

The Goddæus' Dürer-Inspired Trademark: The Meanings, Origins, and Strategic Uses of a Seventeenth-Century Dutch Printer's Device Durrant, Michael

Book History

DOI:

10.1353/bh.2023.a910949

Published: 01/11/2023

Peer reviewed version

Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication

Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA):
Durrant, M. (2023). The Goddæus' Dürer-Inspired Trademark: The Meanings, Origins, and
Strategic Uses of a Seventeenth-Century Dutch Printer's Device. Book History, 26(2), 274-294. https://doi.org/10.1353/bh.2023.a910949

Hawliau Cyffredinol / General rights
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
 - You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
 You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal?

Take down policyIf you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

The Goddæus' Dürer-Inspired Trademark: The Meanings, Origins, and Strategic Uses of a Seventeenth-Century Dutch Printer's Device

Working in collaboration with his wife, Johanna (*fl.* 1660-1690), the Rotterdam-based printer, Henry Goddæus (1633-1684), made himself available as manufacturer for local and international print markets and reading communities, manufacturing Dutch-language books and pamphlets on mathematics and astrology, puritan piety, and Reformation history, works in French by Huguenot exiles, and Dutch-language editions of English-language texts. Not unusually in the contexts of the seventeenth-century Dutch publishing trade, ¹ the Goddæus' heterodox business model also encompassed manufacturing English-language texts on behalf of members of the English community settled in Rotterdam, including works by religious separatists and political exiles.²

D.W.B. Somerset has recently identified at least forty-two print products bearing Henry's name in the imprint, published between 1660 and 1683, and a further ten items printed by Johanna following her husband's death in 1684.³ Together, these items indicate that Johanna and Henry Goddæus typically deployed a squirrel ornament on the title-page or in the colophon as a printer's device, although products bearing the Goddæus name do feature other identifying trademarks, including one in the shape of an angel or *putti*, which was used several times by both Henry and Johanna between 1662 and 1666, and again between 1678 and 1686, as well as a device featuring a lion rampant motif and the motto, '*Pugno Pro Patria*' ['I fight for the Fatherland'].⁴ Henry and Johanna also appear to have been in possession of a fourth woodcut device, a more elaborate and visually complex form

¹ On English-language publishing in the early modern Dutch Republic, see Paul Hoftijzer, 'The English Book in the Seventeenth-Century Dutch Republic', in *The Bookshop of the World: The Role of the Low Countries in the Book Trade, 1473-1941*, ed. by Lotte Hellinga, Alastair Duke, Jacob Harskamp, and Theo Hermans (Leiden and Boston, MA: Brill, 2001), 89-107.

² On the Goddæus' involvement in the publication of texts by religiously dissenting and politically marginalized English expatriates, see Jessica L. Malay, *The Case of Mistress Mary Hampson: Her Story of Marital Abuse and Defiance in Seventeenth-Century England* (Redwood City, CA: Stanford University Press, 2014), esp. 145.

³ D.W.B. Somerset, 'Scottish Covenanting, Jesuit, and Quaker printing in Holland, 1664-1684', *Scottish Reformation Society Historical Journal* 10 (2020), 82-113 (85-94).

⁴ *Ibid.*, 84-5.

of ornamentation that appears on the title-pages of at least two surviving print products manufactured in 1663 and printed in the Nieuwstraat: Joannes Minel's (fl. 1663) Logica, ofte Redenkonstig Onderwys (Fig. 1), a logic textbook pitched towards young adult learners; and A Christian Woman's Experiences of the Glorious Working of Gods Free Grace (Fig. 2), a dissenting conversion narrative composed the English Particular Baptist and Fifth Monarchist Katherine Sutton (fl. 1630-1663), a former governess who gained some celebrity within nonconformist circles for her prophetic 'gift' of 'spiritual singing'.⁵

This device (Fig. 3) is what interests me here. At its center is a motif that offers a visual counterpart to the encounter, recorded in John 20:11-17, between Mary Magdalene and the resurrected Christ in the Garden of Gethsemane, which includes the Magdalene's apparent misrecognition of Christ as a gardener, her subsequent recognition, and finally her attempts to touch and embrace Him. It is a Gospel event popularly known as the *Noli me tangere*, which is the Latin version of the phrase that Christ apparently uttered to the Magdalene in order to rebuff her tactile advances: 'Touch me not', or 'Do not touch me'. Running clockwise around the edge of this central motif is a motto that points towards another biblical referent: 'GODT HERSCHEPT HET HERT' ['God remakes [or rebuilds / recreates] the heart'], which derives from 'PSA[LM]: 51', where King David is forced to confront his sin of adultery with Bathsheba before the Prophet Nathan. Finally, on the outermost edge of the device, two Classical figures frequently associated with European printing look inwards towards the central motif: on the left, we find Mercury (or Hermes), the god of financial gain, communication, travelers and boundaries; on the right, we find Minerva (or Athena), the goddess of wisdom, poetry, commerce, and crafts.

