

Nonlinear responses in interannual variability of lake ice to climate change

Richardson, David C.; Filazzola, Alessandro; Woolway, R. lestyn; Imrit, M. Arshad: Bouffard, Damien: Weyhenmeyer, Gesa A.: Magnuson, John: Sharma, Sapna

Limnology and Oceanography

DOI: 10.1002/Ino.12527

Published: 01/04/2024

Peer reviewed version

Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication

Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA): Richardson, D. C., Filazzola, A., Woolway, R. I., Imrit, M. A., Bouffard, D., Weyhenmeyer, G. A., Magnuson, J., & Sharma, S. (2024). Nonlinear responses in interannual variability of lake ice to climate change. *Limnology and Oceanography*, *69*(4), 789-801. https://doi.org/10.1002/lno.12527

Hawliau Cyffredinol / General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain

- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

1	Non-linear responses in interannual variability of lake ice to climate change
2	
3	David C. Richardson ¹ ¶*, Alessandro Filazzola ^{2,3*} , R. Iestyn Woolway ⁴ , M. Arshad Imrit ³ ,
4	Damien Bouffard ^{5,6} , Gesa A. Weyhenmeyer ⁷ , John Magnuson ⁸ , Sapna Sharma ³
5	
6	¹ Biology Department, SUNY New Paltz, New Paltz NY USA, ORCID: 0000-0001-9374-9624
7	² Apex Resource Management Solutions, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada. AF ORCID: 0000-0001-
8	6544-2035
9	³ Department of Biology, York University, 4700 Keele Street, Toronto, Ontario, Canada,
10	M3J1P3, SS: ORCID: 0000-0003-4571-2768
11	⁴ School of Ocean Sciences, Bangor University, Menai Bridge, Anglesey, Wales ORCID: 0000-
12	0003-0498-7968
13	⁵ Department of Surface Waters – Research and Management, Eawag (Swiss Federal Institute of
14	Aquatic Science and Technology), Kastanienbaum, Switzerland. ORCID: 0000-0002-2005-9718
15	⁶ Institute of Earth Surface Dynamics, Faculty of Geosciences and Environment, University of
16	Lausanne, Lausanne, Switzerland
17	⁷ Department of Ecology and Genetics/Limnology, Uppsala University, Norbyvägen 18D, 75236
18	Uppsala, Sweden, ORCID: 0000-0002-4013-2281
19	⁸ Center for Limnology, University of Wisconsin-Madison 680 North Park Street, Madison,
20	Wisconsin, USA, 53706
21	*Joint first authors
22	[¶] Corresponding author: richardsond@newpaltz.edu
23	
24	Running head: Variability in lake ice
25	
26	Keywords: climate change, interannual variability, ice cover, extreme events, ice-free,
27	freshwater, variation, predictions
28	
29	

30 Abstract

31 Climate change is contributing to rapid changes in lake ice cover across the Northern 32 Hemisphere, thereby impacting local communities and ecosystems. Using lake ice cover time-33 series spanning over 87 years for 43 lakes across the Northern Hemisphere, we found that the 34 interannual variability in ice duration, measured as standard deviation, significantly increased in 35 only half of our studied lakes. We observed that the interannual variability in ice duration peaked 36 when lakes were, on average, covered by ice for about one month while both longer and shorter 37 long-term mean ice cover duration resulted in lower interannual variability in ice duration. These 38 results demonstrate that the ice cover duration can become so short that the interannual 39 variability rapidly declines. The interannual variability in ice duration showed a strong 40 dependency on global temperature anomalies and teleconnections, such as the North Atlantic 41 Oscillation (NAO) and El Niño-Southern Oscillation. We conclude that many lakes across the 42 Northern Hemisphere will experience a decline in interannual ice cover variability and shift to 43 open water during the winter under a continued global warming trend which will affect lake 44 biological, cultural, and economic processes.

45

46 Statement of Significance

47 Lake ice is an important resource for the communities where it has historically been present supporting cultural activities, native biodiversity, and local economies. With climate change, ice 48 49 cover during the winter seasons is decreasing in lakes across the Northern Hemisphere with more 50 lakes experiencing ice-free winters or several freeze-melt cycles through the winter season, in 51 contrast to complete ice cover in past winters. However, our understanding of the patterns in 52 year-to-year changes in the length of ice cover needs improvement so that communities, citizens, 53 and managers can better plan for the next winter and help mitigate the impacts of climate change. 54 We explored patterns of ice variability in 43 lakes over 87 years. Year-to-year differences in ice 55 duration grow larger with the loss of ice from lakes due to climate change. When lakes decline to 56 one month in ice cover each winter, year-to-year differences decrease as lakes approach 57 permanent loss of ice. Ultimately, lakes in the northern hemisphere will both lose ice over time 58 and also have substantial year-to-year differences as lakes advance to ice-free winters in the 59 future with the potential to affect physical, chemical, and biological structure and function in 60 freshwater ecosystems.

63 Introduction

64 The variability of weather conditions is expected to increase under ongoing climate change with more extreme events occurring, including, for example heat waves, droughts, and 65 66 intensive precipitation events (e.g., Diffenbaugh et al. 2013; Pendergrass et al. 2017; Cook et al. 67 2018). Extreme events have deleterious effects on ecosystem goods and services such as storm 68 surges (e.g., Karim & Mimura 2008) or decreasing food security (e.g., Thornton et al. 2014). 69 Similarly, phenological observations in lakes such as the timing and duration of lake ice cover 70 have been predicted to increase in variability under climate change (e.g., Weyhenmeyer et al. 71 2011). However, phenological changes cannot continue interminably as a new stable state might 72 be reached, i.e., lakes might turn from being ice-covered to becoming ice-free (Sharma et al. 73 2019). Increasing variability may provide an early warning signal for reaching a new stable state 74 (Scheffer et al. 2009). Thus, documenting changes in the variability of ice cover is critical for 75 understanding how lakes are responding to climate change (Rühland et al. 2023), as ice on lakes 76 plays an important role in numerous physical and ecological lake processes in winter and 77 throughout the rest of each year (Hampton et al. 2017; Hébert et al. 2021; Jansen et al. 2021). 78 Changes in lake ice phenology (timing of ice-on and ice-off) have shortened lake ice 79 duration over the last century because of climatic variation (Magnuson et al. 2000; Newton & 80 Mullan 2021). Despite the consistent decrease in ice duration in lakes around the world, year-to-81 year variability in the length of ice cover remains high (Duguay et al. 2006; Wang et al. 2012) 82 with linear trends explaining < 30% of the overall variation (e.g., Wynne 2000; Benson et al. 83 2012). The extreme ice seasons could be driven by late freezes, early melts, multiple freeze-melt 84 events, or even no ice cover at all (Bernhardt et al. 2012; Higgins et al. 2021; Sharma et al. 85 2021b). These extremes, including ice-free seasons, are predicted to increase dramatically in the future for individual lakes (Robertson et al. 1992; Magee & Wu 2017) and regions of lakes in the 86 Northern Hemisphere (Sharma et al. 2021a; Wang et al. 2022). However, it is not yet clear which 87 88 lakes are most sensitive to high interannual variability with the recent rapid increase in ice loss 89 and which factors are driving interannual variability in lake ice (Brown & Duguay 2010). 90 Global anthropogenic climate change and teleconnections, large-scale climate linkages, 91 can affect local and regional weather patterns, especially, air temperature which is integrally

92 related to lake ice (Filazzola et al. 2020; Ghanbari et al. 2009; Imrit & Sharma 2021). With synergistic interactions between climate change and teleconnections, extremes and interannual 93 94 variability of air temperature are predicted to increase (IPCC 2021); thus, it is likely that the 95 duration of ice cover will also become increasingly variable with periodicity related to teleconnections (Wang et al. 2012). In past research, the interannual variability of ice has been 96 97 identified as predominantly increasing with shorter ice cover when examined at the annual, 98 decadal, and 20-year time scales (Kratz et al. 2000; Weyhenmeyer et al. 2011; Benson et al. 2012;). One exception is that when broken into two 50-year periods, ice duration variability 99 100 decreased in many lakes, especially across Europe (Benson et al. 2012). Ice duration has a finite 101 limit with the complete loss of ice, indicative of a non-linear relationship that supports previous 102 inconsistent results. Therefore, it is critical to understand the relationship between ice duration 103 and variability when trying to understand and predict the response of lake ice to global drivers of 104 regional weather like climate change and teleconnections.

