Afterlives: reinventing early medieval sculpture in Wales

Edwards, Nancy

Archaeologia Cambrensis

Published: 01/09/2020

Peer reviewed version

Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication

Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA):
Edwards, N. (2020). Afterlives: reinventing early medieval sculpture in Wales. *Archaeologia Cambrensis*, *2020*(169), 1-29.

19. Sept. 2024

PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS
Afterlives: reinventing early medieval sculpture in Wales
Delivered at the 166th Annual Summer Meeting at Haverfordwest

By NANCY EDWARDS

I have spent much of my archaeological career recording and writing about early medieval inscribed stones and stone sculpture, first in Ireland, then in Wales. Hiding in the very brief 'Evidence for Discovery' sections in the Welsh *Corpus* volumes[1] are some fascinating stories of how these early medieval monuments were perceived, forgotten, rediscovered and reinvented over the centuries up to the present day. My aim here is to consider some of these stories in more depth in order to identify and illuminate some broader themes concerning what we should term the 'afterlives' of these monuments. I shall examine three broadly chronological themes: firstly, fragmentation, destruction and survival; secondly, rediscovery and reinvention; and finally preservation, imitation and identity.

Nevertheless, I want to begin with a brief consideration of the theoretical framework so you can see where some of my ideas are coming from. Over the past thirty years archaeologists have become increasingly interested in concepts relating to how monuments are remembered, manipulated and re-invented over time to serve new ends, as indicated in Richard Bradley's pioneering research on the reuse of prehistoric sites.[2] Equally, drawing on studies by anthropologists of the complex cultural and social lives of 'things', archaeologists now regularly reconstruct 'cultural biographies' of both sites and artefacts.[3] Amongst these have been several important studies of early medieval sculpture including the Ruthwell and Bradbourne Anglo-Saxon crosses and the Pictish cross-slabs at Hilton of Cadboll and Meigle,[4] but similar work has yet to be done on early medieval stone sculpture in Wales. Allied to this are notions concerning the symbolism, value, or indeed, the lack of value of such monuments. These can sometimes be viewed as commodities[5] but value judgements can also lead to their manipulation as part of wider political, religious or other agendas.[6] Above all, however, the early medieval carved stones in Wales should be regarded as important examples of our cultural heritage allowing us to understand them, not just as products of the age in which they were carved, but also as cyphers projecting changing attitudes to cultural identity and belonging over time.

[FIG 1]

FRAGMENTATION, DESTRUCTION AND SURVIVAL

Of the more than 570 early medieval inscribed stones, simple cross-carved stones mainly used as grave-markers, and more ambitious sculptural monuments such as freestanding crosses, now known from Wales, a very large proportion survive only in part, or in a fragmentary state. A significant number of fifth- to seventh-century roman-letter and ogam

inscribed memorial stones and the majority of cross-carved stones and other sculpture came to light during the nineteenth century as a result of the great period of Victorian church restoration and rebuilding when many medieval churches were either substantially renovated or demolished and totally replaced. Most were found reused as masonry in the medieval (or sometimes later) fabric, though some were also dug up whilst grave-digging or had been incorporated into churchyard walls and stiles.[7] Nevertheless, a small number of freestanding crosses, notably Carew, Nevern, Llanbadarn Fawr, Maen Achwyfan (Whitford 2) and Penmon 1, either still survive *in situ*, or did so until comparatively recently when they were moved inside for protection.[8]

Deirdre O'Sullivan has demonstrated a similar, though not identical, pattern of preservation and fragmentation for Anglo-Saxon stone sculpture found on ecclesiastical sites or built into the fabric of churches in northern England and has also identified several reasons why this may have taken place. Firstly, she has argued for the active demolition of some monuments after the Norman conquest as part of an ideologically driven remodelling of earlier ecclesiastical sites. Secondly, she has proposed that with the introduction of Romanesque church architecture into England from the Continent beginning in the mid-eleventh century, many earlier monuments may simply have been swept away because they had become culturally and liturgically redundant. Allied to this, elite burials, which had previously been located outside in the cemetery, were now increasingly placed within the church itself. Lastly, she has raised the possibility of what she has termed 'structured deposition' — in other words that some monuments were deliberately reused in such a way as to make a conscious link with the past and to draw attention to their continuing significance to those who had saved them as well as to their wider communities. In practice, however, she has emphasized that there is often insufficient detail in the antiquarian accounts of the rediscovery of monuments to determine which of these is most likely. Indeed, in some cases we may be seeing a combination of factors rather than a single reason why monuments were broken up and reincorporated into church fabric in this way.[9]

In Wales, parts of the borders and south were settled by the Normans from the 1070s onwards, but Gwynedd and some other areas, after initial incursions, were recovered or remained under native control for a further two centuries.[10] This means that in many cases we are not witnessing such a sharp break at the end of the early Middle Ages as in England. Nevertheless, there is evidence for ecclesiastical change and modernization, including the introduction of Romanesque church architecture into Wales by the earlier twelfth century that similarly extended into regions beyond Anglo-Norman control.[11] Likewise, native rulers also began to introduce new monastic orders such as the Augustinians at Penmon, an important earlier foundation associated with the princes of Gwynedd, and the Cistercians at Valle Crucis, closely linked with the princes of Powys Fadog.[12]

The fate of the early medieval sculpture at St Davids in the south west provides an important example. At the end of the eleventh century, St Davids was the principal ecclesiastical foundation in Wales — a monastery, bishopric and centre of learning, as well as a growing focus for pilgrimage indicated by the hagiographic landscape of Rhygyfarch's Life of St David, written in the early 1090s.[13] This meant that it was subject to violence and political pressure, both native and external, including one of several Hiberno-Scandinavian

raids that resulted in the murder of Bishop Abraham in 1080.[14] It likewise became an early subject of Norman interest with William the Conqueror visiting the foundation, ostensibly as a pilgrim, the following year.[15] From 1093 onwards, with the invasion of Deheubarth, St Davids was predominantly under English and Marcher influence becoming subject to Canterbury with bishops mostly outsiders appointed by the English crown.[16] The earliest known cathedral, presumably Romanesque, erected by the first Norman bishop, Bernard (1115–48), was destroyed in 1180 and the present Transitional building was begun under Bishop Peter de Leia (1176–98) with various later extensions. The impact of the Reformation appears slight but the occupation of the cathedral by Cromwellian troops in 1648 was certainly not with the building then entering a long period of severe neglect. This was only reversed at the end of the eighteenth century, culminating, from the 1860s onwards, in the major restorations of George Gilbert Scott and his son John Oldrid Scott.[17]

Most of the pieces of early medieval sculpture from St Davids are now fragmentary, but these can still give a sense of what once existed. Firstly, part of a ninth-century, interlaced cross-slab and three incomplete cross-carved grave-markers, including the ornate stone of late eleventh- or early twelfth-century date commemorating the sons of Bishop Abraham (Fig. 1), had all been cut down for reuse as masonry and were found in the walls of the cathedral during the Scott restoration. Consequently, there are few details concerning their discovery, but the last was removed, amongst other rubble, from the west wall of the Lady Chapel above the entrance arches and it was suggested that this had been incorporated into the wall in the time of Bishop Vaughan (1509–23) just before the Reformation.[18] Secondly, three intact, cross-carved grave-markers fashioned from small waterworn boulders with inscriptions indicating a ninth-century date were found at various times during twentieth-century repairs to the walls of the cathedral close and the boundary of the bishops' palace, both dating to around the turn of the fourteenth century.[19] In contrast, the two surviving fragments of large freestanding crosses do not appear to have been reused as masonry. The first, part of a cross-head carved with interlace ornament and dated to the later tenth or earlier eleventh century (Fig. 2), was first noted in the 1870s in the garden of the chancellor's house in the north corner of the close near Porth Bwnning (Boning's Gate).[20] The second (Fig. 3), first mentioned in 1856 as in the cathedral, is part of a cross-shaft with a mutilated inscription, which at some point, presumably before the Reformation, had been completely reshaped, probably for reuse as a holy water stoup.[21]

[FIG 2]

So what can the circumstances of discovery, incomplete as they are, and the condition of these monuments tell us about changing attitudes to them over time? Firstly, it is significant that, even though by the end of the early Middle Ages St Davids was the most important ecclesiastical site in Wales, remarkably little in the way of sculpture has survived, a situation comparable with both Bangor and Llandaff Cathedrals.[22] It may be argued that this is a reflection of their status making them prime examples of later medieval rebuilding with various additions and alterations in line with changing architectural and liturgical fashions introduced from outside followed by post-Reformation minor rebuilding or neglect and then major nineteenth-century restorations.[23] It is therefore most likely, that the majority of the St Davids sculpture, found either intact because the pieces were small, or broken up into

fragments, both for reuse as masonry, were no longer perceived as worth preserving since times had changed. In other words, it may be argued that they were reused as they no longer had a purpose to fulfil rather than because they were native and therefore out of keeping with a process of 'Normanization'. This is also likely in the case of the cross-shaft which became a handy piece of stone to be cut down and adapted as a holy water stoup, probably with the remains of the inscription concealed by placing it against a wall. The cross-head fragment may, however, have suffered a different fate, with the monument remaining part of the ecclesiastical landscape until after the Reformation only to become ideologically unacceptable and to be thrown down, perhaps as late as the Cromwellian occupation of 1648. In the early nineteenth century Richard Fenton, a local antiquary, noted that there had once been crosses at some distance beyond the gates of the precinct which might have acted as sanctuary markers[24] and it is possible that this cross was either one of these or had originally continued to stand within the cathedral close.

