

#### Depth variation in benthic community response to repeated marine heatwaves on remote Central Indian Ocean reefs

Sannassy Pilly, Jyodee; Roche, Ronan; Richardson, Laura; Turner, John

#### **Royal Society Open Science**

DOI: 10.1098/rsos.231246

Published: 27/03/2024

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication

*Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA):* Sannassy Pilly, J., Roche, R., Richardson, L., & Turner, J. (2024). Depth variation in benthic community response to repeated marine heatwaves on remote Central Indian Ocean reefs. Royal Society Open Science, 11(3), 231246. https://doi.org/10.1098/rsos.231246

Hawliau Cyffredinol / General rights Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.

- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
   You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

## ROYAL SOCIETY OPEN SCIENCE

#### royalsocietypublishing.org/journal/rsos

#### (cc) BY

Research



**Cite this article:** Sannassy Pilly S, Roche RC, Richardson LE, Turner JR. 2024 Depth variation in benthic community response to repeated marine heatwaves on remote Central Indian Ocean reefs. *R. Soc. Open Sci.* **11**: 231246. https://doi.org/10.1098/rsos.231246

Received: 22 August 2023 Accepted: 21 February 2024

#### Subject Category:

Ecology, conservation, and global change biology

Subject Areas:

ecology, environmental science

#### Keywords:

climate-induced thermal stress, marine heatwaves, depth zonation, benthic communities, shallow coral reefs, remote reef systems

#### Author for correspondence:

Sivajyodee Sannassy Pilly e-mail: s.pilly@bangor.ac.uk

Electronic supplementary material is available online at https://doi.org/10.6084/ m9.figshare.c.7103075.

THE ROYAL SOCIETY PUBLISHING

# Depth variation in benthic community response to repeated marine heatwaves on remote Central Indian Ocean reefs

Sivajyodee Sannassy Pilly, Ronan C. Roche, Laura E. Richardson and John R. Turner

School of Ocean Sciences, Bangor University, Bangor LL59 5AB, UK

SSP, 0000-0002-9802-7759; RCR, 0000-0002-6342-9571; LER, 0000-0002-1284-4011

Coral reefs are increasingly impacted by climate-induced warming events. However, there is limited empirical evidence on the variation in the response of shallow coral reef communities to thermal stress across depths. Here, we assess depth-dependent changes in coral reef benthic communities following successive marine heatwaves from 2015 to 2017 across a 5–25 m depth gradient in the remote Chagos Archipelago, Central Indian Ocean. Our analyses show an overall decline in hard and soft coral cover and an increase in crustose coralline algae, sponge and reef pavement following successive marine heatwaves on the remote reef system. Our findings indicate that the changes in benthic communities in response to elevated seawater temperatures varied across depths. We found greater changes in benthic group cover at shallow depths (5–15 m) compared with deeper zones

(15–25 m). The loss of hard coral cover was better predicted by initial thermal stress, while the loss of soft coral was associated with repeated thermal stress following successive warming events. Our study shows that benthic communities extending to 25 m depth were impacted by successive marine heatwaves, supporting concerns about the resilience of shallow coral reef communities to increasingly severe climate-driven warming events.

## 1. Introduction

Climate-induced thermal stress is one of the main drivers of change in coral reef benthic communities [1–3]. However, the

© 2024 The Authors. Published by the Royal Society under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/, which permits unrestricted use, provided the original author and source are credited.

degree to which disturbance events affect ecological communities is not uniform across space and varies along environmental gradients [4-6]. Coral reefs show significant spatial and temporal heterogeneity in community structure post-disturbance [7–9]. While most assessments of the extent of coral bleaching and consequent degradation and succession processes are carried out in shallow depths (2-10 m) [7,10–13], the response of shallow benthic communities to thermal stress over depth ranges extending to 30 m is poorly described [9,14]. As light, temperature [15] and waves decrease with increasing depth, and the availability of organic resources increases at depths [16,17], it is expected that the response of benthic communities to thermal stress will dampen [18]. However, contrary to the deep reef refuge hypothesis, which suggests that reefs at greater depths could escape the effects of climate-induced bleaching events [18,19], increasing evidence of bleaching and mortality within shallow (2–27 m) and mesophotic depth zones ( $\geq$  30 m) [8,14,20–27] underlines the necessity to assess communities at larger depth gradients. Additionally, the limited overlap of species between shallow and deep reefs [28,29] and significant genetic divergence between species across depths indicate that deeper populations may not always provide viable propagules to repopulate shallow reefs [30,31]. These observations have important implications for coral reef assessments that evaluate the ecological response of shallow reef organisms to increasingly frequent thermal stress events, which are predicted to occur annually within the twenty-first century [32].

In 2014–2017, the world observed the first back-to-back coral bleaching events that were documented over 3 years [33–35]. The recurring heatwaves caused coral bleaching on 80% of coral reefs globally and the mass mortality of corals [1,11,35,36]. Thermal anomalies such as the 2014–2017 warming events have raised global concern about the resilience and persistence of tropical reef systems [1,35]. Chronic disturbances can impede recovery and induce significant degradation in communities [37]. As the increased intensity and frequency of ocean-warming events [38–40] shorten the recovery window for benthic communities [41–43], they can lead to potentially irreversible ecological changes [44,45].

Large-scale bleaching-induced coral mortality on coral reefs alters the dynamic interactions between benthic groups, causing significant shifts in community assemblages [46,47]. While the loss of hard corals can cause bare reef pavement to dominate the substrate [48,49], ecological regime shifts on coral reefs can generate non-coral-dominated states primarily characterized by benthic taxa such as algae (including crustose coralline algae (CCA), turf and macroalgae), soft corals and sponges [47,50–54]. Opportunistic and faster growing in nature, these alternative benthic groups competitively replace hard corals, which can lead to a loss of complexity [55,56], reduce reef carbonate budgets [57,58] and alter reef-associated fish communities [59,60], resulting in a decline in provision of important ecosystem services [61,62]. In some instances, coral community composition is altered despite recovering to pre-disturbance coral abundance [7,63,64].

While climate-driven community changes may result in degraded and less resilient reefs [23,65], the depth variability in changes in benthic community assemblages is poorly understood. Coral reef benthic communities are highly heterogeneous [66,67] and naturally show diverse vertical zonation patterns [28,68,69] as a result of the interaction between biophysical processes that concomitantly vary across depths [17,70]. During a marine heatwave, modifications in physiologically important factors such as the combination of sustained elevated seawater temperatures and high solar radiation are often the main causes of bleaching and degradation on reefs [18,71,72]. Additionally, the proportion of change in benthic communities following a marine heatwave may be due to the assemblage composition [11]. Studies show that coral species have different thermal tolerance [73–75], and the susceptibility of species within the same genus to climate-induced bleaching can vary significantly across depths [14]. In addition, imports of nutrient-rich and cold water from deep-water upwelling and internal waves onto shallow reef systems can confer resilience to change in ecological communities during ocean-warming events [76,77]. High spatial variation is therefore expected to occur in the response of benthic lifeforms to thermal stress within the water column [14,78,79].

Where post-bleaching coral reef assessments incorporate multiple depth zones, they can estimate depth-dependent mortality, identify surviving populations with the potential to repopulate and provide a better understanding of the trajectory of community changes across the extent of shallow reef systems (0–30 m) [14,25,27,78,80]. Here, we use benthic community surveys from shallow forereefs of the remote Chagos Archipelago, Central Indian Ocean, before and after successive marine heat-waves in 2015–2017. We examine the effects of recurrent severe thermal stress on benthic communities across a depth gradient of 5–25 m. In 2015–2017, the marine heatwave caused severe coral bleaching and mortality in the Chagos Archipelago, with sustained declines in coral cover due to two consecutive years of elevated temperature stress [41]. Specifically, we assess the change in percentage cover of

five broad benthic groups and examine spatial variation in the change in composition of those groups across depths at four atolls in the archipelago. We also examine differences between the initial and repeated effects of thermal stress on the observed changes in benthic composition.

## 2. Material and methods

#### 2.1. Study sites

The Chagos Archipelago is a remote archipelago located in the Central Indian Ocean. Situated at the southern end of the Laccadives–Maldives–Chagos ridge, it covers a total area of 640 000 km<sup>2</sup> and consists of five islanded atolls. The archipelago has been uninhabited since the early 1970s, except for the US military base on the southern atoll, Diego Garcia [81]. Benthic community data were collected with repeat sampling in March–April 2013–2014 (before) and 2018–2019 (after) following successive severe marine heatwaves in 2015–2017. The peaks of marine heatwave events occurred in May–June 2015 ( $4.2 \pm 0.4$ – $6.1 \pm 0.3$ °C-weeks) and April–June 2016 ( $12.1 \pm 0.1$ – $15.8 \pm 0.1$ °C-weeks) (electronic supplementary material, figure S1). Surveys in each period were carried out at 16 sites on forereef slopes across four atolls–Peros Banhos (PB), Salomon (SA), Great Chagos Bank (GCB) and Egmont (EG) (figure 1)–and conducted at four depth zones: 5–10, 10–15, 15–20 and 20–25 m. For ease of interpretation, shallower depth zones in the text refer to benthic groups occurring between 5–15 m and deeper zones to benthic groups occurring between 15–25 m.

#### 2.2. Data collection and benthic community assessment

A benthic community assessment was carried out using 10 min continuous video swims conducted at a constant speed (0.1 m s<sup>-1</sup>) at each site and depth zone. Equipped with two spotlights and two red laser pointers set 10 cm apart, the camera set-up provided a scale of measurement of the benthos and adjustment for lower light levels at greater depth. During the survey, the camera was held approximately 0.5 m above the substrate and at a 45° angle to capture benthic organisms and substrate types under overhangs and canopies [82]. Each video was converted into a sequence of still images (25 frames per second in Pinnacle Studio, v. 22.2.0). Thirty of these images were selected for analysis using Matlab (R2018a.Ink; total across all sites, n = 5610). Selected images were separated by 80–100 frames in each sequence to avoid resampling the same area of reef.