Available evidence compiled by Klaus Henseler indicates that this device was first deployed by an as yet unidentified Leiden-based printer back in 1631, and so it was not a

⁵ Sutton, *Experiences*, 13, sig. B3^r.

bespoke design unique to the Goddæus printing house. Nevertheless, their adoption of this device—either by way of inheritance or by purchasing it on the second-hand market—may well speak to their shared recognition of the powerful 'symbolic...meanings' that such a trademark could carry and transmit. In an effort to contribute to the current critical interest in the interpretative possibilities offered by early modern printed paratexts, the following article will unpack some of those potential meanings, reading across and between the Christian iconography of the device's central *Noli me tangere* motif, its surrounding motto, and the ancient mythological figures on its periphery. This involves approaching the Goddæus' device as Andie Silva has approached the early modern title-page and the printed ornaments that brand them: that is, as an 'inherently multimodal' paratextual form, both in terms of its aesthetic and functional affordances. In what follows, I hope to encapsulate a sense of the multimodality of the Goddæus' device: specifically, I attend to the everexpanding ways in which this early modern printer's trademark, like other printed ornaments of the period, actively produces and shapes meanings, thereby helping to restage our encounters with the texts that carry it.

The article begins by considering the generic factors that may have influenced the use of a *Noli me tangere* motif as a printer's trademark, and as part of this analysis (and in newly uncovered evidence), I show that the central *Noli me tangere* motif is in an intertextual relationship with an earlier devotional woodcut by the German artist Albrecht Dürer (1471-1528). By identifying the powerful allegorical charge of *Noli me tangere* iconography in the early modern imagination, as well the debt the Goddæus' mark owes to Dürer's specific handling of that Gospel event, I argue that this device works, on the one hand, to foreground

⁶ Klaus Henseler, 'Psalmen bzw. Psalter in Druckermarken [Psalms or Psalters in Printer's Marks]': online. Accessed 20 January 2022. doi: https://www.drucker-marken.de/images/druck/pdf/Buch 54 Psalmen.pdf.

⁷ Sonja Svoljšak and Urša Kocjan, 'The Cat as Printer's Trademark: The Case of the Sessa Family', *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of America* 110:1 (2016): 95-116 (95).

⁸ Andie Silva, *The Brand of Print: Marketing Paratexts in the Early English Book Trade* (Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2019), 66-7.

the 'three-dimensional topography' of the book object that it brands, and on the other, to promote the artisanal efficacy underpinning its owners' book-making practices. 9 Using evidence drawn from the title-pages' of Minel's Logica and Sutton's Experiences, and placing pressure on notions of witnessing and knowledge transfer activated within the central Noli me tangere motif, I then posit that the Goddæus' deployed this Dürer-inspired device in a strategic manner, using it to identify and therefore to brand print products with explicitly empirical dimensions. The nestled set of gazes exchanged between Christ, the Magdalene, Minerva and Mercury, are suggestive, I argue, of the mark's ability to localize apparently disparate genres of texts within specific reading environments. With a direct focus on Sutton's Experiences, the article finally turns to the confessional implications of finding Noli me tangere iconography on the title-page of an English nonconformist text produced in the Dutch Republic. As I show, at the very end of her Experiences, Sutton marshals the Magdalene, as well as the conventions of the Noli me tangere, as important biblical coordinates; that these co-ordinates are also present on the Experiences title-page, and in the form of a printer's device, indicates a calculated attempt to realize Sutton's modes of devotional self-fashioning on the text's outermost point of paratextual encounter.

Threshold Encounters and Dürer's Haptic Influence

Caught between the Resurrection and Ascension, European biblical exegetes understood the prohibition of the *Noli me tangere* as a sign of Christ's 'condition of being between'— between human and God, between presence and absence, the living and the dead. ¹⁰ Unable to touch and physically embrace her Savior, the Magdalene's devotion undergoes a process of

⁹ Andrew Gordon, 'The Renaissance Footprint: The Material Trace in Print Culture from Dürer to Spenser', *Renaissance Ouarterly* 71:2 (2018), 478-529 (482).

¹⁰ Bronwen Wilson, 'Spiritual and Material Conversations: Federico Barocci's *Christ and Mary Magdalene*', in *Quid est sacramentum? Visual Representation of Sacred Mysteries in Early Modern Europe, 1400-1700*, ed. by Walter Melion, Elizabeth Carson Pastan, and Lee Palmer Wandal (Leiden and Boston, MA: Brill, 2019), 394-430 (404).

'transformation': she must let go of the physical and embrace a new kind of inner faith. ¹¹ Medieval and early modern iconographic engagements with the *Noli me tangere* gave visual shape to this state of transformation and betweenness by way of architectural entranceways and exits. (Amongst other available connotations, the Latin verb *tangere* can mean "'to enter or reach a place".) ¹² These thresholds function as symbolic bearers of the 'interim character' of Christ's 'post-resurrection embodiment', capturing a sense of Christ in 'progress' and therefore in process, whilst also helping to emphasize the betweenness of the Magdalene's own subject position, since she, too, finds herself on the cusp of a new world, one in which she must reorientate her devotion towards a 'belief in things that are impossible to touch.' ¹³

Given Henseler's suggestion that the device used by the Goddæus' in 1663 had its provenance in Leiden, it may not be unimportant that, as Paul Hoftijzer shows, 'the resurrection of Christ' was a popular motif for many seventeenth-century Leiden printers. ¹⁴ Within the contexts of Leiden's book trade, the connotations of that motif, to quote Hoftijzer, may be that 'thanks to the art of printing dead authors will', like Christ, 'find a new life'; however, this does not delimit other interpretations. ¹⁵ These include the possibility that such imagery works to enliven a sense of a book's covering as an interactive and participatory space, an explanation would at least compliment recent scholarship that has taken the early modern printed title-page an essential meaning-making zone, which, to quote Lucy Razzall, 'might...be associated with literal and metaphorical kinds of recognition and reflection.' ¹⁶

¹¹ Barbara Baert, 'The Gaze in the Garden: Mary Magdalene in *Noli me tangere*', in *Mary Magdalene, Iconographic Studies from the Middle Ages to the Baroque*, ed. by Michelle Erhardt and Amy Morris (Leiden and Boston, MA: Brill, 2012), 189-222 (194).