105 Here, we explored patterns and drivers of lake ice variability in 43 Northern Hemisphere 106 lakes over the last 87 years, using a recently compiled database on lake ice phenology (Sharma et 107 al. 2022). We define interannual variability in ice as the calculated standard deviation or variance 108 of ice phenology duration over a series of years in a single lake. We asked three main questions: 109 1) what patterns emerge when examining the trends in ice variability over the past 87 years?; 2) 110 is there a consistent relationship between aspects of ice phenology (ice-on, ice-off, and duration) 111 and the variability observed in ice phenology across different lakes?; and 3) to what extent can 112 climate anomalies and teleconnections, recognized as global drivers of regional weather, explain 113 the fluctuations in ice duration amidst the observed decreasing ice trends? We hypothesized that 114 the interannual variability of ice phenology no longer significantly increases if ice duration 115 becomes too short, following a non-linear relationship The hypothesis implies that lake in lakes 116 in colder geographic regions would experience increasing interannual variability while lakes in 117 warmer geographical regions will experience a decrease in interannual variability. We also 118 hypothesized that warmer global temperatures in the Northern Hemisphere winter and 119 teleconnection indices, such as North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) and El Niño-Southern 120 Oscillation (ENSO), will significantly be related to the year-to-year variability in ice duration but 121 with distinct geographical differences (Livingstone 2000; Ghanbari et al. 2009; Bai et al. 2012; 122 Imrit & Sharma 2021).

124 Materials and Methods

125 *Ice duration and lake characteristics*

126 Using a database of 78 lakes with ice phenology records extending over 100 years 127 (Sharma et al. 2022), we selected 43 lakes based on records that included ice duration with more 128 than 65% of years with ice data, even if one or more winters were noted as ice-free (Table S1). 129 These lakes were found between 42.50° N and 65.60° N latitude spanning nine different countries (Fig. S1). We chose to examine records between 1931 and 2018 to encapsulate 130 131 contemporary ice patterns in the Northern Hemisphere with a sufficiently long time series for as 132 many lakes as possible (Table S1). Missing values for ice duration were uncommon in recent 133 decades, although a few of the lakes were missing ice duration in the years typically surrounding 134 world or local events (e.g., wars) that prevented data collection (Table S1; Sharma et al. 2022). 135 The ice phenology records included the duration of ice cover (in days), the geospatial 136 coordinates of the survey point (latitude and longitude), the lake name, and the winter year of ice 137 cover, i.e., a lake that froze in January 2000 would be assigned the winter year of 1999 as winter 138 encompasses two calendar years (i.e., 1999-2000). The database we used for ice phenology 139 records also included information on lake morphometry, such as surface area, maximum lake

140 141

142 *Weather and climate data*

depth, and elevation (Sharma et al. 2022).

143 We obtained the maximum winter air temperatures for December, January, and February 144 from the Climatic Research Unit (CRU) of East Anglia (Harris et al. 2020), which were downscaled to 0.5° x 0.5° grid cells. We acknowledge that the available climate data has 145 146 limitations in terms of resolution, which may result in lakes that are close together having the 147 same temperature value. However, we selected the Climate Research Unit (CRU) dataset as 148 having the finest spatial resolution while also providing annual climate patterns. Monthly temperature values were extracted for each year at every lake where data on ice duration was 149 150 available including years with no ice present. We obtained global climate and teleconnection 151 indices monthly for October through May, spanning the time frame of ice cover from the lakes in 152 this dataset. Global annual temperature anomalies (GTA) were obtained from the National 153 Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration averaged over land and ocean (NCEI 2020). We also

154 considered two teleconnection indices as potential drivers of local winter weather conditions. We

155 downloaded both North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) and El Niño-Southern Oscillation (ENSO)

156 monthly indices from the National Weather Service Climate Prediction Center (National

157 Weather Service 2020).

158

159 *Calculating variability in ice duration*

160 We chose ice duration for these analyses because we could appropriately quantify ice duration when a lake did not freeze (ice duration = 0 days), which is not possible with ice-on or 161 162 ice-off dates when a lake did not freeze. First, for visualization, we calculated a 10-year moving 163 average and Bollinger Bands, one rolling 10-year standard deviation above and below the 164 moving average, that can indicate the volatility of a time series (Bollinger 1992). We used 165 standard deviations to quantify variability patterns in ice duration. We applied 10-year rolling 166 standard deviations to account for variations included in major climate oscillations and 167 teleconnection patterns that happen periodically (Sharma & Magnuson 2014; Imrit & Sharma 168 2021). All analyses and visualizations were completed using R version 4.1.2 (R Core Team 169 2022) for this section and the rest of the manuscript.

170 While simple moving averages and rolling standard deviations can help understand 171 trends, the overlapping nature of the rolling windows results in high autocorrelation. 172 Additionally, choosing a single window for calculating variability can result in different 173 conclusions (e.g., Benson et al. 2012). As an alternative, we identified all sequential windows 174 between 4 and 30 years in length (26 versions of sequential windows) starting with 2018 and 175 moving backward to 1931. For example, a 16-year sequential window would encapsulate non-176 overlapping sets of 16 years (e.g., 2018 to 2003; 2002 to 1986) while a 4-year sequential window 177 would encapsulate non-overlapping sets of 4 years (e.g., 2018 to 2015; 2014 to 2011). For each 178 sequential window, we required a minimum of 75% of years having duration data; for those 179 windows, we calculated the mean (hereafter, duration mean), standard deviation (hereafter, 180 duration sd), and coefficient of variation (duration sd*100/duration mean). We also calculated 181 the year for each sequential window as the median of the start years in that window. 182

183 Trends in duration mean and duration sd

184 To determine whether a change in duration mean and sd occurred over the time series, 185 we calculated linear models based on the duration mean or sd for each sequential window size. 186 For example, with 10-year windows, there would be up to 9 duration means and duration sd 187 incorporated into the linear model. We used Theil-Sen median regressions (Komsta 2019) with 188 the duration mean or duration sd as the response variable and median year as the predictor. We 189 used a median-based regression because these methods are relatively robust to outliers, repeated 190 measures, and changes in the distributions as the sd would become right-skewed with an 191 increased number of years with no ice-cover (Siegel 1982). We calculated a slope for duration 192 mean and sd for all sequential window sizes.

193 To determine which drivers related to trends in duration sd, we chose trends calculated 194 with 17-year sequential windows because 17-year windows were the most represented when 195 evaluating median trends in duration sd. We modeled trends in duration sd using generalized 196 additive models (GAMs; Hastie & Tibshirani 1990; Wood 2017). We built candidate models 197 based on ice characteristics, winter air temperature, geomorphometry, and geography established 198 for each lake. For ice characteristics, we calculated the percent of ice-free years and the mean 199 duration length in days for each lake. For winter air temperature, we used the annual average daily maximum temperature from December, January, and February (DJF) for each lake. Over 200 201 all the years, we calculated the median DJF annual daily maximum temperature. We averaged 202 across the three winter months to use the mean winter temperature for all analyses. We chose to 203 summarize winter temperatures here to encapsulate the time period when most of these 204 geographically and morphologically diverse lakes are frozen in a year. For geomorphometry, we 205 used the surface area and maximum depth; both geomorphometry variables were log-206 transformed because of the several orders of magnitude spread (e.g., Lake Suwa is 7.6 m deep 207 while Lake Baikal is 1642 m deep). For geography, we used latitude, longitude, and elevation. 208 We fit increasingly complex GAMs using the 'mgcv' package (version 1.8-40; Wood 2017) and 209 ultimately selected the models that had statistically lower AIC and maximized deviance 210 explained using the *compareML* function in the '*itsadug*' package (van Rij et al. 2022). We 211 extracted all significant smooths for the selected GAM using the confint function in the 212 'schoenberg' package (Simpson 2018), visualized the smooths using the 'ggplot2 package 213 (Wickham 2016), and arranged the plots with '*patchwork*' package (Pedersen 2022).