Benthic composition within each image was quantified using Coral Point Count with Excel extensions [83]. To reduce observer bias, image analysis was equally distributed among S.S.P., R.C.R. and L.E.R. (10 images per person per site). The percentage cover of benthic organisms and other substrate types was quantified at 15 randomly allocated points on each image using a stratified random design [84]. The broad classification of benthic groups was adapted from Denis *et al.* [85] and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) Coral Reef Information System [86]. This study examined five benthic groups that have been found to undergo shifts in dominance and contribute to habitat building on coral reefs following thermal stress events: hard coral, soft coral, sponge, CCA and reef pavement [48,87–90]. Despite being an important competitor to corals [47], macroalgae were not included, as we only found small changes in macroalgal cover (turf and fleshy macroalgae) following marine heatwaves (pre-heatwaves:  $6.5 \pm 0.2\%$  and post-heatwaves:  $6.0 \pm 0.1\%$ ).

#### 2.3. Estimating change in benthic groups following 2015–2017 bleaching events

The change in the benthic group cover which occurred following the 2015–2017 warming events was calculated using

$$\delta = \frac{\log(V_f) - \log(V_0)}{t},$$

where  $\delta$  is the geometric logarithmic change in cover,  $V_f$  is the percentage cover of benthic groups collected at the end of the time series, i.e. 2018 or 2019,  $V_0$  is the percentage cover of benthic groups at the beginning of the time series, i.e. 2013 or 2014, and *t* is the duration of the time in years between benthic surveys, i.e. before and after the successive marine heatwaves [91]. This approach optimized the dataset by including surveyed sites that were monitored in different years before and after the heat



Figure 1. Map of sampled sites (red points) around surveyed atolls (in bold) in the Chagos Archipelago—northern atolls: Peros Banhos, Salomon and southern atolls: Great Chagos Bank and Egmont—see electronic supplementary material, table S1, for a list of sites and coordinates.

stress event, i.e. to include pre-disturbance community data collected in 2013 or 2014 (hereafter pre-heatwaves), and post-disturbance community data sampled in 2018 or 2019 (hereafter post-heatwaves). The geometric logarithmic change in cover metric allows the quantification and comparison of nonlinear time series by taking into consideration the exponential decline and increase in cover of benthic communities over time (*sensu* [91]; e.g. [64,92]). Compared with other metrics that measure ecological change over time [92], the geometric logarithmic rate of change preserves proportionality of change in cover (e.g. a 50% to 5% loss is proportionately similar to a 10% to 1% loss) and is symmetrical, i.e. produces similar rates of change for declines and matching increases (e.g. a 50% to 5% loss and a 5% to 50% increase yield the same rates [91]). To summarize the geometric logarithmic change in cover metric, a negative value represents a loss in benthic group cover from pre- to postheatwaves and a positive value indicates an increase in benthic group cover following thermal stress. Variation in the change in benthic group cover across depth zones was visualized using a forest plot (ggplot: ggplot2 package [93]). For ease of interpretation, the log change in cover was back-transformed to a percentage change in cover (electronic supplementary material, figure S2), using

where  $\delta$  is the geometric logarithmic change in cover, and *i* is the percentage change in cover.

#### 2.4. Exposure to repeated thermal stress

To determine how benthic groups were affected by thermal stress across depth zones during the 2015-2017 marine heatwaves, maximum degree heat week (hereafter maxDHW) was used to quantify thermal anomalies from 2015 to 2017. DHW is a proxy for accumulated thermal stress, represented by a 1°C increase above the local mean climatic temperature over a 12-week period at a given pixel and expressed as degree Celsius weeks (°C-weeks); and maxDHW is the annual maximum accumulated thermal stress in a year. Using the NOAA Coral Reef Watch 5 km resolution product [94], the annual maxDHW between January 2015 and December 2017 was extracted for each study site (using R packages: ncdf4 [95], raster [96], rgdal [97] and sp [98]). A DHW threshold of 4°C-weeks may be indicative of significant coral bleaching, and a DHW value of 8°C-weeks is a signal for severe and widespread bleaching with likely mortality [11,99–102]. Local-scale hydrodynamics, e.g. upwelling and changes in mixed layer depth, can influence temperature regime across depth gradients [103,104]. However, in the absence of depth-specific temperature data from *in situ* loggers across all study sites, DHW that was derived from SST was used as a proxy of thermal stress experienced along the depth gradient at the study sites during the warming events (electronic supplementary material, figure S1). Here, initial thermal stress refers to maxDHW recorded in 2015 in the first year of the successive marine heatwaves (4.1-6.4°C-weeks) and repeated thermal stress refers to the cumulative maxDHW recorded in all years from 2015 to 2017 (17.1-21.1°C-weeks, electronic supplementary material, table S1). Cumulative maxDHW has been shown to be a good predictor of bleaching in the Western Indian Ocean [105] and therefore the change in benthic group cover following repeated marine heatwaves.

#### 2.5. Data analysis

Non-metric multi-dimensional scaling (nMDS: vegan package [106]) analysis was used to visualize variation in benthic community composition across and within depth zones among atolls before and after the thermal stress. Using a Bray–Curtis distance of square-root transformed data [107], the nMDS was computed in three dimensions (k = 3) with a stress value of less than 0.1. A scree plot and a Shepard stress plot were used to assess the ordination stress and the correlation between the original dissimilarity matrix and the distances on the final nMDS plot. Vectors of the different benthic groups were fitted to show their correlations with how atolls and depth zones are clustered on the ordination plots (envfit: vegan package; with 9999 permutations).

A three-way nested permutational multivariate analysis of variance (PERMANOVA) was carried out to assess whether benthic community composition varied across depth zones (four levels; fixed factor) among atolls (four levels, fixed factor), and whether variation was observed before and after the successive heatwaves (two levels; fixed factor), including an interaction term between depth zone, atoll and heatwave period (i.e. pre- and post-heatwaves). Sites (random factors) were nested in atolls to account for and control for site-specific variation in benthic communities to isolate the effects of the fixed factors. Multivariate homogeneity tests identified whether there were differences in benthic community dispersion across depth zones before and after successive heatwaves (betadisper: vegan package, using Bray–Curtis distances between samples). The difference between the mean dispersion in benthic communities before and after the successive heatwaves across depth zones was tested using a permutation test (permutest: vegan package, with 9999 permutations). Where a significant interaction between depth zones, atolls and successive heatwaves was found, Bonferroni pairwise comparisons of group mean differences were also performed to contrast pre- and post-heatwave communities within depth zones and among atolls.

Bayesian hierarchical models were used to assess the effects of initial and repeated thermal stress on the change in cover of each benthic group (hard coral, soft coral, sponge, CCA and reef pavement) across depth zones and among atolls (brm: brms package [108]). A generalized linear mixed-effects framework was used to model change in cover (response variable), with a Gaussian distribution, as a function of depth zone, atolls and initial and repeated thermal stress (population-level effects), with an interaction between depth zone, atoll and each thermal stress variable. The site (group-level variable) was nested in the atoll to control for the spatial variation in the change in benthic groups at the site level. The models were run in Stan (brms package), using weakly informative priors for the regression parameters in the model (electronic supplementary material, table S2). Models were



nMDS1

**Figure 2.** Non-metric multi-dimensional scaling plot of benthic groups from 16 sites in the Chagos Archipelago, showing clustering of communities in 2013–2014 (pre-heatwaves: unfilled shapes) and 2018–2019 (post-heatwaves: filled shapes) following 2015–2017 marine heatwaves across depth zones (green: 5–10 m, orange: 10–15 m, blue: 15–20 m and pink: 20–25 m) at atolls—Egmont (EG), Great Chagos Bank (GCB), Peros Banhos (PB) and Salomon (SA)—based on Bray–Curtis dissimilarities of square-root transformed data. Ellipses represent the dispersion of pre (grey lines) and post (black lines) marine heatwave communities from centroids at 95% confidence intervals. Vectors show benthic groups that significantly contributed to the patterns on the ordination; arrows show the direction of the gradient; and the length of the vectors is proportional to the correlations between the benthic group and the ordination. Depth-dependent and atoll-dependent variation in benthic communities can be viewed in electronic supplementary material, figure S3.

fitted with 2000 iterations across four chains using a Markov chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) algorithm. Excluding 1000 warm-up iterations per chain, all posterior sampling included 4000 draws to simulate the response variables. Predictors (initial and repeated thermal stress) were centred, and the convergence of the MCMC algorithm was visually assessed using traceplots. Effective and reliable sampling of the posterior distributions was assessed using Gelman–Rubin convergence R-hat values of less than 1.05 and a minimum effective sample size of less than 1000 for all parameters [109]. Posterior predictive checks were used to assess model fits (bayesplot package [110] and tidybayes package [111]). The influence of each predictor (depth zone, atoll, initial and repeated thermal stress) on the change in benthic group cover following the successive severe marine heatwaves was assessed using average marginal effects (emmeans, emtrend: emmeans package [112]). Uncertainty related to the models' posterior estimates was interpreted with 50% and 95% credible intervals. Strong and weak evidence of change was interpreted when 95% and 50% of the intervals did not intercept zero, respectively [64,113]. All data analyses were performed using R 3.5.1 [114].



**Figure 3.** Standardised effects of depth zones (from multi-level Bayesian models) on change in benthic group cover following the 2015–2017 marine heatwaves at atolls: Egmont (EG), Great Chagos Bank (GCB), Peros Banhos (PB) and Salomon (SA). Points indicate median posterior estimates, and bars represent 50% and 95% credible intervals. Strong and weak evidence of change in benthic cover is interpreted when 95% (red lines) and 50% (black and red lines) of the intervals do not intercept zero, respectively. Non-significant effects are shown by black lines.

## 3. Results

## 3.1. Variation in benthic community composition after 2015–2017 marine heatwaves

Multivariate analyses showed no interaction effect between depth and atoll on benthic communities (figure 2, table 1). These findings indicate that there was no difference in benthic communities before and after the marine heatwaves among atolls across depth zones. However, significant depth-dependent and atoll-dependent variations in benthic community composition before and after the successive heatwaves were recorded across all 16 study sites (figure 2, table 1). Pairwise comparisons showed significant differences in benthic communities before and after the successive heatwaves across all depth zones, except at 20–25 m, and across all atolls, except at Egmont (electronic supplementary material, figure S3 and table S3). Dispersion analyses revealed similar dispersion means for benthic communities pre- and post-heatwaves across all depth zones and atolls (table 1).