¹² Baert, *Interruptions and Transitions: Essays on the Senses in Medieval and Early Modern Visual Culture* (Leiden and Boston, MA: Brill, 2019), 38.

¹³ Oliver Davies, *Theology of Transformation: Faith, Freedom, and Christian Art* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), p.117; Baert, 'The Gaze in the Garden', 194.

¹⁴ Hoftijzer, '*Pallas Nostra Salus*: Early Modern Printer's Marks in Leiden as Expressions of Professional and Personal Identity', in *Typographorum Emblemata: The Printer's Mark in the Context of Early Modern Culture*, ed. by Anja Wolkenhauer and Bernhard F. Scholz (Berlin and Boston, MA: de Gruyter, 2018), 169-196 (183). ¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ Lucy Razzall, "Like to a title leafe": Surface, Face, and Material Text in Early Modern England', *Journal of the Northern Renaissance* 8 (2017): online. Accessed 1 May 2021. doi:

Remembering the conceptual relationship between the *Noli me tangere* and the notion of the threshold, it seems strikingly appropriate to find such imagery gracing a printed titlepage, which is, after all, another kind of threshold, one that, as Gerard Genette argued, forms an entranceway and an exit into and out of a text, enabling readers to pass 'from one world to another'. To put it another way, the temporal perception of the title-page as a threshold finds parallel in the visual structure at the center of the device, where, enclosed by a wall and within range of the sepulcher's threshold, Christ takes on His resurrected form. Indeed, it may not be insignificant that readers must cross a title-page threshold by turning the page with their hands: using the book means touching it, and touching the book means that readers will, in turn, be touched by its edifying contents. In this way, the presence of *Noli me tangere* imagery on a title-page transforms and reconstitutes Christ's warning of 'Touch me not', or 'Do not touch me', through a physical interaction with the book itself.

The interpretive potentials modelled by the visual and verbal cues of the Goddæus' device can be augmented by turning to the earlier piece of graphic art that our *Noli me* tangere motif has been modelled after: that is, Dürer's woodcut, 'Christ Appears to Mary Magdalene' (Fig. 4), which was originally published in Nuremberg in 1510 as part of his Passio Christi ab Alberto Dürer (or Small Passion), a book containing thirty-six prints and poems depicting the last days of Christ's life.

There are a few key differences between Dürer's sixteenth-century woodcut and the version that (re)appears within the confines of the Goddæus' seventeenth-century printer's device. For instance, in the background of Dürer's woodcut, placed just outside of the entrance to Christ's tomb, are the women of the *myrrhophore* synoptic tradition; in the printer's device, the myrrh-bearers appear have been edited out, meaning that the Magdalen

https://www.northernrenaissance.org/like-to-a-title-leafe-surface-face- and-material-text-in-early-modern-england/.

¹⁷ Gerard Genette, *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*, trans. by Jane E. Lewin (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 2; 408.

is now alone with Christ. Another key difference between original and copy is that whoever made the copy has redacted Dürer's monogram, featuring the initials 'AB', which, in 'Christ Appears to Mary Magdalene', is clearly visible to the left of Christ, embossed onto a sheet of paper that rests on the ground at a right angle. ¹⁸ Alongside these differences there are also similarities, which together highlight an attempt to hue as closely as possible to the design conventions of Dürer's woodcut: both versions have Christ and the Magdalen appear within a walled garden; Christ is dressed as a gardener and he is carrying a shovel; it is possible to make out that he is represented with the stigmata; Christ's right hand is gesturing towards the Magdalene; and in both versions, an ointment jar sits on the floor between them. In sum, the motif within this device is, despite a few changes, recognizably Dürer, and the agent(s) who commissioned its making might have wanted it that way, given both the 'high regard' that Dürer's graphic art continued to be held in the seventeenth-century Dutch Republic, and the important idiosyncrasies that imbue his handling of the *Noli me tangere* tradition. ¹⁹

As Shira Brisman argues, Dürer's *Noli me tangere* woodcut is notable because it departs from the tradition of the 'touch-denying Christ', who, in medieval and early modern tapestries and woodcuts, in paintings, murals and frescos, is often depicted in a rather awkward posture, averting the Magdalene's attempts at physical contact; instead, Dürer represents Christ as reaching 'with his forefinger to touch [the Magdalene's] head at the very moment that he tells her not to touch him.' ²⁰ By deliberately sounding out the gap between what Christ is reported to have said in John's Gospel and what he might actually do, Brisman

¹⁸ On Dürer's use of a monogram, its significance in relation to the development of marketing in the art world, and in cultural conceptualisations of the artist as an individual genius, see Andrea Bubenik, *Reframing Albrecht*

Dürer: The Appropriation of Art, 1528-1700 (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013), esp. 81-2.

19 Jaco Rutgers, 'The Large Mount Calvary: The Impact of a Dürer Invention', in Dürer's Journeys: Travels of a Renaissance Artist, ed. by Susan Foister and Peter Van Den Brink (London: National Gallery, 2021), 31-35 (31). On the imitation (and transformation) of Dürer's artworks by sixteenth- and seventeenth-century European artists and artisans, see Giulia Bartrum, Albrecht Dürer and his Legacy: The Graphic Word of a Renaissance Artist (London: The British Museum Press, 2002), esp. 239-266.