215 *Relationship between ice phenology mean and sd*

We examined the difference in variability between the two different ice phenology metrics (ice-on and ice-off) that are used to calculate ice duration. For each lake, we applied a Theil-Sen median regressions (Komsta 2019) for both ice-on and ice-off and calculated the residuals for each year. We used those residuals to calculate two overall variances (ice-on and ice-off) and compared those two variances using an F-test.

221 To determine the relationship between ice phenology and variability, we calculated the 222 day of the year for ice-on and ice-off for each lake. We ignored years when the lakes did not 223 freeze for the winter since there are no ice-on or ice-off dates recorded for that year. We used 224 ice-on and ice-off means and sds calculated for every lake for all sequential windows (n = 4 to 30 225 years). To examine the shape of the relationship between mean and sd for each ice phenology variable, we fit GAM models (model: sd ~ mean with k = 7 knots possible) using the 'mgcv' 226 227 package (version 1.8-40; Wood 2017) for each of the sequential window sizes (n = 4 to 30 228 years). We assessed the effective degrees of freedom (edf) which reflects the degree of non-229 linearity of a curve: edf = 1 indicates linear relationship, edf up to 2 indicates weak non-linear 230 relationship, and edf > 2 indicates highly non-linear relationship. We also assessed the mean ice-231 on or ice-off date when the GAM curve was at a maximum.

232 We hypothesized that the relationship between duration and interannual variability of ice 233 phenology would follow a non-linear Shepherd equation (Eq. 1, Fig. 1a, Shepherd 1982). To 234 determine the relationship between ice duration and variability that matches our proposed 235 hypothesis (Fig. 1a), we used duration means and duration sd calculated for every lake for all sequential windows (n = 4 to 30 years). For each sequential window size, we fit a Shepherd 236 function (Eq. 1) between variables for duration mean (meanwindow) and duration sd (SDwindow) 237 238 which is the generalized form of Michaelis-Menten function with 3 different parameters (A, B, 239 C) that permits the function to be domed or unbounded with a non-zero asymptote (Eq. 1, Iles 240 1994). The Shepherd function appeared to be a good fit from the ice phenology GAM results 241 given that we could now include ice free years (duration = 0 days). We estimated the three 242 parameters using non-linear least-squares estimates. We calculated the peak of the curve using 243 the root of the first derivative of the Shepherd function and the inflection point using the root of 244 the second derivative (Iles 1994). To match with the hypothetical groups proposed in Fig. 1a, we 245 used a k-means clustering algorithm to identify clusters across all the individual sequential

window sizes. We ran the algorithm for 1 cluster up to 9 clusters and examined the declining
pattern of 'within sums of squares' with an increasing number of clusters to look for an elbow
indicating that additional clusters have little added explanatory value (Tibshirani et al. 2001).
Using the five identified clusters, we labeled each sequential window based on group (Fig. 1a).





Figure 1: (a) Conceptual figure showing the hypothesized relationship following the Shepherd equation between ice duration and variability (measured as interannual duration standard deviation: sd) with four groups identified with the vertical dotted line indicating the peak of the relationship. (b) For each of those groups, we present corresponding conceptual models of temporal trends in ice duration and variability over the last ~90 years as rolling averages (black line) and rolling standard deviations (gray ribbon).

- 257
- 258

$$SD_{window} = \frac{A * mean_{window}}{B + mean_{window}}^{c}$$
(Eq. 1)

259 We hypothesized that lakes would cluster into groups along the non-linear relationship 260 (Fig. 1). In lakes with no ice, interannual variability is 0; those lakes are consistently frozen (Fig. 261 1a, 1b: region i). Lakes in the warmest region with the shortest ice cover would experience 262 decreasing variability (Fig. 1a, 1b: region ii). In slightly cooler regions, lakes would shift to high 263 and stable variability (Fig. 1a, 1b: region iii). Lakes in colder regions would experience 264 intermediate and increasing interannual variability (Fig. 1a, 1b: region iv). To identify which 265 lake characteristics predicted each lake group located on the Shepherd function (Fig. 1), we 266 selected the window size (16-years) that was the best fit, based on AIC and R², out of each of the 267 Shepherd model fits. We selected the most recent 16-year sequence (2002-2018) and identified 268 the cluster assigned by cluster analysis for each lake. We used groups assigned for the five

269 clusters as identified above (i,ii; iii; iv.1; iv.2; iv.3) and also used three groups (i,ii; iii; iv) to 270 match Fig. 1a as categorical response variables. We used a regression tree with morphometric 271 variables (max depth, surface area) and geography (latitude, longitude, elevation) to explain the 272 assigned group. A parsimonious regression tree was selected by pruning the tree to the level 273 where the complexity parameter minimized the cross-validation error. We calculated the percent 274 variation explained by the regression tree (R^2) as: $R^2 = 1$ - relative error (Sharma et al., 2012). 275 Regression trees were completed using the '*rpart*' and '*rpart.plot*' packages (Milborrow 2019; 276 Therneau & Atkinson 2019).

- 277
- 278

Global explanation of ice duration residuals

279 We examined the effects of global climate and teleconnection factors on year-to-year 280 variability, measured as residuals from a Thiel-Sen slope line fit to all data (1931 to 2018) as 281 above. Given the spatial distribution of our lakes, mostly in North America and Europe, and the 282 timing of ice phenology, spanning October to May, we collapsed all three variables (GTA, 283 ENSO, and NAO) to bimonthly averages for October/November (ON), December/January (DJ), 284 February/March (FM), and April/May (AM) resulting in 12 unique predictor variables. We used 285 these 12 variables scaled to bimonthly means to capture seasonal differences between variability 286 in the timing of ice on our study lakes while also avoiding over-parameterizing models with too 287 many explanatory variables. We removed 4 lakes with < 5 years of non-zero ice cover as 288 residuals were all close or equal to 0. For the remaining 39 lakes, we modeled the annual 289 residuals of ice duration using GAMs with the same 12 explanatory climatic variables and fixed 290 the number of basis functions for each smoothed term to 4 for each parameter. For each lake, we 291 estimated GAMs using automatic parameter selection by penalizing each smooth using the 292 'select = TRUE' option in the 'mgcv' package (version 1.8-40; Wood 2017). We extracted all 293 significant smooths for the selected GAM as above.

294

295 Results

296 *Trends in duration mean and duration sd*

297 The duration of lake ice varied considerably among years and between lakes (Fig. 2; Fig. 298 S2). The average duration of ice cover for the entire dataset was 112 days, ranging from a 299 minimum of 0 to a maximum of 236 days (Table S2). Some lakes that were almost entirely ice300 free for the duration of their time series had little to no interannual variation, such as Aergerisee

301 (Fig. 2a). Lakes with a high frequency of ice-free years tended to have fluctuating standard

deviations with many years close to 0, such as Greifensee (Fig. 2b). Other lakes had ice durations

303 lasting around two months (e.g., Balaton, Fig. 2c) or longer ice durations lasting over 100 days

304 (e.g., Otsego, Fig. 2d), both with less frequent ice-free years over the entire record.





Figure 2: Annual ice duration (black points) and variability patterns in ice duration for 4
selected study lakes. The rolling 10-year mean is presented as a grey line and variability is drawn
as light grey ribbons representing the rolling mean +/- rolling standard deviation in ice duration
over a 10-year window. Lakes are sorted by the group from Fig. 1 that they might occupy
including (a) group i: Aergerisee, (b) group ii: Greifensee, (c) group iii: Balaton, and (d) group
iv: Otsego.