### 3.2. Depth-dependent temporal change in benthic composition

#### 3.2.1. Decline in hard and soft coral cover

Our results revealed an overall decline in hard coral ( $-14.1 \pm 1.5\%$ ) and soft coral cover ( $-23.1 \pm 3.1\%$ ), which varied across depth zones and atolls following the 2015–2017 marine heatwaves. Hard coral cover declined in all depth zones (5–25 m) at Great Chagos Bank compared with Egmont, where a small gain was observed (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4). The loss in hard coral cover after bleaching was greatest at 5–10 m at Great Chagos Bank (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4) and declined with increasing depth (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4). At three atolls (Great Chagos Bank, Peros Banhos and Salomon) soft coral cover declines were greatest at 5–10 m (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4). Soft coral cover loss became less pronounced with increasing depth at all atolls; however, marginal declines were still observed at 15–20 m at Egmont, Peros Banhos and Salomon (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4).

 Table 1. Variation in the benthic community before and after the 2015–2017 marine heatwaves using permutational analysis of variance (PERMANOVA) and dispersions tests across depth zones (5–10, 10–15, 15–20 and 20–25 m) among atolls (Egmont, Great Chagos Bank, Peros Banhos and Salomon).

	PERMANOVA			dispersion		
	d.f.	pseudo-f	<i>p</i> -value	d.f.	pseudo-f	<i>p</i> -value
Heatwaves $ imes$ Depth $ imes$ Atoll	9,127	0.72	0.8274			
Heatwaves $ imes$ Depth	3,186	5.98	0.0001	7,120	0.4958	0.8361
Heatwaves $ imes$ Atoll	3,186	5.64	0.0001	7,120	1.0796	0.3807
Depth x Atoll	9,186	1.5796	0.0607			

Notes: d.f., degrees of freedom

#### 3.2.2. Increase in crustose coralline algae, reef pavement and sponge cover

There was an overall 6.6  $\pm$  1.7% increase in CCA cover following successive heatwaves. There was no evidence of a depth effect on the change in CCA cover at any atoll, except for an increase in CCA at Great Chagos Bank at 5–10 m and a loss in CCA cover at 20–25 m at Peros Banhos (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4).

Reef pavement increased by  $13.4 \pm 1.7\%$  post-heatwaves. The increase in reef pavement at 5–10 m was more pronounced at Egmont and Great Chagos Bank (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4). All atolls showed an increase in reef pavement at 10–15 m (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4). Reef pavement marginally increased at deeper zones (15–20 m and 20–25 m) at Egmont and Salomon (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4).

There was an increase in sponge cover  $(24.1 \pm 7.6\%)$  following successive heatwaves. A small increase in sponge cover was observed at all atolls at 5–10 m and at 10–15 m at Egmont and Great Chagos Bank (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4). Sponge cover marginally increased at 15–20 m at Great Chagos Bank. However, there was no change in sponge cover at 20–25 m at any of the atolls (figure 3, electronic supplementary material, table S4).

#### 3.3. Effects of thermal stress on change in benthic communities across depth zones

Variable effects of initial and repeated thermal stress were observed on the change in benthic groups across depth zones and among atolls. The loss in hard coral cover at all depths was driven by initial thermal stress, with consistent negative effects on the decline in hard coral cover across depth zones (figure 4, electronic supplementary material, table S5). Stronger evidence of hard coral cover loss due to initial thermal stress was shown at Great Chagos Bank across all depth zones, with less pronounced effects at Peros Banhos and Egmont (figure 4, electronic supplementary material, table S5). Repeated thermal stress had a marginal effect on the decline in hard coral cover across all depth zones. These effects were more pronounced at Great Chagos Bank in deeper zones (10–25 m) (figure 4, electronic supplementary material, table S5).

Unlike hard coral, changes in soft coral, CCA, reef pavement and sponge cover following successive marine heatwaves were weakly and variably affected by initial and repeated thermal stress across depth zones and among atolls. Great Chagos Bank was one of the atolls where both initial and repeated thermal stress marginally influenced the loss in soft coral cover across depth (electronic supplementary material, figure S4 and table S5). Both initial and repeated thermal stress marginally decreased soft coral cover at 20–25 m at Egmont. At Salomon, soft coral cover marginally declined due to initial thermal stress at 20–25 m (electronic supplementary material, figure S4 and table S5).

Initial thermal stress marginally increased CCA cover at 5–10 m at Great Chagos Bank (electronic supplementary material, figure S5 and table S5). There was no further evidence of an effect of initial thermal stress at other depth zones and atolls (electronic supplementary material, figure S5 and table S5). Repeated thermal stress marginally increased CCA cover at Peros Banhos at shallower depth zones (5–10 and 10–15 m). The effects of repeated thermal stress on the change in CCA cover were divergent at 20–25 m, with a small increase at Great Chagos Bank and a small decrease at Peros Banhos (electronic supplementary material, figure S5 and table S5).



**Figure 4.** Posterior distributions of the standardised effects of initial and repeated thermal stress (from multi-level Bayesian models) on the change in hard coral cover following 2015–2017 marine heatwaves across depth zones: 5–10, 10–15, 15–20 and 20–25 m at atolls: Egmont (EG), Great Chagos Bank (GCB), Peros Banhos (PB) and Salomon (SA). Points indicate median estimates, and bars represent 50% and 95% credible intervals. Strong and weak evidence of change in benthic cover is interpreted when 95% (indicated by \*\*) and 50% (indicated by \*) of the intervals do not intercept zero, respectively.

There was no evidence of an effect of initial thermal stress on the increase in reef pavement at 5–10 m at any atoll. Repeated thermal stress slightly increased reef pavement at 5–10 m at Great Chagos Bank and Salomon (electronic supplementary material, figure S6 and table S5). Both initial and repeated thermal stress marginally increased reef pavement at deeper zones (10–15, 15–20 and 20–25 m) at Egmont, Great Chagos Bank and Salomon (electronic supplementary material, figure S6 and table S5).

Initial thermal stress marginally increased sponge cover at shallower depth zones (5–10, 10–15 m) at Great Chagos Bank and at deeper zones (20–25 m) at Peros Banhos. A slight increase in sponge cover was observed due to repeated thermal stress at mid-depths (10–15, 15–20 m) at Egmont, Great Chagos Bank and Peros Banhos (electronic supplementary material, figure S7 and table S5).

## 4. Discussion

It is evident that intense ocean-warming events such as the successive heatwaves in 2014–2017 [36,115] are changing coral-dominated reefs to alternative configurations, with severe impacts on ecosystem functioning [11]. However, there is limited understanding of the changes that occur in benthic communities from recurring warming events at depths greater than 10 m [1,60,101,116]. We observed changes in benthic communities on the remote Central Indian Ocean reefs of the Chagos Archipelago following successive heatwaves in 2015–2017 at depths down to 25 m. Our findings indicate greater changes in benthic group cover at shallower depths (5–15 m) relative to deeper zones (15–25 m). However, the changes in benthic communities in response to elevated seawater temperatures were variable at different depths.

#### 4.1. Variation in ecological response to thermal stress across depth

Changes in communities occur as a result of the complex interactions between their habitat, physiological traits and the nature of disturbance events [117]. Here, we show that the change in benthic communities decreased with increasing depth. This pattern [14,78] may relate to biophysical forcing, such as light, temperature, salinity [15,118,119] and wave and current regimes [16,120] that simultaneously vary across depth.

During a global warming event, compositional changes observed in benthic communities occur as a result of thermal stress-related coral bleaching, which is caused by increased seawater temperature and light irradiance. As light intensity and temperature naturally decline with increasing depth [15], lower levels of bleaching and mortality are frequently observed at depth [8,14,24,25,27], which could account for the lower change in soft and hard coral cover at 15–25 m compared with the shallower communities at 5–15 m. In addition to the combination of the natural attenuation of light and temperature with increasing depth, the presence of internal waves may explain the smaller change in benthic community cover at deeper zones relative to shallower parts of the reefs. Significant water temperature fluctuations with increasing depth suggest strong internal wave activity in the Chagos Archipelago [121]. Internal waves which drive deep-water upwelling can significantly decrease thermal stress and mitigate the response of benthic organisms to bleaching events at depth [122]. By cooling temperatures and bringing in allochthonous nutrients from the deep, upwelling can increase productivity in shallow reef systems [120]. When autotrophy is compromised during a warming event [123], upwelling can promote heterotrophy and the survival of mixotrophic organisms such as hard and soft corals [17,77,124,125].

Despite the variation in the change of benthic groups across depths, we observe a consistent pattern of loss in hard coral and soft coral cover, followed by an increase in CCA, reef pavement and sponge cover across all depth zones. The increase in sponge and CCA cover can also be associated with the increase in the proportion of reef pavement after the marine heatwaves. Mass bleaching events have been shown to induce widespread mortality in hard and soft coral communities [40,126] creating vacant space [127]. Recent studies in the Chagos Archipelago have shown a higher proportion of reef pavement and boring sponge cover on shallow exposed sites after the 2015–2017 marine heatwaves compared with more sheltered sites [48]. Higher wave energy at shallow depths can increase the susceptibility of benthic groups such as dead hard and soft corals to physical damage and dislodgement [128], resulting in vacant bare reef pavement and promoting the growth of rapidly colonizing and wave-tolerant organisms like sponge and CCA [129,130].

#### 4.2. Variation in ecological response to initial and repeated thermal stress

#### 4.2.1. Change in hard coral cover following bleaching events

There were variable and modest responses in benthic communities to initial and repeated thermal stress across depth zones. Recent studies show similar trends of little to no significant interaction between depth and thermal stress in explaining post-heatwave trajectories in benthic communities across depth gradients [8,26,131]. Among all surveyed benthic groups, only hard coral cover had a consistent negative effect of initial thermal stress across all depth zones. This suggests that the initial effect of thermal stress in 2015 had the largest influence on the observed decline in hard coral cover, potentially due to mortality of coral assemblages with low tolerance to thermal stress [101,117]. In contrast, the cumulative effect of repeated thermal stress from 2015 to 2017 was associated with a smaller decline in hard coral cover. Previous studies in Chagos support these findings with comparable patterns reporting higher coral bleaching and mortality in 2015 despite higher exposure to thermal stress in 2016 [41]. Similar trends of lower bleaching and mortality rates in the second year of consecutive coral bleaching events were reported on the Great Barrier Reef [116] and in the Coral Sea [101], even though higher thermal stress was recorded in the second year.