²⁰ Shira Brisman, 'A Touching Compassion: Dürer's Haptic Theology', *Open Arts Journal* 8 (2014-15): 9-27 (10).

posits that Dürer's woodcut showcases his 'haptic theology', which at once 'verifies his carnal presence and his proximity to man', whilst 'it also announces Dürer's understanding of the potentials and limitations of the printed medium'. ²¹ To quote Brisman again:

The transfer of image to paper through the contact between block and page mirrors the touch by which Christ leaves his impression on the human world – an impression that can be multiplied and widely circulated. But, like Christ's touch, Dürer's print project inscribes a message of its own impermanence. The printed image, marks in ink left behind on a page, is, like all Christian art, a substitute that insists on the presence of someone no longer available. ²²

Dürer's 'haptic theology' might go some way in explaining why this particular woodcut was attractive enough to have been repurposed as a printer's trademark. In Dürer's image of Christ's pointing finger, there was a readymade metaphysical distillation of what it meant to print, to leave behind inky (though transitory) 'impressions' upon paper, and with this, a recognizable refinement of important humanist concerns about the material enactments of the 'human-divine bond'.²³

Dürer's 'haptic theology' might even help to illuminate the relationship between the device's central motif and the motto that surrounds it: 'GODT HERSCHEPT HET HERT'.

This motto, which takes its cue from the twelfth line of Psalm 51 as it appears in the Dutch Bible (or the official *States Translation*)—'Schep mij een rein hart, oh God!' ['Create in me a clean heart, oh Lord!']—plays with the meanings of the Dutch word 'schep', which as a noun can mean shovel, or spade, and as a verb, 'scheppen', means to dig up or out, to lay open, to make, create, construct or manufacture, or to give material shape and form to something.

These notions of digging, creating, making, and constructing interact suggestively (and not uncoincidentally) with the image of Christ at the center of the device, which, following

Dürer, represents Christ as a gardener, clutching a shovel and wearing a gardener's hat.

²¹ *Ibid.*, 11.

²² *Ibid*.

²³ *Ibid*.

In his *Noli me tangere* woodcut, Dürer was following other late-medieval and early modern artists in Northern and Southern Europe, including Fra Angelico (*c*. 1395–1455), Israhel van Meckenem (*c*. 1445–1503), Titian (*c*. 1488–1576), and Hans Baldung (*c*. 1484–1545), in allowing the viewer to see Christ in the way that the Magdalene does: that is, as a gardener. A Rather than a product of the Magdalene's imperfect perception, what we see is a vision of Christ that Christ himself has constructed; like an artist, Dürer has Christ playing with Mary's perception', fashioning a vision that, in combining signifiers of agricultural labor and toil, projects the promise of spiritual 'cultivation' that the Resurrection will animate. Dürer's woodcut can, in this context, be seen to act doubly: first, it visually emphasizes a broader sense of Christ as a materially productive and intervening force who tends to the soul as if it were a garden; and second, by linking Christ's gardener's aspect to 'artistry', it self-reflexively underscores Dürer's own status as artistic laborer, who, with woodworking tools such as chisels and knives in hand, 'organizes and manipulates' a block of wood to fashion devotional images. Dürer's

The agent responsible for commissioning and/or designing the printer's device later used by the Goddæus' was clearly receptive to, and influenced by, the complex significations embodied by Dürer's woodcut. In the motto that surrounds and contains the *Noli me tangere* imagery, we can see an illuminating context for that central motif, one that, in emphasizing Christ's materially interventionist nature, enriches the parallels it articulates between religious piety and the material making. By extension, reading between the device's Dürerinspired *Noli me tangere* motif and its motto, we might begin to discern a prudent marketing

_

²⁴ See Joachim Schaper, 'The Messiah in the Garden: John 38-41, (Royal) Gardens and Messianic Concepts', in *Paradise in Antiquity: Jewish and Christian Views*, ed. by Markus Bockmuehl and Guy G. Stroumsa (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 17-27 (esp. 27).

²⁵ Cynthia Lewis, 'Soft Touch: On the Renaissance Staging and Meaning of the "*Noli me tangere*" Icon', *Comparative Drama* 36:1/2 (2002): 53-73 (59-60).

²⁶ Lewis, 'Soft Touch', 60; Jean-Luc Nancy, *Noli Me Tangere: On the Raising of the Body*, trans. by Sarah Clift, Pascale-Anne Brault, and Michael Naas (New York, NY: Fordham University Press, 2008), 32.

technique, one that, in conjuring and repurposing Dürer, draws and appropriates a readymade schema of glorified labor, which symbolically aligns Christ's generative agency with the agency of the artisan laboring in the printshop.

Empirical Dimensions

I am arguing, then, that the presence of *Noli me tangere* iconography on the title-page of an early modern printed book may help to pattern a recognition of that paratextual site as a transformative threshold. Not unlike contemporary title-page ornaments and borders that were designed to resemble architectural façades, the architectural motifs present in this example of early modern *Noli me tangere* iconography lends itself to a conception of the book as a physical space that readers must enter in order to be transformed. Recognizing Dürer's aesthetic influence on the look and design of the Goddæus' device adds another layer of meaning-making potential. Christ's shovel signifies His mediating potential as gardener of the soul, and this is reflected in, and recapitulated by, Dürer's personal presence as he busily scraped out and filleted a woodblock. In this way, Dürer's 'Christ Appears to Mary Magdalene' offers a 'pictorial meditation' on the 'unity of faith' and printing practices, and the Goddæus' device appears to co-opt and make a feature of this by way of the motto that surrounds the central *Noli me tangere* scene, which linguistically foregrounds paradigms related to digging and creating. 28

I have also indicated that as part of the mediating processes that transformed Dürer's sixteenth-century devotional woodcut into a seventeenth-century printer's device, changes and additions have been made. This includes the redaction of Dürer's monogram, as well as the incorporation of two classical figures, Minerva and Mercury. In this section, I want to

²⁷ For more on the architectural conventions of the early modern printed title-page, see Alastair Fowler, *The Mind of the Book: Pictorial Title Pages* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017).