314 Most lakes (79%) displayed decreasing duration means but trends in duration sd were 315 less consistent looking across sequential windows of 4 to 40 years (Fig. 3). Duration sd significantly increased for 49%, decreased for 7%, and had no significant trend for 44% of lakes 316 317 (Fig. 3). Trends in standard deviation of 17-year sequential windows were best explained by ice characteristics, winter air temperature, and lake depth in a GAM that explained 85.5% of overall 318 319 deviance (Fig. 4; Table S3). Lakes with no ice-free years had increasing trends in duration sd, 320 but lakes with an increasing number of ice-free years were more likely to have decreasing trends 321 in duration sd until the lake was ice-free all the time (Fig. 4a). Lakes with the coldest winter 322 daily maximum air temperatures were more likely to have decreasing duration sd while 323 approaching 0°C air temperatures indicated increasing trends in duration sd (Fig. 4b). When approaching 5°C, lakes were likely to have to change in duration sd (Fig. 4b). Deeper lakes had 324 325 increasing trends in standard deviation (Fig. 4c). Finally, the trends in duration were most likely 326 to switch from increasing to decreasing at an average of ~ 100 days of ice cover (Fig. 4d). The 327 trends in duration CV predominantly matched those of duration sd (data not shown) and 328 therefore, we proceeded with using duration sd for the rest of the analyses.







Figure 3: A comparison between the mean ice duration rate of change (duration slope) and thestandard deviation of ice duration rate of change (duration sd slope) for each lake. The vertical

and horizontal error bars represent a 1.5x interquartile range for all slopes calculated from
sequential windows of 4 to 40 years. The color of the point represents whether 95% of the
duration sd slopes are above, equal to, or below 0; the shape of the points represents whether
95% of the mean duration slopes are below or equal to 0.





Figure 4: Trends in standard deviation of ice duration explained by (a) percentage of ice-free years, (b) median of the December, January, and February maximum daily air temperature (DJF daily max.), (c) maximum depth (Max. depth), and (d) mean ice duration over the 1931-2018 time-span for each lake. While other parameters were included in the model, the four significant parameters are presented. Curves (black line) represent smoothed relationships holding the other variables constant as identified by a General Additive Model; bands represent 95% credible intervals.

345

346 *Relationship between ice phenology mean and sd*

347 Ice-on dates tended to have higher variability than ice-off dates. Ice-on variance was 348 almost twice ice-off variance ($F_{2978,2936} = 1.82$, p < 0.001; Fig. 5a). Later mean ice-on dates had 349 higher ice-on sds across all sequential windows with variability increasing by ~40% across the 350 range of mean ice-on dates (Fig. 5b). Ice-on sds increased linearly with increasing ice-on mean 351 (edf = 1) but some sequential windows had increasing quadratic or higher polynomial $(edf \ge 2)$ 352 fits with maxima on 17 Jan. The GAM model explained 13% of the variance at most. Earlier 353 mean ice-off dates had higher sds across all sequential windows with variability increasing by 354 300% across the range of mean ice-off dates (Fig. 5c). The GAM model explained up to 77% of 355 the variance; most of the fits were highly non-linear (edf > 2). Maximum variance was on 16 Feb

across all sequential windows and 23 Feb at the models with the downward tilt in early February (edf > 4.5) which were able to capture the Shepherd function shaped curve proposed for ice duration (Fig. 1a).

- 359
- 360





Figure 5: (a) Relative variability between ice-on and ice-off dates with each point representing
the residual to the temporal trends (Theil-Sen slope analysis) for each lake. The violin plot shows
the distribution of the points and the lines on the violin plots represent the quartiles for each
distribution with a wider spread between lines indicating more variability. Fitted GAM models
between mean and standard deviation (sd) for (b) ice-on and (c) ice-off dates for each sequential
window sizes from 4 to 30 years.

369 We found a non-linear relationship between duration standard deviation and average ice 370 duration that was similar across all sequential windows (Fig. 6), and which supported our 371 hypothesis (Fig. 1a). The median peak of all the models was at 26.0 days of ice duration while 372 the median inflection point was 47.8 days (Fig. 6); this also represents the transition between 373 increasing variability and decreasing variability (Fig. 1a). The inflection point of this relationship was at ~1.5 months, at that boundary, there is a shift from accelerating (> 1.5 months ice 374 375 duration) to decelerating (< 1.5 months ice duration) duration sd. The model with the best fit, as identified by deviance explained and AIC, was for 16-year sequential windows (A = 474, B =376 175, C = 1.7, $R^2 = 0.75$, Fig. 6b). Using all the data across all sequential windows and all lakes, 377 k-means clusters were calculated for 1 to 9 clusters. Within sums of squares minimized at 5 378

clusters; therefore, we used 5-clusters to categorize each group of the duration mean vs. duration
sd (Fig. 6b; Fig. S3). One cluster was identified at the lower end of ice duration; we labeled that
as group i,ii to match with groups i and ii from the conceptual model (Fig. 1). Group iii matched
the conceptual model, while group iv from the conceptual model was identified by the k-mean
clustering as three distinct clusters, we labeled those as groups iv.1, iv.2, and iv.3 according to
increasing ice duration (Fig. 6b) and also lumped all of those iv categories together to match our
hypotheses (Fig. 1a).





Figure 6: (a) Shepherd model fits for 16-year sequential windows (black line) and 5th to 95th credible interval for all model fits (n = 4 to 30-year sequential windows). The blue rectangle represents the 5th to 95th percentiles of the peak of the curve across all models. (b) Shepherd model fit for the 16-year sequential windows from all lakes displayed as points. There are 18 overlapping points at 0 days ice duration and 0 days ice duration sd. Colors and labels indicate groups as identified by k-means clustering analysis.

394

387

Geography and depth of each lake explained different categories for the most recent 16year window (2012 - 2018) for each lake. For five groups, a tree with both elevation and latitude explained 66% of the apparent variance. For three groups, a tree with both maximum depth and latitude explained 85% of the apparent variance. Lakes at higher latitudes (> 55°N) were exclusively group iv (Fig. 7). Lakes at higher elevation (> 394 m) and latitude were group iv.3 with the longest ice duration and intermediate duration sd (Fig. 7a). Lakes at lower latitudes but higher elevations tended to be group i,ii (Fig. 7a). Lakes at a lower latitude, between 40°N and 402 55°N and deeper maximum depth were group i, ii, and iii while shallower maximum depth (< 29
403 m) were in group iv (Fig. 7b).

404





Figure 7: Regression tree results for the most recent 16-year window (2012-2018) for each lake
(a) using 5 groups identified by k-means cluster analysis and using (b) 3 groups, collapsing all
groups from iv.1 to iv.3 down to iv. The lines indicate split points from optimal regression trees
for the explanatory variables including latitude, elevation, and maximum depth (Max. depth) for
each lake.

411

412 *Global explanation of ice duration residuals*

413 Across the 39 lakes, ice duration residuals were significantly related to a range of climate 414 and teleconnection variables. Selected GAMs explained between 8% and 59% of the deviance in ice duration residuals (Fig. 8). Between 0 and 6 explanatory bimonthly variables (median = 2) 415 416 were significant for each lake (p < 0.05, Fig. 8). Of all the climate and teleconnection variables, 417 NAO for October/November (n = 17) and the global temperature anomaly for April/May (n =418 16) were the most common significant explanatory variables. In general, higher global 419 temperatures in any bimonthly period resulted in shorter-than-expected ice durations (Fig. 8). 420 Similarly, increasing NAO indices in October/November resulted in shorter-than-expected ice 421 durations (Fig. 8).