There are several mechanisms which could drive successive bleaching events resulting in lower coral mortality. Over the duration of a warming event, less susceptible hard corals can resist, adapt and recover from thermal stress [132,133]. For example, exposure to the initial warming event in 2015 may have created thermal preconditioning for the remaining live hard coral community to develop resistance to subsequent bleaching [134,135]. In addition, natural association with [136,137] or shifting to thermally tolerant endosymbionts during stress [138,139] can decrease bleaching susceptibility and lower coral cover decline during subsequent warming events.

#### 4.2.2. Change in other benthic groups following bleaching events

Unlike the hard coral community, the remaining benthic groups showed weak and variable responses to both initial and repeated thermal stress across depth zones. For example, repeated thermal stress increased soft coral cover loss at 20–25 m, whereas no effects were observed on change in soft coral cover at shallower depths. Studies which have looked at the impact of recurring thermal stress on soft coral communities in the Western and Central Pacific also show similar trends of loss related to repeated bleaching and eventual die-offs [88,126]. The impact of thermal stress at 20–25 m may relate to lower thermal variability at depths making deeper soft coral communities less resilient to chronic warming [88]. In addition, soft coral communities at depth could be made up of more vulnerable populations like *Sarcophyton* colonies, which are known to degrade completely after recurring bleaching events, compared with *Lobophytum* and *Sinularia*, which are more resistant to bleaching [88,126].

Both initial and repeated thermal stress decreased the recovery in sponge cover following the 2015–2017 bleaching event. This effect was most pronounced at the shallowest depths (5–10 m). The increase in sponge cover that we found is probably driven by an increase in encrusting boring sponges [90,140], also observed following the major 1998 bleaching event in the Chagos Archipelago [141]. These bio-eroding sponges can host *Symbiodinium* spp., which are resistant to bleaching [142]. This association with thermally tolerant holobionts helps the sponges spread rapidly on stressed and dead corals during warming events [143].

CCA was the benthic group least influenced by initial and repeated thermal stress. Repeated thermal stress marginally reduced the recovery of CCA cover at one atoll (Peros Banhos), and minimal to no effect of initial thermal stress was observed on the increase in CCA cover. Recent studies show that CCA has high thresholds for elevated water temperatures [89]. While an acute thermal stress event can significantly reduce photosynthetic rates in CCA, it also has the potential to acclimatize to chronically elevated water temperatures and maintain photosynthesis and calcification [144]. In addition to being highly tolerant to heat stress, the increase in CCA cover may relate to their high dispersal rates and ability to spread rapidly on various substrates such as available bare reef substrate, dead coral colonies and coral rubble post-bleaching [145].

There were variable effects of both initial and repeated thermal stress on the increase in available reef pavement. This is probably linked to the loss of previously dominant hard and soft coral cover following the 2015–2017 marine heatwaves on these reefs. The overall gain in available reef pavement also coincides with an increase in fish community herbivory about 2 years following the warming events [146]. By sustaining high levels of grazing on endolithic and epilithic algae following bleaching, herbivores can maintain a high proportion of bare reef pavement [146,147].

#### 4.3. Benthic community reorganization following thermal stress

The reorganization of coral reef benthic communities following a disturbance event depends on the dynamic interaction between the nature (scale and severity) of the disturbance event and the reef community composition [148]. Marine heatwaves have been shown to cause widespread bleaching and mortality in scleractinian corals [1,123]. This subsequently modifies the network of interactions between the wider benthic community and can cause coral-dominated reefs to shift to reefs with novel alternative configurations [1,33,40,100,149]. During the 2015–2017 thermal stress events, reefs within the Indian Ocean region that experienced high to extreme levels of bleaching [149–151] altered to configurations dominated by epilithic algal matrix (e.g. Seychelles, Aldabra atoll [140]; Kenya, Zanzibar [13]) and rubble beds (e.g. Maldives [10]).

Despite high bleaching and mortality rates during the successive marine heatwaves in the Chagos Archipelago [41], there is no evidence suggesting that changes in benthic groups are indicative of a regime shift from a hard coral-dominated community (electronic supplementary material, figures S8 and S9). This potential resilience to regime shifts following bleaching in the Chagos Archipelago may be attributed to (i) the isolation of the reefs from direct anthropogenic activities (e.g. pollution, eutrophication, sedimentation) [101]; (ii) local upwelling [121], which may reduce thermal stress and deliver nutrients required by benthic communities resulting in a less severe change in community structure following the warming events [77,152]; and (iii) high fish biomass [153,154] with strong top-down control on algae (macroalgae cover less than 7%) maintained by a high herbivore density post-bleaching in the archipelago [146], which may reduce the successional dominance of algae on the reefs post-disturbance and which will also provide vacant space for coral recruitment and recovery

[155]. The Chagos Archipelago also has one of the most diverse coral communities in the Indian Ocean region, which has been associated with resilience and recovery following previous severe bleaching events in the archipelago [156] as well as the Great Barrier Reef, Moorea and Jamaica [65].

Benthic community recovery is usually assessed as the return of cover to pre-disturbance levels as well as the reassembly to similar pre-disturbance taxa relative abundances [14,148,157]. Recovery to pre-disturbance configurations can take 8–13 years [148,157]. However, as the return time between climate-induced warming events becomes shorter, the ability of coral reefs to recover to pre-bleaching levels may become compromised [1,40,43]. Despite significant bleaching and mortality of key coral species such as *Acropora, Pachyseris, Echinopora, Isopora* and *Galaxea* during the back-to-back bleaching events in the Chagos Archipelago [21,41,158], our data show a lack of a shift in dominance 1–2 years post-bleaching. Additionally, Lange *et al.* [159] recently indicated high recovery potential with new coral recruitment across all morphotypes (branching, massive, encrusting, tabular *Acropora*, branching *Acropora*). However, the recovery trends shown by Lange *et al.* [159] in the Chagos Archipelago only describe reefs at 8–10 m. This and several post-bleaching coral reef studies similarly focus on changes occurring shallower than 10 m [1,10,40,101,159,160], limiting our understanding of how deeper reefs respond to recurring marine heatwaves.

## 5. Conclusion

It has been suggested that reefs at greater depths may escape the effects of climate-induced bleaching events [18,19,161]. By surveying shallow reefs, we show the loss of hard and soft coral cover post-heatwaves between 15 and 25 m. While less than the observed changes at shallower 5–15 m depths, our results highlight that benthic communities down to 25 m depth can be impacted by severe heatwaves. This is supported by an increasing number of studies that show reefs at greater depths, including mesophotic reefs (30–150 m) are not immune to thermal stress with widespread evidence of bleaching impacts and changes in community composition [9,20,22,24,26,30,104]. The decreasing change in cover of benthic groups with depth highlights the importance of surveying multiple depth gradients when explaining the rate at which communities can be altered after large-scale disturbance events. The effects of initial and repeated thermal stress across depths show that even remote reefs that are protected from direct anthropogenic impacts are not resistant to the impacts of elevated seawater temperatures and subsequent changes in community dynamics and zonation patterns. Given the predicted increase in the frequency and severity of climate-driven marine heatwaves, our findings support concerns about the ability of contemporary benthic communities across the depth range of shallow coral reefs (<30 m) worldwide to resist and recover from recurrent thermal stress.

**Ethics.** This study conducted video observations of benthic communities on reefs around the Chagos Archipelago and research permits were issued by the Foreign and Commonwealth Office, UK.

**Data accessibility.** Data and script can be accessed on Zenodo [162].

Electronic supplementary material is available at Figshare [163].

Declaration of Al use. We have not used AI-assisted technologies in creating this article.

Authors' contributions. S.S.P.: conceptualization, data curation, formal analysis, investigation, methodology, resources, software, validation, visualization, writing—original draft, writing—review and editing. R.C.R.: conceptualization, data curation, investigation, project administration, supervision, validation, writing—review and editing. L.E.R.: data curation, writing—review and editing. J.R.T.: funding acquisition, investigation, methodology, project administration, resources, supervision, writing—review and editing.

All authors gave final approval for publication and agreed to be held accountable for the work performed therein.

Conflict of interest declaration. We declare we have no competing interests.

**Funding.** This work was supported by the Bertarelli Foundation as part of the Bertarelli Programme in Marine Science—Project 6. Research in 2013/2014 was funded by the Darwin Initiative (Reference: 19-027) and supported by the M/V Pacific Marlin. The expedition in 2018/2019 was supported by the Bertarelli Foundation and carried out on the M/V Grampian Frontier.

**Acknowledgements.** We thank the M/V Pacific Marlin and M/V Grampian Frontier crew for assistance with fieldwork. We thank Lucy Southworth for assistance with frame grabbing and Lucille Chapuis with Matlab code design. Special thanks to Sam Hollick, Lekip S. Pilly, Johnathan Ball, and the Bangor University Reef Systems research group for advice and support. We thank anonymous reviewers for useful comments.