²⁸ David Hotchkiss Price, *Albrecht Dürer's Renaissance: Humanism, Reformation, and the Art of Faith* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2003), 131.

extend my analysis to encompass Minerva and Mercury, since their presence on the periphery of the *Noli me tangere* motif offers insights into the marketing potentials of this device.

European book-trade professionals regularly deployed these Classical figures as allegorical symbols for printing, and we know that print technologies were visually represented as having been 'passed down through the mediation of Minerva and Mercury', a mythology of origin that extended the 'Foxean motifs of the press as a providential gift'.²⁹ The symbolic association between Minerva and Mercury and 'wisdom and dissemination', as well as the 'transfer and translation of divine and therefore true knowledge', explains their presence (either independently or in combination) in the devices of some European printers who specialized in manufacturing academic and philosophical materials, as well as tracts associated with the burgeoning field of the empirical sciences.³⁰

As Hoftijzer points out, since Minerva appeared on the original seal of Leiden University, she was sometimes deployed in the devices of Leiden-based printers who sought to emphasize their connections to that academic institution.³¹ Hoftijzer posits that the bookseller, Pieter van der Aa (*fl.* 1683-1733), was the first book-trade agent in Leiden to feature Minerva alongside Mercury within his trademark, which he started to use in 1685; however, if, as Henseler proposes, the device later used by the Goddæus' in Rotterdam in 1663 was first used in Leiden in the 1630s, then there was conceivably a longer tradition of using this Minerva-Mercury combination in Leiden devices.³² Additionally, when Minerva and Mercury do feature together in European printers' devices they often flank a central

²⁹ Adrian Johns, *The Nature of the Book: Print and Knowledge in the Making* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1998), 334-5.

³⁰ Helmer Helmers, Nina Lamal and Jamie Cumby, 'Introduction: The Printing Press as an Agent of Power', in *Print and Power in Early Modern Europe, 1500-1800*, ed. by Helmers, Lamal, and Cumby (Leiden and Boston, MA: Brill, 2021), 1-20 (1); Lea Hagedorn, 'Minerva in the Printshop: Publisher's Advertisements in Frontispieces and the Media Presence of Early Modern Printer-Publishers', in *Gateways to the Book: Frontispieces and Title Pages in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Gitta Bertram, Nils Büttner, and Claus Zittel (Leiden and Boston, MA: Brill, 2021), 92-123 (119).

³¹ Hoftijzer, 'Pallas Nostra Salus', 186.

³² *Ibid*.

motif that might typically feature images of open books or compasses. Although the Magdalene can be found in some earlier European devices, including the trademark used by the nuns who operated a press at the Augustinian convent of Santa Maria Maddalena in Venice (1557-1561), I have yet to locate a device that features Minerva and Mercury on the periphery of a *Noli me tangere* motif, let alone one with a direct Dürer connection.³³

The composition of the Goddæus' device finds Minerva and Mercury casting their gaze towards the central *Noli me tangere* motif, and the intimate exchange of glances taking place there between the Magdalene and Christ in the Garden of Gethsemane. They are, in a way, positioned as witnesses to a gospel event that is itself concerned with, and that 'celebrates', the 'spiritual elevation and responsibilities of those who bear witness to the truth of the Resurrection'. ³⁴ It is, after all, the Magdalene who, having witnessed a transforming Christ, becomes the vehicle for new understandings of Christian devotion, specifically as it pertains to a turn from a physical to a more inward reception of faith, and her authority as a post-Resurrection messenger is grounded in this first-hand sensory encounter. Within this printer's device, Minerva and Mercury's twofold gaze appears to partake in, and visually encode, this prospect of experiential knowledge through witnessing; together, Minerva and Mercury serve as a kind of footnote for the interrelated issues of witnessing and authority that are activated within the *Noli me tangere* motif.

This comingling is broadly indicative of the 'complex hermeneutic relationships' between 'exegetical and the empirical' in the pre-modern world, and it is certainly an evocative juxtaposition given the genres of the two 1663 tracts that carry this particular device. Minel's textbook, *Logica*, and Sutton's Particular Baptist conversion account, A

Thorny Place of Knowledge (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), 22.

³³ See Brian Richardson, *Women and the Circulation of Texts in Renaissance Italy* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2020) esp. 143-4.