425 Figure 8: Relationships of ice duration residual and bimonthly average global temperature
426 anomaly (GTA), North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO), and El Niño-Southern Oscillation (ENSO)

427 for October/November (ON), December/January (DJ), February/March (FM), and April/May

428 (AM) as determined by a General Additive Model (GAM). Any significant parameters were

429 identified by a filled tile, the smooths for each relationship are plotted as a black line to see the

430 direction and shape of the trend. The right panel indicates the percentage of deviance explained

- 431 (Dev. Expl.) for each lake's GAM fit.
- 432

433 Discussion

434 Not all lakes experienced increasing interannual variability in lake ice duration, despite 435 most experiencing unprecedented rates of recent ice loss supporting our initial hypothesis. 436 Therefore, as lakes continue to warm and ice duration decreases (Sharma et al. 2021b), we can 437 anticipate an increase in variability until ice seasons last ~1 month (Fig. 6). After which, there 438 are increasingly high numbers of ice-free years with decreasing variability and, eventually, lakes 439 may cross a tipping point to either have a sequence of ice-free years or become permanently ice-440 free as forecasted by Sharma et al. (2021a) but will remain to be seen in the coming decades if 441 greenhouse gas emissions are not mitigated. This suggests that year-to-year variability in ice 442 duration will be larger when there is a short duration of ice cover. Geography, air temperatures, 443 and lake depth were found to drive the trends of ice variability, in addition to the frequency of 444 ice-free years (Fig. 4, 7), suggesting that there may be some lakes that are naturally more 445 variable or sensitive to changes in climate than others. Finally, in many lakes, year-to-year 446 variability responded to both large-scale indices of climate change and teleconnections such as 447 NAO and ENSO.

448

449 Trends in duration mean and duration sd

450 Most lakes have been experiencing a rapid decline in ice duration (Fig. 3), consistent with 451 other lakes and rivers in the northern hemisphere (e.g., Magnuson et al. 2000; Newton & Mullan 452 2021; Sharma et al. 2021b). Several lakes in this study did not have decreasing ice durations 453 because they have already transitioned to predominantly ice-free lakes (e.g., Fig. 2a). On 454 average, lakes were losing 21.7 days of ice per century using the sequential window technique in 455 this study which was similar to rates calculated using linear regression for these lakes in a prior 456 study (Sharma et al. 2021b). The duration sd gained an average of 4 days per century with many 457 lakes increasing in variability. This reflects the potentially increasing variability of both

458 components of ice duration, ice-in and ice-out which is driven by regional weather conditions
459 and the rate of change of those weather conditions at either end of the winter season (Kratz et al.
460 2000; Arp et al. 2013). Notably, some lakes had decreasing variability, counter to previous
461 studies indicating only increasing or no change in variability (Weyhenmeyer et al. 2011; Benson
462 et al. 2012; Kainz et al. 2017); this phenomenon may be a potential indicator of an ice-free
463 future.

464 Ice conditions, air temperature, and depth had the largest effects on trends in duration variability. Lakes experiencing ice-free winters for more than half of the time experienced 465 466 rapidly decreasing variability in ice duration, most rapid rates of ice loss, and are vulnerable to 467 permanent ice loss if greenhouse gas concentrations are not mitigated (Sharma et al. 2021a; b). 468 Air temperature is closely linked with ice duration (Palecki & Barry 1986; Robertson et al. 1992; 469 Duguay et al. 2006) and we confirm that this extends to trends in ice variability (Fig. 4). Lakes 470 found in the southern regions of the "slush zone" in the United States and Eurasia where daily 471 winter air temperatures reach a maximum of around or just below 0°C have increasing variability 472 (Fig. 4b) and are most sensitive to the increased frequency of extreme ice-free years (Filazzola et 473 al. 2020). The deepest lakes which are also vulnerable to short ice duration, intermittent ice 474 cover, and some of the fastest rates of ice cover loss (Sharma et al. 2019, 2021b), are increasing 475 in ice duration variability. Larger and deeper lakes require consistently colder air temperatures 476 because larger volumes of water must be cooled in the late fall and early winter (Brown & 477 Duguay 2010; Arp et al. 2013; Magee & Wu 2017). Large lakes with long fetches are also more 478 sensitive to wind action breaking the skim of ice at the beginning and end of the ice season 479 (Leppäranta 2010; Brown & Duguay 2010; Magee & Wu 2017). For example, Grand Traverse 480 Bay in Lake Michigan and Bayfield in Lake Superior had the highest variability in ice duration.

481

482 *Relationship between ice phenology mean and sd*

Ice phenology exhibited more variability at the beginning of the season than the end (Fig. 5a), consistent with other lakes (Kratz et al. 2000; Zdorovennov et al. 2013). Ice-on dates are controlled by local factors like freezing air temperatures, precipitation, and low wind that will set-up ice formation (Duguay et al. 2006; Mishra et al. 2011; Hou et al. 2022). Ice-off dates still are dependent on crossing the 0°C threshold at the end of the ice-season but also reflect the entire winter season with precipitation on ice, ice thickness, and snow cover and drive the timing of ice melt (Jensen et al. 2007; Preston et al. 2016). Despite both ice phenology metrics increasing in variability as the ice season shortens, ice-off dates exhibit more non-linear patterns. Ice-on dates could continue to increase in variability while ice-off dates exhibit a non-linear curve that we originally hypothesized that ice duration followed and likely drives more of the ice duration pattern. Ice duration is a better metric for understanding patterns in lake ice variability because ice duration captures ice phenology from both the start and end of the season, while also allowing for incorporation of ice-free years.

496 Earlier studies had suggested that variability increases with shortened ice duration (i.e., 497 Weyhenmeyer et al. 2011; Sharma et al. 2016), yet we observed a non-linear relationship 498 between variability and ice duration both across and within lakes over time (Fig. 6). The 499 previously undocumented non-linear relationship between variability and ice duration may now 500 be apparent because of accelerated rates of ice loss and warmer winter temperatures contributing 501 to a higher occurrence of ice-free years in lakes around the Northern Hemisphere in recent 502 decades (Sharma et al. 2019; Newton & Mullan 2021), a phenomenon which was not as 503 widespread in earlier studies (Weyhenmeyer et al. 2011; Benson et al. 2012). Our new analysis 504 with ice duration (Fig. 6) is more reflective of the current state of northern hemisphere lakes as 505 they move from consistent ice cover to intermittent or no ice winters.

The critical transition points from increasing to decreasing variability at ~1 month may portend ecological regime shifts, as variability changes can be an early warning indicator of an impending regime shift (Scheffer et al. 2001). Once lakes cross that boundary and begin to have decreasing variability, the shift to ice-free winters may be an inevitable outcome. Within the past 90 years, some of our study lakes have already transitioned to a new ecological state and represent the endpoints of the mathematical relationship where they are now permanently icefree and therefore have no interannual variability (Fig. 6).

513 Our initial hypothesis was that there would be 4 different groups within this mathematical 514 relationship (Fig. 1a). These groups could either represent the characteristic of a lake as a whole 515 or represent intervals of time for a particular lake which might not be fixed in time as ice 516 duration declines. Because of the sharp decline in the shape of the curve, lakes in groups i and ii 517 were lumped together by the clustering analysis (Fig. 6b) but represent high variability 518 decreasing to completely ice-free. Geography and depth were the best predictors of the groups 519 identified for the most recent 16-year window (2012 - 2018) which is consistent with other 520 studies (Arp et al. 2013). Lakes found at higher latitudes were consistently higher in ice duration 521 and had moderate but increasing duration sd. The cutoff for latitudes between 50 and 62°N is 522 consistent with the 61°N boundary below which lakes are highly susceptible to ice loss 523 (Weyhenmeyer et al. 2011). At the lower latitudes, the deeper lakes at higher elevations were the 524 most likely to be in group i,ii in lakes with these lakes most sensitive to experiencing ice-free 525 years and intermittent ice cover (Sharma et al. 2019). Although lower elevation sites tend to be 526 less climatically variable (Palazzi et al. 2019), we observed higher variability at low elevations, 527 likely driven by warmer air temperatures and less winter snowpack, causing shorter ice seasons 528 (Palecki & Barry 1986; Brown & Duguay 2010; Arp et al. 2013).