# References

Downloaded from https://royalsocietypublishing.org/ on 03 May 2024

- 1. Hughes TP et al. 2017 Global warming and recurrent mass bleaching of corals. *Nature* **543**, 373–377. (doi:10.1038/nature21707)
- Lough JM, Anderson KD, Hughes TP. 2018 Increasing thermal stress for tropical coral reefs: 1871-2017. Sci. Rep. 8, 6079. (doi:10.1038/s41598-018-24530-9)
- 3. Oliver ECJ et al. 2018 Longer and more frequent marine heatwaves over the past century. *Nat. Commun.* 9, 1324. (doi:10.1038/s41467-018-03732-9)
- 4. Schwartz MW et al. 2015 Increasing elevation of fire in the Sierra Nevada and implications for forest change. *Ecosphere* **6**, 1–10. (doi:10.1890/ES15-00003.1)
- 5. Blowes SA et al. 2019 The geography of biodiversity change in marine and terrestrial assemblages. *Science* **366**, 339–345. (doi:10.1126/ science.aaw1620)
- 6. Giraldo-Ospina A, Kendrick GA, Hovey RK. 2020 Depth moderates loss of marine foundation species after an extreme marine heatwave: could deep temperate reefs act as a refuge? *Proc. Biol. Sci.* 287, 20200709. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2020.0709)
- 7. Adjeroud M, Kayal M, Iborra-Cantonnet C, Vercelloni J, Bosserelle P, Liao V, Chancerelle Y, Claudet J, Penin L. 2018 Recovery of coral assemblages despite acute and recurrent disturbances on a South Central Pacific reef. *Sci. Rep.* **8**, 9680. (doi:10.1038/s41598-018-27891-3)
- 8. Baird AH *et al.* 2018 A decline in bleaching suggests that depth can provide a refuge from global warming in most coral taxa. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* **603**, 257–264. (doi:10.3354/meps12732)
- 9. Bridge TCL, Hughes TP, Guinotte JM, Bongaerts P. 2013 Call to protect all coral reefs. *Nature Clim. Change* **3**, 528–530. (doi:10.1038/nclimate1879)
- 10. Perry CT, Morgan KM. 2017 Post-bleaching coral community change on southern Maldivian reefs: is there potential for rapid recovery? *Coral Reefs* **36**, 1189–1194. (doi:10.1007/s00338-017-1610-9)
- 11. Hughes TP et al. 2018 Global warming transforms coral reef assemblages. *Nature* 556, 492–496. (doi:10.1038/s41586-018-0041-2)
- 12. Muñiz-Castillo AI, Rivera-Sosa A, Chollett I, Eakin CM, Andrade-Gómez L, McField M, Arias-González JE. 2019 Three decades of heat stress exposure in Caribbean coral reefs: a new regional delineation to enhance conservation. *Sci. Rep.* **9**, 11013. (doi:10.1038/s41598-019-47307-0)
- Elma E, Gullström M, Yahya SAS, Jouffray JB, East HK, Nyström M. 2023 Post-bleaching alterations in coral reef communities. *Mar. Pollut. Bull.* 186, 114479. (doi:10.1016/j.marpolbul.2022.114479)
- 14. Muir PR, Marshall PA, Abdulla A, Aguirre JD. 2017 Species identity and depth predict bleaching severity in reef-building corals: shall the deep inherit the reef? *Proc. Biol. Sci.* 284, 20171551. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2017.1551)
- Kahng SE, Akkaynak D, Shlesinger T, Hochberg EJ, Wiedenmann J, Tamir R, TchernovD. 2019 Light, temperature, photosynthesis, heterotrophy, and the lower depth limits of mesophotic coral ecosystems. In *Mesophotic coral ecosystems*. Coral Reefs of the World, vol 12 (eds Y Loya, K Puglise, T Bridge), pp. 801–828. Cham, Switzerland: Springer. (doi:10.1007/978-3-319-92735-0)
- 16. Lowe RJ, Falter JL. 2015 Oceanic forcing of coral reefs. Ann. Rev. Mar. Sci. 7, 43–66. (doi:10.1146/annurev-marine-010814-015834)
- 17. Williams GJ et al. 2018 Biophysical drivers of coral trophic depth zonation. Mar. Biol. 165, 60. (doi:10.1007/s00227-018-3314-2)
- Glynn PW. 1996 Coral reef bleaching: facts, hypotheses and implications. Glob. Chang. Biol. 2, 495–509. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.1996. tb00063.x)
- 19. Bak RPM, Nieuwland G, Meesters EH. 2005 Coral reef crisis in deep and shallow reefs: 30 years of constancy and change in reefs of Curacao and Bonaire. *Coral Reefs* 24, 475–479. (doi:10.1007/s00338-005-0009-1)
- 20. Smith TB, Gyory J, Brandt ME, Miller WJ, Jossart J, Nemeth RS. 2016 Caribbean mesophotic coral ecosystems are unlikely climate change refugia. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 22, 2756–2765. (doi:10.1111/gcb.13175)
- 21. Sheppard CRC, Sheppard A, Mogg AOM, Bayley D, Dempsey AC, Roache R, Turner J, Purkis S. 2017 Coral bleaching and mortality in the Chagos Archipelago. *Atoll Res. Bull.* **163**, 1–26. (doi:10.5479/si.0077-5630.613)
- 22. Morais J, Santos BA. 2018 Limited potential of deep reefs to serve as refuges for tropical Southwestern Atlantic corals. *Ecosphere* 9, e02281. (doi:10.1002/ecs2.2281)
- 23. Schramek TA, Colin PL, Merrifield MA, Terrill EJ. 2018 Depth-dependent thermal stress around corals in the tropical Pacific Ocean. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **45**, 9739–9747. (doi:10.1029/2018GL078782)
- 24. Frade PR, Bongaerts P, Englebert N, Rogers A, Gonzalez-Rivero M, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2018 Deep reefs of the great barrier reef offer limited thermal refuge during mass coral bleaching. *Nat. Commun.* **9**, 3447. (doi:10.1038/s41467-018-05741-0)
- 25. Crosbie A, Bridge T, Jones G, Baird A. 2019 Response of reef corals and fish at Osprey Reef to a thermal anomaly across a 30 m depth gradient. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* **622**, 93–102. (doi:10.3354/meps13015)
- 26. Venegas RM, Oliver T, Liu G, Heron SF, Clark SJ, Pomeroy N, Young C, Eakin CM, Brainard RE. 2019 The rarity of depth refugia from coral bleaching heat stress in the Western and Central Pacific Islands. *Sci. Rep.* **9**, 19710. (doi:10.1038/s41598-019-56232-1)
- 27. Pérez-Rosales G, Rouzé H, Torda G, Bongaerts P, Pichon M, Parravicini V, Hédouin L, Under The Pole Consortium. 2021 Mesophotic coral communities escape thermal coral bleaching in French Polynesia. *R. Soc. Open Sci.* **8**, 210139. (doi:10.1098/rsos.210139)
- Roberts TE, Bridge TCL, Caley MJ, Madin JS, Baird AH. 2019 Resolving the depth zonation paradox in reef-building corals. *Ecology* 100, 1–8. (doi:10.1002/ecy.2761)
- 29. Rocha LA, Pinheiro HT, Shepherd B, Papastamatiou YP, Luiz OJ, Pyle RL, Bongaerts P. 2018 Mesophotic coral ecosystems are threatened and ecologically distinct from shallow water reefs. *Science* **361**, 281–284. (doi:10.1126/science.aaq1614)

- 30. Bongaerts P, Riginos C, Brunner R, Englebert N, Smith SR, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2017 Deep reefs are not universal refuges: reseeding potential varies among coral species. *Sci. Adv.* **3**, e1602373. (doi:10.1126/sciadv.1602373)
- 31. Brazeau DA, Lesser MP, Slattery M. 2013 Genetic structure in the coral, *Montastraea cavernosa*: assessing genetic differentiation among and within mesophotic reefs. *PLoS One* **8**, e65845. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0065845)
- 32. van Hooidonk R, Maynard J, Tamelander J, Gove J, Ahmadia G, Raymundo L, Williams G, Heron SF, Planes S. 2016 Local-scale projections of coral reef futures and implications of the Paris agreement. *Sci. Rep.* **6**, 39666. (doi:10.1038/srep39666)
- 33. Heron SF, Maynard JA, van Hooidonk R, Eakin CM. 2016 Warming trends and bleaching stress of the world's coral reefs 1985–2012. *Sci. Rep.* **6**, 38402. (doi:10.1038/srep38402)
- 34. Genner MJ, Freer JJ, Rutterford LA.2017 Future of the sea: biological responses to ocean warming. In *Foresight* pp. 1–30. Government Office for Science.
- 35. Eakin CM et al. 2022 The 2014-17 global coral bleaching event: the most severe and widespread coral Reef destruction. Preprint. See https://www.researchsquare.com/article/rs-1555992/v1
- 36. Eakin CM, Liu G, Gomez AM, Cour JL, Heron FS, WiJ S. 2017 The witch is dead (?)—three years of global coral bleaching 2014–2017. *Reef Encounter* **32**, 33–38. (doi:10.53642/0GHN7156)
- 37. Connell JH. 1997 Disturbance and recovery of coral assemblages. Coral Reefs 16, S101–S113. (doi:10.1007/s003380050246)
- Donner SD, Rickbeil GJM, Heron SF. 2017 A new, high-resolution global mass coral bleaching database. *PLoS ONE*. (ed CR Voolstra), 12, e0175490. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0175490)
- 39. Frölicher TL, Fischer EM, Gruber N. 2018 Marine heatwaves under global warming. *Nature* **560**, 360–364. (doi:10.1038/s41586-018-0383-9)
- 40. Hughes TP et al. 2018 Spatial and temporal patterns of mass bleaching of corals in the Anthropocene. *Science* **359**, 80–83. (doi:10.1126/science.aan8048)
- Head CEI, Bayley DTI, Rowlands G, Roche RC, Tickler DM, Rogers AD, Koldewey H, Turner JR, Andradi-Brown DA. 2019 Coral bleaching impacts from back-to-back 2015–2016 thermal anomalies in the remote central Indian Ocean. *Coral Reefs*. 38, 605–618. (doi:10.1007/s00338-019-01821-9)
- Oliver J, Berkelmans R, Eakin CM. 2018 Coral bleaching in space and time. In *Coral bleaching: patterns, processes, causes and consequences*. Ecological Studies, vol. 205 (eds MJH van Oppen, JM Lough), pp. 21–39. Berlin, Germany: Springer International Publishing. (doi:10.1007/978-3-540-69775-6)
- 43. Osborne K, Thompson AA, Cheal AJ, Emslie MJ, Johns KA, Jonker MJ, Logan M, Miller IR, Sweatman HPA. 2017 Delayed coral recovery in a warming ocean. *Glob. Change Biol.* 23, 3869–3881. (doi:10.1111/gcb.13707)
- Gilman SE, Urban MC, Tewksbury J, Gilchrist GW, Holt RD. 2010 A framework for community interactions under climate change. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* 25, 325–331. (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2010.03.002)
- Schmitt RJ, Holbrook SJ, Davis SL, Brooks AJ, Adam TC. 2019 Experimental support for alternative attractors on coral reefs. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 116, 4372–4381. (doi:10.1073/pnas.1812412116)
- Dornelas M, Gotelli NJ, McGill B, Shimadzu H, Moyes F, Sievers C, Magurran AE. 2014 Assemblage time series reveal biodiversity change but not systematic loss. Science 344, 296–299. (doi:10.1126/science.1248484)
- 47. Reverter M, Helber SB, Rohde S, de Goeij JM, Schupp PJ. 2022 Coral reef benthic community changes in the Anthropocene: biogeographic heterogeneity, overlooked configurations, and methodology. *Glob. Change Biol.* 28, 1956–1971. (doi:10.1111/gcb.16034)
- Lange ID et al. 2021 Wave exposure shapes reef community composition and recovery trajectories at a remote coral atoll. Coral Reefs 40, 1819– 1829. (doi:10.1007/s00338-021-02184-w)
- Benkwitt CE, Wilson SK, Graham NAJ. 2019 Seabird nutrient subsidies alter patterns of algal abundance and fish biomass on coral reefs following a bleaching event. *Glob. Change Biol.* 25, 2619–2632. (doi:10.1111/gcb.14643)
- Bell JJ, Bennett HM, Rovellini A, Webster NS. 2018 Sponges to be winners under near-future climate scenarios. *BioScience* 68, 955–968. (doi: 10.1093/biosci/biy142)
- Tebbett SB, Connolly SR, Bellwood DR. 2023 Benthic composition changes on coral reefs at global scales. Nat. Ecol. Evol. 7, 71–81. (doi:10.1038/ s41559-022-01937-2)
- 52. Wee HB, Reimer JD, Safuan M, Saidin J, Tan CH, Bachok Z. 2017 Zoantharian abundance in coral reef benthic communities at Terengganu Islands, Malaysia. *Reg. Stud. Mar. Sci.* **12**, 58–63. (doi:10.1016/j.rsma.2017.02.005)
- 53. Cornwall CE *et al.* 2023 Crustose coralline algae can contribute more than corals to coral reef carbonate production. *Commun. Earth Environ.* **4**, 1–12. (doi:10.1038/s43247-023-00766-w)
- Courtney TA, Barkley HC, Chan S, Couch CS, Kindinger TL, Oliver TA, Kriegman DJ, Andersson AJ. 2022 Rapid assessments of Pacific Ocean net coral reef carbonate budgets and net calcification following the 2014–2017 global coral bleaching event. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 67, 1687–1700. (doi:10.1002/lno.12159)
- 55. Magel JMT, Burns JHR, Gates RD, Baum JK. 2019 Effects of bleaching-associated mass coral mortality on reef structural complexity across a gradient of local disturbance. *Sci. Rep.* 9, 2512. (doi:10.1038/s41598-018-37713-1)
- 56. Elliott JA, Patterson MR, Staub CG, Koonjul M, Elliott SM. 2018 Decline in coral cover and flattening of the reefs around Mauritius (1998–2010). *PeerJ*. **6**, e6014. (doi:10.7717/peerj.6014)
- 57. Cornwall CE et al. 2021 Global declines in coral reef calcium carbonate production under ocean acidification and warming. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **118**, e2015265118. (doi:10.1073/pnas.2015265118)