Erin E. Benay and Lisa M. Rafanelli, Faith, Gender and the Senses in Italian Renaissance and Baroque Art:
 Interpreting the Noli me tangere and Doubting Thomas (London and New York: Routledge, 2015), 79.
 Kevin Killeen, Biblical Scholarship, Science and Politics in Early Modern England: Thomas Browne and the

Christian Woman's Experiences, share an empirical as well as a didactic method, which both texts advertise on their respective title-pages. The title-page of Minel's Logica—'Tot Rotterdam: | Gedrukt bij HENRICUS GODDÆUS, Boekdrukker in | de Nieuwstraat' situates that text within the contexts of sciences and learning ('wetenschap'), whilst also stressing Minel's own mediating role as pedagogue, who has labored to open up scholarly knowledges in a way that is suitable for everyone's understanding ('Na een ieders begrip geschikt'). It also emphasizes the text's exemplarity: Logica works towards the clarification ('verklaart') and application ('Toepassingen') of knowledges, which will be acquired by way of examples ('Exempelen'). The title-page to Sutton's Experiences—'Printed by HENRY GODDÆUS, Printer in the Newstreet'—similarly publicizes that text's commitment to the experiential. Emerging from an English separatist congregation headed by the London-based Particular Baptist pastor, Hanserd Knollys (1598-1691), who provides a three-page prefatory address to the 'COURTEOUS READER', the Experiences promotes a broadly Calvinistic approach to godly selfhood that incorporates the cataloguing, recording, and witnessing of lived experiences, and it offers up Sutton's first-person testimony as a reproducible model of saving faith, which has been made public for 'the Edification' of her co-religionists and the unconverted.

With these contexts in mind, it might not be coincidental that the Goddæus' branded both of these texts with their *Noli me tangere* device. Through the nestled set of gazes enacted between the Magdalene and Christ, between Minerva, Mercury, and the central *Noli me tangere* motif, that device invokes and announces a biblical role model whose authority as teacher, as bearer of knowledge of the Resurrection, is predicated upon direct observation (or 'eye-witnessing'). To put it another way, there is a possibility that this *Noli me tangere* device was strategically used to signal the function of the printed text that it brands—these

³⁶ Baert, *Interruptions and Transitions*, 46.

are practical/instructive texts that contain empirical data—as well as the credentials of its author—these authors are, like the Magdalene, trustworthy and reliable propagators of didactic knowledges. Thus, by narrowing our focus to a single trademark we can open up new ways of reading them: in this case, as a means by which print agents could visually encode connections across and between specific titles.

Strategic Uses: The Case of Sutton's Experiences

As suggested, Henry and Johanna Goddæus deployed at least four different devices, which feature either a squirrel in profile, an angel, a lion, or the *Noli me tangere* scene. It may have been at the printer's discretion whether any given text was branded with a squirrel or an angle, a lion or a penitent Mary Magdalene; equally, it is possible that when clients visited the Goddæus' house to discuss the look and design of their publication, they were offered a choice of devices from which they could choose. Either way, closer engagement with Sutton's text strongly suggests that the logics informing the decision to brand it with the *Noli me tangere* device were far from random; rather, this device appears to have been strategically selected for Sutton because it interacts with her devotional self-fashioning.

In a five-page coda that accompanies her *Experiences*, Sutton asserts her spiritual authority, proclaiming that '*I own a Prophetical voice of Christ*', ³⁷ and she reinforces the point by conjuring Mary Magdalene—'a popular exemplar for the Protestant faithful' in the post-Reformation world—as a useful model of feminine duty and responsibility. ³⁸ Specifically, Sutton alludes to Christ's posthumous 'appearance' to the Magdalene on the Sunday following the crucifixion (i.e., the *Noli me tangere* event), and she argues that by

³⁷ Sutton, Experiences, 40, sig. E4^v.

³⁸ Lisa McClain, "They have taken away my Lord": Mary Magdalene, Christ's Missing Body, and the Mass in Reformation England', *Sixteenth Century Journal* 38 (1) (2007): 77-96 (esp. 92-93). For more on the role of Mary Magdalene in English Protestantism, see Margaret Arnold, *The Magdalene in the Reformation* (Cambridge and London: Harvard University Press, 2018), esp. 71-94.

appearing to the Magdalene in this transformative state, Christ put 'honour upon her', rendering her as a vessel for the 'resurrection', which she subsequently disseminated amongst 'the Disciples'. 39 Rachel Adcock argues that since the Magdalene's report of her intimate encounter with Christ was initially 'dismissed' by the disciples, Sutton's reference to her is designed to pre-empt and assuage congregational doubt over her own claims to discipleship. 40 That is to say, the text concludes by looking forwards in time to the Experiences' encounters with disapproving (presumably male) readers; however, the text's concluding reference to the Magdalene also looks back towards to the Experiences' titlepage, where, situated just beneath a biblical excerpt from the post-Resurrection narrative about the authenticity of the Magdalene's witnessing—'LUK. 24:24. And they found it even so, as the VVoman had said'—we encounter the Goddæus' device and the Noli me tangere encounter that Sutton, in conclusion, will identify herself and her spiritual experiences.

There are other linkages between this printer's device and the contents of Sutton's *Experiences*, which continue to intimate that this *Noli me tangere* device was used because its linguistic and visual elements had an important preparatory and navigational function. For example, the device's allusion to 'PSA[LM]: 51' anticipates Sutton's later citation of the same, and the comparison she makes between herself and the biblical King 'David';⁴¹ the word heart (or 'HERT'), which encircles the device's *Noli me tangere* image, also anticipates the heart's proliferation within the main body of the *Experiences*, where, in order to emphasize the inward and introspective nature of her devotion, Sutton deploys the word 'heart' at least 103 times; and when, in the conclusion to the text, Sutton calls on her readers to 'seek [Christ's] face' through scripture reading and prayerful meditation, we should remember that Christ's 'face' has been there all along, right on the text's title-page and at the

³⁹ Sutton, Experiences, 40, sig. E4^v.