[FIG 3]

Many other important early medieval foundations and other Christian sites evolved into parish churches and, as a result, the fate of earlier stone sculpture rested in the hands of successive incumbents, patrons and local communities. Early inscribed stones were sometimes carefully preserved by reusing them in later masonry with the inscriptions still visible, indicating their continuing historical and cultural significance. For example, the famous Latin-inscribed stone at Llangadwaladr, Anglesey (Fig. 8), commemorating Cadfan, the early seventh-century king of Gwynedd, was formerly the lintel over the south door in the probably thirteenth-century church.[25] Occasionally, early medieval cross-carved stones were reworked to update them, probably for reuse as grave-markers, thereby also indicating their continuing value. Steynton 1, Pembrokeshire, provides a particularly interesting example of use and reuse over time (Fig. 4). It began as a roman-letter and ogam inscribed stone of fifth- or sixth-century date before having a cross added during the ninth or first half of the tenth centuries when it was probably reused as a grave-marker partially obliterating the roman-letter inscription. Further symbols were then added to the cross-head, including an upside-down shield, most likely to update it at some point in the later Middle Ages. It was finally reused as a grave-stone with the addition of an inscription in 1876.[26] Llandeilo Tal-y-Bont 1, Glamorgan, is a further example. It has an underlying incised cross and crosslets design of probable seventh- to ninth-century date but this was later elaborated into a heraldic shield, most likely during the thirteenth or fourteenth century. Ultimately, however, it was cut down for reuse in the fabric of the church.[27] Nevertheless, in many cases the early medieval sculpture was simply reused as masonry as at Llangaffo, Anglesey, where a cross-head and several cross-carved grave-stones, one reused as a lintel suggesting an eye to preservation, were found in the fifteenth-century walls during demolition of the church in 1846.[28]

[FIG 4]

Nonetheless, in contrast with St Davids, much of the more ambitious early medieval sculpture associated with parish church sites and the houses of later monastic orders continued to play a role in the Christian landscape. Indeed, a surprising number of large freestanding crosses survived both the Reformation and its aftermath, as well as the Civil War, intact, especially in west Wales. This suggests a stronger long-term concern with the

preservation of local cultural and other values, as in Ireland, north-west England and Cornwall.[29] A good example is the cross at Nevern, Pembrokeshire, which dates to the later tenth or first half of the eleventh century and still stands on the south side of the church (Fig. 5).[30] It was first noted *c*. 1603 by the important local antiquary George Owen of Henllys (1552–1613), who was a protestant but also, as lord of Cemais, had a deep sense of the Pembrokeshire landscape, its history and traditions. Written to be included in a projected parish history of Pembrokeshire,[31] his account of a story associated with the monument is instructive because it gives an insight into how the cross was perceived in the years after the Reformation.

[FIG 5]

> Nevarne is the greatest and largest parishe in the Sheere . . . & in old tyme was dedicated to the bryttishe Saint called *Sainct Burnaghe* whose festifalle day yt dulie observed within this and diverse other parishes with noe smale solempnitie the seaventh of Aprill, on wch day yt is wth us said the Cocow first beginneth to tune her laye. I might well here omytt an old report freshe as yet of this odiouse bird that in the old world the parishe priest would not beginne Masse in this parishe untill this bird . . . had first appeared & begann her note upon a stone called Saint Burnaghes stone being a stone curiouslie wrought with sondrie sortes of knottes standing upright in the Churchyarde of this parishe, and one yere stayeinge verey longue & the priest & people expecting her accustomed cominge … cam at laste & lighting upon the said stone her accustomed preaching place and being scarse able once to sounde the note upon the said stone presentlie fell downe dead. This religiouse tale although yt Concerne in some sorte Churche matters you may eyther beleave or not without perill of damnation.[32]

He tells us that the monument was known as St Brynach's stone, indicating as a result its supposed age and continuing significance because of its link with the patron saint, whose feast day was still celebrated, but, because of fears that in a post-Reformation environment it might be perceived as idolatrous, he is careful not to call it a cross. Yet he also sees the monument as the stuff of folklore incorporating a distinct undercurrent of pre-Reformation superstition since the cuckoo is 'an odiouse bird that in the old world' would perch on the stone and sing on the saint's day — only after this could Mass be said.

In some other cases, however, the changes in attitude wrought by the Reformation are much plainer to see. For example, the cross now known as the Pillar of Eliseg (Fig. 6) provides an important example of a ninth-century monument which continued to have considerable significance in the later Middle Ages, but was subsequently thrown down. It is still sited on an Early Bronze Age cairn close to the Cistercian abbey of Valle Crucis outside Llangollen. The long Latin inscription, no longer legible but which once ran the length of the shaft, tells us that it was erected by Concenn, the last early medieval ruler of Powys, who died in 854, in memory of his great-grandfather Eliseg, a contemporary of Offa, and also

indicates that Eliseg was responsible for a victory, or re-conquest of territory, from the English. It probably then recalls the purported origins of Powys and ends with a request for a blessing on Concenn and his kingdom. I have argued that this cross marked a place of assembly and was perhaps the royal inauguration site of the early medieval rulers of Powys.[33]

[FIG 6]

More than 250 years later, the political re-emergence of the kingdom during the first half of the twelfth century led, particularly during the reign of Madog ap Maredudd (d. 1160), to a revival in Powysian identity and consequently an interest in the continuity of older traditions.[34] The cross with its inscription should be seen as a key element of this, thereby restoring its earlier iconic status. It is therefore no coincidence that Madog named his youngest son Elise.[35] Nor is it surprising that when his grandson, Madog ap Gruffudd, prince of northern Powys, founded the Cistercian abbey of Valle Crucis ('the Vale of the Cross') on his land *c*. 1201, it was this landmark that gave the monastery its name.[36] The cross would have been clearly visible to those approaching from the north on the route linking the Vale of Clwyd with the Dee and it may therefore have functioned as a wayside prayer station.[37] However, when Valle Crucis was suppressed during the Dissolution, probably in January 1537,[38] the status of the monument changed dramatically since it was now perceived as idolatrous placing it in real danger of iconoclastic activity. In the wake of the Reformation, Alexandra Walsham has charted both the continuation of older practices in Wales and the borders, and the destruction of churchyard crosses, for example in Chester and Shrewsbury.[39] We cannot be certain when the cross near Valle Crucis was pulled down, but according to John Aubrey, an antiquary with good Welsh connections, it was probably during the Civil War in the 1640s.[40] In this regard, Kelsey Williams has recently pointed to the significance of Aubrey's friendship with the Welsh antiquary and lawyer, Meredith Lloyd,[41] cousin of Robert Vaughan of Hengwrt[42] who made the earliest known record of the inscription on the monument in 1648.[43]

Parliamentary ordinances in 1643 and 1644 enforced the obliteration of 'Monuments of Superstition and Idolatory', including those in 'any . . . open place', leading to the destruction of many crosses.[44] The field in which the remains of the cross stand is first noted as Maes y Groes ('Field of the Cross') on the estate map of 1606, suggesting that it still stood, and it is also worth pointing out that *c*. 1651, the then owner, Lady Mary Throckmorton, had her lands sequestered as a royalist supporter and possible recusant.[45] However, during the 1640s, the wider locality had been drawn more directly into the Civil War and this included acts of ideologically charged 'godly vandalism' on the part of Parliamentary troops in 1643, and in 1646 the fall of Chirk, Ruthin and eventually Denbigh to Cromwellian forces.[46] Nevertheless, with the Restoration of the monarchy in 1660, we are entering a new phase with different perceptions of the cultural value of early medieval stone monuments in Wales and elsewhere leading to their longer-term preservation and reinvention in new ways.

REDISCOVERY AND REINVENTION

Graham Parry has charted the development of antiquarian studies over the course of the seventeenth century. He has emphasized that this was born out of the knowledge that, in the wake of the Reformation and the Dissolution of the monasteries, much of the Christian material past was on the verge of disappearing, a sense heightened by the destruction of the Civil War. At the same time an archaeological mentality was emerging with antiquaries increasingly interested, not just in saving precious manuscripts, but also in seeking out and recording a range of sites and other artefacts,[47] including early medieval inscribed and sculptured stones. Of seminal importance for Wales was the work of Edward Lhuyd (1659/60–1709)[48] since this was instrumental, not only in the rediscovery of ancient British relics, but also in the articulation of their role in illuminating evolving perceptions of the origins of a British, and hence Welsh, cultural identity. In all Lhuyd and his associates recorded nearly ninety examples of early medieval inscribed and sculptured stones in Wales, over eighty for the first time.[49] The records of many of these only survive in manuscript form, often only in copies.[50] Nonetheless, his ground-breaking contributions on the antiquities of Wales in Gibson's edition of Camden's *Britannia*, published in 1695,[51] and the *Glossography*, devoted to the Celtic languages, published in 1707, the only volume of his projected *Archaeologia Britannica* to see the light of day,[52] brought knowledge and a new understanding of these monuments to an educated audience, both within and beyond Wales. This also gave many of the monuments a new value, often, but not always, paving the way for their future preservation.