- Molina-Hernández A, González-Barrios FJ, Perry CT, Álvarez-Filip L. 2020 Two decades of carbonate budget change on shifted coral reef assemblages: are these reefs being locked into low net budget states? *Proc. Biol. Sci.* 287, 20202305. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2020.2305)
- Richardson LE, Graham NAJ, Pratchett MS, Eurich JG, Hoey AS. 2018 Mass coral bleaching causes biotic homogenization of reef fish assemblages. *Glob. Change Biol.* 24, 3117–3129. (doi:10.1111/gcb.14119)
- 60. Robinson JPW, Wilson SK, Jennings S, Graham NAJ. 2019 Thermal stress induces persistently altered coral reef fish assemblages. *Glob. Change Biol.* 25, 2739–2750. (doi:10.1111/gcb.14704)
- 61. Eddy TD, Lam VWY, Reygondeau G, Cisneros-Montemayor AM, Greer K, Palomares MLD, Bruno JF, Ota Y, Cheung WWL. 2021 Global decline in capacity of coral reefs to provide ecosystem services. One Earth 4, 1278–1285. (doi:10.1016/j.oneear.2021.08.016)
- Woodhead AJ, Hicks CC, Norström AV, Williams GJ, Graham NAJ. 2019 Coral reef ecosystem services in the Anthropocene. Funct. Ecol. 33, 1023– 1034. (doi:10.1111/1365-2435.13331)
- Darling ES et al. 2019 Social-environmental drivers inform strategic management of coral reefs in the Anthropocene. Nat. Ecol. Evol. 3, 1341– 1350. (doi:10.1038/s41559-019-0953-8)
- 64. González-Barrios FJ, Cabral-Tena RA, Alvarez-Filip L. 2021 Recovery disparity between coral cover and the physical functionality of reefs with impaired coral assemblages. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 27, 640–651. (doi:10.1111/gcb.15431)
- 65. McWilliam M, Pratchett MS, Hoogenboom MO, Hughes TP. 2020 Deficits in functional trait diversity following recovery on coral reefs. *Proc. Biol. Sci.* **287**, 20192628. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2019.2628)
- 66. McClanahan TR, Ateweberhan M, Darling ES, Graham NAJ, Muthiga NA. 2014 Biogeography and change among regional coral communities across the Western Indian Ocean. *PLoS One* **9**, e93385. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0093385)
- 67. Ford HV, Gove JM, Davies AJ, Graham NAJ, Healey JR, Conklin EJ, Williams GJ. 2021 Spatial scaling properties of coral reef benthic communities. *Ecography* **44**, 188–198. (doi:10.1111/ecog.05331)
- Edmunds PJ, Leichter JJ. 2016 Spatial scale-dependent vertical zonation of coral reef community structure in French Polynesia. *Ecosphere* 7, 1– 14. (doi:10.1002/ecs2.1342)
- 69. Sannassy Pilly S, Richardson LE, Turner JR, Roche RC. 2022 Atoll-dependent variation in depth zonation of benthic communities on remote reefs. *Mar. Environ. Res.* **173**, 105520. (doi:10.1016/j.marenvres.2021.105520)
- Levin SA. 1992 The problem of pattern and scale in ecology: the Robert H. MacArthur award lecture. *Ecology* 73, 1943–1967. (doi:10.2307/1941447)
- McClanahan TR, Weil E, Cortés J, Baird AH, Ateweberhan M. 2009 Consequences of coral bleaching for Sessile Reef organisms. In *Coral bleaching: patterns, processes, causes and consequences* (eds MJH van Oppen, JM Lough), pp. 121–138. Berlin, Germany: Springer. (doi:10.1007/978-3-540-69775-6)
- McClanahan TR. 2020 Coral community life histories and population Dynamics driven by seascape Bathymetry and temperature variability. In Advances in marine biology (ed. BM Riegl), pp. 291–330, vol. 87. Burlington, VT: Academic Press. See https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/ article/pii/S0065288120300353
- Marshall PA, Baird AH. 2000 Bleaching of corals on the Great Barrier Reef: differential susceptibilities among taxa. Coral Reefs 19, 155–163. (doi:10.1007/s003380000086)
- Dalton SJ, Carroll AG, Sampayo E, Roff G, Harrison PL, Entwistle K, Huang Z, Salih A, Diamond SL. 2020 Successive marine heatwaves cause disproportionate coral bleaching during a fast phase transition from El Niño to La Niña. *Sci. Total. Environ.* **715**, 136951. (doi:10.1016/j. scitotenv.2020.136951)
- McClanahan TR et al. 2020 Highly variable taxa-specific coral bleaching responses to thermal stresses. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 648, 135–151. (doi: 10.3354/meps13402)
- Reid EC, DeCarlo TM, Cohen AL, Wong GTF, Lentz SJ, Safaie A, Hall A, Davis KA. 2019 Internal waves influence the thermal and nutrient environment on a shallow coral reef. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 64, 1949–1965. (doi:10.1002/lno.11162)
- 77. Fox MD, Guillaume-Castel R, Edwards CB, Glanz J, Gove JM, Green JAM, Juhlin E, Smith JE, Williams GJ. 2023 Ocean currents magnify upwelling and deliver nutritional subsidies to reef-building corals during El Niño heatwaves. *Sci. Adv.* **9**, eadd5032. (doi:10.1126/sciadv.add5032)
- 78. Bridge TCL, Hoey AS, Campbell SJ, Muttaqin E, Rudi E, Fadli N, Baird AH. 2013 Depth-dependent mortality of reef corals following a severe bleaching event: implications for thermal refuges and population recovery. *F1000Res*. **2**, 187. (doi:10.12688/f1000research.2-187.v3)
- Bridge TCL, Ferrari R, Bryson M, Hovey R, Figueira WF, Williams SB, Pizarro O, Harborne AR, Byrne M. 2014 Variable responses of benthic communities to anomalously warm sea temperatures on a high-latitude coral reef. *PLoS One* 9, e113079. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0113079)
- 80. de Bakker DM, van Duyl FC, Bak RPM, Nugues MM, Nieuwland G, Meesters EH. 2017 40 Years of benthic community change on the Caribbean reefs of Curaçao and Bonaire: the rise of slimy cyanobacterial mats. *Coral Reefs* **36**, 355–367. (doi:10.1007/s00338-016-1534-9)
- Sheppard CRC. 1999 Corals of Chagos, and the Biogeographical role of Chagos in the Indian Ocean. In *Ecology of the Chagos Archipelago* (eds CRC Sheppard, MRD Seaward), pp. 53–66. The Linnean Society of London. Mansfield, UK: Westbury Publishing.
- 82. Goatley CHR, Bellwood DR. 2011 The roles of dimensionality, canopies and complexity in ecosystem monitoring. *PLoS One* **6**, e27307. (doi:10. 1371/journal.pone.0027307)
- 83. Kohler KE, Gill SM. 2006 Coral Point Count with Excel extensions (CPCe): a visual basic program for the determination of coral and substrate coverage using random point count methodology. *Comput. Geosci.* **32**, 1259–1269. (doi:10.1016/j.cageo.2005.11.009)
- 84. Suchley A. 2014 Video data analysis of coral community structure on the Reef slopes of the Atolls of the Chagos archipelago British Indian ocean territory. thesis. Bangor University, School of Ocean Sciences.