529

530

Global explanation of ice duration residuals

531 Overarching trends in lake ice decline are ultimately linked to climate change (Magnuson 532 et al. 2000; Sharma et al. 2019). For example, higher global temperature anomalies, especially in 533 April/May, result in shorter ice seasons (Fig. 8) likely affecting spring melt for many northern 534 hemisphere lakes. However, global temperature and weather patterns vary from year to year with 535 the effects of climate change on regional and local drivers of limnological processes like lake ice 536 being modulated by teleconnections (Wilkinson et al. 2020). The resulting synergistic or 537 antagonistic between climate change and teleconnections could result in extremes in ice duration; 538 for example, variance in ice phenology has been attributed to NAO or ENSO teleconnections 539 (Sharma & Magnuson 2014; Bai et al. 2018; Schmidt et al. 2019). In this study, many northern 540 European lakes had their ice duration affected by October/November NAO where NAO effects 541 are strongest in the early winter (Hurrell et al. 2002). With climate change driving greater 542 variability and extremes in some of these oscillations (e.g., ENSO, Wang et al. 2019), lakes may 543 also experience abrupt shifts in their phenology between years in response to phase switches of 544 teleconnection patterns or especially strong teleconnection years (Wang et al. 2012; Bai et al. 545 2012). Teleconnections and the global temperature might be better predictors of long-term and 546 ecosystem-wide processes such as lake ice duration because they integrate direct drivers, such as 547 meteorology, over space and time (Hallett et al. 2004).

548 There was a wide range in the deviances of ice duration residuals explained by the global 549 temperature anomaly and the two teleconnection indices that we examined. Depending on the 550 timing of ice-on and ice-off, some lakes may be less responsive to metrics averaged bimonthly.

Location may play a large role as well; for example, NAO strongly affects the Atlantic basins of
both North America and Europe (Hurrell et al. 2002), but lakes inland from the Atlantic Ocean
might not be as responsive. Similarly, different geographic regions might respond to the

teleconnections differently, positive NAO indices link to warm conditions in northeastern North

555 America and Northern Europe but cooler conditions in southern Europe (Hallett et al. 2004).

- Northern European lakes in this study had a negative relationship between ice duration and NAO
- 557 indices for late fall and early winter months (Fig. 8).
- 558

559 Conclusions

560 The effects of climate change on ecological, societal, and physical processes have 561 frequently been identified as non-linear processes (e.g., Grünig et al. 2020). Our results confirm 562 non-linear responses for ice cover dynamics, with shifting interannual ice phenology variability 563 patterns if lake ice cover lasts for less than a month. The observed shifting patterns in lake ice 564 variability will have consequences for both humans and ecosystems making planning for 565 recreational opportunities, such as skating races and ice fishing tournaments, even more difficult 566 (Magnuson & Lathrop 2014; Knoll et al. 2019). Ultimately, these recreational events will be 567 permanently lost when lakes no longer freeze in warmer winters. The loss of ice cover for lakes 568 can promote summer warming of lakes and harmful cyanobacterial blooms thereby reducing 569 freshwater ecosystem goods and services such as recreational activities and access to potable 570 water (Weyhenmeyer et al. 2008; Hampton et al. 2017). Future studies on the cryosphere should 571 include an analysis of interannual variability to serve as early-warning indicators and identify 572 which systems may be approaching an ice-free state with deleterious effects on freshwater 573 ecosystem goods and services year-round.

574

575 Acknowledgements

We thank the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council Discovery Grant, Ontario
Ministry of Innovation and Science Early Researcher Award, and the York University Research
Chair program to SS for funding to support this research. GAW received financial support from
the Swedish Research Council (VR Grant No. 2020-03222 and FORMAS Grant No. 202001091). RIW was supported by a UKRI Natural Environment Research Council (NERC)

- 581 Independent Research Fellowship [grant number NE/T011246/1]. We thank Dr. Isabella Oleksy
- 582 for useful conversations about the analyses in this manuscript.
- 583

584 Author Contributions

- 585 All authors conceived the ideas and designed methodology; DCR and AF analyzed the data with
- 586 input from the other authors. DCR, SS, and AF led the writing of the manuscript. All authors
- 587 contributed critically to the drafts and gave final approval for publication.
- 588

589 Open Research

- All data used in this study is publicly available including the lake ice phenology records
- 591 (https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19146611.v3) and climate data
- 592 (https://www.nature.com/articles/s41597-020-0453-3). All code used in the analyses will be
- 593 permanently archived at Zenodo.
- 594

595 References

- Arp, C. D., B. M. Jones, and G. Grosse. 2013. Recent lake ice-out phenology within and among
 lake districts of Alaska, U.S.A. Limnology and Oceanography 58: 2013–2028.
- 598 doi:<u>10.4319/lo.2013.58.6.2013</u>
- Bai, X., J. Wang, C. Sellinger, A. Clites, and R. Assel. 2012. Interannual variability of Great
 Lakes ice cover and its relationship to NAO and ENSO. Journal of Geophysical Research:
- 601 Oceans 117. doi:10.1029/2010JC006932
- Benson, B. J., J. J. Magnuson, O. P. Jensen, and others. 2012. Extreme events, trends, and
 variability in Northern Hemisphere lake-ice phenology (1855–2005). Climatic Change 112:
- 604 299–323. doi:<u>10.1007/s10584-011-0212-8</u>
- 605 Bernhardt, J., C. Engelhardt, G. Kirillin, and J. Matschullat. 2012. Lake ice phenology in Berlin-
- Brandenburg from 1947–2007: observations and model hindcasts. Climatic Change 112:
 791–817. doi:10.1007/s10584-011-0248-9
- Bollinger, J. Using Bollinger Bands. Stocks & Commodities 10: 47–51.
- Brown, L. C., and C. R. Duguay. 2010. The response and role of ice cover in lake-climate
- 610 interactions. Progress in Physical Geography: Earth and Environment **34**: 671–704.
- 611 doi:<u>10.1177/0309133310375653</u>

- Cook, B. I., J. S. Mankin, and K. J. Anchukaitis. 2018. Climate Change and Drought: From Past
 to Future. Curr Clim Change Rep 4: 164–179. doi:10.1007/s40641-018-0093-2
- 614 Diffenbaugh, N. S., M. Scherer, and R. J. Trapp. 2013. Robust increases in severe thunderstorm
- environments in response to greenhouse forcing. Proceedings of the National Academy of
- 616 Sciences of the United States of America 110: 16361–6. doi:10.1073/pnas.1307758110
- 617 Duguay, C. R., T. D. Prowse, B. R. Bonsal, R. D. Brown, M. P. Lacroix, and P. Ménard. 2006.
- Recent trends in Canadian lake ice cover. Hydrological Processes 20: 781–801.
 doi:<u>10.1002/hyp.6131</u>
- 620 Filazzola, A., K. Blagrave, M. A. Imrit, and S. Sharma. 2020. Climate Change Drives Increases
- in Extreme Events for Lake Ice in the Northern Hemisphere. Geophysical Research Letters
 47: e2020GL089608. doi:10.1029/2020GL089608
- Ghanbari, R. N., H. R. Bravo, J. J. Magnuson, W. G. Hyzer, and B. J. Benson. 2009. Coherence
 between lake ice cover, local climate and teleconnections (Lake Mendota, Wisconsin).
 Journal of Hydrology 374: 282–293. doi:10.1016/j.jhydrol.2009.06.024
- Grünig, M., P. Calanca, D. Mazzi, and L. Pellissier. 2020. Inflection point in climatic suitability
 of insect pest species in Europe suggests non-linear responses to climate change. Global
 Change Biology 26: 6338–6349. doi:10.1111/gcb.15313
- Hallett, T. B., T. Coulson, J. G. Pilkington, T. H. Clutton-Brock, J. M. Pemberton, and B. T.
- Grenfell. 2004. Why large-scale climate indices seem to predict ecological processes better
 than local weather. Nature 430: 71–75. doi:10.1038/nature02708
- Hampton, S. E., A. W. E. Galloway, S. M. Powers, and others. 2017. Ecology under lake ice.
 Ecology Letters 20: 98–111. doi:10.1111/ele.12699
- Harris, I., T. J. Osborn, P. Jones, and D. Lister. 2020. Version 4 of the CRU TS monthly highresolution gridded multivariate climate dataset. Sci Data 7: 109. doi:<u>10.1038/s41597-020-</u>
 0453-3
- Hastie, T., and R. Tibshirani. 1990. Exploring the Nature of Covariate Effects in the Proportional
 Hazards Model. Biometrics 46: 1005–1016. doi:10.2307/2532444
- 639 Hébert, M.-P., B. E. Beisner, M. Rautio, and G. F. Fussmann. 2021. Warming winters in lakes:
- 640 Later ice onset promotes consumer overwintering and shapes springtime planktonic food
- 641 webs. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences **118**: e2114840118.
- 642 doi:<u>10.1073/pnas.2114840118</u>

