gradients in key physical environmental drivers. We further show that local human impacts appear capable of disrupting

and fundamentally altering these natural biophysical relationships, a process we term *biophysical decoupling*. At populated islands, chronic human impacts do not simply result in wholesale
changes in benthic cover, instead they likely alter communities in such a way that they are no
longer reflective of (or reactive to) the background physical regimes in which they reside. These
findings demonstrate the ability of local human impacts to fundamentally disrupt the natural
rules of nature in the marine environment.

389

Acknowledgements – This study was conducted with the support of the NOAA Coral Reef
Conservation Program and the NOAA/NSF CAMEO program. We thank Jacob Asher, Russell
Brainard, Julia Ehses, Molly Timmers, Timothy Jones, Ivor Williams, and Bernardo VargasÁngel for data collection, technical support, and stimulating discussion, and Rachel Morrison,
the NOAA internal review process, and two anonymous reviewers for comments that greatly
improved the manuscript. This paper is dedicated to the memory of Rachel Anne Morrison, an
explorer, scientist, and friend.

397

398 **References**

- Abelson, A. and Denny, M. 1997. Settlement of marine organisms in flow. Annu. Rev. Ecol.
 Syst. 28: 317-339.
- Barott, K., et al. 2012. Natural history of coral–algae competition across a gradient of human
 activity in the Line Islands. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 460: 1-12.
- Brown, B. E. 1997. Coral bleaching: causes and consequences. Coral Reefs 16: 129-138.

- Bulleri, F. 2006. Duration of overgrowth affects survival of encrusting coralline algae. Mar.
 Ecol. Prog. Ser. 321: 79-85.
- 406 Connell, J. H. and Slatyer, R. O. 1977. Mechanisms of succession in natural communities and
 407 their role in community stability and organisation. Am. Nat. 111: 1119-1144.
- 408 Connolly, S. R., et al. 2012. Food availability promotes rapid recovery from thermal stress in a
 409 scleractinian coral. Coral Reefs 31: 951–960.
- 410 Curran, L. M., et al. 2004. Lowland forest loss in protected areas of Indonesian Borneo. 411 Science 303: 1000-1003.
- 412 Darling, E. S., et al. 2013. Life histories predict coral community disassembly under multiple
 413 stressors. Global Change Biol. 19: 1930-1940.
- 414 Dethier, M. N., et al. 1991. Distribution and thickness patterns in subtidal encrusting algae from
 415 Washington. Bot. Mar. 34: 201-210.
- 416 Dollar, S. J. 1982. Wave stress and coral community structure in Hawaii. Coral Reefs 1: 71-81.
- 417 Done, T. 1983. Coral zonation: its nature and significance. In: D. J. Barnes (ed) Perspectives on
 418 coral reefs. Australian Institute of Marine Science, pp. 107-147.
- Engelen, A. H., et al. 2005. Effects of wave exposure and depth on biomass, density and fertility
 of the fucoid seaweed *Sargassum polyceratium* (Phaeophyta, Sargassaceae). J. Phycol.
 40: 149-158.
- 422 Folke, C., et al. 2011. Reconnecting to the biosphere. Ambio 40: 719-738.
- Fraser, R. H. and Currie, D. J. 1996. The Species Richness-Energy Hypothesis in a System
 Where Historical Factors Are Thought to Prevail: Coral Reefs. Am. Nat. 148: 138-159.
- 425 Glynn, P. W. 1976. Some physical and biological determinants of coral community structure in
- 426 the Eastern Pacific. Ecol. Monogr. 46: 431-456.