⁴⁰ Rachel Adcock, *Baptist Women's Writings in Revolutionary Culture*, *1640-1680* (London and New York: Routledge, 2015), 93.

⁴¹ Sutton, Experiences, 14, sig. B3^v.

center of the Goddæus' device. 42 This is revealed by physically closing the book, by turning back to the title-page with your hands, a tactile movement that cues correlations between (the book's) endings and beginnings, and one that appears to also activate a model of 'reading...from beginning to end, and then starting again', which was crucial to Calvinist reading protocols. 43

These complex paratextual effects—and the broader implication that a printer's device can participate in a text's 'knowledge-delivery system'—are not entirely unexpected. 44 We know that early modern printers' devices could be used to tactically 'train' readers 'to follow a path' through a book, imagistically evoking thematic concerns found in the text that a reader is about to enter. 45 Like printer's flowers and other ornaments, printers' devices of the hand-press period developed their own complex 'visual vocabulary', a vocabulary that, in the contexts of the Goddæus' device, appears to creatively blur distinctions between 'the work' and those book parts that are considered 'extraneous to it'. 46 That said, the materially playful use of *Noli me tangere* iconography on the title-page of the *Experiences* does set it apart, not least because it suggests that there was a level of care and attention put into the making of Sutton's text that is so often absent in the contexts English nonconformism.

Elizabeth Skerpan-Wheeler says as much when she points out that, unlike nonconformist self-narratives manufactured in London in the seventeenth century, which

⁴² *Ibid.*, 44, sig. F2^v.

⁴³ Femke Molekamp, *Women and the Bible in Early Modern England: Religious Reading and Writing* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), 61.

⁴⁴ Silva, *The Brand of Print*, 67.

⁴⁵ Paul F. Gehl, 'Advertising or *Fama*?: Local Markets for Schoolbooks in Sixteenth-Century Italy', in *Print Culture and Peripheries in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Benito Rial Costas (Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2012), 69-99 (91); Lee Palmer Wandel, 'John Calvin and Michel de Montaigne on the Eye', in *Early Modern Eyes*, ed. by Walter Melion and Wandel (Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2010), 135-56 (141).

⁴⁶ Hazel Wilkinson, 'Printers' Ornaments and Flowers', in *Book Parts*, ed. by Dennis Duncan and Adam Smyth (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), 111-22 (112); Juliet Fleming, *Cultural Graphology: Writing After Derrida* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2016), 75.

were often made 'cheaply', Sutton's *Experiences* was 'beautifully produced'. ⁴⁷ One reason why this was the case was precisely because Sutton had her *Experiences* manufactured in the Dutch Republic rather than in England. Buoyed by its status as 'Europe's most urban, most literate and most educated society', the Dutch 'book world' had, as Andrew Pettegree and Arthur der Weduwen have shown, a highly 'sophisticated market arrangement' when it came to print, and with this, a well-established reputation for producing 'the best-quality books'. ⁴⁸ The Dutch Republic was thus a magnet for European authors of all kinds, including religious émigrés like Sutton, who, in search of a greater degree of politico-religious autonomy than the Restoration regime could accommodate, journeyed to Rotterdam in the company of her Particular Baptist pastor, Knollys. ⁴⁹

When, in her *Experiences*, Sutton briefly recounts the circumstances of the sea voyage that brought her there, she represents the journey as having been a traumatic but ultimately rewarding one. Sutton tells us that on the way her ship hit a sandbank during a storm and subsequently sank, casting a number of her possessions into the ocean, including the manuscript 'papers of [her] experiences'. Sutton retrospectively interprets this as a sign of God's displeasure 'for not putting [her writings] in print'. It is a judgement that forces Sutton to 'write again', and she does so with a renewed sense that her 'voyce' should not 'be kept in', but disseminated as widely as possible. The venue in which that desire for publicization was to be ultimately fulfilled was at the Goddæus' 'Newstreet' printing house

⁴⁷ Elizabeth Skerpan-Wheeler, 'Katherine Sutton', in *Reading Early Modern Women*, ed. by Helen Ostovich and Elizabeth Sauer (London and New York: Routledge, 2004), 173-75 (173).

⁴⁸ Andrew Pettegree and Arthur der Weduwen, *The Bookshop of the World: Making and Trading Books in the Dutch Golden Age* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2019), 7-9.

⁴⁹ On Knollys's visit to the Dutch Republic—and his attempts to establish an English Baptist colony in Neuwied, Germany, at this time—see Martin Rothkegel, "The unequall yoke unloosed": Ein unbekannter Traktat über Ehe und Ehescheidung von Thomas Tillam und die Ansiedlung englischer Baptisten in Deutschland 1661', in *Pastor Bonus - Theologie für die pastorale Praxis. Festschrift für Volker Spangenberg*, ed. by Michael Kißkalt, Andrea Klimt, and Martin Rothkegel (Heidelberg and Göttingen: Oncken Verlag, 2021), 131-166.

⁵⁰ Sutton, Experiences, 22, sig. C3^v.

⁵¹ *Ibid*.