- Higgins, S. N., C. M. Desjardins, H. Drouin, L. E. Hrenchuk, and J. J. van der Sanden. 2021. The
 Role of Climate and Lake Size in Regulating the Ice Phenology of Boreal Lakes. Journal of
 Geophysical Research: Biogeosciences 126: e2020JG005898. doi:10.1029/2020JG005898
- 646 Hou, G., X. Yuan, S. Wu, and others. 2022. Phenological Changes and Driving Forces of Lake
- 647 Ice in Central Asia from 2002 to 2020. Remote Sensing 14: 4992. doi:<u>10.3390/rs14194992</u>
- Hurrell, J. W., M. P. Hoerling, and C. K. Folland. 2002. Climatic variability over the North
- 649 Atlantic, p. 143–151. *In* R.P. Pearce [ed.], International Geophysics. Academic Press.
- 650 Iles, T. C. 1994. A review of stock-recruitment relationships with reference to flatfish
- populations. Netherlands Journal of Sea Research 32: 399–420. doi:10.1016/0077 <u>7579(94)90017-5</u>
- Imrit, M. A., and S. Sharma. 2021. Climate Change is Contributing to Faster Rates of Lake Ice
- 654 Loss in Lakes Around the Northern Hemisphere. Journal of Geophysical Research:
- 655 Biogeosciences **126**: e2020JG006134. doi:<u>10.1029/2020JG006134</u>
- 656 IPCC. 2021. Climate Change 2021: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group
 657 I to the Sixth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change.
 658 Cambridge University Press.
- Jansen, J., S. MacIntyre, D. C. Barrett, and others. 2021. Winter Limnology: How do
 Hydrodynamics and Biogeochemistry Shape Ecosystems Under Ice? Journal of Geophysical
 Research: Biogeosciences 126: e2020JG006237. doi:10.1029/2020JG006237
- 662 Jensen, O. P., B. J. Benson, J. J. Magnuson, V. M. Card, M. N. Futter, P. A. Soranno, and K. M.
- 663 Stewart. 2007. Spatial analysis of ice phenology trends across the Laurentian Great Lakes
 664 region during a recent warming period. Limnology and Oceanography 52: 2013–2026.
- 665 Kainz, M. J., R. Ptacnik, S. Rasconi, and H. H. Hager. 2017. Irregular changes in lake surface
- water temperature and ice cover in subalpine Lake Lunz, Austria. Inland Waters 7: 27–33.
 doi:10.1080/20442041.2017.1294332
- 668 Karim, M. F., and N. Mimura. 2008. Impacts of climate change and sea-level rise on cyclonic
- storm surge floods in Bangladesh. Global Environmental Change 18: 490–500.
- 670 doi:10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2008.05.002
- 671 Knoll, L. B., S. Sharma, B. A. Denfeld, G. Flaim, Y. Hori, J. J. Magnuson, D. Straile, and G. A.
- 672 Weyhenmeyer. 2019. Consequences of lake and river ice loss on cultural ecosystem services.
- 673 Limnology and Oceanography Letters 4: 119–131. doi:<u>10.1002/lol2.10116</u>

- 674 Komsta, L. 2019. Median-Based Linear Models. R package version 0.12.1.
- Kratz, T. K., B. P. Hayden, B. J. Benson, and W. Y. B. Chang. 2000. Patterns in the interannual
 variability of lake freeze and thaw dates. SIL Proceedings, 1922-2010 27: 2796–2799.
 doi:10.1080/03680770.1998.11898175
- 678 Leppäranta, M. 2010. Modelling the Formation and Decay of Lake Ice, p. 63–83. *In* G. George
- [ed.], The Impact of Climate Change on European Lakes. Springer Netherlands.
- 680 Livingstone, D. M. 2000. Large-scale climatic forcing detected in historical observations of lake
- 681 ice break-up. SIL Proceedings, 1922-2010 **27**: 2775–2783.
- 682 doi:<u>10.1080/03680770.1998.11898171</u>
- 683
- Magee, M. R., and C. H. Wu. 2017. Effects of changing climate on ice cover in three
 morphometrically different lakes. Hydrological Processes 31: 308–323.
- 686 doi:10.1002/hyp.10996
- Magnuson, J. J., and R. C. Lathrop. 2014. Lake ice: Winter, beauty, value, changes, and a
 threatened future. Lakeline 18–27.
- Magnuson, J. J., D. M. Robertson, B. J. Benson, and others. 2000. Historical Trends in Lake and
 River Ice Cover in the Northern Hemisphere. Science 289: 1743–1746.
- 691 doi:10.1126/science.289.5485.1743
- Milborrow, S. 2019. rpart.plot: Plot "rpart" models: An enhanced version of "plot.rpart." Rpackage version 3.0.8.
- Mishra, V., K. A. Cherkauer, L. C. Bowling, and M. Huber. 2011. Lake Ice phenology of small
 lakes: Impacts of climate variability in the Great Lakes region. Global and Planetary Change **76**: 166–185. doi:10.1016/j.gloplacha.2011.01.004
- 697 National Weather Service. 2023. Climate Prediction Center Teleconnections: North Atlantic698 Oscillation.
- NCEI. 2023. Anomalies and Index Data | Global Surface Temperature Anomalies | National
 Centers for Environmental Information (NCEI).
- 701 Newton, A. M. W., and D. J. Mullan. 2021. Climate change and Northern Hemisphere lake and
- river ice phenology from 1931–2005. The Cryosphere **15**: 2211–2234. doi:<u>10.5194/tc-15-</u>
- 703 <u>2211-2021</u>