- 85. Denis V, Ribas-Deulofeu L, Sturaro N, Kuo CY, Chen CA. 2017 A functional approach to the structural complexity of coral assemblages based on colony morphological features. *Sci. Rep.* **7**, 9849. (doi:10.1038/s41598-017-10334-w)
- NOAA CRED. 2014 Benthic percent cover derived from image analysis for selected locations in the Pacific Ocean. See https://www.coris.noaa.gov/metadata/records/faq/CRED\_ImageAnalysis.html
- Carballo-Bolaños R, Soto D, Chen CA. 2020 Thermal stress and resilience of corals in a climate-changing world. J. Mar. Sci. Eng. 8, 15. (doi:10.3390/jmse8010015)
- Slattery M, Pankey MS, Lesser MP. 2019 Annual thermal stress increases a soft coral's susceptibility to bleaching. Sci. Rep. 9, 8064. (doi:10.1038/s41598-019-44566-9)
- 89. Cornwall CE, Diaz-Pulido G, Comeau S. Impacts of ocean warming on coralline algal calcification: meta-analysis, knowledge gaps, and key recommendations for future research. *Front. Mar. Sci* **6**, 186. (doi:10.3389/fmars.2019.00186)
- Chaves-Fonnegra A, Riegl B, Zea S, Lopez JV, Smith T, Brandt M, Gilliam DS. 2018 Bleaching events regulate shifts from corals to excavating sponges in algae-dominated reefs. *Glob. Change Biol.* 24, 773–785. (doi:10.1111/gcb.13962)
- Côté IM, Gill JA, Gardner TA, Watkinson AR. 2005 Measuring coral reef decline through meta-analyses. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond. B. Biol. Sci. B* 360, 385–395. (doi:10.1098/rstb.2004.1591)
- 92. Côté IM, Gardner TA, Gill JA, Hutchinson DJ, Watkinson AR. 2006 New approaches to estimating recent ecological changes on coral reefs. In *Coral reef conservation* (eds IM Cote, JD Reynolds), pp. 293–313, Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press. (doi:10.1017/CB09780511804472)
- 93. Wickham H. 2016 ggplot2: elegant graphics for data analysis journal of statistical software. New York, NY: Springer-Verlag. See http://link. springer.com/10.1007/978-3-319-24277-4
- 94. NOAA Coral Reef Watch. 2018 NOAA coral reef watch version 3.1 daily global 5km satellite coral bleaching degree heating week product, Jan 1, 2013-Jan 1, 2019. College Park, MD: NOAA Coral Reef Watch. See https://www.star.nesdis.noaa.gov/pub/sod/mecb/crw/data/5km/v3.1\_op/nc/v1.0/daily/dhw/
- 95. Pierce D. 2021 ncdf4: Interface to Unidata netCDF (Version 4 or Earlier) Format Data Files. R package version 1.19. See https://CRAN.R-project.org/ package=ncdf4
- 96. Hijmans RJ. 2021 raster: geographic data analysis and modeling. R package version 3.5-11. See https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=raster
- 97. Bivand R, Keitt T, RowlingsonR. 2021 rgdal: bindings for the 'geospatial' data abstraction library. R package version 1.5-28. See https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=rgdal
- 98. Pebesma EJ, Bivand RS. 2005 Classes and methods for spatial data in R. R News. 5, 9–13.
- Ceccarelli DM, Evans RD, Logan M, Mantel P, Puotinen M, Petus C, Russ GR, Williamson DH. 2020 Long-term dynamics and drivers of coral and macroalgal cover on inshore reefs of the Great Barrier Reef Marine Park. *Ecol. Appl.* **30**, e02008. (doi:10.1002/eap.2008)
- Claar DC, Szostek L, McDevitt-Irwin JM, Schanze JJ, Baum JK. 2018 Global patterns and impacts of El Niño events on coral reefs: a meta-analysis. PLoS One 13, e0190957. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0190957)
- Harrison HB, Álvarez-Noriega M, Baird AH, Heron SF, MacDonald C, Hughes TP. 2019 Back-to-back coral bleaching events on isolated atolls in the Coral Sea. Coral Reefs. 38, 713–719. (doi:10.1007/s00338-018-01749-6)
- Liu G et al. 2014 Reef-scale thermal stress monitoring of coral ecosystems: new 5-km global products from NOAA coral reef watch. *Remote Sens*.
   6, 11 579–11 606. (doi:10.3390/rs61111579)
- Guillaume-Castel R, Williams GJ, Rogers JS, Gove JM, Green JAM. 2021 Quantifying upwelling in tropical shallow waters: a novel method using a temperature stratification index. *Limnol. Oceanogr. Meth.* 19, 566–577. (doi:10.1002/lom3.10449)
- Diaz C, Foster NL, Attrill MJ, Bolton A, Ganderton P, Howell KL, Robinson E, Hosegood P. 2023 Mesophotic coral bleaching associated with changes in thermocline depth. *Nat. Commun.* 14, 6528. (doi:10.1038/s41467-023-42279-2)
- McClanahan TR, Ateweberhan M, Ruiz Sebastián C, Graham NAJ, Wilson SK, Bruggemann JH, Guillaume MMM. 2007 Predictability of coral bleaching from synoptic satellite and in situ temperature observations. *Coral Reefs* 26, 695–701. (doi:10.1007/s00338-006-0193-7)
- Oksanen AJ, Blanchet FG, Kindt R, Legen P, Minchin PR, Hara RBO, et al. 2012 Vegna: community Ecology package. R package version 2.6-4. See https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/vegan/index.html
- De Cáceres M, Legendre P, He F. 2013 Dissimilarity measurements and the size structure of ecological communities. *Methods Ecol. Evol.* 4, 1167–1177. (doi:10.1111/2041-210X.12116)
- 108. Bürkner PC. Advanced Bayesian multilevel modeling with the R Package brms. RJ. 10, 395. (doi:10.32614/RJ-2018-017)
- Gelman A, Carlin JB, Stern HS, Dunson DB, Vehtari A, Rubin DB. 2013 bayesplot: Bayesian data analysis. See https://www.taylorfrancis.com/ books/9781439898208
- 110. Gabry J, Mahr T. 2017 bayesplot: plotting for Bayesian models. See http://mcstan.org/bayesplot
- 111. Kay M. 2022 tidybayes: tidy data and 'geoms' for Bayesian models. See https://github.com/mjskay/tidybayes/
- 112. Lenth RV. 2022 Emmeans: estimated marginal means, Aka least-squares means. R package version 1.7.2. See https://CRAN.R-project.org/ package=emmeans
- Robinson JPW, Wilson SK, Graham NAJ. 2019 Abiotic and biotic controls on coral recovery 16 years after mass bleaching. Coral Reefs. 38, 1255– 1265. (doi:10.1007/s00338-019-01831-7)
- 114. R Core Team. 2018 R: a language and environment for statistical computing. Vienna, Austria: R Foundation for Statistical Computing. See http:// www.r-project.org
- 115. Skirving WJ, Heron SF, Marsh BL, Liu G, De La Cour JL, Geiger EF, Eakin CM. 2019 The relentless march of mass coral bleaching: a global perspective of changing heat stress. *Coral Reefs* **38**, 547–557. (doi:10.1007/s00338-019-01799-4)