For example, in 1699 Lhuyd wrote to Bishop Humphrey Humphries of Bangor describing and illustrating a Latin inscribed stone which he had had removed from the wall of the church at Llanddewibrefi, Cardiganshire, so he could see the entire inscription (Fig. 7).[53] This may be translated to read, 'Here lies Idnert son of Iacobus, who was slain on account of the plundering of St David'. The monument has been dated to the ninth century[54] and is an early (but not the earliest), mention of Wales's patron saint making its cultural value all the more important. Nevertheless, this drawing is now the only record of the entire inscription since Lhuyd's additional note, published in the 1722 edition of Camden's *Britannia*, failed to make a connection with St David,[55] which might have ensured its preservation. Instead, nearly two centuries later it was broken up in 1873–74 during what J. O. Westwood referred to as 'a destructive church restoration' and now only two small fragments survive built into the masonry of the external west wall of the nave.[56]

<div style="text-align:center">[FIG 7]</div>

Lhuyd was not just interested in recording early medieval inscribed and sculptured stones, but, as a Celtic linguist, also made what turned out to be a vain attempt to restore what he termed 'the Ancient Letters of the *Britains*',[57] which he regarded as nearer to the pronunciation of the Welsh words than the Latin alphabet. In his Preface *At y Kymry* ('To the Welsh') in the *Glossography*, originally only partly translated into English, he begins by discussing the unusual orthography he has used for the Welsh text, which he also encourages others to adopt. He says that it is written using certain letters which 'I often met with, not only on Stones, in divers places in *Wales*, but also in old Books, written on Goat-skin Parchment'.[58] One of the inscriptions that had undoubtedly influenced him was that commemorating Catamanus at Llangadwaladr (Fig. 8), which he had seen in 1699 and had

correctly identified as a memorial to King Cadfan of Gwynedd who died *c*. 625.[59] This inscription has a mixture of upper and lower case letters, several of which are very distinctive, and Lhuyd used these in his Welsh orthography. He was also keen to demonstrate that the British had been influenced by their contact with Roman literacy and therefore the letters had not been learnt from the Anglo-Saxons as one of his correspondents, Sir Humphrey Wanley, claimed.[60] In attempting to revive these 'Ancient Letters of the *Britains*' Lhuyd demonstrates not only his pride in the achievements of his ancient forebears but he is also seeking to harness the inscribed stones in a form of cultural nationalism at the expense of the English.

[FIG 8]

From the late seventeenth century until around the 1760s, classical nostalgia and the viewing and recording of classical remains became major occupations for aristocratic young men who went on the 'Grand Tour'. In Rome, for example, some British visitors counted and measured the huge number of ancient columns and obelisks still visible in the city. The wealthiest brought back antiquities, including stones with Latin inscriptions, and redesigned their gardens to display them.[61] More significantly, such travels also encouraged those who went to redefine their own origins and native identities within a wider Euopean context. However, from the 1790s until 1815, hostilities with France made it almost impossible to journey abroad resulting in an upsurge of travellers to view the picturesque landscapes and antiquities at home.[62]

By the 1770s the antiquarian outlook was very different from that in the time of Lhuyd, since it was now dominated by druids,[63] Celticism and the picturesque. The fashion for Celticism had been promoted by Thomas Gray in his famous 1757 poem, *The Bard*, set in the mountains of north Wales,[64] the subject of an iconic painting (1774) by the Welsh artist, Thomas Jones.[65] In 1764 Evan Evans (Ieuan Fardd) also published examples of early Welsh poetry with English translations, one of several works bringing this material to a wider audience for the first time.[66] Equally, Horace Walpole's *The Castle of Otranto*, the first Gothic romance, published in 1764, had become a runaway success,[67] though the earliest example of this genre set in Wales, *The Abbey of St Asaph* by Isabella Kelly, did not appear until 1795.[68] Viewed through this lens, the 1770s in Wales was a key decade when new ideas concerning antiquarianism, romanticism and the Gothic took hold and the picturesque qualities of the scenery in the Wye valley, Snowdonia and the Vale of Llangollen began to attract keen outside interest. At the same time, the quickening industrial revolution was beginning to change the Welsh landscape with wealth now in the hands of industrialists as well as the traditional landed classes.

I shall now consider two examples of how early medieval carved stones were reinvented at this time. In 1770 the shaft of the cross that became known as the Pillar of Eliseg still lay on the ground but the inscription, by then only partially legible, had been recorded, first by Robert Vaughan of Hengwrt in 1648, with Lhuyd's more complete transcript in 1696.[69] By this time the monument, together with the ruins of Valle Crucis Abbey, were part of the estate of Trevor Lloyd (1747–1805)[70] who transformed the landscape in line with picturesque taste and an expanding interest in the British past. This was one factor in promoting the Vale of Llangollen as an essential destination for the picturesque

traveller fostered by Thomas Pennant's popular guidebook, *A Tour in Wales* (1778–83). In 1773, a letter from Pennant's friend, Daines Barrington, was read at the Society of Antiquaries in London. This included an interesting drawing, probably by Moses Griffith (Fig. 9). The lower half shows the base and part of the former cross-shaft but the upper, somewhat unexpectedly, reconstructs the monument as an obelisk with a pointed top. Upon reflection, however, this is not as odd as it might first appear since antiquaries, influenced by Roman antiquities, were now referring to other early medieval cross-shafts as obelisks, including Pennant in his description of the Ruthwell Cross. This not only indicates the wider impact of attitudes to classical antiquity that interpreted such remains as triumphal symbols of the British past but also reflects contemporary attitudes to monuments that might still be considered 'popish' by removing their Christian identity.[71]

[FIG 9]

As part of his works on the estate, Trevor Lloyd dug into the cairn on which the cross had stood, as indicated in Pennant's *Tour in North Wales in 1773*. He briefly states, 'Within these few years the *tumulus* was opened, and the reliques of certain bones found there, placed as usual in those days, between some flat stones', thereby referring to a burial cist.[72] The partial re-excavation by myself, Gary Robinson and Howard Williams of Lloyd's intrusion into the Early Bronze Age cairn identified an extensive area of antiquarian intrusion, including a disturbed cist, dated by seventeenth- and eighteenth-century ceramics, that also extended under the re-erected pillar suggesting that the workmen had originally dug into the top of the mound.[73] After his 'excavation' Trevor Lloyd re-erected the remaining part of the shaft in its original base on top of a new dry-stone plinth in its former location on top of the reconstructed cairn. To record the event he added a Latin inscription[74] to the column, on the opposite side from the original. In translation this reads: 'That which remains of this old monument, long removed from eyes and neglected, T. Lloyd of Trevor Hall finally restored AD 1779'. This addition should not be perceived as vandalism but as a record of Lloyd's role in preserving the pillar for subsequent generations to view.

Its re-erection gave the Pillar of Eliseg the appearance of a broken classical column of the type encountered in Italy. Even if he did not experience the 'Grand Tour', Trevor Lloyd would very likely have seen books and prints describing and illustrating the classical ruins of Italy[75] and quite possibly paintings, notably those of Richard Wilson (*c*. 1714–82), who was raised in Flintshire but spent his formative years as a painter in Rome during the 1750s.[76] His later paintings of the sublime landscape of the Vale of Llangollen for his patron and distant relative, Sir Watkin Williams Wynn of Wynnstay, a neighbour of Lloyd, were transformed by bathing them in Italianate light.[77] Wynn, who had been on the 'Grand Tour' in 1768–9, was also an important patron of native British culture, notably Evan Evans and the famous blind harpist, John Parry, who had partly inspired Gray's poem, and his artist son William, who had also painted a portrait of Trevor Lloyd.[78]

Lloyd's reinvention of the Pillar of Eliseg as a broken Roman column on top of a burial mound rapidly became identified in the popular imagination as the grave of Eliseg and would have been a worthy memorial to a native Welsh ruler. It was an important feature within a wider picturesque landscape dominated by the ruins of Valle Crucis Abbey from which it could be viewed. In 1773 Lloyd built a summer-house at the eastern end of the abbey

and from there it is still possible to follow the vista north-westwards and see in the distance the pillar on its mound. This would not have been possible had not the column and base been raised by mounting them on the dry-stone plinth with earth added around the top to shield it from view. Our topographical survey and the lidar image also suggest that considerable amounts of earth had been removed along the east–west field boundary to the south to make the mound appear more impressive when approached from the south east.[79]

Therefore Trevor Lloyd manipulated the broader landscape of his estate to increase its picturesque impact. The romantic wildness of the Nant Eglwyseg valley with its swiftly flowing stream, rocky western slope, steeply rising wooded bank, and mountain views had all the natural ingredients of a sublime landscape. This was enhanced by gothic remains in the form of the Pillar of Eliseg on the cairn (re-interpreted as the grave of a native prince) and the crumbling ruins of Valle Crucis Abbey with a distant view of Castell Dinas Brân on the precipitous summit beyond.[80] Shortly after its re-erection, Richard Wilson incorporated what is unmistakably the Pillar of Eliseg, out of place, into the right middle ground of his late painting of the castle.[81] Other artists who sketched it include the young J. M. W. Turner,[82] and Thomas Rowlandson who shows a group of visitors at the monument addressed by a guide.[83] Other picturesque tourists also wrote accounts or drew sketches, not least Continental travellers, notably Cristian August Gottlieb Göde whose romantic experience of north Wales in 1802–3 included a visit to the pillar where he encountered an 'English scholar with a love of Welsh culture' with whom he engaged in an aesthetic debate![84]