⁵² *Ibid.*, 25, sig. D1^r.

in Rotterdam. To quote from Knollys's preliminaries, it is there that the vulnerable 'Fragments' of Sutton's 'manuscript' writings were turned into a 'little Book'; it is there that, in an echo of John 6:12, Sutton's handwritten experiences could be 'gather[ed] up' and deposited into the more durable 'basket' of the printed object. 53 For Adcock, the loss of Sutton's writings to a sea storm and their memorial reconstruction serves as an allegory for the importance of memory in nonconformist community formation, as well as a clear lesson for Sutton's readers that they must observe and preserve the 'evidences of God's grace'. 54 It is certainly this, but the same anecdote of loss and recovery also betrays a self-consciousness about materiality and textual making. Echoing the twofold nature of Christ's body in the Noli me tangere, which was understood to be 'suspended between its incarnative and risen states', the conceptualization of Sutton's 'little Book' as a collection of written 'Fragments', which have been brought together into the 'basket' of the 'Book', is in fact suggestive of its own 'double nature' as both 'object and as discourse.' 55

As part of the mechanical processes that gave material embodiment to Sutton's 'voyce', serious thought went into the look and design of the 'basket' that transmitted it. This is not just (or only) a matter of expert Dutch workmanship—the lucidity of the Experiences' mise-en-page is what underscores Skerpan-Wheeler's point that Sutton's text was 'beautifully produced'; rather, it is a matter of the Experiences' use of art in the domain of nonconformist devotional expression. The Noli me tangere motif on the Experiences' titlepage is, indeed, a source and sign of transnational differences in nonconformist attitudes to the visual arts.

_

⁵³ *Ibid.*, sig. *1^v.

⁵⁴ Adcock, "'Gathering up the *Fragments*, that nothing be lost": "Memorable" Women's Conversion Narratives', *Early Modern Women: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 6 (2001): 151-209 (211).

⁵⁵ Elizabeth Saur and Lisa M. Smith, 'Noli me tangere: Colonialist Imperatives and Enclosure Acts in Early Modern England', in Sensible Flesh: On Touch in Early Modern Culture, ed. by Elizabeth D. Harvey (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003), 141-58 (140); Roger Chartier and Maurice Elton, 'Crossing Borders in Early Modern Europe: Sociology of Texts and Literature', Book History 8 (2005): 37-50 (41).

As Nigel Smith posits in his recent exploration of the 'Anglo-Dutch radical religious inter-traffic in this period', Dutch nonconformists, especially amongst the Spiritualists and the Mennonite communities, actively incorporated 'visual genres' into their devotional expressions, and in ways that seem quite distinct from the English context. ⁵⁶ In English religious radicalism, almost without exception, art... is either absent or disapproved of before the later seventeenth century'; conversely, Dutch followers of the radical reformation had 'a more advanced economy' and a 'greater visual and material sophistication', which 'meant that they saw matter with more nuanced eyes.' ⁵⁷ Far from disavowing 'visual art', Dutch religious radicals 'reveled in it and it helped them understand their world', and it is perhaps within the context of these 'material-cultural differences' that the *Experiences*' title-page, and its clever use of a Dürer-inspired *Noli me tangere* printer's device, can be put into a new perspective. ⁵⁸

Conclusion

This is at least a context that would help to thicken the analysis that has been undertaken so far, which, in focusing on the Goddæus' second-hand trademark—a device that originates in 1630s Leiden but with a motif that calls us back to Nuremburg in 1510—has moved from the generic to the specific. In terms of the generic, this article has picked up on notions of threshold encounters, as well as the haptic connotations of Dürer's woodcut, to consider how the *Noli me tangere* device deployed by the Goddæus' might work, on the one hand, to enliven a sense of the book's covering as a transformation space, and on the other, to promote intellectual and spiritual meanings related to printing as an artisanal activity. In terms of the specific, the article then pursued the possibility that this woodcut device was deployed

⁵⁶ Nigel Smith, 'To Network or Not to Network Art, the Literary, and "Invention" in Early Modern European Radical Religion', *Church History and Religious Culture* 101 (2021), 376-398 (377; 398).

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, 376; 392; 393.

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, 398; 377.

strategically, used to suggest the empirical credentials of the print products that have survived to bear witness to it. By then settling on Sutton's *Experiences*, a more localized reading has emerged, one that has hopefully helped to illuminate the internal weavings of text and paratext, and with this, the complex intersections between the spheres of print and personal devotional expression.

To borrow Silva's phrase again, the 'inherently multimodal' character of early modern printed paratexts often requires a multimodal approach. Taking my cue from the 'multimodal' nature of the device itself, I have therefore followed the disparate pathways that it illuminates, which together range across and between commercial and creative boundaries. Indeed, boundary hopping is precisely what the Goddæus' device demands of us, if we look at it closely enough. Condensed within its oval bounds, we find Christ and the Magdalene positioned on a boundary between different forms of faith. Acknowledging Dürer's influence on the ornament's design incites us to cross the boundaries between religious iconography produced in one century and the modalities of artisanal self-promotion active in another. As a marketing device—and in taking Minel's *Logica* and Sutton's *Experiences* as test cases—the Goddæus' trademark asks us to think across boundaries between early modern scholasticism and confessional self-scrutiny, offering, in turn, a discreet example of the ways in which early modern print agents could manage and brand text types by way of visual ornamentation. By homing in on the linkages between the Goddæus' device and the contents of Sutton's Experiences, the boundaries between a printed text's outsides and insides, between its beginnings and its endings, have also become a lot more permeable. And clearly, one final boundary that the Goddæus' device might ask us to traverse is geographical in nature. The internationally-imported Dürer finds a place in a Rotterdam printing house, but so too did the Englishwoman, Sutton. As suggested, an English-language nonconformist text produced in the Dutch Republic is not at all unusual for the period, but with specific reference to the

Experiences, we might recognize its title-page device as a record of the culturally- and place-specific mediations that helped to underwrite the material construction of Sutton's 'little Book'.