- 116. Hughes TP et al. 2019 Ecological memory modifies the cumulative impact of recurrent climate extremes. *Nature Clim. Change* 9, 40–43. (doi:10. 1038/s41558-018-0351-2)
- 117. Connell JH. 1978 Diversity in tropical rain forests and coral reefs. Science 199, 1302–1310. (doi:10.1126/science.199.4335.1302)
- 118. Kleypas JA, Mcmanus JW, Meñez LAB. 1999 Environmental limits to coral reef development: where do we draw the line? *Am. Zool.* **39**, 146–159. (doi:10.1093/icb/39.1.146)
- 119. Cooper TF, Uthicke S, Humphrey C, Fabricius KE. 2007 Gradients in water column nutrients, sediment parameters, irradiance and coral reef development in the Whitsunday Region, central Great Barrier Reef. *Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci.* **74**, 458–470. (doi:10.1016/j.ecss.2007.05.020)
- 120. Radice VZ, Hoegh-Guldberg O, Fry B, Fox MD, Dove SG. 2019 Upwelling as the major source of nitrogen for shallow and deep reef-building corals across an oceanic atoll system. *Funct. Ecol.* **33**, 1120–1134. (doi:10.1111/1365-2435.13314)
- 121. Sheppard C. 2009 Large temperature plunges recorded by data loggers at different depths on an Indian Ocean atoll: comparison with satellite data and relevance to coral refuges. *Coral Reefs* **28**, 399–403. (doi:10.1007/s00338-009-0476-x)
- 122. Wyatt ASJ, Leichter JJ, Toth LT, Miyajima T, Aronson RB, Nagata T. 2020 Heat accumulation on coral reefs mitigated by internal waves. *Nat. Geosci.* **13**, 28–34. (doi:10.1038/s41561-019-0486-4)
- 123. Lough JM, Oppen MJH. 2018 Introduction: coral bleaching–patterns, processes, causes and consequences. In *Coral bleaching: patterns, processes, causes and consequences* pp. 1–8. Berlin, Germany: Springer International Publishing. (doi:10.1007/978-3-540-69775-6)
- 124. Fabricius KE, Klumpp DW. 1995 Widespread mixotrophy in reef-inhabiting soft corals: the influence of depth, and colony expansion and contraction on photosynthesis. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* **125**, 195–204. (doi:10.3354/meps125195)
- 125. Fox MD, Williams GJ, Johnson MD, Radice VZ, Zgliczynski BJ, Kelly ELA, Rohwer FL, Sandin SA, Smith JE. 2018 Gradients in primary production predict trophic strategies of mixotrophic corals across spatial scales. *Curr. Biol.* **28**, 3355–3363. (doi:10.1016/j.cub.2018.08.057)
- 126. Maucieri DG, Baum JK. 2021 Impacts of heat stress on soft corals, an overlooked and highly vulnerable component of coral reef ecosystems, at a central equatorial Pacific atoll. *Biol. Conserv.* 262, 109328. (doi:10.1016/j.biocon.2021.109328)
- 127. Cerutti JMB, Burt AJ, Haupt P, Bunbury N, Mumby PJ, Schaepman-Strub G. 2020 Impacts of the 2014–2017 global bleaching event on a protected remote atoll in the Western Indian Ocean. *Coral Reefs* **39**, 15–26. (doi:10.1007/s00338-019-01853-1)
- Madin JS, Connolly SR. 2006 Ecological consequences of major hydrodynamic disturbances on coral reefs. *Nature* 444, 477–480. (doi:10.1038/ nature05328)
- 129. Williams GJ, Smith JE, Conklin EJ, Gove JM, Sala E, Sandin SA. 2013 Benthic communities at two remote Pacific coral reefs: effects of reef habitat, depth, and wave energy gradients on spatial patterns. *PeerJ*. **1**, e81. (doi:10.7717/peerj.81)
- 130. Gove JM, Williams GJ, McManus MA, Clark SJ, Ehses JS, Wedding LM. 2015 Coral reef benthic regimes exhibit non-linear threshold responses to natural physical drivers. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* **522**, 33–48. (doi:10.3354/meps11118)
- 131. Donovan MK, Burkepile DE, Kratochwill C, Shlesinger T, Sully S, Oliver TA, Hodgson G, Freiwald J, van Woesik R. 2021 Local conditions magnify coral loss after marine heatwaves. *Science* **372**, 977–980. (doi:10.1126/science.abd9464)
- 132. Darling ES, Côté IM. 2018 Seeking resilience in marine ecosystems. Science 359, 986–987. (doi:10.1126/science.aas9852)
- 133. Roche RC, Williams GJ, Turner JR. 2018 Towards developing a mechanistic understanding of coral reef resilience to thermal stress across multiple scales. *Curr. Clim. Change Rep.* **4**, 51–64. (doi:10.1007/s40641-018-0087-0)
- 134. Guest JR, Baird AH, Maynard JA, Muttaqin E, Edwards AJ, Campbell SJ, Yewdall K, Affendi YA, Chou LM. 2012 Contrasting patterns of coral bleaching susceptibility in 2010 suggest an adaptive response to thermal stress. *PLoS One* **7**, e33353. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0033353)
- Maynard JA, Anthony KRN, Marshall PA, Masiri I. 2008 Major bleaching events can lead to increased thermal tolerance in corals. *Mar. Biol.* 155, 173–182. (doi:10.1007/s00227-008-1015-y)
- 136. Rowan R. 2004 Coral bleaching: thermal adaptation in reef coral symbionts. *Nature* **430**, 742–742. (doi:10.1038/430742a)
- 137. Wham DC, Ning G, LaJeunesse TC. 2017 Symbiodinium glynnii sp. nov., a species of stress-tolerant symbiotic dinoflagellates from pocilloporid and montiporid corals in the Pacific Ocean. Phycologia 56, 396–409. (doi:10.2216/16-86.1)
- 138. Jones AM, Berkelmans R, van Oppen MJH, Mieog JC, Sinclair W. 2008 A community change in the algal endosymbionts of a scleractinian coral following a natural bleaching event: field evidence of acclimatization. *Proc. Biol. Sci.* **275**, 1359–1365. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2008.0069)
- Keshavmurthy S, Meng PJ, Wang JT, Kuo CY, Yang SY, Hsu CM, Gan CH, Dai CF, Chen CA. 2014 Can resistant coral-Symbiodinium associations enable coral communities to survive climate change? A study of A site exposed to long-term hot water input. *PeerJ.* 2, e327. (doi:10.7717/ peerj.327)
- 140. Carballo JL, Bautista E, Nava H, Cruz-Barraza JA, Chávez JA. 2013 Boring sponges, an increasing threat for coral reefs affected by bleaching events. *Ecol. Evol.* **3**, 872–886. (doi:10.1002/ece3.452)
- 141. Sheppard CRC, Spalding M, Bradshaw C, Wilson S. 2002 Erosion vs. recovery of coral reefs after 1998 El Niño: Chagos reefs, Indian Ocean. *AMBIO* **31**, 40–48. (doi:10.1579/0044-7447-31.1.40)
- 142. Fang JKH, Schönberg CHL, Hoegh-Guldberg O, Dove S. 2016 Day-night ecophysiology of the photosymbiotic bioeroding sponge Cliona orientalis Thiele, 1900. *Mar. Biol.* **163**, 100. (doi:10.1007/s00227-016-2848-4)
- 143. Rützler K. 2002 Impact of crustose clionid sponges on Caribbean reef corals. Acta Geol. Hisp **37**, 61–72. https://raco.cat/index.php/ ActaGeologica/article/view/75734
- 144. Page TM, Bergstrom E, Diaz-Pulido G. Acclimation history of elevated temperature reduces the tolerance of coralline algae to additional acute thermal stress. *Front. Mar. Sci.* 8. (doi:10.3389/fmars.2021.660196)
- 145. Kennedy E, Ordoñez A, Lewis B, Diaz-Pulido G. 2017 Comparison of recruitment tile materials for monitoring coralline algae responses to a changing climate. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* **569**, 129–144.

- 146. Taylor BM, Benkwitt CE, Choat H, Clements KD, Graham NAJ, Meekan MG. 2020 Synchronous biological feedbacks in parrotfishes associated with pantropical coral bleaching. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 26, 1285–1294. (doi:10.1111/gcb.14909)
- 147. Mumby PJ, Steneck RS. 2008 Coral reef management and conservation in light of rapidly evolving ecological paradigms. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* 23, 555–563. (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2008.06.011)
- 148. Gouezo M, Golbuu Y, Fabricius K, Olsudong D, Mereb G, Nestor V, Wolanski E, Harrison P, Doropoulos C. 2019 Drivers of recovery and reassembly of coral reef communities. *Proc. Biol. Sci. B* 286, 20182908. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2018.2908)
- 149. Gudka M, Obura D, Mbugua J, Ahamada S, Kloiber U, Holter T. 2020 Participatory reporting of the 2016 bleaching event in the Western Indian Ocean. *Coral Reefs* **39**, 1–11. (doi:10.1007/s00338-019-01851-3)
- 150. Koester A, Migani V, Bunbury N, Ford A, Sanchez C, Wild C. 2020 Early trajectories of benthic coral reef communities following the 2015/16 coral bleaching event at remote Aldabra Atoll, Seychelles. *Sci. Rep.* **10**, 17034. (doi:10.1038/s41598-020-74077-x)
- 151. Gudka M, Obura D, Mwaura J, Porter S, Yahya S, Mabwa R.2018 Impact of the 3rd global coral bleaching event on the Western Indian Ocean, Global Coral Reef Monitoring Network (GCRMN)/Indian Ocean Commission. Global Coral Reef Monitoring Network (GCRMN)/Indian Ocean Commission.
- 152. Riegl B, Glynn PW, Banks S, Keith I, Rivera F, Vera-Zambrano M, D'Angelo C, Wiedenmann J. 2019 Heat attenuation and nutrient delivery by localized upwelling avoided coral bleaching mortality in northern Galapagos during 2015/2016 ENSO. *Coral Reefs* **38**, 773–785. (doi:10.1007/s00338-019-01787-8)
- 153. Graham NAJ, Pratchett MS, McClanahan TR, Wilson SK. 2013 The status of coral Reef fish assemblages in the Chagos archipelago, with implications for protected area management and climate change. In *Coral reefs of the United Kingdom overseas territories coral reefs of the world* (ed. CRC Sheppard), pp. 253–270. Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Springer. (doi:10.1007/978-94-007-5965-7)
- 154. Samoilys M, Roche R, Koldewey H, Turner J. 2018 Patterns in reef fish assemblages: insights from the Chagos Archipelago. *PLoS One* **13**, e0191448. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0191448)
- 155. Mumby PJ. 2009 Herbivory versus corallivory: are parrotfish good or bad for Caribbean coral reefs? *Coral Reefs* 28, 683–690. (doi:10.1007/ s00338-009-0501-0)
- Sheppard CRC, et al. 2013 Coral reefs of the Chagos archipelago, Indian ocean. In Coral reefs of the United Kingdom Overseas Territories (ed. CRC Sheppard), pp. 241–252. Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Springer. (doi:10.1007/978-94-007-5965-7)
- Johns KA, Osborne KO, Logan M. 2014 Contrasting rates of coral recovery and reassembly in coral communities on the Great Barrier Reef. Coral Reefs 33, 553–563. (doi:10.1007/s00338-014-1148-z)
- 158. Sheppard CRC, Sheppard A, Fenner D. 2020 Coral mass mortalities in the Chagos Archipelago over 40 years: regional species and assemblage extinctions and indications of positive feedbacks. *Mar. Pollut. Bull.* **154**, 111075. (doi:10.1016/j.marpolbul.2020.111075)
- Lange ID, Perry CT, Stuhr M. 2023 Recovery trends of reef carbonate budgets at remote coral atolls 6 years post-bleaching. *Limnol. Oceanogr* 68, 701–712. (doi:10.1002/lno.12066)
- Fox MD et al. 2019 Limited coral mortality following acute thermal stress and widespread bleaching on Palmyra Atoll, central Pacific. *Coral Reefs* 38, 701–712. (doi:10.1007/s00338-019-01796-7)
- Smith TB, Glynn PW, Maté JL, Toth LT, Gyory J. 2014 A depth refugium from catastrophic coral bleaching prevents regional extinction. *Ecology* 95, 1663–1673. (doi:10.1890/13-0468.1)
- 162. Sannassy Pilly S, Roche RC, Richardson LE, Turner JR. 2024 Data from: Depth variation in Benthic community response to repeated marine heatwaves on remote central Indian ocean reefs [Dataset]. Dryad Digital Repository. (doi:10.5061/dryad.mw6m9062r)
- Sannassy Pilly S, Roche R, Richardson LE, Turner J. 2024 Data from: Depth variation in benthic community response to repeated marine heatwaves on remote Central Indian Ocean reefs. Figshare. (doi:10.6084/m9.figshare.c.7103075)