My second example is the now incomplete earlier sixth-century inscribed stone commemorating Macarinus son of Beria[ci] (Fig. 10), first recorded by Edward Lhuyd in its original upland location at Clwydi Banwen, on the line of the Roman road between the forts at Neath and Coelbren.[85] Sometime in the later eighteenth century the stone was removed to the grounds of the Gnoll in the Vale of Neath, a landscape already known for its picturesque beauty. This was at the behest of Lady Eliza Mackworth (née Trefusis, 1737–99) the Cornish born wife of the owner, Sir Herbert Mackworth (1737–91), a Cardiff MP who was also a Fellow of the Royal Society.[86] The family's wealth lay in coal-mining and copper-smelting and over the course of the eighteenth century the park at the Gnoll was laid out according to picturesque taste with ponds and cascades as well as features that included a mosshouse, a gazebo and an ivy tower.[87] Lady Eliza displayed her antiquities, which included this inscribed stone and a fragment of a probably tenth-century cross from near Capel Coelbren,[88] in a grotto. This is almost certainly the cave-like grotto formerly lined with exotic shells and artificial stalagmites recently relocated in Mosshouse Wood beside an informal cascade beneath the gazebo.[89] By the late eighteenth century when it was built such 'primitive' structures were linked with an archaic Britain[90] and the presence of the inscribed stone within would have offered the visitor the opportunity to sit and contemplate a heroic British past. Indeed, the man commemorated was later tentatively identified as the son of the tribal chief who had informed the Romans of Caratacus's imminent revolt.[91] Such a location may be compared with the Worthyvale inscribed stone in north Cornwall. In the mid-eighteenth century this had also been removed by Lady Dowager Falmouth from its original location to her park where it lay in 'one of the natural grottes on the hill' which was probably down by the cascade where it still is.[92] A significant number of other early medieval inscribed and

sculptured stones in Wales were likewise removed to the homes of the wealthy during the later eighteenth and nineteenth centuries either to be reused as garden ornaments or as part of private collections.[93] The acquisition of such ancient British antiquities gave them a new value as they were now objects of elite social display. However, as with the monument from Clwydi Banwen,[94] there were also in some cases indictions of local and antiquarian opposition to the removal of carved stones from their original locations demonstrating a wider concern for such monuments and the integrity and preservation of the ancient British past.

[FIG 10]

PRESERVATION, IMITATION AND IDENTITY

I shall now examine briefly some key episodes that help to cast light on changing attitudes to early medieval inscribed stones and stone sculptures in Wales over the past 175 years. Using examples, I shall focus on their preservation and imitation, and arising from these, their evolving use as symbols of national and cultural identity.

With the foundation of the Cambrian Archaeological Association and its journal in 1846–7, we can immediately see an upsurge of interest in these monuments across Wales, fostered by the annual meetings in different parts of the country where they were visited and discussed. And, as we have already seen, the fashion for the demolition of medieval churches at this time — something the Cambrians deplored — and their rebuilding or restoration in the Gothic style,[95] resulted in the rediscovery and recording of large numbers of often fragmentary early medieval carved stones. These were often reset in the church fabric so they remained visible, or were otherwise displayed within the building.

Increased scholarly understanding of the significance of these monuments, both within and beyond Wales, ultimately led to their better preservation and display. This included the acquisition of examples by two major museums outside Wales, the British Museum and the Ashmolean, since there was as yet no National Museum in Wales. (This only received its royal charter in 1907 and the Cathays Park building did not open to the public until 1922.)[96] Both of these acquisitions proved controversial. In 1876 the Revd Lewis Price spotted the Llywel early sixth-century, Latin and ogam inscribed stone commemorating *Maccvtreni Salicidvni* (later upended and incised with figural scenes), on Pentre Poeth Farm, Breconshire, where it was about to be set up as a gate-post. Initially he persuaded the landowner, Mr Price of Ty'r Capel, that the stone should be displayed nearby, either in Dyfynnog or Llywel parish churches. However, the landowner's son, a London medical student, realized its potential commercial value and in February 1878 it was sold to the British Museum for £10.[97]

In 1899 the Ashmolean acquired two Latin inscribed stones found *c*. 1833 at Tir-gwyn, near Llannor, on the Llŷn peninsula. The first, inscribed with the name *Vendesetli*, dates to the late fifth or first half of the sixth century; the second commemorating Iovenalis, son of Eternus, to the latter part of this period.[98] In *c*. 1895, however, they were again dug up, this time by Edward Nicolson (1849–1912), a man with Celtic interests who had been brought up in Llanrwst and became the Oxford Bodleian librarian. He then had them sent by

the farmer's son to Oxford before presenting them to the Ashmolean.[99] Nevertheless, a century later, the by then greatly increased local understanding of the significance of their cultural value meant that there was a successful local campaign by *Cyfeillion Llŷn* to have them returned. As part of this in March 1992, the poet R. S. Thomas wrote to the Ashmolean complaining that when the stones had been visited 'they were in the Museum basement, covered in dust'. He went on to say 'since they are doing nobody any good in your cellar I would like to put pressure on you to have them returned to their rightful home here in Llŷn'.[100] They were indeed returned on loan in 1993[101] and are now displayed in the porch of Oriel Plas Glyn-y-Weddw in Llanbedrog. The first early medieval carved stone to be acquired by what eventually became the National Museum of Wales was in fact the tenth-century inscribed cross from Baglan, donated to Cardiff Museum and Art Gallery in 1892, and it was only two decades later that this collection began to grow.[102]

[FIG 11]

At the same time Cardiff Museum and Art Gallery, in line with other museums in Britain and Ireland, began to build up a collection of casts (Fig. 11) of the more important early medieval stone monuments with some financial help from the South Kensington Museum (now the V&A), beginning in 1894 with the Conbelin and Enniaun crosses at Margam.[103] Casts such as these, since they record the then condition of the monuments concerned, have recently been recognized as significant elements in the construction of more complex cultural biographies in their own right.[104] At the time they were instrumental, alongside new scholarly studies of Welsh and Scottish sculpture together with Celtic interlace and other early medieval ornament made by J. Romilly Allen (1847–1907), the editor of *Archaeologia Cambrensis*,[105] in bringing the significance of these monuments to a much wider audience. In turn this led, in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, to the adoption of Celtic themes and motifs in contemporary industrial art and design, including stone sculpture, notably commemorative crosses.[106] For example, in the municipal cemetery in Bangor there is an interlaced cross commemorating Cadwaladr Davies (Fig. 12), the first registrar of the University College of North Wales, who died in 1905, whilst Llantwit Major war memorial, erected in 1921 (Fig. 13), is partly modelled on the late ninth- or early tenth-century cross at Penally, Pembrokeshire.[107] In Wales the 'Celtic Revival' in art and design, as in Scotland and Ireland, was partly inspired by a growing sense of national identity. However, in Wales, though this fashion was also partly inspired by patriotism stemming from the *Cymru Fydd* or Young Wales movement in the 1880s, which championed the idea of home rule for Wales within the British Empire, the art that emerged was but a pale reflection of that seen during the campaign for home rule in Ireland.[108]

[FIG 12]

During the 1890s the artist Thomas Henry Thomas (1839–1915) campaigned for Welsh early medieval stone crosses to be seen not only as models for contemporary artists, but also for them to be brought inside churches and other buildings 'where they would stand as grand ornaments and memorials of the early history of our country'.[109] Such exhortations eventually led to the comparatively early scheduling of a number of inscribed and sculptured stones following the 1913 Ancient Monuments Consolidation and Amendment Act. Notably, the earliest were the crosses Maen Achwyfan (in 1922), the Pillar of Eliseg (in 1923) and

Carew (in 1924), but inscribed stones followed, such as Maen Madog, Breconshire.[110] In the wake of the publication of V. E. Nash-Williams's *Early Christian Monuments of Wales* in 1950 and following advice from the Ancient Monuments Board for Wales in 1956, there was a concerted Ministry of Works programme to bring monuments into churches or provide other shelter.[111] It is, however, particularly interesting that when Cadw: Welsh Historic Monuments was set up in 1984, the head of the Carew cross, dating to the later tenth or first half of the eleventh century, was chosen from a small number of other designs as the logo.[112] Echoing the C of Cadw, it initially looked quite naturalistic, but with the demands of the digital age, it has evolved into something much simpler, but still clearly recognizable.