- Gove, J. M., et al. 2013. Quantifying climatological ranges and anomalies for Pacific coral reef
 ecosystems. PLoS One 8: e61974.
- Gove, J. M., et al. *In Press*. Coral reef benthic communities exhibit threshold responses to
 natural physical drivers. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.
- 431 Graham, S. A., et al. 1963. Aspens: phoenix trees of the Great Lakes Region. University
 432 Michigan Press.
- 433 Grigg, R. W. 1983. Community structure, succession, and development of coral reefs in Hawaii.
 434 Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 11: 1-14.
- Grottoli, A. G., et al. 2006. Heterotrophic plasticity and resilience in bleached corals. Nature
 440: 1186-1189.
- Hoegh-Guldberg, O. 1999. Climate change, coral bleaching and the future of the world's coral
 reefs. Mar. Freshwat. Res. 50: 839-866.
- Hughes, T. P. 1994. Catastrophes, phase-shifts, and large-scale degredation of a Caribbean coral
 reef. Science 265: 1547-1551.
- Hughes, T. P. and Connell, J. H. 1999. Multiple stressors on coral reefs: a long-term perspective.
 Limnol. Oceanogr. 44: 932-940.
- Hughes, T. P., et al. 2010. Rising to the challenge of sustaining coral reef resilience. Trends
 Ecol. Evol. 25: 633-642.
- Johannes, R. E., et al. 1983. Latitudinal limits of coral reef growth. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 11:
 105-111.
- Jouffray, J., et al. In Press. Human and natural drivers of multiple coral reef regimes across the
 Hawaiian Archipelago. Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B

- Kenyon, J. C., et al. 2006. Towed-Diver Surveys, a Method for Mesoscale Spatial Assessment of
 Benthic Reef Habitat: A Case Study at Midway Atoll in the Hawaiian Archipelago. Coast. Manage. 34: 339-349.
- 452 Lesser, M. P. and Farrell, J. H. 2004. Exposure to solar radiation increases damage to both host
 453 tissues and algal symbionts of corals during thermal stress. Coral Reefs 23: 367-377.
- 454 Littler, M. M. and Littler, D. S. 1984. Models of tropical reef biogenesis. Phycol. Res. 3: 324455 364.
- Littler, M. M. and Littler, D. S. 1985. Factors controlling relative dominance of primary
 producers on biotic reefs. In: Proceedings of the Fifth International Coral Reef
 Congress.
- Lough, J. M. and Barnes, D. J. 2000. Environmental controls on growth of the massive coral *Porites.* J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol. 245: 225-243.
- 461 MacNeil, M. A., et al. 2009. Hierarchical drivers of reef-fish metacommunity structure. 462 Ecology 90: 252-264.
- Madin, J. S. and Connolly, S. R. 2006. Ecological consequences of major hydrodynamic
 disturbances on coral reefs. Nature 444: 477-480.
- 465 Margalef, R. 1969. Diversity and stability: a practical proposal and a model of interdependence. 466 In: Brookhaven Symposia in Biology. pp. 25-37.
- Margalef, R. 1975. Diversity, stability and maturity in natural ecosystems. In: W. H. Dobben
 and R. H. Lowe-McConnell (eds), Unifying Concepts in Ecology. Springer Netherlands,
 pp. 151-160.
- 470 McClanahan, T. R., et al. 2011. Critical thresholds and tangible targets for ecosystem-based
 471 management of coral reef fisheries. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 108: 17230-17233.

- 472 Möllmann, C., et al. 2009. Reorganization of a large marine ecosystem due to atmospheric and
 473 anthropogenic pressure: a discontinuous regime shift in the Central Baltic Sea. Global
 474 Change Biol. 15: 1377-1393.
- 475 Mora, C. 2008. A clear human footprint in the coral reefs of the Caribbean. Proc. R. Soc.
 476 Lond., Ser. B: Biol. Sci. 275: 767-773.
- 477 Nyström, M., et al. 2008. Capturing the cornerstones of coral reef resilience: linking theory to
 478 practice. Coral Reefs 27: 795-809.
- 479 Odum, E. P. 1969. The Strategy of Ecosystem Development. Science 164: 262-270.
- Odum, H. T. and Odum, E. P. 1955. Trophic structure and productivity of a windward coral reef
 community on Eniwetok Atoll. Ecol. Monogr. 25: 291-320.
- 482 Page-Albins, K. N., et al. 2012. Patterns in Benthic Coral Reef Communities at Pearl and
 483 Hermes Atoll along a Wave-Exposure Gradient. Pac. Sci. 66: 481-496.
- Pandolfi, J. M., et al. 2003. Global trajectories of the long-term decline of coral reef ecosystems.
 Science 301: 955-958.
- 486 Pianka, E. R. 1970. On r- and k-selection. The American Naturalist 104: 592-597.
- Price, N. 2010. Habitat selection, facilitation, and biotic settlement cues affect distribution and
 performance of coral recruits in French Polynesia. Oecologia 163: 747-758.
- 489 Reznick, D., et al. 2002. r-and K-selection revisited: the role of population regulation in life490 history evolution. Ecology 83: 1509-1520.
- 491 Riegl, B. M., et al. 2012. Human Impact on Atolls Leads to Coral Loss and Community
 492 Homogenisation: A Modeling Study. PLoS One 7: e36921.
- 493 Sandin, S. and Sala, E. 2012. Using successional theory to measure marine ecosystem health. 494 Evol. Ecol. 26: 435-448.