- 704 Palazzi, E., L. Mortarini, S. Terzago, and J. von Hardenberg. 2019. Elevation-dependent
- warming in global climate model simulations at high spatial resolution. Climate Dynamics
 52: 2685–2702. doi:10.1007/s00382-018-4287-z
- 707 Palecki, M. A., and R. G. Barry. 1986. Freeze-up and Break-up of Lakes as an Index of
- 708 Temperature Changes during the Transition Seasons: A Case Study for Finland. Journal of
- 709 Applied Meteorology and Climatology **25**: 893–902. doi:<u>10.1175/1520-</u>
- 710 <u>0450(1986)025<0893:FUABUO>2.0.CO;2</u>
- 711 Pedersen, T. 2022. patchwork: The Composer of Plots. R package version 1.1.2.
- 712 Pendergrass, A. G., R. Knutti, F. Lehner, C. Deser, and B. M. Sanderson. 2017. Precipitation
- variability increases in a warmer climate. Sci Rep 7: 17966. doi:10.1038/s41598-017-17966v
- 715 Preston, D. L., N. Caine, D. M. McKnight, M. W. Williams, K. Hell, M. P. Miller, S. J. Hart, and
- P. T. J. Johnson. 2016. Climate regulates alpine lake ice cover phenology and aquatic
- 717 ecosystem structure. Geophysical Research Letters **43**: 5353–5360.
- 718 doi:<u>10.1002/2016GL069036</u>
- R Core Team. 2022. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for
 Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. URL https://www.R-project.org/,.
- van Rij, J., M. Wieling, R. H. Baayen, and D. van Rijn. 2022. itsadug: Interpreting Time Series
 and Autocorrelated Data Using GAMMs. R package version 2.4.1.
- Robertson, D. M., R. A. Ragotzkie, and J. J. Magnuson. 1992. Lake ice records used to detect
 historical and future climatic changes. Climatic Change 21: 407–427.
- 725 doi:<u>10.1007/BF00141379</u>
- Rühland, K. M., M. Evans, and J. P. Smol. 2023. Arctic warming drives striking twenty-first
- 727 century ecosystem shifts in Great Slave Lake (Subarctic Canada), North America's deepest
- 728lake. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 290: 20231252.
- 729 doi:<u>10.1098/rspb.2023.1252</u>
- Scheffer, M., J. Bascompte, W. A. Brock, and others. 2009. Early-warning signals for critical
 transitions. Nature 461: 53–59. doi:<u>10.1038/nature08227</u>
- Scheffer, M., S. Carpenter, J. A. Foley, C. Folke, and B. Walker. 2001. Catastrophic shifts in
 ecosystems. Nature 413: 591–596. doi:10.1038/35098000

- Schmidt, D. F., K. M. Grise, and M. L. Pace. 2019. High-frequency climate oscillations drive
 ice-off variability for Northern Hemisphere lakes and rivers. Climatic Change 152: 517–532.
 doi:10.1007/s10584-018-2361-5
- 737 Sharma, S., K. Blagrave, A. Filazzola, M. A. Imrit, and H.-J. Hendricks Franssen. 2021a.
- Forecasting the Permanent Loss of Lake Ice in the Northern Hemisphere Within the 21st
- 739 Century. Geophysical Research Letters **48**: e2020GL091108. doi:<u>10.1029/2020GL091108</u>
- 740 Sharma, S., K. Blagrave, J. J. Magnuson, and others. 2019. Widespread loss of lake ice around
- the Northern Hemisphere in a warming world. Nat. Clim. Chang. 9: 227–231.
- 742 doi:<u>10.1038/s41558-018-0393-5</u>
- 743 Sharma, S., A. Filazzola, T. Nguyen, and others. 2022. Long-term ice phenology records
- spanning up to 578 years for 78 lakes around the Northern Hemisphere. Sci Data 9: 318.
 doi:10.1038/s41597-022-01391-6
- 746 Sharma, S., and J. J. Magnuson. 2014. Oscillatory dynamics do not mask linear trends in the
- timing of ice breakup for Northern Hemisphere lakes from 1855 to 2004. Climatic Change
 124: 835–847. doi:10.1007/s10584-014-1125-0
- 749 Sharma, S., J. J. Magnuson, R. D. Batt, L. A. Winslow, J. Korhonen, and Y. Aono. 2016. Direct
- observations of ice seasonality reveal changes in climate over the past 320–570 years. Sci
 Rep 6: 25061. doi:10.1038/srep25061
- 752 Sharma, S., D. C. Richardson, R. I. Woolway, and others. 2021b. Loss of Ice Cover, Shifting
 753 Phenology, and More Extreme Events in Northern Hemisphere Lakes. Journal of
- 754 Geophysical Research: Biogeosciences **126**: e2021JG006348. doi:10.1029/2021JG006348
- Shepherd, J. G. 1982. A versatile new stock-recruitment relationship for fisheries, and the
 construction of sustainable yield curves. ICES Journal of Marine Science 40: 67–75.
- 757 doi:<u>10.1093/icesjms/40.1.67</u>
- Siegel, A. F. 1982. Robust regression using repeated medians. Biometrika 69: 242–244.
 doi:10.1093/biomet/69.1.242
- Simpson, G. L. 2018. schoenberg: Ggplot-based graphics and other useful functions for GAMs
 fitted using mgcv. R package version 0.0-6.
- Therneau, T., and B. Atkinson. 2019. rpart: Recursive partitioning and regression trees. R
 package version 4.1-15.

- Thornton, P. K., P. J. Ericksen, M. Herrero, and A. J. Challinor. 2014. Climate variability and
 vulnerability to climate change: a review. Global Change Biology 20: 3313–3328.
 doi:10.1111/gcb.12581
- Tibshirani, R., G. Walther, and T. Hastie. 2001. Estimating the number of clusters in a data set
 via the gap statistic. Journal of the Royal Statistical Society: Series B (Statistical
- 769 Methodology) **63**: 411–423. doi:<u>10.1111/1467-9868.00293</u>
- van Rij, J., M. Wieling, R. H. Baayen, and D. van Rijn. 2022. itsadug: Interpreting Time Series
 and Autocorrelated Data Using GAMMs. R package version 2.4.1.
- Wang, B., X. Luo, Y.-M. Yang, W. Sun, M. A. Cane, W. Cai, S.-W. Yeh, and J. Liu. 2019.
- Historical change of El Niño properties sheds light on future changes of extreme El Niño.
- Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences **116**: 22512–22517.
- doi:<u>10.1073/pnas.1911130116</u>
- Wang, J., X. Bai, H. Hu, A. Clites, M. Colton, and B. Lofgren. 2012. Temporal and Spatial
- Variability of Great Lakes Ice Cover, 1973–2010. Journal of Climate 25: 1318–1329.
 doi:10.1175/2011JCLI4066.1
- 779 Wang, X., L. Feng, W. Qi, and others. 2022. Continuous Loss of Global Lake Ice Across Two
- 780 Centuries Revealed by Satellite Observations and Numerical Modeling. Geophysical
 781 Research Letters 49: e2022GL099022. doi:10.1029/2022GL099022
- 782 Weyhenmeyer, G. A., D. M. Livingstone, M. Meili, O. Jensen, B. Benson, and J. J. Magnuson.
- 783 2011. Large geographical differences in the sensitivity of ice-covered lakes and rivers in the
- Northern Hemisphere to temperature changes. Global Change Biology **17**: 268–275.
- 785 doi:<u>10.1111/j.1365-2486.2010.02249.x</u>
- 786 Weyhenmeyer, G. A., A.-K. Westöö, and E. Willén. 2008. Increasingly ice-free winters and their
- effects on water quality in Sweden's largest lakes, p. 111–118. *In* T. Nõges, R. Eckmann, K.
- 788Kangur, P. Nõges, A. Reinart, G. Roll, H. Simola, and M. Viljanen [eds.], European Large
- 789 Lakes Ecosystem changes and their ecological and socioeconomic impacts. Springer790 Netherlands.
- Wickham, H. 2016. ggplot2: Elegant Graphics for Data Analysis, H. Wickham [ed.]. Springer
 International Publishing.

793	Wilkinson, G. M., J. Walter, R. Fleck, and M. L. Pace. 2020. Beyond the trends: The need to
794	understand multiannual dynamics in aquatic ecosystems. Limnol Oceanogr Letters 5: 281–
795	286. doi: <u>10.1002/lol2.10153</u>
796	Wood, S. N. 2017. Generalized Additive Models: An Introduction with R, Second Edition, CRC
797	Press.
798	Wynne, R. H. 2000. Statistical modeling of lake ice phenology: issues and implications. SIL
799	Proceedings, 1922-2010 27: 2820–2825. doi:10.1080/03680770.1998.11898182
800	Zdorovennov, R., N. Palshin, G. Zdorovennova, T. Efremova, and A. Terzhevik. 2013.
801	Interannual variability of ice and snow cover of a small shallow lake. Estonian Journal of
802	Earth Sciences 62. doi: 10.3176/earth.2013.03