[FIG 13]

I want to end by drawing attention to the role of the early medieval inscribed and sculptured stones in contemporary Welsh art in the work of Ceredigion painter, Mary Lloyd Jones (1939–). As a native Welsh speaker from a rural background and a distant relative through marriage of the Celtic scholar, Sir John Rhys,[113] her landscape paintings and other artwork convey a deep sense of belonging within a continuum and a pride in Welsh cultural identity. In 2001, Mary Lloyd Jones was invited to put together a large exhibition called *Lliwio'r Gair* ('Colouring the Word') in the newly extended Aberystwyth Arts Centre. This included large proclamatory banners which expressed her feelings, not only about Welsh poetry, but also about the significance of the Welsh past envisaged, amongst other things, through different alphabets and scripts including ogam. She included banners showing early medieval inscribed stones and stone crosses in a new and exciting way (Fig. 14).[114] In *Iaith Gyntaf* ('First Language'), an exhibition in the National Library of Wales in 2006, she went on to explore the significance of her mother tongue, its origins and antiquity together with its endangered status. She chose to do this partly through the new medium of digital printing. She created palimpsests of letters, words and printed pages, sometimes with images of inscribed stones, connecting them with Celtic scholars, notably Sir John Rhys and Edward Lhuyd (who had wished to restore to use the 'Ancient letters of the *Britains*' all those years before).[115]

[FIG 14]

CONCLUSION

The study of Welsh inscribed and sculptured stones within their early medieval context, though fundamental, is but one aspect in our understanding of their overall significance. As I hope I have demonstrated, the reconstruction of cultural biographies helps us better to understand changing attitudes to these monuments over time and in a much broader context. If, during the later Middle Ages, many, especially the less ambitious cross-carved stones, were initially broken up and reused as masonry, largely as a result of changes in architectural and liturgical fashion, other more significant monuments, including freestanding crosses continued to fulfil a role, either standing in churchyards or as wayside crosses. Although a surprising number of these survived the iconoclastic destruction brought on by the Reformation and the Civil War, such acts of violation ultimately contributed to their

reinvention in new ways whilst also preserving a sense of their longer cultural continuum and identity as British antiquities. It was this that gave the monuments that survived a new value fostering scholarly interest and increased understanding, which over the last 175 years has led to their protection and to them being more fully understood as part of our Welsh heritage. Nevertheless, we should never be complacent.[116] With the number of redundant churches fast growing, it is now important to consider the future of early medieval carved stones in churches and churchyards which are now losing their original Christian purpose. At the same time, far fewer early medieval stone monuments are displayed in museum exhibitions because of limitations of space and changing perceptions of what should be shown and how.[117] Equally, digital technology, including photogrammetry, laser scanning, and 3D printing, as well as the internet, are already giving us exciting new ways to record, display and reinvent these monuments,[118] potentially bringing their significance to a global audience. Nevertheless, such exciting opportunities should not be regarded as more than a convenient substitute for the originals that inspired them. We therefore need to ensure that we continue to cherish them for future generations to see and enjoy.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

NOTES

1. Redknap and Lewis 2007; Edwards 2007a; Edwards 2013.
2. Bradley 1987; 1993; see also Bradley and Williams 1998 for the wider application of these ideas.
3. Gosden and Marshall 1999.
4. Cassidy 1992; Moreland 1999; James *et al.* 2008; Hall 2015. For other Scottish monuments, see Hall *et al.* 2000; Hall 2011; 2012.
5. Kopytoff 1986, 64–70.

6. For an excellent discussion of a specific example, the Parthenon (or 'Elgin') marbles, see Hamilakis 1999.
7. Redknap and Lewis 2007, 15; Edwards 2007a, 33–4, 55–6; 2013, 44, 78–9.
8. Edwards 2007a, P9, 303, P73, 396, CD4; Edwards 2013, F12, 336–7, AN51, 221, 225.
9. O'Sullivan 2011, 183–7.
10. Davies 1987, 24–107, 216–51, 289–354.
11. Thurlby 2006. The Romanesque cathedral at Llandaff built by the first Norman bishop, Urban, *c.* 1120 replacing the earlier stone church has been described as the 'most emphatic statement of the Normanization of this part of Wales', Thurlby 2006, xv.
12. Burton and Stöber 2015, 160–4, 213–17; Gem 2009, 108–10; Stephenson 2013.
13. Edwards 2007a, 427; Sharpe and Davies 2007; Davies 2007, 159–60.
14. Jones 1955, 30–1.
15. Davies 1987, 33.
16. Pryce 2007, 305–6.
17. Stalley 2004, 387–92.
18. Edwards 2007a, P90, 427, P96, 438, P97, 440, P98, 444. P96 and P98 were reused with other later fragments to form the altar frontal in Trinity (Bishop Vaughan's) Chapel, Stalley 2004, 409.
19. Edwards 2007a, P93, 433, P94, 435, P95, 437; Evans and Turner 2005, 14–17, 48–9.
20. Edwards 2007a, P91, 429; Lloyd *et al*. 2004, 416–17; Evans and Turner 2005, 49, fig.
21. Edwards 2007a, P92, 431.
22. Edwards 2013, CN4–9, 246–55; Redknap and Lewis 2007, G36–40, 320–7.
23. Haslam *et al.* 2009, 239–41; Newman 1995, 240–1.
24. Fenton 1811, 112.
25. The Latin inscription reads: *Catamanus / rex sapientisi/mus opinatisim/us omnium reg/um*, 'King Catamanus, the wisest, most illustrious of all kings', Edwards 2013, AN26, 180–3; Davidson 2000, 167; Haslam *et al*. 2009, 178.
26. Edwards 2007a, P138, 503–5.
27. Redknap and Lewis 2007, G41, 327–8. See also two monuments from St Dogmaels Abbey, Pembrokeshire, that may also have later medieval reworking, Edwards 2007a, P115, P118, 522–4.
28. Prichard 1898, 288–9; Edwards 2013, AN27–37, 183–94, 453–6.
29. Harbison 1992; O'Sullivan 2011, 179–82; Preston-Jones and Okasha 2013.
30. Edwards 2007b, P73, 396–401.
31. Miles 2004; 1994, xli.
32. Charles 1948, 269–70.
33. For detailed discussion of its early medieval significance, see Edwards 2009; 2013, D3, 322–36.
34. Stephenson 2016, 55–7.
35. Ibid., 55.
36. Pryce 2005, 698–700, no. 499; Evans 2008, 3.
37. Walsham 2011, 60.
38. Pratt 1997, 38.
39. Walsham 2011, 102–6, 119.

40. See Fowles 1980–2, i, 550–1 for Aubrey's reference to its destruction; Scurr 2015, 3, 98, 101, 112, 417, 419, 421 for more general references to his links with Wales.

41. Williams 2016, 43 and n. 101.

42. Morgan 1959.

43. Edwards 2009, 145–6; 2013, 322, 330 fig.

44. Walsham 2011, 128–33, where quotes from the Parliamentary Ordinances in 1633 and 1634 are included.

45. Pratt 1997, 44–7.

46. Walsham 2011, 135, 137–8; Tucker 2003, 66–9, 84–94.

47. Parry 1995, 10–11, 14, 362; see also Walsham 2011, 273–96.

48. Emery 1971; Jones and Pryce 2010.

49. Edwards 2007b, 165.

50. Ibid., 169–76.

51. Camden 1695, 583–702. Further minor additions also appear in the 1722 edition.

52. Lhuyd 1707; Evans and Roberts 2009.

53. Oxford, Early Modern Letters Online, Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd 29 Mar 1699; Bangor University Archives and Special Collections, MS Penrhos V, 868, available at <tinyurl.com/y5hbw9ey>, accessed 31 December 2019.

54. Edwards 2007a, CD9, 150–3. The Latin inscription reads: *Hic iacet Idnert filivs Iacobi / qvi occisvs fvit propter predam / sancti David.*

55. Camden 1722, ii, 39–40.

56. Westwood 1876–79, 140; Lloyd *et al.* 2006, 501.

57. Evans and Roberts 2009, 110–11.

58. Lhuyd 1707, no pagination; Evans and Roberts 2009, 108–9.

59. Lhuyd 1700–1, 790, fig.; Camden 1722, ii, 62, fig.; Edwards 2013, AN26. 180–3.

60. Evans and Roberts 2009, 110–15; Edwards 2010, 45.

61. Sweet 2012, 1–3, 5–6, 107–129, 164–5; Hawkes 2017, 86–7.

62. Sweet 2012, 10–13.

63. Sweet 2004, 127–30.

64. Andrews 1989, 127–8; Smiles 1994, 47–51; Thomas Gray archive, available at <https://www.thomasgray.org.uk/>, accessed 31 December 2019.

65. Lord 2016, 228–9; Amgueddfa Cymru – National Museum Wales, Art Collections Online, available at <https://museum.wales/art/online>, accessed 31 December 2019. Smiles 1994, 51–61 also considers changing artistic representations of the poem in the second half of the eighteenth and early nineteenth century.

66. Prescott 2008, 57–83; Smiles 1994, 55–6.

67. Gamer 2001, xiii–xviii, xxxii.

68. Aaron 2013, 15–20.

69. Edwards 2009, 145–7, 156–60; 2013, D3, 322, 330–1 figs.

70. Price 1952, 192. Cato 2008, 107, pl. 45, 153, discusses the fine portrait of Lloyd by William Parry.

71. Hawkes 2017, 99–100.

72. Pennant 1778–83, 400.

73. Edwards *et al.* 2015, 12.

74. *Quod hujus veteris Monumenti / Superest / Diu ex oculis remotum / Et neglectum / Tandem restituit / T. LLOYD / de / TREVOR HALL / A. D. / M D C C L X X I X.*

75. Sweet 2012, 1.

76. Lord 2009, 7–23; Postle and Simon 2014.

77. Andrews 1989, 111–12; Postle and Simon 2014, 166–7, nos 81–2; Lord 2016, 104–7; Yale Centre for British Art, online collections, available at <https://collections.britishart.yale.edu>, accessed 2 January 2020.