- Sandin, S. A., et al. 2008. Baselines and degradation of coral reefs in the northern Line Islands. PLoS One 3: e1548.
- 497 Schils, T., et al. 2013. Geographical partitioning of marine macrophyte assemblages in the
 498 tropical Pacific: a result of local and regional diversity processes. J. Biogeogr. 40: 1266499 1277.
- Schulte, L., et al. 2007. Homogenization of northern U.S. Great Lakes forests due to land use. Landscape Ecol. 22: 1089-1103.
- Sheppard, C. R. C. 1980. Coral cover, zonation and diversity on reef slopes of Chagos Atolls,
 and population structures of the major species. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 2: 193-205.
- Sousa, W. P. 1984. The Role of Disturbance in Natural Communities. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst.
 15: 353-391.
- Stearns, S. C. 1977. The evolution of life history traits: a critique of the theory and a review of
 the data. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst. 8: 145-171.
- Steffen, W., et al. 2011. The Anthropocene: from global change to planetary stewardship. Ambio 40: 739-761.
- 510 Vermeij, M. J. A., et al. 2010. The effects of trophic interactions and spatial competition on algal
 511 community composition on Hawaiian coral reefs. Mar. Ecol. 31: 291-299.
- 512 Vermeij, M. J. A., et al. 2011. Crustose coralline algae can suppress macroalgal growth and
 513 recruitment on Hawaiian coral reefs. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 422: 1-7.
- 514 Vroom, P. S., et al. 2006. Algae-dominated reefs. Am. Sci. 94: 430-437.
- Vroom, P. S. and Braun, C. L. 2010. Benthic composition of a healthy subtropical reef: baseline
 species-level cover, with an emphasis on algae, in the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands. PloS One 5: e9733.

- Vroom, P. S., et al. 2010. Marine biological community baselines in unimpacted tropical
 ecosystems: spatial and temporal analysis of reefs at Howland and Baker Islands. Biodivers. Conserv. 19: 797-812.
- 521 Vroom, P. S. 2011. "Coral Dominance": A Dangerous Ecosystem Misnomer? Journal of
 522 Marine Biology Article ID 164127: 1-8.
- Wagenmakers, E.-J. and Farrell, S. 2004. AIC model selection using Akaike weights. Psychon.
 Bull. Rev. 11: 192-196.
- Western, D. 2001. Human-modified ecosystems and future evolution. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.
 USA 98: 5458-5465.
- Williams, G. J., et al. 2013. Benthic communities at two remote Pacific coral reefs: effects of
 reef habitat, depth, and wave energy gradients on spatial patterns. PeerJ 1: e81.
- Williams, I. D., et al. 2011. Differences in Reef Fish Assemblages between Populated and
 Remote Reefs Spanning Multiple Archipelagos Across the Central andWestern Pacific. -
- Journal of Marine Biology: Article ID 826234: 1-14.
- Wood, S. N. 2012. mgcv: GAMs with GCV/AIC/REML smoothness estimation and GAMMs by
 PQL. R package.version 1.7-22.
- 534

535 Supplementary Material

- 536 Appendix 1. Supplementary partial residual plots from the generalized additive mixed-effects537 models (GAMM).
- 538 Appendix 2. Supplementary methods for benthic community surveys, satellite-derived and
- 539 modeled predictor variable data, and statistical modeling procedures.