78. Smiles 1994, 49; Lord 2016, 104–5, 107–9; see n. 70 above.

79. Edwards *et al.* 2015, 61.

80. Ibid.

81. National Library of Wales (NLW), 99401497302419, Richard Wilson, 'Castell Dinas Brân', *c.* 1781; Wakelin 2016, no. 1.

82. Wilton 2012, D00334.

83. NLW PD9363, Thomas Rowlandson, 'The Pillar of Eliseg near Valle Crucis', 1797; Evans 2008, 56, pl.

84. Tully 2009, 132–4; European Travellers to Wales, available at <http://etw.bangor.ac.uk/accounts/england-wales-irland-und-schottland-erinnerungen-natur-und-kunst-aus-einer-reise-den-jahren>, accessed 2 January 2020.

85. Redknap and Lewis 2007, G7, 270–2. The complete Latin inscription may have read *Macaritini fili Beria*[*ci*].

86. Thomas 1964.

87. RCAHMW Coflein, The Gnoll House Garden, Neath, NPRN 265660, including Cadw Parks and Gardens Register text description, CPG236, available at <https://coflein.gov.uk/en/site/265660/details/gnoll-thegnoll-house-garden-neath>, accessed 2 January 2020.

88. Redknap and Lewis 2007, G10, 277–8.

89. International Grotto Directory, Gnoll Grotto, available at <http://osborne.house/profilego.asp?ref=293F35>, accessed 2 January 2020; Westwood 1865, 59–65. The latter account of where the inscribed stone was displayed seems rather confused. The Revd T. Williams, in a letter to J. O. Westwood in 1853 (though he may well be referring to an earlier undated event), describes how a former under-gardener had told him that the grotto had collapsed in a storm. This led Williams to visit Mrs Grant, the wife of the then owner, who had the grotto dug out and the inscribed stone retrieved. When Westwood saw both stones in 1846, they were 'embedded into the upright bank of a recess, or grotto, in a terrace about one hundred yards south of the house'.

90. Smiles 1994, 198–9.

91. Westwood 1865, 62.

92. William Borlaise (1754), quoted in Okasha 1993, 333; pers. comm., Ann Preston-Jones.

93. See, for example, Clocaenog 1 (D1), Tywyn 2 (MR25), Maenclochog 1 (P58), Llanfynydd 1 (CM24) and Merthyr Mawr 1–2 (G98–9), which became garden ornaments; Cynwyl Gaeao 2–3 (CM5–6), Tregaron 1–2 (CD32–3) and Aberdaron 1–2 (CN2–3) entered private collections, Edwards 2007a; 2013.

94. Westwood 1865, 60–1.

95. Pryce 2011, 15–20.

96. On the long campaign to establish a National Museum, see Morgan 2007; Mason 2007, 25–8; Lord 2000, 304–6. On the construction of the building in Cathys Park, only formally opened by George V in 1927, see Dykes 1993, 3–7.

97. Redknap and Lewis 2007, B42, 235–7; Rhys 1901, 240–3. In contrast, the St Davids *Rinaci / nomena* inscribed stone, Edwards 2007a, P107, 438–9, was purchased by Henry Owen from the Revd Thomas Lewis for £5 but was then placed in the porch of the local church at Carnhedryn, thereby keeping it in the locality, Williams 1896.

98. Edwards 2013, 290, CN30–1.

99. Clapinson 2004; Evans, 1899, 15; Breese 1925, 387. Breese had attempted to view the stones on site. Being informed of their removal, 'since they should never have been taken out of Wales', he pursued enquiries on their whereabouts and asked the Cambrian Archaeological Association to report the matter to the Ancient Monuments Board for Wales with a view to securing their return.

100. Bangor University Archives and Special Collections, copy of letter from R. S. Thomas to M. Vickers, Deputy Keeper, The Ashmolean Museum, 8 March 1992.

101. Pers. comm., Eleanor Standley, Ashmolean Museum, August 2014. Similarly, St Dogmaels 6, Pembrokeshire, found in 1996 and deposited in Amgueddfa Cymru – National Museum Wales, is now on loan and displayed at St Dogmaels Abbey following a local campaign for its return, Edwards 2007a, P117, 470–1. For an analysis of similar local concerns about legal ownership and display and the wider context surrounding these in relation to the Hilton of Cadboll Pictish cross-slab, Easter Ross (displayed in the National Museum of Scotland, Edinburgh), together with the later discovery of its base in 2001 leading to an important study of local perceptions of the monument, see James *et al.* 2008, 8–9, 251–66.

102. Redknap and Lewis 2007, G6, 30, 268.

103. Ibid., 29–35, Margam 1 and 2, G78–9, 408–20. On the wider significance of the South Kensington Museum in the funding of contemporary cast collections of early medieval 'Celtic' crosses, especially in Scotland, see Foster 2014.

104. Foster and Curtis 2016, 129–37.

105. Allen 1899; Allen and Anderson 1903.

106. On their impact in Scotland, see Foster 2014, 5–6.

107. Imperial War Museum, Llantwit Major War memorial by E. Jones; Edwards 2007a, P82, 458–9, available at <https://www.iwm.org.uk/memorials/item/memorial/6700> accessed 13 January 2020.

108. Lord 2000, 318–24; Pryce 2011, 37–9; Sheehy 1980.

109. Thomas 1892–93, 40, 46; 1897, 108–11; Pryce 2011, 38–9.

110. Rees forthcoming; Maen Madoc (Ystradfellte 1), Redknap and Lewis 2007, B50, 251–3.

111. Lewis 1964.

112. Cadw ('To Preserve') was chosen as the title by Wyn Thomas, the then Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State at the Welsh Office. He called a small group informally together to choose the logo, including Richard Avent (then Chief Inspector of Ancient

Monuments) and Jeremy Knight (then Inspector of Ancient Monuments). The decision
was unanimous. Pers. comm. Jeremy Knight.
113. Lloyd Jones 2014, 33.
114. Ropek 2001; Lloyd-Morgan 2002, 60, 117–18.
115. Lloyd Jones 2006, 9–11, 15–16, 39, 44, 112, 122.
116. The problems associated with the protection of early medieval carved stones in Wales
were last fomally considered in Ancient Monuments Board for Wales 2001.
117. The Early Christian Monuments gallery at the National Museum, Cathays Park,
Cardiff, was installed by John Lewis in 1976 and included a large number of early
medieval carved stones and a number of painted casts. This was taken down in 2007,
pers. comm. Mark Redknap. For a photograph of the display, see Redknap 1991, 41.
original Amgueddfa Cymru – National Museum Wales exhibition of early Christian
monuments, which included a number of painted casts, survived until the late 2000s.
For a photographs of the display, see Redknap 1991, 41.
118. See, for example, Redknap and Lewis 2007, 28, figs 27–8; Preston-Jones and Okasha
2013, 5–7; the *Ogham in 3D* project in Ireland, available at
<https://ogham.celt.dias.ie>, accessed 11 January 2020, and *The Digital Corpus of Isle
of Man Early Medieval Crosses*, available at
<https://www.lancaster.ac.uk/history/news/the-digital-corpus-of-isle-of-man-early-
medieval-crosses>, accessed 11 January 2020.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Aaron, J., 2013. *Welsh Gothic* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press).
Allen, J. R., 1899. 'Early Christian art in Wales', *Archaeologia Cambrensis*, ser. 5, 16, 1–69.
Allen, J. R. and Anderson, J., 1903. *The Early Christian Monuments of Scotland*, 3 pts,
Edinburgh: Society of Antiquaries of Scotland, repr. 1993 with introduction by I.
Henderson (Balgavies: Pinkfoot Press).
Andrews, M., 1989. *The Search for the Picturesque* (Aldershot: Scolar Press).
Ancient Monuments Board for Wales 2001. *Diogelu Cerrig Arysgrifedig a Cherfluniau
Carreg o'r Oesoedd Canol Cynnar / Protecting Early Medieval Inscribed Stones and
Stone Sculpture*, Annual Report 2000–01.
Bradley, R., 1987. 'Time regained: the creation of continuity', *Journal of the British
Archaeological Association* 140, 1–17.
——1993. *Altering the Earth: The Origins of Monuments in Britain and Continental Europe*
(Edinburgh: Society of Antiquaries of Scotland).
Bradley, R. and Williams, H. (eds), 1998. *The Past in the Past: The Reuse of Ancient
Monuments*, *World Archaeology* 30(1).
Breese, C. E., 1925. 'Meini hirion on the Tir Gwyn Farm in the parish of Llannor,
Carnarvonshire', *Archaeologia Cambrensis* 80, 385–7.
Burton, J. and Stöber, K., 2015. *Abbeys and Priories of Medieval Wales* (Cardiff: University
of Wales Press).

Camden, W., 1695. *Britannia: newly translated into English: with large additions and improvements* (London: Edmund Gibson).

——1722. *Britannia: or a chorographical description of Great Britain and Ireland, together with the adjacent islands* (2nd edn, London: Edmund Gibson).

Cassidy, B., 1992. 'The later life of the Ruthwell cross: from the seventeenth century to the present', in B. Cassidy (ed.), *The Ruthwell Cross* (Princeton, Department of Art and Archaeology), 3–34.

Cato, M. W., 2008. *Parry: the life and works of William Parry A.R.A. (1743–1791)* (no place of publication: M. W. Cato).

Charles, B. G., 1948. 'The second book of George Owen's *Description of Penbrokeshire*', *National Library of Wales Journal* 5(4), 265–85.

Clapinson, M., 2004. 'Edward Williams Byron Nicholson (1849–1912), *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, <https://doi-org.ezproxy.bangor.ac.uk/10.1093/ref:odnb/35227>, accessed 25 June 2019.

Davidson, A., 2000. 'Historic Churches of Gwynedd, Gazetteer of Churches, Diocese of Bangor', unpublished report, Gwynedd Archaeological Trust Report No. 390.

Davies, J. R., 2007. 'Some observations on the "Nero", "Digby", and "Vespasian" recensions of *Vita S. David*', in Evans and Wooding (eds) 2007, 156–60.

Davies, R. R., 1987. *Conquest, Coexistence, and Change: Wales 1063–1415* (Oxford: Clarendon Press and University of Wales Press).

Dykes, D. M., 1993. 'Wales in miniature', *Amgueddfa* 16 (Autumn).

Edwards, N., 2007a. *A Corpus of Early Medieval Inscribed Stones and Stone Sculpture in Wales, Vol. II, South-West Wales* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press).

——2007b. 'Edward Lhuyd and the origins of early medieval Celtic archaeology', *Antiquaries Journal* 87, 165–96.

——2009. 'Rethinking the Pillar of Eliseg', *Antiquaries Journal* 89, 143–77.

——2010. 'Edward Lhuyd: an archaeologist's view', *Welsh History Review* 25(1), 20–50.

——2013. *A Corpus of Early Medieval Inscribed Stones and Stone Sculpture in Wales, Vol. III, North Wales* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press).

Edwards, N., Robinson, G. and Williams, H., 2015. 'Excavations at the Pillar of Eliseg, Llangollen, 2010–2012: Project Eliseg, final report prepared for Cadw', unpublished report, Bangor University and University of Chester.

Emery, F. V., 1971. *Edward Lhuyd FRS 1660–1709* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press).

Evans, A., 1899. *Report of the Keeper of the Ashmolean to the Visitors* (Oxford: Ashmolean Museum).

Evans, D. H., 2008. *Valle Crucis Abbey* (rev. edn, Cardiff: Cadw).

Evans, D. W. and Roberts, B. F. (eds), 2009. *Edward Lhwyd, Archæologia Britannica: Texts and Translations,* Celtic Studies Publications 10 (Aberystwyth: Celtic Studies Publications).

Evans, J. W. and Turner, R., 2005. *St David's Bishop's Palace* (2nd edn, Cardiff: Cadw).

Evans, J. W. and Wooding, J. M. (eds), 2007. *St David of Wale: Cult, Church and Nation* (Woodbridge: Boydell).

Fenton, R., 1811. *A Historical Tour through Pembrokeshire* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme and Co.)

Foster, S. M., 2014. 'Circulating agency: the V&A, Scotland and the multiplication of plaster casts of 'Celtic crosses', *Journal of the History of Collections* 27(1), 73–96.

Foster, S. M. and Curtis, N. G. W., 2016. 'The thing about replicas – why historic replicas matter', *European Journal of Archaeology* 19(1), 122–48.

Fowles, J. (ed.), 1980–2. *Monumenta Britannica, John Aubrey (1626–97)*, 3 pts, facsimile (annotated by R. Legg), 2 vols (Sherborne: Dorset Publishing).

Gamer, M., 2001. 'Introduction', in H. Walpole, *The Castle of Otranto*, ed. by M. Gamer, (London: Penguin).

Gem, R., 2009. 'Gruffudd ap Cynan and the Romanesque church at Penmon, Anglesey', in N. Edwards (ed.), *The Archaeology of the Early Medieval Celtic Churches* (Leeds: Maney), 301–12.

Gosden, C. and Marshall, Y., 1999. 'The cultural biography of objects', *World Archaeology* 31(2), 169–78.

Hall, M. A., 2011. 'Tales from beyond the Pict: sculpture and its uses in and around Forteviot, Perthshire from the ninth century onwards', in S. T. Driscoll, J. Geddes and M. A. Hall (eds), *Pictish Progess*: *New Studies on Northern Britain in the Early Middle Ages*, Leiden and Boston: Brill, 135–168.

——2012. 'Three stones, one landscape, many stories: cultural biography and the early medieval sculptures of Inchyra and St Madoes, Carse of Gowrie, Perthshire, Scotland', in S. H. Dudley, A. J. Barnes, J. Binnie, J. Petrov and J. Walklate (eds), *Narrating Objects, Collecting Stories: Essays in honour of Susan M. Pearce* (London and New York: Routledge), 85–102.

——2015. 'The Meigle stones: a biographical overview', *Northern Studies* 46, 15–46.

Hall, M. A., Forsyth, K., Henderson, I., Scott, I. G., Trench-Jellico, R. and Watson, A., 2000. 'Of makings and meanings: towards a cultural biography of the Crieff Burgh Cross, Strathearn, Perthshire', *Tayside and Fife Archaeological Journal* 6, 154–88.

Hamilakis, Y., 1999. 'Stories from exile: fragments from the cultural biography of the Parthenon (or "Elgin") marbles', *World Archaeology* 31(2), 303–20.

Haslam, R., Orbach, J. and Voelker, A., 2009. *Gwynedd* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press).

Hawkes, J., 2017. 'Constructing identities in the eighteenth century: Thomas Pennant and the early medieval sculpture of Scotland and England', in M.-A. Constantine and N. Leask (eds), *Enlightened Travel and British Identities: Thomas Pennant's Tours in Scotland and Wales* (London: Anthem Press), 85–104.

James, H. F., Henderson, I., Foster, S. M. and Jones, S., 2008. *A Fragmented Masterpiece: Recovering the Biography of the Hilton of Cadboll Pictish Cross-slab* (Edinburgh: Society of Antiquaries of Scotland).

Jones, A. and Pryce, H. (eds), 2010. *Edward Lhuyd and his Legacy*, *Welsh History Review*, 25(1).

Jones, T. (ed. and trans.), 1955. *Brut y Tywysogyon or The Chronicle of the Princes: Red Book of Hergest Version* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press).

Kopytoff, I., 1986. 'The cultural biography of things: commoditization as process', in A. Appadurai (ed.), *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), 64–91.

Lewis, J. M., 1964. 'Early Christian stones in Wales', *Archaeologia Cambrensis* 113, 166–8.

Lhuyd, E., 1700–1. 'An account of some Roman, French, and Irish inscriptions and antiquities', *Philosophical Transactions* 22 (269), 790–2.

——1707. *Archaeologia Britannica, giving some account additional to what has been hitherto publish'd, of the languages, histories and customs of the original inhabitants of Great Britain, Vol. 1, Glossography*, Oxford: printed at the theater for the author, and sold by Mr. Bateman in London, facsimile ed. 1971, with introduction by A. and W. O'Sullivan (Shannon: Irish Academic Press).

Lloyd, T., Orbach, J. and Scourfield, R., 2004. *Pembrokeshire* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press).

——2006. *Carmarthenshire and Ceredigion* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press).

Lloyd Jones, M., 2006. *First Language* (Llandysul: Gomer).

——2014. *No Mod Cons* (Llanrwst: Gwasg Carreg Gwalch).

Lloyd-Morgan, C., 2002. *Delweddau o'r Ymylon: Bywyd a Gwaith Mary Lloyd Jones* (Talybont: Y Lolfa).

Lord, P., 2000. *Imaging the Nation / Delweddu'r Genedl* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press).

——2009. *Richard Wilson: Life and Legacy* (Conwy: Royal Cambrian Academy).

——2016. *The Tradition: A New History of Welsh Art 1400–1990* (Cardigan: Parthian).

Mason, R., 2007. 'Representing the Nation', in Osmond 2007, 23–37.

Miles, D. (ed.), 1994. *The Description of Pembrokeshire, George Owen of Henllys* (Llandysul: Gomer).

——2004. 'Owen, George (1552–1613)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography,* <https://doi-org.ezproxy.bangor.ac.uk/10.1093/ref:odnb/20999>, accessed 29 December 2019.

Moreland, J., 1999. 'The world(s) of the cross', *World Archaeology* 31(2), 194–213.

Morgan, P., 2007. 'The creation of a National Museum and National Library', in Osmond 2007, 13–22.

Morgan, W. T., 1959. 'LLOYD, MEREDITH (fl. 1655–1677), lawyer and antiquary', *Welsh Dictionary of National Biography*, <https://biography.wales/article/s-LLOY-MER-1655>, acessed 30 December 2019.

Newman, J., 1995. *Glamorgan*, London and Cardiff: Penguin and University of Wales Press.

Okasha, E., 1993. *Corpus of Early Christian Inscribed Stones of South-West Britain* (Leicester: Leicester University Press).