Appendix 3. Supplementary tables, including location and timing of all benthic surveys,
predictor variable codes and units, predictor variable correlation values, and summary outputs of

542 GAMMs across all 39 islands.

543 Appendix 4. R code for our *all.subsets.gamm* convenience wrapper function.

544

545 Figure legends

546 Figure 1. Location of the 39 U.S.-affiliated coral reef islands surveyed within four geopolitical

547 regions in the Pacific Ocean: Hawaiian Archipelago (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands and the

548 Main Hawaiian Islands), Mariana Archipelago, the Pacific Remote Island Areas (PRIAs), and

the islands of American Samoa. Islands are classified as unpopulated (filled circles) and

populated (open circles). Island codes are defined in full in Appendix 3 (Table A1).

Figure 2. Island mean (+ 95 % confidence interval) percent cover of three benthic groups: hard 551 coral (a), crustose coralline algae (b), and macroalgae (c) across 39 U.S.-affiliated coral reef 552 553 islands spanning four geopolitical regions in the Pacific Ocean (left panels). Islands are classified as unpopulated (U, grey shading) or populated (P, no shading). Bootstrapped means and 95 % 554 confidence intervals (generated using 10,000 random iterations of the data with replacement) are 555 556 shown across a series of hierarchical levels (right panels): geopolitical region, island status (unpopulated versus populated islands) within each region, and island status across all 39 islands 557 558 (ALL, far right). Samoa, American Samoa; PRIAs, Pacific Remote Island Areas.

559 Figure 3. Generalized additive mixed-effects models (GAMM) showing the influence of

560 predictor variables on hard coral cover variation across unpopulated and populated islands in the

561 U.S. Pacific. a) best-fit model across unpopulated islands (n = 24), b) unpopulated island best-fit model structure fitted anew to populated islands (n = 15), c) unpopulated island best-fit model 562 structure fitted anew to populated islands with the forced inclusion of variations in human 563 population density as a predictor, and d) best-fit model across populated islands. Data points 564 represent distribution of standardized partial residuals (SPR). The y-axes are on the scale of the 565 566 linear predictor of the model, i.e. the units are link (response units) with the smooth terms centered to ensure model identifiability (sum to zero over the covariate values). The number 567 center-top within each plot represents the relative importance of each predictor variable (sum of 568 569 AICc model weights across all models containing each predictor). The deciles of the distribution of the predictors are indicated by tick marks along the bottom of the plots. Black lines represent 570 571 model-fitted splines of the estimated smoothing functions bounded by 95 % Bayesian credible intervals (solid grey shading). 572

Figure 4. Generalized additive mixed-effects models (GAMM) showing the influence of
predictor variables on crustose coralline algae cover variation across unpopulated and populated
islands in the U.S. Pacific. See Fig. 3 legend for details.

Figure 5. Generalized additive mixed-effects models (GAMM) showing the influence of
predictor variables on macroalgae cover variation across unpopulated and populated islands in
the U.S. Pacific. See Fig. 3 legend for details.

Figure 6. *Biophysical decoupling* on Pacific coral reefs – the natural biophysical relationships predominating at unpopulated islands decouple (i.e. flat-line or dramatically weaken) or alter in the direction of their relationship at populated (human impacted) islands. The percentages indicate the overall spatial variation in benthic groups explained by the physical environmental

drivers: hard coral (top), crustose coralline algae (middle), and macroalgae (bottom). SPR, standardized partial residuals. Temp, mean sea-surface temperature; WAV_mag, mean magnitude of wave anomalies; Chl-*a*, mean chlorophyll-*a*; CAV, frequency of chlorophyll-*a* anomalies; CAV_mag, mean magnitude of chlorophyll-*a* anomalies. Imagery obtained from the University of Maryland Center for Environmental Science (ian.umces.edu/imagelibrary/).