Osmond, J. (ed.), 2007. *Myths, Memories and Futures: The National Library and the National Museum in the Story of Wales* (Cardiff: Institute of Welsh Affairs).

O'Sullivan, D., 2011. 'Normanising the North: the evidence of Anglo-Saxon and Anglo-Scandinavian sculpture', *Medieval Archaeology* 55, 163–91.

Parry, G., 1995. *The Trophies of Time: English Antiquarians of the Sevententh Century* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

Pennant, T., 1778–83. *A Tour in Wales*, 3 pts (London: Benjamin White, facsimile ed. 1991, 2 vols, with intro. by R. P. Evans, Wrexham: Bridge Books).

Postle, M. and Simon, R. (eds), 2014. *Richard Wilson and the Transformation of European Landscape Painting* (New Haven and London: Yale Centre for British Art, Amgueddfa Cymru – National Museum Wales, Yale University Press).

Pratt, D., 1997, *The Dissolution of Valle Crucis Abbey* (Wrexham: Bridge Books).

Prescott, S., 2008. *Eighteenth-Century Writing from Wales: Bards and Britons* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press).

Preston-Jones, A. and Okasha, E., 2013. *Early Cornish Sculpture*, *Corpus of Anglo-Saxon Sculpture, Vol. 11* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

Price, G. V., 1952. *Valle Crucis Abbey* (Liverpool: Hugh Evans and Sons Ltd, the Brython Press).

Prichard, H., 1898. 'Old Llangaffo Church and cross', *Archaeologia Cambrensis*, ser. 5, 15, 288–90.

Pryce, H., (ed.), 2005. *The Acts of Welsh Rulers 1120–1283* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press).

——2007. 'The dynasty of Deheubarth and the church of St Davids', in Evans and Wooding, 305–16.

——2011. 'Culture, identity, and the medieval revival in Victorian Wales', *Proceedings of the Harvard Celtic Colloquium* 31, 1–40.

Redknap, M., 1991. *The Christian Celts: Treasures of Late Celtic Wales* (Cardiff: National Museum of Wales).

Redknap, M. and Lewis, J. M., 2007. *A Corpus of Early Medieval Inscribed Stones and Stone Sculpture in Wales, Vol, I, Breconshire, Glamorgan, Monmouthshire, Radnorshire, and geographically contiguous areas of Herefordshire and Shropshire* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press).

Rees, S., forthcoming. 'The Pillar of Eliseg: the management of the site as an Ancient Monument in State Guardianship', in N. Edwards, G. Robinson, and H. Williams, *The Pillar of Eliseg* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press).

Rhys, J., 1901. 'The Pentre Poeth inscribed stone', *Archaeologia Cambrensis*, ser. 6, 1, 240–4.

Ropek, E., 2001. 'Introduction', in E. Ropek (ed.), *The Colour of Saying: The Work of Mary Lloyd Jones* (Llandysul: Gomer), 7–11.

Scurr, R., 2015. *John Aubrey: My Own Life*, London: Vintage.

Sharpe, R. and Davies, J. R. (ed. and trans.), 2007. 'Rhygyfarch's *Life* of St David', in Evans and Wooding, 107–55.

Sheehy, J., 1980. *The Rediscovery of Ireland's Past: The Celtic Revival 1830–1930* (London: Thames and Hudson).

Smiles, S., 1994. *The Image of Antiquity: Ancient Britons and the Romantic Imagination* (Newhaven and London: Yale University Press).

Stalley, R., 2004. 'The cathedral', in T. Lloyd *et al.,* 386–414.

Stephenson, D., 2013. 'The rulers of Gwynedd and Powys', in J. Burton and K. Stöber (eds), *Monastic Wales: new approaches* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press), 89–102.

——2016. *Medieval Powys, Kingdom, Principality and Lordships, 1132–1293*, Cardiff: University of Wales Press.

Sweet, R., 2004. *Antiquaries: The Discovery of the Past in Eighteenth-Century Britain* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

——2012. *Cities and the Grand Tour. The British in Italy,* c. *1690–1820* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

Thomas, P. D. G., 1964. 'MACKWORTH, Herbert (1737–91), of Gnoll, Glam.', *The History of Parliament*, <http://www.historyofparliamentonline.org/volume/1754-1790/member/mackworth-herbert-1737-91#family-relations>, accessed 2 January 2020.

Thomas, T. H., 1892–93. *Inscribed Stones. (Some account of the Pre-Norman inscribed and decorated monumental stones of Glamorganshire, being explanatory notes upon the series of photographs made by Mr. T. Mansel Franklin*, *Cardiff Naturalists' Society Report and Transactions* 25(1), 34–46.

——1897. 'Celtic art, with a suggestion of a scheme for thebetter preservation and freer study of the monuments of the early Christian Church in Wales', *Y Cymmrodor* 12, 87–111.

Thurlby, M., 2006. *Romanesque Architecture and Sculpture in Wales* (Woonton Almeley: Logaston Press).

Tucker, N., 2003. *North Wales and Chester in the Civil War* (Ashbourne: Landmark Publishing).

Tully, C., 2009. 'The Celtic misconnection: the German romantics and Wales', *Angermion* 2, 127–41.

Wakelin, P., 2016. *Romancing Wales: Romanticism in the Welsh Landscape since 1770* (Machynlleth: MOMA).

Walsham, A., 2011. *The Reformation of the Landscape: Religion, Identity, and Memory in Early Modern Britain and Ireland* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

Westwood, J. O., 1865. 'Early inscribed stones in Wales', *Archaeologia Cambrensis*, ser. 3, 2, 59–66.

——1876–79. *Lapidarium Walliae: the Early Inscribed and Sculptured Stones of Wales* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, reprinted Macclesfield: Redesmere Press, 1993).

Williams, H. N., 1896. 'The Carnhedryn inscribed stone', *Archaeologia Cambrensis*, ser. 5, 13, 165–6.

Williams, K. J., 2016. *The Antiquary: John Aubrey's historical scholarship* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

Wilton, A., 2012. 'Drawings made on the Midland Tour 1794', subset, April 2012, in D. B. Brown (ed.), *J. M. W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*, London: Tate Research Publication, <https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/drawings-made-on-the-midland-tour-r1141042>, accessed 3 January 2020.

[FIGURE CAPTIONS]

Fig. 1. St Davids 8, an incomplete cross-carved stone with an inscription commemorating Hed and Isaac, sons of Bishop Abraham (d. 1080), found in the Cathedral masonry in 1891. © *Crown copyright: RCAHMW*.

Fig. 2. St Davids 2, part of a large freestanding cross. © *Crown copyright: RCAHMW*.

Fig. 3. St Davids 3, a fragmentary cross-shaft later reworked and reused destroying most of the inscription. © *Crown copyright: RCAHMW.*

Fig. 4. Steynton 1, Pembrokeshire. The ogam inscription can be seen on the left angle, traces of the Latin inscription on the upper cross-arm. The inverted shield and other symbols are visible on the cross-head with the nineteenth-century inscription obliterating most of the shaft. © *Crown copyright: RCAHMW.*

Fig. 5. Nevern 4, Pembrokeshire, still in its original location. © *Crown copyright: RCAHMW.*

Fig. 6. The Pillar of Eliseg (Llandysilio yn Iâl 1), Denbighshire, standing on top of an Early Bronze Age cairn. *Photograph: Nancy Edwards.*

Fig. 7. Llanddewibrefi 2, Cardiganshire, drawing sent by Edward Lhuyd to Bishop Humphrey Humphreys of Bangor, 1699. Bangor University, MS Penrhos V, 868. *Reproduced by kind permission of Lord Stanley of Alderney.*

Fig. 8. Llangadwaladr 1, Anglesey, showing 'Ancient Letters of the *Britains*' which Edward Lhuyd hoped to revive. © *Crown copyright: RCAHMW.*

Fig. 9. Drawing of the Pillar of Eliseg in 1773, showing it reconstructed as an obelisk and below part of the shaft and base still lying on the ground. SAL, Minutes, XIII, 72–3, 20 May 1773. © *Society of Antiquaries of London.*

Fig. 10. Cadoxton-Juxta-Neath (Clwydi Banwen) 1, Glamorgan, an incomplete Latin inscribed stone removed to a grotto in the ground of the Gnoll, near Neath, in the later eighteenth century. © *Crown copyright: RCAHMW.*

Fig. 11. Casts of early medieval monuments, including Maesmynys Cross, Llanfihangel Cwm Du cross-carved stone and Llandyfaelog Fach cross-slab, Breconshire, in William Clarke's Llandaf workshop *c*. 1906. © *Amgueddfa Cymru – National Museum Wales.*

Fig. 12. Celtic cross decorated with interlace commemorating Cadwaladr Davies (d. 1905), mason unknown, Bangor Municipal Cemetery. *Photograph: Huw Pryce.*

Fig. 13. Llantwit Major War Memorial, modelled on the early medieval cross at Penally. Designed by E. Jones and erected in 1921, it stands on the stepped base of the later medieval market cross. *Photograph: Wikimedia Commons.*

Fig. 14. Mary Lloyd Jones, *Lliwio'r Gair* ('Colouring the Word') exhibition, Aberystwyth 2001, banner depicting inscriptions and crosses on early medieval carved stones. © *Mary Lloyd Jones, by kind permission of the artist.*